



The World Bank Institute  
Community Empowerment and Social Inclusion  
Learning Program

---

**Draft for Comments Only**

Summary Paper on the Stocktaking  
of Social Accountability Initiatives  
in Asia and the Pacific

Dennis Arroyo  
December 16, 2004

---

This paper was written under the supervision of Karen Sirker, WBIEN. Comments were made by Reiner Forster of the Participation and Civic Engagement Group, Janmejay Singh of the Asia Development Bank, Bhuvan Bhatnagar, EASSD, and Kirsten Havemann and Sophia Moestrup, SDV Consultants.

## Table of Contents

I.	Introduction.....	3
II.	Methodology.....	4
III.	Social Accountability: Conceptual Framework.....	4
IV.	Driving Forces.....	5
	Increased Development Effectiveness	
	Improved Governance	
	Empowerment	
V.	Social Accountability Mechanisms and Applications.....	11
VI	Inclusion.....	17
VII	Advocacy.....	19
VIII	Impacts of the Interventions.....	20
IX	Problems and Challenges.....	23
X	Institutionalization.....	26
XI	Sectoral Analysis.....	27
XII	Concluding Remarks: Forging Advocacy Chains.....	29
	<b>ANNEX.....</b>	<b>32</b>

## 1. INTRODUCTION

For many years, the knowledge and learning on social accountability (SAc) stemmed from a handful of pioneering case studies, such as participatory budgeting in Porto Alegre in Brazil, budget analysis by the Institute for Democracy in South Africa, and the report card on pro-poor services in the Philippines. In view of the need for a broader investigation of SAc approaches and initiatives, a team from the World Bank Institute's Community Empowerment and Social Inclusion (CESI) Learning Program, the Participation and Civic Engagement Group of the Social Development Department (SDV), and the Philippine Center for Policy Studies (PCPS) at the University of the Philippines, launched a stocktaking exercise in Asia.

The objectives of the stocktaking exercise were: (a) to extend the knowledge base and learning opportunities on SAc tools and mechanisms for the World Bank and its partners; b) to derive generic methodologies or strategies used in the SAc initiatives; (c) to feed the findings into the upcoming World Bank SAc sourcebook in terms of possible strategies for Bank operations; d) to create a platform for implementing groups to disseminate information on their interventions and influence the debate on social accountability; and e) to begin to create a network of practitioners.

The result is an initial repository of fifty-three SAc initiatives selected from both civil society groups and official state bodies in the region, and a menu for the development of fifteen case studies for capacity development activities.<sup>1</sup> The case studies will provide an in-depth analysis of the key elements of different SAc tools and mechanisms when applied in different contexts and an examination of the modifications, risks and critical success factors that are required. It is only with such an analysis that the generic elements of different methodologies can be better understood when applying the mechanisms in different sectors and cultural contexts.

The purpose of this paper is to summarize the findings from a stocktaking exercise covering Asia and the Pacific. The paper does not provide a detailed description of the SAc initiatives nor does it seek to provide an exhaustive conceptual analysis<sup>2</sup>. Instead the goal is to look specifically at the tools, mechanisms and activities that were used towards improving the accountability of governments in selected initiatives. The paper does demonstrate the need for more in-depth analysis on some accountability issues such as answerability (having the obligation to answer questions regarding decision and/or actions); sanctions (the ability of overseeing actors to impose punishment on the accountable actors for failures or transgressions)<sup>3</sup> and enforcement/compliance (possible legal recourse or incentives, supervision, promotion, etc. within the public sector, for example).

The next section briefly describes the methodology used to undertake the stocktaking exercise. Section III discusses the conceptual framework on which this work was based; it includes the definitions of accountability and social accountability. Section IV describes the social/political context within which the SAc initiatives were implemented or have failed. It also describes the driving forces behind the engagement of SAc mechanisms, and whether they were initiated by the state, by civil society, or by both jointly.

---

<sup>1</sup> The Public Affairs Foundation in Bangalore, India will develop the case studies.

<sup>2</sup> For a more detailed description of each initiative, please refer to the templates.

<sup>3</sup> For a deeper conceptual discussion of answerability and sanctions in accountability, please see Derrick Brinkerhoff, *Accountability and Health Systems: Toward Conceptual Clarity and Policy Relevance*. Health Policy Planning 19(6): 371-379, Oxford University Press, 2004.

Section V lists the SAc initiatives and how they operate.<sup>4</sup> Section VI looks into the issue of inclusion and explains how the target audiences of the SAc initiatives participated. Section VII highlights the advocacy, media and mobilization activities that supported the SAc interventions. Section VIII presents the initial impacts of the SAc interventions. The problems encountered in implementing the initiatives are discussed in section IX. Section X discusses the institutionalization of initiatives and how various mechanisms have been entrenched in government agencies or in civil society groups. Section XI examines some of the interventions by sector and discusses the kinds of mechanisms that may be best implemented in certain sectors. The resulting analysis may suggest policy implications for the World Bank.

In the concluding section, the question is asked, what types of SAc mechanisms are not being used in the Asia-Pacific region? It also focuses on the need for synergy- a major lesson learned in this paper. One observes synergy, complementarities, and convergence among SAc mechanisms in both India and the Philippines.

## **2. METHODOLOGY**

The Asia stocktaking exercise involved a series of steps:

1. Drawing up of a TOR: outline, objectives, steps, methodology, and process.
2. An invitation was sent to several practitioners both within and outside the World Bank who would be willing to serve as focal points to refine the content and process, and to share their knowledge of social accountability initiatives in Asia;
3. A template was jointly designed by focal points to organize and capture the information for each social accountability initiative;
4. In addition to the suggestions from the focal points, the PCPS launched an internet search for potential candidates for the stocktaking exercise;
5. The initial list of initiatives was refined under the guidance of the focal points to include a broad range of initiatives by country, type of tools and mechanisms and initial impact;
6. The PCPS team contacted the individuals of the selected SAc initiatives by phone and email and conducted interviews. Additional documents or reports were requested.
7. A final selection of fifty-three SAc initiatives was made by focal points and individual templates were then produced by PCPS for each initiative.

## **3. THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK**

Conceptually, accountability is the ability to require that public officials, private employers, or service providers answer for their policies, actions, and use of funds. Social accountability is an approach, initiated by civil society or the state, towards building an accountable and responsive government by relying on civic engagement.

---

<sup>4</sup> For more detailed information, please see the document that contains the completed templates on 53 initiatives from which this paper was based. E-mail: Ksirker@worldbank.org.

The present SAc model used in the World Bank consists of the participatory public expenditure cycle: civil society may participate in these four phases: 1) budget preparation/formulation (participatory budgeting), 2) budget analysis, 3) expenditure tracking, and 4) performance monitoring. The budget is a fiscal expression of social priorities. Civic groups intervene in the stage of crafting that expression. The resulting budget document is put under public scrutiny to analyze how well it attends to social development concerns. Non-government organizations and/or other actors such as parliamentarians then check to see if the funds on paper have indeed been spent on the committed programs. At the fourth stage, the people grade the final outputs, most commonly the performance of government agencies.

This report's research began by looking for interventions in the four broad social accountability categories with the exception of participatory budgeting (which was being examined in a separate World Bank stocktaking exercise). However, the stocktaking exercise demonstrated that a multitude of activities, tools, and mechanisms (beyond and including those in the participatory public expenditure cycle) are involved in implementing a single SAc initiative

While most of the previous research on SAc mechanisms focused on the role of ordinary citizens and/or civil society organizations participating directly or indirectly in exacting accountability, the Asia stocktaking exercise found that many governments have taken the lead in setting up their own mechanisms to involve the public in promoting social accountability such as the Local Governance Development Fund Project of Sirajganj, Bangladesh. Joint state-civil society initiatives have also been undertaken, and many governments institutionalize the innovations of the NGOs. Ultimately, both sides must work together. In a recent newsletter, the Public Affairs Centre in India noted, "it takes two hands to clap."

What common elements bind these initiatives together? A concept paper on social accountability prepared by the Participation and Civic Engagement Group of the World Bank<sup>5</sup> notes that social accountability encompasses an extremely broad array of actions that citizen can potentially take to hold government officials and bureaucrats accountable. These actions normally comprise several (and, ideally all) of the following building blocks: An intervening agency mobilizes around an entry point for addressing a priority problem. If poor health service delivery is the problem, the response may be to add more resources to the municipal budget. The next building block is to build an information/evidence base that will hold public officials to account. The needed data may take the form of budget commitments and expenditure records. The intervening group then goes public, rallying support and building coalitions. Finally the initiating group work to advocate and negotiate change, pushing for reforms in programs, policies, budgets and laws.

Taken together, this series of steps and phases can be viewed as an ascending stairway of social mobilization. These building blocks were found in the various mechanisms scanned across the region. However, the Asia stocktaking exercise found that perhaps rather than looking at key building blocks, a more precise image may be that of an advocacy chain: different groups complement each other's interventions in pursuit of a common cause. This point will be discussed later.

---

<sup>5</sup> Carmen Malena with Reiner Forster and Janmejay Singh. "Social Accountability: An Introduction to the Concept and Emerging Practice Participation and Civic Engagement Group of the World Bank, Social Development Papers, Paper No. 76, December 2004.

#### 4. CONTEXT AND DRIVING FORCES

Why is social accountability important? The initiatives in Asia arise from a mix of forces, conditions, and motivating factors. The main three are increased development effectiveness, improved governance, and empowerment. Accountability of public officials is the cornerstone of good government and a prerequisite for an effective democracy. Social accountability also contributes to increased development effectiveness through improved public service delivery and more informed policy design.<sup>6</sup> Social accountability initiatives can lead to empowerment, particularly of the poor. The initiatives can also be typed under financial, performance, and political/democratic accountability framework.<sup>7</sup>

##### **Increased Development Effectiveness.**

One key concern of groups that operate SAc mechanisms is the budget. The reality is that a policy direction is only as important as the resources committed to it. If no funds are reserved for it, an official objective is rendered meaningless. However, crafting the budget is not a mere academic exercise, for it is subject to the interplay of political pressures. Various stakeholders within the state maneuver to control and influence these funds. Hence, the groups promote budget advocacy and monitoring to encourage public spending that is transparent, pro-poor and socially responsive.

***Poverty Reduction and the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers.*** Countries designing their Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) use budgets to implement their priorities and programs. As such, budgets are examined more thoroughly by government and civic groups to ensure that they are indeed pro-poor. PRSP process and associated policy and program commitments have the *potential* to increase the pro-poor focus and accountability of policy-making and budgeting, through improved availability and use of information, and better incentives and processes. For example, Cambodia's PRSP<sup>8</sup> aimed to assess the contribution of the PRSP process to more accountable and pro-poor budgeting and the degree of implementation of PRSPs via the budget.

The spotlight becomes more glaring when governments have to struggle with fiscal difficulties and budget cuts. FITRA in Indonesia used provincial budget advocacy in support of public services, especially for poverty reduction. Action Aid Nepal has been examining the national budget partly due to the threat of cuts in social spending. In the Philippines, KALAHI-CIDSS is the state's flagship anti-poverty program, and it trains communities to formulate budgets for their own infrastructure projects.

***Ineffective Public Services.*** Many interventions sprouted in reaction to the poor and inadequate social services found in many cities as well as the lack of access to and feedback mechanisms for public services. For example in India, Delhi citizens used to resort to bribery to get access to public services. They formerly did not have mechanisms to complain to the city government. In Hyderabad, the public services were monopolies of the government, so there was a sense of complacency in the staff. In Maharashtra, agencies got away with inaccurate

---

<sup>6</sup> Carmen Malena with Reiner Forster and Janmejay Singh. "Social Accountability: An Introduction to the Concept and Emerging Practice Participation and Civic Engagement Group of the World Bank, Social Development Papers, Paper No. 76, December 2004.

<sup>7</sup> See Brinkerhoof.

<sup>8</sup> See Jeni Klugman and Rosa Alonso. Powerpoint: PRSP and Budget Links: Emerging Evidence from Case Studies, October 12, 2004.

performance reports because the public rarely read them. In Mumbai, activists recognized a problem of citizens' passivity.

The Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA) and the Foundation for Public Interest in Ahmedabad felt research should be conducted in the slum areas. Though India has a strong tradition of urban planning and analysis, the assessment of the performance of urban plans and service has received less attention. In addition, an explicit focus on municipal services is also rare in urban sector studies. Housing rights, access to land, sites-and-services, construction methods, cost and design are frequent topics of analysis but municipal services such as water, sanitation, street lights, and solid waste collection are often neglected. Yet it is these services that give real and qualitative meaning to tenure, finance, construction and other aspects of urban life for the poor. "Without water, no toilets. And no toilets, no investments in shelter," said a local resident of a slum.<sup>9</sup> Feedback on service performance is also rare, especially in a systematic manner, and it rarely comes from poor women who constitute 50 per cent of the municipal service users.

### **Improved Governance.**

*Pervasive Corruption.* The morass of corruption they find in their respective countries drives many civic groups in Asia. For example, Bangladesh has dynamic anti-corruption groups because the nation is deeply immersed in corruption. In her speech to the 18<sup>th</sup> session of Parliament, the Prime Minister voiced her despair at its sheer magnitude. She said that even the institutions created to fight corruption have turned corrupt.

Corruption often takes place at the clerical level. Agency employees use their discretion to slow down the release of papers, to deny licenses, and to impose arbitrary fees on citizens' transactions. That way they can solicit petty bribes. The city government of Seoul has thus set up a special website called "OPEN" to handle these transactions. Grease money no longer flows when the dealings are faceless and leave an electronic trail.

Corruption can be institutionalized among local officials, as in the case of Japan. Bribe taking by local government politicians prompted the creation of the Citizen Ombudsmen in the City of Sendai. The council launched a direct attack on Japan's construction industry, which has for many years exerted a powerful influence on politics. Such companies initiated bid-rigging scandals and donated millions of dollars to politicians' campaign chests.

Corruption can flow from the pork barrel of legislators, as in the case of the Philippines. In the rural sector, Congress members often reward the areas that supported them with infrastructure projects, and neglect the rest. This sort of spending undermines the objectives laid out in development plans. Shady legislators collude with the local public works officials of his/her province. The bidding is rigged to favor certain contractors. The members of Congress and the public works officials in turn get a cut of the deal. The Website of the Department of Budget and Management in the Philippines revealed the pork barrel of some legislators.

Corruption can weigh down a nation with problems of financial mismanagement, as has been the case of Nepal. A 2002 World Bank economic update for the country takes note of "poor budget implementation resulting from opacity of budget presentation and weaknesses in budget monitoring."

---

<sup>9</sup> "Assessing the Performance of Municipal Services for the Poor in Ahmedabad: The Report Card Project" By Mihir R. Bhatt, 1999 page 2.

***National Crisis.*** The context for some SAc groups was the outbreak of a crisis. In the Solomon Islands, which had been running report cards, the crisis was social unrest breaking out into insurgency. In fact the last report card showed the worst results in 15 years. The guerilla war was on its fourth year. Australia deployed an intervention force called the Regional Assistance Mission to the Solomon Islands (RAMSI) in mid-2003 to restore order. This was the third military intervention since independence in 1978.

In Nepal, a communist insurgency has gained strength in the rural areas since 1986. Since 1990, 11 governments have ruled the country. During this time the Cabinet was reshuffled 30 times. Polarization has characterized politics in Nepal, and in the legislature the main opposition party was the Communist Party until late 2002, when King Gyanendra had the Prime Minister suspend parliament due to unrest. The King consolidated his power thereafter. In this position, he has been promulgating the budget without oversight.

In Bangladesh, the school year began without available textbooks because the sole supplier failed to deliver them on time. Hence, 25 million students did not have textbooks for their high school classes. And the few books that were on hand were full of errors.

***Promotion of Democratic Values.*** The long-term trend points towards greater democracy, so civic groups have been encouraging democratic values among the people. For example, the Public Affairs Centre has been nurturing civic values among the youth through its collaboration with the NGO Swabhimana in Bangalore. They jointly formed a children's civic movement, which embarked on the survey of roads in the city.

PROOF, also in Bangalore, believes that "financial reporting standards are essential to the effective functioning of democracy." Hence, PROOF pursues transparency in the financial operations of the government, through a collaborative process, between the stakeholders of the city and its municipal corporation. The Centre for Social Development in Phnom Penh has been upholding democratic values in Cambodia. Its survey revealed that the youth were indifferent toward corruption. The Centre responded by pushing for an anti-corruption curriculum.

***Decentralization/ Devolution/ Empowering Local Governments.*** National governments have been devolving power to regional units, partly to avoid the clumsy processes of centralized planning. This process allows local officials to become more sensitive to district needs. Nations such as Bangladesh, India, Indonesia, Nepal, Pakistan, and the Philippines mandate decentralization by law. Governments employ social accountability mechanisms to improve local governance. For example, the Bangladesh Local Government Development Fund Project uses score cards to grade public services, participatory budgeting, holds community participatory planning and budgeting sessions, and makes information transparent via notice boards and complaint books. Citizens' Charters pushed by civic groups like Lok Satta (India) are adopted by local governments and their municipal corporations via resolutions and executive orders. CIET Pakistan has undertaken social audits together with the National Reconstruction Bureau, a government agency and the main architect of devolution.

But the transition is all too often fraught with difficulty. Local governments are constrained by little transparency, low capacity, bureaucratic control, political interference, limited authority, the lack of accountability of service providers to them, and weak financial resources. Citizens must also contend with the confusion of roles. This comment comes from an interview with Dr. Vinod Vyasulu, Director of the Centre for Budget and Policy Studies (CBPS):

Many of the problems of governance stem from a multiplicity of agencies-- for example, the city government does not deal with drinking water. There is separate agency for planning. The constitutional amendment creating local self governance--the term used in the law--through devolution of power has yet to be implemented.

Civic groups can articulate well the needs of local constituencies and hold local officials accountable. For example, since Indonesia has decentralized power has likely flowed to traditional interests at the local level. They use their power to maintain their control over community resources. Because they are traditional, they are not likely to hear women's voices and care for women's interests in public fora. The Koalisi Perempuan (Coalition for Women) thus undertakes to organize, train, and empower women to advocate their issues.

### **Empowerment.**

***Rights-based Development.*** Various social accountability mechanisms were created to defend neglected sectors. The obligation of government officials and bureaucrats to account to citizens derives from notions of citizen's rights, information rights and human rights. SAC offers mechanisms to monitor and protect these rights.<sup>10</sup> The concept of SAC underlines the right of citizens to expect and ensure that government acts in the best interests of the people.

In Nepal and in the Indian State of Andhra Pradesh, the NGOs focused on the lowest castes. In Maharashtra State, India, bonded labor – slavery – persisted in the Thane district despite the practice being banned by the Constitution, and laws provided for the release of bonded workers. The movement Samarthan arose to fight for the rights of the child laborers. The group noted that the bonded workers were being excluded from formal health and education services.

Some sectors were left out of the gains from globalization. The Indian State of Tamilnadu was considered one of the more urbanized and industrialized in India. However, the gains of development were unevenly distributed. Indicators of poverty, inequality, and rural-urban disparities showed that the low-caste *dalits*, indigenous peoples, fisherpeople, unorganized labor, and some social groups of women and children, hardly benefited from the state's development. In response, the Tamilnadu People's Forum for Social Development was established.

In Indonesia, the Bandung Institute of Governance Studies (BIGS) focused on the housing needs of women. Within the archipelago, around 4.4 million families did not own their houses. But housing the poor was not gender neutral. In general, slum areas had more women than men. Furthermore, while public housing was a public issue, culture assigned women to the "domestic space," not the public space. Put together, poor women were at the losing end in public housing.

In South Korea, officials hardly understood and recognized gender issues. There was no evaluation system for the implementation of women-related policies. The budget for women concerns accounted for only 0.003 percent of the general account. Women's Link of Korea therefore carried out a gender budget analysis of seven local governments. In the Marshall

---

<sup>10</sup> Simply disseminating information about entitlements or soliciting citizen feedback about public sector performance, for example, can facilitate the fulfillment of rights of access to information, food, housing, social security, education, freedom of association and speech, etc. Carmen Malena with Reiner Forster and Janmejay Singh. "Social Accountability: An Introduction to the Concept and Emerging Practice, Social Development Papers, Participation and Civic Engagement, Paper No. 76, December 2004.

Islands, the public expenditure project for women noted the following women issues: high rates of malnutrition, high dropout rates among schoolgirls, teen pregnancies, spousal abuse, and child abuse.

***Strong Civil Society Movements.*** The stocktaking exercise suggests that the leading countries in Asia for social accountability initiatives India and the Philippines. In India, Bangalore is known for the citizens report cards rolled out by the Public Affairs Centre. Among the latest offspring is the road survey by the Children's Movement for Civic Awareness, jointly spawned by PAC and the movement Swabhimana. Another example is the National Centre for Advocacy Studies. The NCAS has linked up with other budget groups to form People's BIAS, a network of Indian civil society groups working on budget issues. People's BIAS in turn has acted as the preparatory platform for the Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability (CBGA). In addition, Consumer Unity and Trust Society, CUTS. From its humble beginnings as a consumer protection group in 1983, CUTS has evolved into an international umbrella movement, integrating diverse areas of public interest.

The Philippines provides other examples of NGO multiplication. Many civic groups sprouted all over the country after the 1986 People Power Revolution. An association of election watchdogs, made up of NAMFREL volunteers in Abra province, has set up the Concerned Citizens of Abra for Good Government. These citizens clearly observe a need to monitor public expenditures. NAMFRE's national network has also been instrumental in the Textbook Count project. For its part, the global survey community respects Social Weather Stations (SWS) and its data has been well received by the media. As a result, there was pressure on the government which has recently been working to respond to the high incidence of hunger found by SWS. For its part, Procurement Watch has stressed that procurement corruption leaves a paper trail. Procurement activities can thus be documented and reviewed.

***Access to Information.*** Civic groups and governments have come to realize the value of information in their advocacy activities. Various States of India used citizen's charters to upgrade their public services. In Japan citizens came together to push for, and succeeded in establishing, a Right to Information Act. The Citizens Ombudsmen later used this. Social Weather Stations fought with members of Philippine Congress and the Judiciary for the right to publish survey information. The Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism specialized in digging up and publishing information on corruption. Transparency International-Bangladesh compiled information on corruption cases and would revive them for public attention.

The passage of the Delhi Right to Information Act of 2001 allowed citizens access to government files. In practice they were generally not informed about their rights under the law. To aid in promoting transparency and accountability, Parivartan thus enlightened the public on how to use the Information Act. However, politicians can undermine the right to information act. Activists in Goa, India, criticized the state's version of the act for draconian provisions in the law. They felt that the government's true intention was to intimidate the press.

***Information and Communication Technology.*** Putting fiscal information in the public domain via the Internet has begun to block opportunities for corrupt deals. Through e-procurement, government agencies could compare prices offered by various sellers, getting the contracts most advantageous for them. This was the innovation offered by South Korea and replicated across Asia. The website of the Philippines' budget department even publicized the names of blacklisted firms. A civic alliance from the same country uncovered corrupt arrangements via its website on pork barrel spending. Bangladesh made public all pertinent data

on infrastructure projects, a sector often prone to corruption. Seoul's OPEN website removed the element of discretion by making agency transactions faceless.

## 5. MECHANISMS AND APPLICATIONS

The following section lists the array of social accountability mechanisms seen in the stocktaking. Most of them will be grouped into the categories of: Budget Analysis and Advocacy, and Expenditure Tracking, and Performance Monitoring. However, new activities involving ICT have emerged broadens the categories of SAc mechanisms. At times there is some evidence of "mutation" among the mechanisms: they have been adapted to fit the local context. For example, the usual report card is a quantitative exercise, a survey. However, the report card of the Seventh Urban Resource Center in Sri Lanka was more qualitative as it encouraged broader participation of the poor though the taking photographs. All of these mechanisms work to enforce transparency.

### ***BUDGET ANALYSIS AND ADVOCACY***

In this category of SAc mechanisms, NGOs scrutinized budgets to find out to what extent fiscal allocations truly reflected government commitments. The interventions could be summarized under the theme of *prioritization*. Assessments looked into the impact of the budget on social priorities, particularly on pro-poor programs. The civic groups translated the raw numbers and technical analysis into lay language, feeding their reports to the public via the mass media. They also conducted seminars to raise popular awareness on the budget process and budget issues. Budget analysis interventions varied according to the issue being studied: spending priorities, total availability of resources, trends over time. They also varied according to the intended audience: communities, sectors, local governments, and entire states.

***State Budget Analysis.*** Budget groups in India often analyzed public spending at the state level. The Tamilnadu People's Forum for Social Development looked into the 1996-2000 budget priorities in the State of Tamilnadu in India. CUTS scrutinized the budget of the State of Rajasthan in India. It informed the state's citizens about how the funds allocated for them were unutilized at different government levels. People's BIAS analyzed the 2000 budget for the Indian State of Maharashtra, upon the request of the government. The report recommended doing away with budget secrecy, circulating vital documents before the presentation of the budget, and publishing subsidies.

***Provincial and Local Budget Analysis.*** For example, the devolution law in the Philippines provides for people's participation in Local Development Councils. The LDCs assist the local government Assemblies (at the village, municipality, city, and provincial levels) in setting the direction of economic and social development. They review the budgets of the local governments. At least one fourth of the LDC members must come from NGOs and people's organizations. LDCs are seen as the "natural bodies" through which government can consult the basic sectors.

***Sectoral Budget Analysis.*** DISHA began its budget advocacy by scrutinizing funding for the tribal population in Gujarat, India. The Centre for Budget and Policy Studies in Bangalore studied education expenditure at the district level in Karnataka state. The research was conducted with the cooperation of Karnataka's Department of Education. The project served as a model for how civil society groups could work with the government without compromising their

independence. Indonesia's BIGS analyzed the impact of housing policy and budgets on the poor in the slums. From the same country, the Koalisi Perempuan pursued budget advocacy for women's concerns. In the Marshall Islands, a joint government-civil society initiative was the project Gender and Youth Sensitive Public Expenditure Management. It looked into a particular problem among the women: teenage pregnancies.

***National Budget Analysis.*** The NGO Action Aid Nepal scrutinized the national budget passed by the King in July 2003 without a sitting parliament. Its estimate was that more than half of development expenditure would not be implemented because of the security situation. An example of national budget analysis for the whole India was that done by the Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability for the 2003-2004 budgets. The NGO concluded that the process was not satisfactory as regards: (a) civil society's participation, (b) transparency on the implications of the budget proposals on the different sectors, and (c) budget implementation.

***Budget Demystification*** Action Aid Nepal has been involved in training the media on the budget. The group's experience is that, due to the journalists' lack of specialized knowledge, its reports are not well presented. The Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability holds workshops at the national and regional levels to demystify the budget. Samarthan has done the same for the budget of the State of Maharashtra, India. It publishes a booklet explaining the budget in a simple and reader-friendly format. BIGS in Indonesia demystifies the provincial housing budget for the urban poor as well as for public and private housing providers.

### ***EXPENDITURE TRACKING***

Civic groups monitor how the government actually spends public funds. The particular focus is to look for *leakages* as the resources flow downstream. (Leakages point to system inefficiencies as well as corruption.) A common technique is to compare official documents, like disbursement and agency records with the data on actual delivery. For example, the contract specifies 450 textbooks for a public school, but the actual number received is 378. The discrepancies are then revealed to the concerned offices and to the public. This review has found a wider range of interventions than the various types of social audits. Civil society groups have fought for the right to information on public finance records. They scrutinize the public procurement process. They uncover corruption via in-depth media reports and by checking the inordinate lifestyles of public officials.

***Monitoring Procurement.*** Procurement Watch trains civil society organizations on the intricacies of procurement. It deploys observers, armed with checklists, to official bidding sessions. When anomalies are discovered, they are brought up to the superiors of erring agencies. Those who persist are reported to civil society watchdogs.

***Social Audits.*** Social audits involve the community by scrutinizing public projects and the amounts actually spent on them. The details of contracts are read during public hearings, in order to compare official sums with the reality on the ground. A leading exponent of this mechanism is the Mazdoor Kisan Shakti Sangathan (MKSS) of Rajasthan, India. Another group, Parivartan, has reviewed 68 public works in North East Delhi via hearings, and it has found that many roads exist only on paper.

PROOF in Bangalore has persuaded the city government to release quarterly public statements on financial performance. These statements compare revenues and expenditures with

the original budget estimates. In the Philippines, the NGO Concerned Citizens of Abra for Good Government monitors actual construction projects. Financial details are read aloud on its radio program. The NGO has forged ties with the Commission on Audit to conduct an audit on a local government. In Pakistan, the civic group CIET, and the National Reconstruction Bureau, a government agency, have conducted a social audit on health, education, water, and local government services.

***Right to Information Acts.*** Right to Information Acts are in place in Japan and in Indian states like Goa and Hyderabad. They often pertain to expenditure data for public projects. The Goa Right to Information Act guarantees that any citizen can apply in writing for “any information relating to the affairs of the state or any local authorities.” Once the application is received, agencies have 30 days to furnish, or refuse, the information. Citizens can photocopy entire files pertaining to government transactions. The law also provides a procedure for appeals against requests that have been denied. However, Goa’s version of the act has not proven to be very effective in promoting transparency.

***Sectoral Expenditure Tracking.*** The Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability in New Delhi looks at actual spending (as well as budgets) on specific government programs: health, education, drinking water, sanitation, and tribal welfare. In Japan, the Citizen Ombudsmen now covers 47 prefectures. It examines local government expenditures in particular. They began by probing politicians’ entertainment expenses. They then branched out into bids and accounts that appeared mysterious. The directors of the national liaison conference requested that all ombudsmen send them the materials received to make comparisons and create a national database.

***Community-Driven Development (CDD).*** These mechanisms combine participatory budgeting with close expenditure tracking by the community. KALAHI-CIDSS is the flagship anti-poverty program of the national government in the Philippines and is supported by the World Bank. The villages choose infrastructure projects to address their basic needs. They prepare formal budgets and proposals, and the best in the municipality wins the funding. Spending is closely monitored, for all the financial statements are posted on the village bulletin board and reported to the assembly. The Local Governance Development Fund project in Sirajganj, Bangladesh employs a wide range of tools. The people are involved through community gatherings and participatory planning and budgeting sessions. Expenditure is made transparent through information boards and complaint books. They get to know the details of costs, funds received, and responsible persons.

***Lifestyle Checks.*** Philippine law requires all public officials to file a statement of assets and liabilities every year. If the assets are way above what can be accounted for by salaries, savings from corporate income, marriage, or inheritance, they are subsequently investigated. Indicators include unexplained bank deposits, “manifestly excessive expenditures,” ostentatious displays of wealth, frequent travel abroad, and the like. Agents conduct lifestyle checks on officials by verifying statements of assets and liabilities. They follow this up with office and house visits.

***Investigative Reports.*** The Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism (PCIJ) specializes in the production of in-depth reports, often on corruption. It has published close to 200 articles in major Philippine dailies and magazines. It has released over a dozen books. The reports on graft and influence peddling in high places have shaken the political landscape. In many cases, these accounts have forced the government to act. PCIJ’s investigative reports go beyond high-

profile corruption cases. They also look into entrenched corrupt practices in key departments or branches of government.

***Database to Scan News.*** Transparency International Bangladesh (TIB) compiles news articles about corruption cases and aggregates them into a comprehensive report. The database is available on a website. It is a valuable research tool for investigative work in expenditure tracking. For example, in 2000 there were 846 news reports with figures on government losses due to corruption. The database is useful for follow-up research, for updates on ongoing corruption cases, and for keeping government officials on their toes. Stories that fade away in the public eye can be easily “revived.”

### ***PERFORMANCE MONITORING***

In this class of SAc tools and mechanism, NGOs or their client communities monitor and assess local projects, public services, or government programs. The common theme is ***impact*** and the groups use evaluation tools that sweep a host of indicators. The scale can be micro, as in community scorecards on district services, or macro, as in citizen report card surveys. Data obtained from these exercises are presented in workshops to the concerned authorities. They are also shared with the public via the mass media, unleashing pressure for reform. Performance monitoring requires setting standards and operationalizing them into indicators. Actual performance is measured against the template of indicators. This template examines welfare impacts as assessed by the people themselves. At times such interventions uncover hidden practices, new insights, and performance dimensions that should not have been omitted in the surveys.

***Deploying Project Monitors.*** Government Watch is a Filipino initiative to monitor the projects of public agencies. Volunteers deployed to the project sites fill out the matrix or monitoring tool. The “variance” is the deviation between the planned and actual results. The variance emerges along the dimensions of quantity (e.g. 45,000 textbooks were delivered instead of 56,000), quality (the highway is made of asphalt rather than the promised concrete) cost (the budget is overshot by 20 percent), or time (the road projects are delayed by 6 weeks).

***Tracking Textbook Delivery.*** This initiative was in response to textbook corruption and the resulting shortages in the Philippines. In the past, the ratio was 5 public school children sharing a single textbook. Civil society organizations monitored the terms of delivery and inspected the printing, binding and packaging of the textbooks in the warehouses. The groups then monitored the deliveries on-site. They looked into the condition of the delivered goods, and the accuracy of the book counts.

***Children’s Road Survey.*** To curb public works corruption, children holding checklists were sent to monitor the streets of Bangalore. The youth, aged 12 to 14 years old, were first briefed on the need to drain water from the roads to maintain their quality. The lecturers explained the various critical road dimensions: the efficacy of the drainage system, impediments to pedestrian and road safety, and the quality of the riding surface. The children were then sent to observe 300 meters of each road and to fill out their checklists. Some of the indicators were: presence of drains, evenness of the surface, whether or not the footpath was covered with slabs, number of potholes, and number of cracked areas.

***Citizens’ Charters.*** Indian civic groups like Praja and Lok Satta guide residents in writing a Citizens’ Charter for their municipalities. The charter spells out the responsibilities of

the local government. After much discussion and revision, the people then present the charter to the officials. They pressure the bureaucrats to approve the charter. Once ratified, the citizens commit themselves to monitor how the public services comply with the charter's standards. The groups hold regular meetings with the municipal corporations.

**Community Score Cards.** In the Gemi Diriya project of Sri Lanka, community scorecards reveal the criteria for evaluating the performance of village organizations. Their performance is then graded every month for 6 months. The organizations also evaluate themselves and present the findings to the village. Community scorecards are also used in the Maharashtra Rural Water Supply and Sanitation project in India. In the Local Governance Development Fund project of Bangladesh, scorecards are run annually to assess the performance of the unit of government known as the union *parishads*.

**Citizen Report Cards.** Initiated by the Public Affairs Centre in Bangalore, and now replicated around the world, report cards are surveys on social services that impact on the poor. This is a chance for the people to grade the agencies that provide these services. It helps uncover problem areas in service delivery. The dimensions probed include access to the service, quality, affordability, willingness to pay, coping mechanisms, staff behavior, efficiency, reliability, adequacy of supplies, and ultimately, user satisfaction. The report cards have been run for entire nations and states, often following the advice and training given by the PAC.

**Corruption Surveys .** Social Weather Stations in the Philippines, Transparency International Malaysia (TIM), and the Centre for Social Development in Cambodia, have run national surveys on corruption. The polls get data on people's first-hand experiences with fraud and identify which agencies are most prone to it. They quantify the frequency of bribery in relation to paying taxes, getting licenses and permits, transacting business with and collecting receivables from the government. The surveys obtain data on the percentages paid to acquire government contracts. Corruption surveys can also be localized, as in the case of the TIM poll for the local council of Selayang Baru.

**Integrity Pacts.** This project of Transparency International Nepal (TIN) comes from the Bhaktapur region. An Integrity Pact is a contract or agreement from the local government to adopt a package of measures put forward by TIN. Public officials and employees pledge to implement the "integrity system:" no bribe-taking, simple and transparent decision making, realistic construction budgets, openness and responsiveness to complaints by citizens. Procurement procedures and guidelines are delineated, and a system for the redress of grievances is installed. A monitoring committee is set up, which includes a representative of TI Nepal.

**Citizen Juries.** Performance monitoring here critically reviews policy. Residents are selected to study an issue that will greatly affect their community. They are given information on the topic. They listen to talks, watch videos, and study the readings. They interrogate the specialists on the subject matter and deliberate on its many angles. Finally, they render their verdict on the issue to the community, the authorities, and the media. In Andhra Pradesh, India, the citizen jury deliberated over the future of the state's food system in the light of the official plan, Vision 2020. The group threshed out its implications on livelihood security, biodiversity, and the foundations of the local economy.

## **INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATIONS TECHNOLOGY**

Interventions using information and communications technology promote accountability by opening official data to the public glare. As put by one Korean administration, “sunshine is the best disinfectant.” Uniting these instruments produces the common theme of *disclosure*. These become part of the public domain: state budgets and actual expenditures, procurement and official purchases, infrastructure projects and the sums allocated for them, and the names behind government transactions. One website features a long roster of blacklisted contractors. State portals computerize agency transactions, removing the element of staff discretion, widely regarded as an occasion for bribery. Cell phone networks are not part of the internet, but they belong to the class of ICT tools. Because of the popularity in Asia of short message services (SMS or text messages), mobiles are useful for harvesting reports on acts of petty corruption. They can be instrumental in name-and-shame campaigns. Displaying the same creativity found in many ICT business innovations, this category is spawning many mechanisms.

***Agency Transactions.*** Seoul’s Online Procedures Enhancement for Civil Applications (OPEN) is a website that shows the status of applications made to the 54 agencies most vulnerable to corruption. It reveals “the contents of the application, approval time of the application, administrative procedures, names of the officials assigned to the applications, and their contact numbers.” The electronic trail easily suppresses the impulse to commit fraud.

In India, each e-seva computerized kiosk can handle more than 100 services, ranging from getting birth certificates, to paying examination fees, to buying tickets to cultural events. Utility areas served by the e-seva are many, such as electricity, municipal corporations, transport, hospitals, water supply and railways. By digitalizing transactions, the government eliminates layers of middlemen, which reduces tendencies toward corruption.

***E-procurement.*** E-procurement is also pioneered by South Korea through the government’s website, GePS. The law requires more than 25,000 public organizations to list their bidding information on GePS. The system pre-qualifies suppliers and standardizes product information. The public can compare the prices offered by different suppliers. Private bidders cannot collude with each other because all the bids are disclosed online. For the same reason, government procurement officers cannot delay the placing of orders.

***Blacklists.*** In the Philippines, the Department of Budget and Management (DBM) posts the names of blacklisted contractors on its website. A banner flies through the site inviting visitors to click on the blacklist -- the roster even runs up to 7 pages. It shows which companies have had their licenses suspended, revoked, or denied.

***Pork Barrel Spending.*** Another website by the Filipino civil society alliance Transparent and Accountable Governance (TAG), particularly its Congress Watch section, monitors pork barrel spending by legislators. The site reprints in-depth articles on pork barrel that explain cases of blatant anomalies.

***Public Works Projects.*** The website of the Roads and Highways Department (RHD) of Bangladesh contains much information on infrastructure projects: road and bridge data, names of personnel, financial project information, the contractor database, the tender database, and the document database. It also includes audit reports. Every month the site updates financial and physical information on all of the department’s infrastructure projects.

***SMS Database.*** A recent innovation, this mechanism takes advantage of the popularity of short message services, SMS or text messages, in the Philippines. The intervention is aimed to

contain acts of petty corruption by civil servants. Using their cell phones, people can report graft as it occurs and yet remain anonymous. For example, when a clerk at city hall asks for bribes, the citizen quietly sends a text message to the hotline number of the Office of the Ombudsman. When the names of the same offenders keep appearing on the database, the claims are investigated.

## 6. INCLUSION

Civic groups running SAC mechanisms want their interventions to be as inclusive as possible; they wish to involve the poor and their constituent communities in the whole research process. However, the complexity of the information processed and lack of education among the poor sometimes limits their involvement. This constraint is reflected in this interview comment of Dr. Vinod Vyasulu of the CBPS: “The poor are not involved. We have tried to include slum dwellers associations, but this has not been successful.... We are trying to build their capacity in this regard.”

The review of Asia-Pacific SAC initiatives has found that inclusion can vary according to these four degrees: (i) the general public is involved; (ii) the public can get involved via the Internet; (iii) the poor get involved after they are organized and trained; and (iv) few are involved because the interventions require specialized knowledge.

***Open to the general public.*** Surveys involve the general public because each adult resident has an equal chance of being included in the representative sample. As long as the selection process is random, the standard 1,200 respondents can speak for the whole nation. Social accountability mechanisms in this category often take the form of citizen’s report cards. The stocktaking has gathered report card findings across the continent: e.g. Ahmedabad and Hyderabad in India, Bharatpur in Nepal, Colombo in Sri Lanka, 9 cities of Metro Manila in the Philippines, and a national poll for the Solomon Islands.

A Right to Information Act is open to all citizens, in theory. In Goa, India, the law does not promote a culture of automatic information disclosure. Rather, it leads to the grudging release of information in response to individual petitions. Since the passage of the act, only a few civil society groups, such as the All-Goa Citizens’ Committee for Social Justice and Action, have extensively exercised their information rights.

Direct feedback mechanisms may be considered open to the public as well. Transparency International Malaysia runs a toll-free “corruption hotline.” The Seoul Mayor receives postage-free post cards on corruption complaints. A new feedback instrument in the Philippines is the text message database of the Office of the Ombudsman.

***Inclusion via the Internet.*** Such interventions are open to the public, as they can be accessed by anyone with an Internet connection. General services are provided by India’s e-seva and South Korea’s OPEN facility. Groups that want to monitor public spending can check various e-procurement sites in Asia, the pork barrel site in the Philippines, and the highway department site in Bangladesh.

However, digital divide issues can limit inclusion. For example in Bangladesh, little has been done to popularize downloading public information from the Internet. This is due to formidable obstacles. Few citizens of Bangladesh can read English. Computer use is not popular in its culture, as PCs are viewed as tools of the elite and irrelevant for daily life. In government

offices, computers are lacking and are sometimes seen as little more than glorified typewriters. Only a tiny fraction has access to the Internet: approximately 0.04% of the population, according to one study.

***Organization and Training the Poor.*** Fortunately there are many examples of these mechanisms that do the most to empower the poor. One recalls that the Public Affairs Centre trained youth from 12-14 years old to undertake a road survey in Bangalore. Parivartan taught the residents of Sundernagari and New Seemapuri how to hold public hearings. The people closely monitored the civil works in their blocks, demanding redress when discrepancies were seen. CCAGG mobilized the people of Abra province, Philippines, to monitor their own infrastructure projects.

In Indonesia, members of the Koalisi Perempuan got basic training on the budget in their civic modules. FITRA, for its part, pulled in the basic sectors to its hearings on the provincial budgets. The Marshall Islands Gender Budget project mobilized women groups through the NGO umbrella alliance Women United in the Marshall Islands. CUTS in India worked with grassroots social action groups through training workshops. The latter in turn relayed the information to the communities through traditional meetings of the village.

The KALAHY project in the Philippines is very inclusive, as it is designed to involve the entire village. The target for community participation is that 80% of all village households attend the assemblies. In some cases, the ratio has reached 98%. This exercise is creating a cadre of leaders who will total some 50,000 by KALAHY's end. They will be equipped with the skills to prepare project proposals and to demand the projects from their local politicians.

Another training-intensive case is the Sirajganj Local Government Development Fund in Bangladesh. The emphasis is for the poor to participate in decision-making. They participate in the committees, meetings, and planning sessions. They implement, operate, monitor, and maintain the projects. The venture promotes learning-by-doing.

Lok Satta has embarked on a 3-year program for training 100,000 citizens in Andhra Pradesh, India, aiming to teach them the techniques of collective assertion. The program, launched in late 2001 is scheduled to end in December 2004. So far nearly 53,000 citizens have been trained.

The Citizen's Jury in Andhra Pradesh has organized many training for the marginalized classes and castes. This comment comes from a member of the Oversight Panel, Paul Ter Weil:

What was most interesting was the fact that farmers, on the basis of their knowledge, wisdom and feelings, rather quickly understood what they are dealing with. . . . What amazed me indeed was that they immediately knew whether what was being told to them was nonsense or propaganda or whether it had some meaning.

***Specialized Interventions.*** These mechanisms are hardly inclusive due to their technical skill requirements. For example, a Citizen Ombudsman is a lawyer with special training in probing through expense accounts. The members of Procurement Watch have mastered the labyrinth of the procurement process. The Public Accounts Committee consists of legislators who comb through the government's financial statements. Agents deployed to conduct lifestyle checks know how to read between the lines of asset statements. The top-tier analysts of the budget groups have specialized in fiscal scrutiny. Investigative journalists almost always have finished graduate school.

## 8. ADVOCACY

The civic groups reach out to the universities, often by publishing their findings. For example, BIGS in Indonesia has released a book on its evaluation of the gender sensitivity of Bandung's municipal housing budget. Social Weather Stations shares its survey data via compact disks. Institutes like the Colombo Centre for Policy Alternatives disclose their research via the Internet.

However, the communications literature speaks of "intellectual dynasties" – scholars write reports that are read only by succeeding generations of scholars. If SAc mechanisms are to be effective, these dynasties should be broken: findings from social research should be read by the broad sectors of society. A common pattern seen in the Asia-Pacific stocktaking is that the findings from the initiatives are disseminated to their constituencies and the general public.

***Internal Newsletters and Guide Books.*** Movements must first inform their members through their own publications. The newsletter of CUTS is called *The 5<sup>th</sup> Estate* that highlights governance issues and CUTS projects. Its target audience is civil society. There is a bilingual as well as an electronic version sent internationally. Another is *Letter for You*, a monthly newsletter: it informs its readers about NGO activities, government accountability issues, and the consumer movement. *Village Revolution* is a monthly wall newspaper for the rural areas. It focuses on peoples' rights and programs that affect the residents. Non-literate citizens are still able to receive the information through "the mouths of others."

There are political guidebooks and primers. The Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability in New Delhi tries to simplify the budget by developing reference guides and training manuals. Samarathan does likewise by publishing a reader-friendly booklet. Indonesia's Koalisi Perempuan produces modules on political education and transformative leadership.

***Press Releases.*** The findings from social accountability initiatives are shared with the public at large, via the mass media. For example, broadsheets and broadcasters are always instrumental in disseminating the survey results of Social Weather Stations. Its press releases most often make the front page and the evening news telecasts. SWS e-mails an alert to the tri-media, inviting them to visit its website. The site contains the full press release including data and charts.

But are these releases on fiscal research newsworthy? When asked if their findings get much coverage in the media, the Centre for Budget and Policy Studies has replied, "Not well at all. Occasionally someone asks a specific question, but budget analysis per se does not seem to interest them. They would like newsworthy stuff--corruption, I'm afraid."

That stands in contrast with the avid response to releases by Transparency International Bangladesh. Most newspapers write their lead stories on the findings, and private TV channels telecast the events. The BBC Bengali service regularly broadcasts the news on issues researched by TIB. The same interest is seen in citizen juries. Because they capture the drama found in legal court battles, they get much media attention in both India and the United Kingdom. The children's road survey has caught the media's eye as well. Children putting pressure on high local officials make for much drama. The general lesson, it seems, is that putting names and faces behind the numbers can make the reports interesting.

**Radio and Television Programs.** PROOF hosts “Puttana on Air,” a weekly radio program in the Kannada language. Discussions cover many of the concerns of the citizens of Bangalore – the finances of the local government, ward-problems, environment, health, sanitation, etc. Another example comes from the Concerned Citizens of Abra for Good Government. “Echoes” is CCAGG’s Sunday primetime radio program. Once CCAGG receives the list of projects implemented in Abra, it goes on the air to disseminate the details, such as costs, the agency running the project, and the manner of implementation.

Lok Satta produces 2-3 minute videos that detail its concerns regarding each public service. They are called Public Broadcasting Capsules. The Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism has produced five full-length documentaries that are broadcast on television.

**Engaging Government.** A critical part of advocacy is to bring the findings to the concerned officials and to negotiate for change. In India the results of the Children’s Road Survey have been presented to the Bangalore Municipal Commissioner at a public function. Praja conducts Citizen-Municipality workshops to get the support of the staff that delivers the public services. And CUTS meets members of the Rajasthan Assembly, ministers, and secretaries of various departments.

In South Korea the results of the gender budget analysis were delivered to the government and presented at a forum organized by the official Korea Women’s Development Institute. The Ministry of Gender Equality, heads of local governments, members of local assemblies, and female members of the national legislature all received copies of the results. In Indonesia, the Koalisi Perempuan submitted its blueprint for the National Plan of Action to the Ministry of Women Empowerment. It drafted proposals and lobbied for amendments to the 1945 Constitution. The coalition wrote position papers on maternity rights, on affirmative action for women, and on anti-trafficking measures.

The Center for Social Development organized the Coalition for Transparency-Cambodia (CTC) in 2002. Its major concern was the passage of the Anti-Corruption Law. The group lobbied with the King, the Prime Minister, the President and members of the Senate and the National Assembly.

At times groups take to the streets to add to the pressure on government. For example, Samarthan of Maharashtra pressed for an increase in the budget for education. It led 5,000 people in protesting outside a State House. They carried a huge begging bowl and asked passersby to contribute to the State coffers for education. This embarrassed the chief minister who appointed a task force to study the problem.

## **9. IMPACT OF THE INTERVENTIONS**

**Social problems exposed.** The State government of Maharashtra, India, once denied the existence of bonded labor. A recent performance budget claimed that there were no slaves in the state since 1992. But Samarthan presented another document that showed that over 300 bonded laborers were rehabilitated in one district alone. The press reported the inconsistency, forcing the minister to present the true picture.

One year after the Goa Right to Information Act was passed, individuals seeking the release of information filed 400 applications. The information sought ranged from potentially

illegal construction, to business taxes paid by those known to be favored by the government. However, the petitions filed so far could not yet be called a serious campaign against corruption affecting the poor.

Transparency International Bangladesh analyzed 11 reports per day in 2000 for its News Scan Database. The law-implementing agencies were found to be the most corrupt, accounting for 320 reports out of the total 1,948. However, official action taken against these cases was not satisfactory. In fact the official anticorruption bureau dealt with only 5% of the cases.

***Public opinion was inflamed.*** The information released by Parivartan social audits enraged the local residents. They demanded a platform to air their grievances, even amid threats and risks to their safety. The momentum for action was overwhelming: even efforts by the government to disrupt the social audits were overrun by the people.

FITRA's reports on politicians' fund use stirred up public anger. The network found that the governor of Jakarta and his councilors would get additional allowances of 44 billion rupiahs a year. The money, it was found, would be taken from funds for these agencies: Education, Social Affairs, and Youth. The FITRA reports forced the governor of Jakarta to cut his allowances by 40 percent. The Jakarta Post (January 31, 2003) used strong language in its commentary:

It would appear that the governor, the deputy-governor and councilors are in the happy position of being able to enjoy their good fortune without any obligation to account to the public...The Indonesian Forum for Budget Transparency (FITRA), which revealed the extra allocations for the governor and the councilors, said the money was part of a conspiracy among the city's political elite to hoodwink the public.

A corruption case in 2000 involved the Royal Nepal Airlines Corp. The Public Accounts Committee probed the case and reported grave corruption and irregularities, implicating the Minister for Tourism and Civil Aviation. Opposition parties disrupted parliamentary sessions for 57 days, and yet no action was taken. The opposition mobilized its followers for a general strike that lasted three violent days. The constitutional body responsible for investigating corruption concurred with the PAC's findings, and the Tourism Minister was arrested.

***Corruption Prosecuted.*** In the Philippines alone there are three cases that have gone to trial. Government audit teams investigated the Abra watchdogs' earliest complaints and filed administrative cases against 11 public works engineers. Politicians tried to step in and intervene on their behalf. But other community service organizations supported the cause while the cases were in court. Eventually, the accused were found guilty.

The lifestyle checks netted the anti-corruption agencies high-ranking officials, including a general, an undersecretary and an assistant secretary of the public works department. Several officials of the Bureau of Customs and the Bureau of Internal Revenue were also fired and charged in court. Some 600 cases of corruption were filed against presidential appointees.

In July to October 2000, the Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism released three reports on President Joseph Estrada's unexplained wealth and the mansions he was building for his mistresses. The reports on the President's mansions became part of the impeachment suit filed against him later in the year. He was overthrown in the second People Power revolution of January 2001.

***Increased Transparency.*** As a result of the Net portal, procurement in South Korea has become much more competitive. Today there are 87,000 suppliers registered on the site and around 1.2 million people participate in e-bidding every month. Procurement is now transparent: it has eliminated face-to-face contact, an opportunity for graft. The various agencies can check each other on the awarding of bids. The OPEN website of the Seoul city government has reduced the perception of corruption amongst citizens. According to a Gallup Korea poll, 84% of Seoul inhabitants believe OPEN is effectively slashing graft.

CCAGG's monitoring activities have subdued the systemic corruption in Abra province, Philippines. A radio program, which exposes corruption, is one of its most effective tools. Government officials have become "quite cautious" as regards their actions, or they might end up "CCAGGed" (i.e. the new slang term for having one's anomalies exposed on the air).

In India surveys of the Centre for Media Studies showed a remarkable drop in corruption over 2000-2003 because of the e-seva centers. The use of middlemen was cut to 28% in 2003 from 48% in 2000. The fall was particularly sharp in Hyderabad, where e-seva centers were most widespread: the presence of corrupt middlemen plunged to 27% from 63%. Nationally, the bribery is down to 30% from 51%.

***Use of Finding.*** Social Weather Stations findings on corruption are used in designing the programs of the TAG civil society coalition, as well as those of official anti-corruption bodies. The agencies revealed as the most corrupt are coming under increasing fire. Congress is considering a bill to purge the Bureau of Internal Revenue and replace it with a newly established National Revenue Authority.

In response to its survey data on youth indifference to corruption, Cambodia's Centre for Social Development (CSD) campaigned to introduce anti-corruption education into the curriculum. A Transparency Task Force was formed in 1999. It developed the needed instructional materials, and integrated them into the national training program for teachers. The Ministry of Education began revising textbooks in 2002 to integrate the material produced by the task force.

The data generated by the SEWA Report Card of Ahmedabad, India, were employed on many levels. SEWA used it for its own organizational work. The SEWA Bank mined it for its financial planning. The Ahmedabad Municipal Corporation applied it for its international proposals. The Foundation for Public Interest utilized it to expand its own work in the urban sector.

***Policy and Law Changes.*** Procurement Watch helped draft and shepherd the new procurement law signed in January 2003. It covered the procurement process for the national government, local governments and even state-owned and controlled corporations. It swept through infrastructure, the hiring of consultants, and the purchase of government supplies.

This year Transparency International Bangladesh released a diagnostic study on the police. The parliamentary standing committee on police thus decided to implement at least ten recommendations proposed by TIB. In Cambodia, the Council of Ministers adopted a draft anti-corruption bill incorporating 80% of the version prepared by a working group that included the Centre for Social Development.

Because of Parivartan's public hearings, the Delhi administration has taken several corrective steps. On each public works site, a board now displays all pertinent information. A list of all completed works within the last quarter is prominently displayed on the notice boards of all division offices. The copies of contracts for all ongoing works are displayed on the walls of the local municipal corporation branch. The Chief Secretary has issued orders that all Delhi government departments should conduct public hearings on their own initiative.

***Financial Gains.*** Because of transparency, competition, and efficiency gains due to Korea's e-procurement, the savings amount to an estimated \$2.5 billion in annual procurement costs. This compares with the \$26 million investment used to set up the system.

In the Philippines, the Department of Budget and Management observes that prices in the e-marketplace are lower by at least 40%, as marketing and distribution costs are avoided. Due to reforms in its procurement process in 2001, the Department of Education reports that their textbook prices are down by as much as 65%. Savings in textbooks alone can allow for the purchase of an additional 11-16 million textbooks.

Because Lok Satta in India has organized citizens to monitor petrol bunks, short-selling has effectively stopped in all the 1,500 gasoline stations of Andhra Pradesh. In many cities the personnel at the property registration offices have been forced to refund the bribes they collected.

***Efficient Public services.*** Surveys run in municipalities covered by Nepal's Integrity Pacts show increased public satisfaction with service delivery. Because of Lok Satta's work, Citizen's Charters that apply to more than 50 municipalities in Andhra Pradesh rated four services excellent. For the first time, the citizens get compensation for each day's delay in these services.

Procurement in South Korea formerly involved a large staff, enormous amounts of paper, and many trips to government agencies. Firms seeking government business scanned newspaper ads and registered with the various agencies. Today, e-procurement has slashed much red tape. Before e-procurement, payment for goods took all of 14 days. Today the payment is done in just 4 hours.

The impact of the Seoul's OPEN system is supported by research presented in December 2001 by a team from Korea University. Of those polled, 74% replied that the OPEN system cut processing time, 86% said that application became easier, and 62% cited improved accuracy of applications. There is anecdotal support for the cut in visits and phone calls. Business Week's June 25, 2001 issue reports the story of architect Kim Hong Sik, who applies for dozens of building permits annually. According to Kim, OPEN shortened the processing time by about 30%. "One of my employees used to spend days finding out the status of our applications," Kim says. "Now all you need to do is to click on your PC."

***Welfare Gains.*** The Pandits, the founders of Samarthan, have done much to free bonded labor in the Thane district in Maharashtra, India. Budget analysis is used to support this effort in order to ensure sufficient funds for law enforcement. Such activism has led to the release of some 1,500 slaves.

The children's road survey graphically captured the deficient quality of public works in Bangalore. The Municipal Commissioner told his officials to take immediate steps to upgrade the roads covered in the research. Because of these measures, there was indeed a visible change in road maintenance in Bangalore. Filled-in potholes were an observable improvement.

The Andhra Pradesh state government responded to Lok Satta's pressure by launching a large program of household toilets. Workers installed more than one million toilets in 2 years.

As of April 2004, KALAHÍ has reached out to 78 municipalities in 33 provinces. The favorite projects built by the villages are: water supply systems, roads, day care centers, multi-purpose buildings, health centers, and schools. Various testimonies from the villagers have been printed in the main newspapers.

## 10. PROBLEMS AND CHALLENGES

*At times, politicians ignored the findings.* The entire mobilization effort would fail if the decision-makers did not act upon calls for reform. In Indonesia, legislators would be invited to the public discussions organized by FITRA, but they rarely came. Parliament was not responsive towards the proposed budget changes. In the Philippines, Social Weather Stations was respected for its academic objectivity. But SWS findings would be habitually attacked or dismissed by politicians and agencies that got low ratings. In Sri Lanka there were no significant policy changes that arose due to the Colombo Report Card. However, this was attributed to a lack of advocacy.

Given the charged political atmosphere in Nepal, the administration was seen to regard reports by the Public Accounts Committee as political attacks. At times it ignored the reports, while followers of the opposition replied by taking to the streets. National Peoples' Front (NPF) lawmaker Pari Thapa said, "We already have enough commission reports gathering dust...If only the government would dare to implement them." United People's Front (UPF) lawmaker, Lilamani Pokharel added, "Nothing is going to happen unless the government looks back at the past reports and implements them."

*The state conceded mere token change.* Governments could yield to the letter of the reform law but not to its spirit. In some provinces of the Philippines, NGOs felt that participation in local development councils began and ended with accreditation. On the part of the local governments, they tended to limit NGO participation to merely inviting them to meetings without seriously considering their proposals. A study of 300 local governments was conducted by the civil society alliance CODE-NGO. It found that at least a fourth of the local governments designated who were to be the NGO representatives to the councils. Then research by the civic group PhilDHRRA noted that NGOs perceived their participation in LDCs to be mere tokenism.

In Goa, India, tokenism was said to have masked other intentions. The government introduced a right-to-information bill in 1997 that surprised activists and the media. As mentioned earlier, the bill contained draconian clauses that had no bearing on accountability. One provision specified fines for people who utilized such information for "malafide purposes." Activists believed that this clause was really meant to intimidate the press.

*The bureaucracy resisted the reforms.* Change proved to be threatening to bureaucracies, prompting certain offices to oppose the accountability mechanisms. When Transparency International Bangladesh released its reports, the concerned institutions or ministries tended to criticize it. They managed to get their allies to write in the newspapers against the corruption watchdog. TIB would respond by maintaining a period of silence, and then meeting its critics. In India, Parivartan complained that not much action was taken on certain acts

of corruption it exposed. In the Philippines, the leadership of the Commission on Audit initially did not take well to CCAGG's participatory audit. They resisted the move to involve civil society in a function that required accounting expertise. (However, the success of the project challenged the established mindsets.) Neither did the community-driven development project KALAHÍ find a ready audience. It was argued that KALAHÍ was too community-based and did not take advantage of economies of scale. Hence, the nation's economic planning authority initially shot it down. But lobbying by the social welfare department turned the tide.

More interesting was the bureaucracy's resistance to e-procurement in the Philippines. Some Procurement Service employees feared job cuts as a result of computerization. The agencies were also reluctant to give up control of their procurement authority. They were assured that e-procurement was meant primarily to disseminate information; they would still handle the evaluation of bids. Further, the system was pilot-tested during the time when President Joseph Estrada was facing impeachment charges. The prospect of his removal threatened the tenure of his budget secretary and the head of procurement.

***Access to government data was restricted.*** Governments recognized the power of information in the hands of their citizens, so some were hesitant to share their data. Officials in South Korea were often not willing to cooperate with civil society groups undertaking budget analysis and were unresponsive to public requests for information. As a result, WomenLink collected information through unofficial routes. Action Aid Nepal faced the same bottleneck in getting data on local budgets. Hence, the organizations assigned to do such budget work were linked up with those based in Kathmandu to facilitate a smoother exchange of information. In the Philippines, some public officials feared that the results from the report card on 9 cities would be used against them, so this led to delays in data gathering.

In India, resistance towards sharing government data was seen even in states with right to information laws. As put by Vinod Vyasulu of CBPS, "The main problem has been the lack of proper records in various local government offices, and in getting access. The new Right to Information law has not really made a difference in this regard. We have to spend lots of time in getting data. We deal with it by visiting officers often and with persistence."

Parivartan observed that despite the law, no action was taken against officers who refused to provide timely or accurate information. The process of obtaining and inspecting records was not well explained. Fees charged to obtain information were quite high. For its part, CUTS noted that the process was hampered by delays. The task of collecting all the necessary data also ate up a lot of government staff time. The constant turnover of government officials caused more postponements.

***Civic groups were constrained in capacity, resources, and time.*** Civil society work in Cambodia was still in its budding stages because democracy was relatively new. The country still had to fill its lack of professionals, a legacy of the Khmer Rouge era. In the Philippines, there was little funding support to assist the NGOs to enable them to effectively participate in the local development councils. The issue of lack of funds had been strongly articulated at the level of the municipalities. The groups that took part in local development councils did not have the skills and technical expertise needed to fulfill their mandate. Similarly, the lack of funds had impaired report card projects in the Philippines.

In India the CBGA was still at the building stage, going through the bottlenecks associated with the transition process. It was short-staffed, with only five people. Another movement, CUTS, noted the lack of capacity among its grassroots groups. At times,

responsibilities between CUTS and the selected partner organizations were not clearly delineated. For the Marshall Islands gender project, the constraint was the one-year time frame. It was adequate for the first goal of raising awareness but too short to have an impact on changing the budget itself.

**ICT Infrastructure.** ICT social accountability mechanisms are not used when nations do not invest enough in telecommunications. Bangladesh had a website on infrastructure projects, but little had been done to popularize getting government information from the Internet. This was due to formidable digital divide obstacles. As was mentioned earlier, few citizens of Bangladesh could read English. Only a tiny fraction had access to the Internet -- fixed telephone penetration was 0.34%; mobile penetration: 0.14%; PC penetration: 0.09%; Internet penetration: 0.04%. E-procurement was slow to catch on in the Philippines as well. One factor was the lack of resources among the different agencies for full computerization. Only a fourth of the agencies that got training on e-procurement were ready for it. Another obstacle was low Internet penetration: a 1999 survey revealed that only eight percent of Filipinos were into the Internet, largely due to the lack of telecommunications infrastructure.

## 10. INSTITUTIONALIZING THE MECHANISMS

***The interventions have been regularly repeated, enhanced, and expanded.*** Six report card surveys in the Solomon Islands were run over a span of 15 years. Each survey evaluates the performance of the party in power. This indicates a high degree of institutionalization, for the survey has survived six governments.

In Ahmedabad, SEWA conducts its report card project on an annual basis. In Andhra Pradesh, Lok Satta's Citizens' Charters are now an integral part of the social fabric of the state. The Children's Movement for Civic Awareness not only thrives; it is expanding to 60 schools in Bangalore. In Pakistan, CIET's pilot has led to a five-year annual social audit.

After the Bhaktapur experience, Transparency International Nepal enhanced the Integrity Pact. It issued public notices of activities and got signed integrity pledges from district committee members. It secured no-bribe-making pledges from suppliers, and it delineated procurement guidelines. TI Nepal installed a grievance redress system and formed a monitoring committee.

***The interventions have been replicated by other NGOs.*** Korean NGOs have backed up Seoul's OPEN initiative. Since 2000, Transparency International Korea has monitored OPEN through surveys to provide a third party view of the system. The OPEN system is also gaining recognition from academe worldwide – the 62nd Annual Conference of the American Society for Public Administration (March 2001) selected the OPEN system as a success case.

Since the citizen ombudsmen of Sendai, Japan came from the national elite, they were quick in forming partnerships with the members of civil society. Different NGOs took part in the campaign for information disclosure. Fully 47 prefectures have installed the mechanism.

Bhaktapur's Integrity Pact has caught on in Nepal and in the wider Transparency International community. The following is taken from the December 31, 2002 Status Report of Transparency International:

Apparently, the impact of the Integrity Pact became so well known throughout Nepal that many other communities requested information, leading to a set of regional workshops in all five Regions of the country, each with more than 100 participants from the public and private sectors.

***Governments have internalized the interventions.*** The state government of Karnataka has accorded CBPS active participation in formulating policy. Its studies on budget analyses have been used as a reference for newly elected government officials. In Mumbai, the municipal corporation has accepted Praja's Citizens' Charter initiative and has responded very positively to it. It holds workshops on the charters for municipal staff. Because of Parivartan's example, Delhi government agencies are running social audits.

Almost all government departments have been clients of Social Weather Stations. They present to the survey firm some questions that reflect their interests. SWS refines the questions and brings them on board for the polls. As an SWS tradition, the first person to be briefed on the survey results is the President of the Philippines.

Indonesia's Koalisi Perempuan has established a Caucus of Parliamentarian Women at the national level. The coalition has installed itself in the policy-making body of the Ministry for Women Empowerment. Because of DAWN's path breaking work, Bacolod city now has a focal point for gender and development (GAD) concerns. This is a council consisting of GAD champions from the departments and from civil society; it handles GAD planning.

## **11. SECTORAL ANALYSIS**

Different actors are involved in the sweeping menu of social accountability mechanisms. Communities are empowered to wield the interventions in their areas through their own people's organizations. These groups may take the form of local associations, cooperatives, or village project teams. Then there are the non-government organizations whose efforts touch a network of communities. Their clientele are broad sectors spread over an entire nation. They may include civic groups of accountants, survey professionals, and media watchdogs. Finally, governments themselves set up social accountability mechanisms. They create the social conditions for the free flow of information and promote transparency in their dealings. They also store and organize data generated from the bureaucracy.

The following table classifies the mechanisms according to their main sector actors. It reviews what broad activities each sector does best. As shown below, people's organizations gather community data, NGOs independently process and analyze social data, and governments put public sector data in the public domain. The interventions require special resources in the form of community organizers, trained professionals, and stacks of data. Possible implications for the World Bank are offered in the final column.

<b>Sectors and their Interventions</b>	<b>Comparative Advantage of Each Sector</b>	<b>Resource Requirements</b>	<b>Implications for the World Bank</b>
<p>PEOPLE'S ORGANIZATIONS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Social audits</li> <li>- Village score cards</li> <li>- Tracking deliveries</li> <li>- Surveys on roads</li> </ul> <p>Community driven development</p>	<p>Obtaining local information, generating data at the community level.</p> <p>Mobilizing the community to push for local interests.</p> <p>Negotiating with local governments and service providers.</p>	<p>Manpower for community organizing and training.</p>	<p>Support the community training costs of NGOs that have installed SAC mechanisms in their network of communities.</p>
<p>NON-GOVERNMENT ORGANIZATIONS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Budget analysis</li> <li>-Budget advocacy</li> <li>-Demystifying budgets</li> <li>-Tracking expenditures</li> <li>-Deploying monitors</li> <li>-Guarding procurement</li> <li>-Lifestyle checks</li> <li>-Citizen charters</li> <li>-Integrity pacts</li> <li>-Surveys</li> <li>-Report cards</li> <li>-Citizen ombudsmen</li> <li>-Citizen juries</li> <li>-SMS database</li> <li>-Investigative reports</li> <li>-News scan database</li> </ul>	<p>Technical interventions. Processing and analyzing data at the state, sectoral or national level.</p> <p>Advocating and critiquing policies based on the analysis of the data.</p> <p>Negotiating with the national government.</p>	<p>Professionals skilled at rigorous analysis</p>	<p>Promote the sharing of innovations among NGOs.</p> <p>Promote the creation of NGO partnerships, alliances on issues.</p> <p>Support training on generating, analyzing, and acting upon social data.</p>
<b>Sectors and their Interventions</b>	<b>Comparative Advantage of Each Sector</b>	<b>Resource Requirements</b>	<b>Implications for the World Bank</b>
<p>STATES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Right to information acts</li> <li>-Local development councils</li> <li>-Agency transaction websites</li> <li>-State budget sites</li> <li>-Expenditure sites</li> <li>-Pork barrel sites</li> <li>-E-procurement</li> <li>-Infrastructure sites</li> <li>-Website blacklists</li> </ul>	<p>Ensuring the availability and free flow of information.</p> <p>Putting government data into the public domain.</p> <p>Negotiating within government (e.g. agency deliberations, Congress debates)</p>	<p>Available data generated from government records.</p> <p>Sufficient IT infrastructure, Net penetration</p>	<p>Promote transparency in state accounts</p> <p>Encourage e-governance.</p>

## 12. CONCLUDING REMARKS: FORGING ADVOCACY CHAINS

This review concludes by asking, what more can be done? What mechanisms are lacking in the Asia-Pacific region? The stocktaking does not include participatory budgeting, but initial scans indicate that these interventions are not yet popular. They are often found in India and even institutionalized by the state of Kerala. Some local governments in the Philippines also employ participatory budgeting. However, the mechanism has not gained much ground in the rest of Asia-Pacific.

The review has seen more *uneven development* in the innovations as opposed to a lack of innovation development. India is very advanced in budget advocacy, expenditure tracking, performance monitoring, even in e-governance solutions. The Philippines follows along these avenues, but is many steps behind.

It would be best for the countries of Asia-Pacific to share information on the whole taxonomy of interventions. One recalls that budget advocacy was pioneered in India, and replicated in nations like Bangladesh, Indonesia, Nepal, and the Philippines. A subset of this work was the drive for gender budgets. It began in South Africa but was replicated in India, the Philippines, South Korea, and the Marshall Islands. The citizen jury of Andhra Pradesh, India is not homegrown. Outside the judiciary, citizen juries have been used for social research in the United Kingdom.

This leads to the point on synergy in the service of information. At the heart of social accountability work in Asia-Pacific is public pressure for access to accurate fiscal information. The information is retrieved and generated, sifted and packaged, shared internally and disseminated to the public. All these steps are needed for effective engagement with those who craft policy. It is possible for a very large civic movement to embark on these activities on its own. However, it would be better for most NGOs to create alliances with other associations that can complement their individual efforts.

Synergy multiplies the power of any one organization. The review has found much synergy, complementation, and convergence among SAC groups in India and the Philippines in particular. The introduction pictures the advocacy process as a series of steps. Thus an advocacy chain represents gains from pursuing synergy. Different groups wielding SAC mechanisms link together to hold the state accountable for its services that target impoverished individuals. These chains should include the following elements.

***NGOs that conduct fiscal research.*** It is imperative to gather robust and systematic data. Activist groups find the appropriate research entry point by determining what are the communities' most pressing needs. The civic organizations monitor public spending at the local, state, or national levels. This may require field workers, local public hearings or a desk review of documents. Findings, critiques, and recommendations are written up into a technical report.

***Efforts to build the capacity of people's organizations.*** Some groups demystify the findings of fiscal advocacy reports into bulletins, summary sheets, and briefing kits. Often in the vernacular, they are used for the training sessions of the movement's members. It would be best to upgrade community capabilities so that the residents themselves can generate the data. The process itself is empowering. Individuals and groups that become well-versed on the issue built a constituency. The members can participate at the last stage of the chain.

***Ties with the mass media.*** Activist groups should circulate demystified reports to the general public via the mass media. NGOs issue press releases, alert the newspapers to their websites, hold press conferences, or sponsor events that are newsworthy. It seems that the most effective agents of persuasion are commentators on television and radio. However, they still rely on article clippings for their research. Editorials, features, and investigative reports are thus valuable aids for public analysis. The groups can sustain human interest by putting a human face on the mass of numbers.

***An internet presence.*** It is vital to make fiscal data and performance reports public by posting them on the Net. In the internet mechanisms, social accountability powers are exercised not by a single NGO but by the public at large. The public monitors budgets, actual expenditure, or agency performance through the websites. Various 'Net mechanisms run by the state have been created partly due to NGO pressure for information disclosure. The governments respond by posting budgets and data on the Net.

***Using public opinion surveys.*** Ultimately, Congress members, governors, and mayors will have to make the policy decisions. But politicians, being elected officials, want to maximize their votes during elections. Between elections, the proxy mechanisms for expressing public sentiment are opinion surveys. A declining approval rating disquiets a senator seeking reelection. The surveys reveal public opinion on various issues. Politicians who directly oppose policy directions preferred by the public risk possibilities of reelection.

***Lobbying and mobilization.*** It is not enough that the civic groups write their reports, that the media release the findings to the public, and that survey results are on the side of the reformers. The last leg of the marathon must be run: civil society movements should approach the policy-makers to present alternatives. Direct, face-to-face negotiations are imperative; all the other interventions build up to this climax. Finally, demonstrations at the plaza add pressure to meetings at the office. Politicians cannot help but feel accountable to the people when they behold the parliament of the streets.

## ANNEX

### **LIST OF TEMPLATES OF THE SOCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY INITIATIVES**

Bangladesh, Local Governance Development Fund Project in Sirajganj

Bangladesh, News Scan Database of Corruption Cases by Transparency International

Bangladesh, Textbook Crisis Survey

Bangladesh, Website of the Roads and Highways Department

Cambodia, Corruption Surveys of the Center for Social Development, Phnom Penh

Cambodia, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper

India, Budget Analysis of the Centre for Budget and Governance Accountability (CBGA), New Delhi

India, Budget Analysis of the Centre for Budget and Policy Studies (CBPS), Bangalore

India, Budget Analysis of the Consumer Unity and Trust Society (CUTS), Rajasthan

India, Budget Analysis of the Samarthan Center for Budget Studies, Maharashtra

India, Budget Analysis of the Tamilnadu People's Forum for Social Development

India, Children's Survey of Roads, Bangalore

India, Citizens' Charters of Lok Satta, Hyderabad

India, Citizens' Charters of Praja, Mumbai

India, Citizen's Jury, Andhra Pradesh

India, E-Seva Centers (Electronic Transactions Kiosks)

India, People's Planning Campaign, Kerala

India, Maharashtra Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Project

India, Social Audits of Parivartan, Delhi

India, Social Audits of Proof, Bangalore

India, Report Card on Public Services in Ahmedabad

India, Report Card on Public Services in Hyderabad

India, Right to Information Act of Goa

Indonesia, Budget Analysis of the Bandung Institute of Governance Studies (BIGS)

Indonesia, Budget Analysis of the Forum Indonesia untuk Transparansi Anggaran (FITRA)

Indonesia, Gender Budget Analysis by the Koalisi Perempuan

Japan, Citizen Ombudsmen of Sendai city

Malaysia, Corruption Surveys of Transparency International in Selayang Baru and Bandar Baru Selayang

Marshall Islands, Gender Budget Pilot

Nepal, Budget Analysis of Action Aid

Nepal, Budget Workshops of the Citizens' Poverty Watch Forum

Nepal, Integrity Pacts of Transparency International, Bhaktapur

Nepal, Public Accounts Committee, House of Representatives, Kathmandu

Nepal, Report Card on Public Services in Bharatpur

Pakistan, Social Audits of CIET, Islamabad

Philippines, Community-Driven Development: KALAHI-CIDSS

Philippines, Corruption Surveys of Social Weather Stations

Philippines, Gender Budget Analysis by DAWN of the Bacolod city government

Philippines, Infrastructure Monitoring by the Concerned Citizens of Abra

Philippines, Investigative Journalism

Philippines, Lifestyle Checks on Government Officials

Philippines, Local Development Councils

Philippines, Procurement Watch, Inc.

Philippines, Report Card on Public Services in Nine Cities of Metro Manila

Philippines, Textbook Count Program

Philippines, Website of the Department of Budget and Management

Philippines, Website on Pork Barrel

Solomon Islands, Report Card on Public Services

South Korea, Gender Budget Analysis of Local Governments

South Korea, Website on E-Procurement

South Korea, Website for Tracking Public Transactions (OPEN)

Sri Lanka, the Gemi Dariya Project

Sri Lanka, Report Card on Public Services in Colombo

Sri Lanka, Report Cards of the Seventha Urban Resource Center