
Appendix J

World Bank Support for Secondary Education

This appendix summarizes the World Bank's experience in supporting secondary education reforms in developing and transition countries in recent years and offers a framework for continued support of secondary education development. It draws on a portfolio review of World Bank lending for secondary education over the period 1990–2002 (World Bank 2004b) by the Bank's Operations Evaluation Department (OED).

The Operations Evaluation Department (OED) is an independent unit within the World Bank that reports directly to the Bank's Board of Executive Directors. The OED assesses what works and what does not, how a borrower plans to run and maintain a project, and what the lasting contribution of the Bank to a country's overall development has been. The goals of evaluation are to learn from experience, to provide an objective basis for assessing the results of the Bank's work, and to enable accountability in the achievement of Bank objectives. Evaluation also improves the Bank's work by identifying and disseminating the lessons learned from experience and by framing recommendations drawn from the findings.

Assessment of Recent World Bank Experience in Secondary Education, 1990–2002

World Bank lending for education began in 1963. Since then, the Bank has played a prominent role in assisting developing countries in their efforts to expand secondary education and to improve the quality of institutions and programs. New lending for secondary education grew from \$148 million in 1990 to \$250 million in 2004. Lending for secondary education reached a peak of \$376 million in 1995. The World Bank is currently assisting secondary education development in 71 countries. (See the tables at the end of this appendix for a listing of projects by country, a synopsis of World Bank analytical work on secondary education between 2002 and 2005, and a list of World Bank publications on secondary education.)

The types of interventions and their general objectives can be summarized as follows:

In countries with high secondary education enrollments

- improving employability and productivity of school leavers through support to vocational secondary schools, especially in countries where specific shortages of vocational and technical skills have been identified
- increasing a country's competitiveness by improving the quality of general secondary education to raise the overall productivity and trainability of the labor force

In countries with low secondary education enrollments

- meeting specific shortages of educated manpower in the public and private sectors by raising secondary school completion rates
- improving the social conditions of the poor and reducing inequity by expanding access to secondary education

Until the 1980s World Bank support to secondary education had focused on the expansion of capacity and enrollments to meet manpower needs, primarily through financing school construction and equipment. A shift in Bank support followed the 1980 sector policy paper, which proposed that the Bank finance education quality and internal efficiency in those countries that had achieved adequate quality of education at acceptably low unit costs. Over the past two decades the Bank has advocated lending for secondary education mainly in countries that have already achieved universal access to primary schooling. The World Bank's 1986 policy note recommended, as a sound approach to promoting secondary education, cost recovery, accompanied by selective scholarship schemes, and the encouragement of private and community schools to improve quality and efficiency in education through competition. That position was endorsed in the 1995 strategy paper (World Bank 1995), which advocated cost-benefit analysis to determine country-specific public expenditure priorities and reinforced the priority to be given primary education, where social rates of return were estimated to be highest in most developing countries. The paper further cited higher returns to general than to specialized vocational secondary education. The focus shifted from primary to basic education, which in many cases included the lower secondary grades.

With respect to vocational versus general secondary education, the Bank has taken an increasingly clear and firm stand since the 1980s. It has discouraged support for vocational secondary schooling on the grounds of its high unit costs and mixed outcomes, which are attributed to the poor cost-effectiveness of vocational school programs and their weak linkages to employment opportunities. The Education Sector Strategy (World Bank

1999b) advocated a more holistic approach, from a sectorwide perspective: identification of context-specific reform alternatives, better monitoring and empirical research to guide reform efforts, a focus on participation and client ownership, comprehensive analysis but selectivity in supporting actions, an emphasis on quality through a continuing shift from “hardware” to “software,” concentration on development and poverty impact, knowledge management, and partnerships. No specific attention was given to secondary education. Within the 1999 sector support framework, regional variations and priorities prevailed (see box J.1).

The OED review of the Bank’s secondary education portfolio revealed that shifts had taken place in the balance of project objectives and components in keeping with the education sector strategy. The result was a stronger focus on educational quality, sector management, and poverty issues. Other elements of the education sector strategy, such as the promotion of private schools and cost recovery combined with scholarship schemes, did not feature prominently in the portfolio. Support for secondary education in Africa, in low-income countries, and in countries with small populations was often part of projects that included assistance for the primary or tertiary sectors.

Box J.1 Issues and Priorities in Secondary Education by Region

Sub-Saharan Africa

Distance learning; secondary mathematics and science

East Asia and the Pacific

Equity and quality; need for diversified strategies related to country conditions

Europe and Central Asia

Systemic change to allow for realignment to market demand; reform of governance; improved efficiency, equity, and sustainability

Latin America and the Caribbean

Alternative approaches to increasing access to secondary education, together with curriculum reform to improve relevance to the global economy

Middle East and North Africa

Improved relevance of secondary education, closing the gender and social gaps in participation in postcompulsory education, and vocational education to meet the requirements of a market economy

Since the mid-1990s, several factors have promoted a rapid increase in the share of lending to general secondary education. First, as primary completion rates have risen, the demand for secondary places has grown. Second, the equitable and sustainable financing and management of secondary education have become a major challenge, especially in low-income countries. Third, the role of secondary education in economic and social development is being reassessed in the context of globalization and competitiveness in the information age. Fourth, changes in secondary education are being driven by rapid transformations in technology and labor markets.

The objectives of World Bank–supported secondary education projects can be grouped into six categories: (a) expansion of secondary education, (b) poverty and equity focus, (c) gender focus, (d) qualitative improvements in secondary education, (e) rehabilitation of physical facilities, and (f) improvement of efficiency and management in secondary education.

World Bank support for secondary education since 1990 shows the following trends:

1. *Middle-income countries* with high primary enrollment rates tended to borrow for secondary education in preference to other levels. On average, countries borrowing for secondary education had higher gross enrollment rates at the primary level, stronger policy and institutional conditions, and higher per capita incomes than those borrowing to finance other levels of education. Although the effectiveness of the primary system as measured by youth literacy rates did not appear to be a constraint on providing support to the secondary subsector, countries borrowing for dedicated secondary projects had higher rates of youth literacy. Countries with higher incomes and enrollment rates but weaker policy and institutional conditions did not borrow from the Bank.
2. Country population size seemed to be another factor, with *highly populated countries* borrowing more often for secondary education projects. Countries with medium-size or smaller populations tended to combine borrowing for secondary education with assistance for other education levels.
3. In *Asia* and *Latin America* country selection for secondary education lending was also influenced by the activities of other multilateral development banks.

Secondary education projects, on average, allocated a larger share of expenditures to civil works primarily and then to equipment, and smaller shares to textbooks, training, and technical assistance than did investments in the education portfolio as a whole. During the late 1990s the focus of lending activities shifted to include more projects aimed at supporting assessment systems, management information systems, financing of reform,

decentralization, school-level management, and community participation and gave more attention to labor market information and employment services. The shift was in direct response to the changing global environment, the advent of the increased use of technology in education, and the focus on knowledge, lifelong learning, and skills for the labor market.

Performance of secondary education projects. As is well known, the education sector is characterized by long gestation periods before positive outcomes are forthcoming. Concerted, continuing efforts are needed to elicit cumulative positive outcomes. Over the past two decades, country conditions were a major factor in project performance. Outcomes of secondary education projects were sensitive to country income level. World Bank project completion and evaluation reports frequently attributed good performance in project implementation to national ownership, government commitment, and improved implementation capacity. Top-down initiatives (curriculum and assessment, supply of inputs), combined with bottom-up, demand-driven interventions such as school-managed improvement funds and textbook selection, were found to be important factors in improving education quality and equity, as demonstrated by the Chile Secondary Education project.

Policy reform. Successive Bank sector strategy documents have stressed that policy reform would be possible and effective if the focus were on ensuring government commitment to equitable and sustainable financing. One approach in this direction is the promotion of private secondary schools, combined with cost recovery and selective scholarship schemes in public schools. For example, a World Bank project in Mauritius included loans and other incentives for expanding private schools. Government commitment, however, was too weak to support implementation. In China and Korea some progress was seen in cost containment, cost recovery, and increased involvement of the private sector as a result of consistent government commitment to implementing proposed reforms. Good results were realized by involving employers in the curriculum reform process at the secondary vocational level.

Increasing access. It is a fairly straightforward matter to specify and measure the number of new places created through a project or program, the quality and efficiency of construction and equipment, enrollment rates, and utilization rates. Reporting on all the measures is, however, a challenging task. Proxies such as construction and equipment of facilities in underserved areas have often been used to measure progress toward poverty and equity objectives. It can be difficult to track impacts on productivity and social indicators.

Relevance to the labor market. The quality of evidence for progress in improving the relevance of secondary schooling to labor market requirements continues to pose a major challenge. General secondary education projects that aim to meet changing labor market needs by improving access to and quality of education must focus on evidence for results beyond the education

sector. Graduate employment rates and tracer studies are important instruments for studying the link between education and labor market needs. Measures to study productivity should encompass labor market-oriented macroeconomic studies. All these considerations point to longer lag times in assessing the efficacy of policy reforms in general secondary education.

Educational quality. Educational outcomes or impacts must drive the assessment of performance in the area of quality improvement objectives. Input-based measures such as numbers of teachers trained or textbooks delivered, although necessary for the short-term assessment of project or program outputs, are not adequate for analyzing the impact of the inputs on student achievement or on labor market relevance. Here again, the lag time and resources needed to conduct impact evaluation often pose a problem for full analysis of the efficacy of project or program interventions. The definition of quality objectives needs to be less vague and better linked to specific and expected benefits that can be monitored. This is especially so in the areas of proposed curriculum reforms and teacher training.

Linkage of monitoring and evaluation to institutional capacity. Proven monitoring evaluation measures include evaluation of every project or program activity during the course of implementation, facilitation of midcourse refinements, dissemination and synergies at the local or school level, and use of test results to monitor equity and target at-risk schools. The Chile Secondary Education project exemplifies such an approach. Chile's strong institutional capacity is a major enabling factor for effectively monitoring and evaluating projects and programs. Another example is Angola, where the Education I project was implemented in a context of extremely difficult institutional conditions, civil conflict, and macroeconomic instability. Monitoring and evaluation were relatively strong, with sustained commitment from the Ministry of Education. Project outcomes were measured by comparing selected project and nonproject schools on the basis of changes in transition and completion rates, the number of pupils acquiring basic literacy and numeracy within four years, and the number reaching satisfactory achievement levels. In addition, a beneficiary assessment revealed perceptions about the quality of education in the project schools. These measures show that effective assessment of the efficacy of lending is indeed possible.

Financing and efficiency. Detailed analysis of subsector expenditures, unit costs, and cost-effectiveness form the bedrock for a variety of measures to increase the efficiency of the secondary education system. Internal efficiency measures such as cost recovery, double shifting, measures to reduce student dropout and repetition, school consolidation to support economies of scope and scale, reduction of the share of boarding places, and changes in teacher utilization are important. Project-financed activities and policy measures, however, should be implemented as planned, and the results should be subjected to cost analysis.

Planning and management capacity. Tracking actual versus planned implementation of proposed training, technical assistance, and studies is important, but good independent evaluation of the effectiveness of project and program activities is necessary for assessing the achievement of objectives and subobjectives related to planning and management capacity. Often, the intent is to achieve these objectives through support for management information systems, curriculum development, assessment systems, decentralization, capacity for budgeting, economic and financial analysis, planning, and policy development.

Highly satisfactory outcomes owe much to good project preparation. This can include securing approval from the national legislature (as in the case of two similar and overlapping projects in Korea) and providing timely technical assistance to prepare for the shifting of implementation responsibilities to local bodies. Lack of government or national ownership and underestimation or inadequate assessment of institutional constraints are the factors that most often make for unsatisfactory outcomes. A sensible, realistic scope for projects, relatively simple project design, anticipation of the need for legal and regulatory changes, measures to ensure adequate stakeholder assessment, and a participation strategy help improve project outcomes. A thorough assessment of the capacity of project implementation units, proactive steps to mobilize political commitment or community participation, development of capacity and procedures for procurement and financial control, and adequate study of demand-side needs, cost-effectiveness, and recurrent financing capacity help strengthen project implementation and make for positive outcomes.

Directions in General Secondary Education Development

Issues concerning the development of secondary education relate to options for structure, curriculum, financing (including recurrent cost implications and financial sustainability), and governance specific to human, social, and economic development objectives in particular county contexts. These need to be addressed in a systematic and concerted manner, accompanied by a careful assessment of the distribution and poverty impacts of Bank assistance to secondary education. It is important to strengthen the analytical basis for general support of secondary education by anchoring it in a broader analysis of country economic, financial, institutional, social, and labor market conditions.

Alternate strategies are needed to address particular challenges for the development of secondary education in low-income countries where institutional capacity is weak. The current focus on the Millennium Development Goals and on Education for All has reaffirmed the priority to be given primary education but has also increased awareness of needs at the secondary level. Furthermore, the global knowledge economy and lifelong learning

goals draw the spotlight to the crucial role of secondary education as a bridge between the primary and tertiary levels and its relevance to the labor market, which rewards adaptable skills.

Future secondary education projects could rely more on deeper and broader country-level analysis; draw explicit linkages between expected project outcomes and broader development goals for economic growth, social development, and poverty reduction; monitor distributional poverty impacts even when poverty reduction is not a specific project objective; assess real constraints and opportunities; ensure that project priorities and design match locally perceived priorities and institutional capacity; focus on the analytical basis for general secondary support in a broader assessment of country economic, financial, institutional, and social conditions; and strengthen the Bank's support for secondary education through systematic prior analysis and ongoing tracking of the linkages with labor market conditions and poverty and equity impacts.

Table J.1 World Bank Support for Secondary Education Development by Objective and by Region, Fiscal 1990–2001

<i>Objective</i>	<i>Sub-Saharan Africa</i>	<i>Eastern Europe and Central Asia</i>	<i>Latin America and the Caribbean</i>	<i>Middle East and North Africa</i>	<i>South Asia</i>	<i>East Asia and the Pacific</i>
Expansion of secondary education	Angola Botswana Burundi Ethiopia Ghana Mauritius Tanzania	Turkey	Chile Haiti	Jordan Morocco Oman Yemen, Republic of	Maldives Pakistan	China Malaysia Papua New Guinea Solomon Islands Vanuatu
Addressing poverty reduction and equity	Ethiopia Ghana Kenya Mauritius		Chile Jamaica	Morocco Oman	Maldives Pakistan Sri Lanka	China Vanuatu
Reducing gender disparity	Tanzania			Oman	Maldives Pakistan	
Improving quality	Angola Botswana Burundi Ethiopia Kenya Mauritius Rwanda Tanzania Togo	Albania Hungary Turkey	Argentina Barbados Brazil Chile Haiti Jamaica Mexico	Jordan Morocco Oman Yemen, Republic of	Maldives Sri Lanka	China Indonesia Korea, Rep. of Malaysia Papua New Guinea Solomon Islands Vanuatu

(Continues on the following page.)

Table J.1 Continued

<i>Objective</i>	<i>Sub-Saharan Africa</i>	<i>Eastern Europe and Central Asia</i>	<i>Latin America and the Caribbean</i>	<i>Middle East and North Africa</i>	<i>South Asia</i>	<i>East Asia and the Pacific</i>
Rehabilitating physical facilities	Botswana Ghana Rwanda Tanzania	Hungary Turkey	Barbados Brazil Mexico	Yemen, Republic of	Maldives Sri Lanka	China Korea, Rep. of Papua New Guinea
Promoting efficiency and improving management	Angola Burundi Ghana Kenya Mauritius Rwanda Tanzania Togo	Albania Turkey	Argentina Barbados Brazil Chile Haiti Jamaica Mexico	Jordan Oman Yemen, Republic of	Maldives Pakistan Sri Lanka	China Indonesia Korea, Rep. of Malaysia Solomon Islands Vanuatu

Table J.2 Synopsis of World Bank Analytical Work on Secondary Education

<i>Country and region</i>	<i>Title</i>	<i>Fiscal year</i>	<i>Output type</i>
Africa	Secondary and Secondary Teacher Education Strategic Plan	2004	Report
Uganda (AFR)	Postprimary Education Sector Work	2003	Report
Brazil (LAC)	Brazil Northeast Education Analytical and Advisory Activities	2003	Report
Ukraine (ECA)	Education Sector Note	2003	Policy Note
Azerbaijan (ECA)	Education Sector Note	2003	Policy Note
India (SAR)	State Education Reforms	2003	Policy Note
India (SAR)	Andhra Pradesh Education Strategy	2003	Policy Note
Jordan (MNA)	Jordan Education Sector Dialogue	2003	Country Dialogue
Philippines (EAP)	Philippines Human Development Sector Study	2003	Report
Egypt, Arab Rep. of (MNA)	Egypt Education Sector Policy Dialogue	2003	Country Dialogue
Timor-Leste (EAP)	Education Sector Study	2003	Report
Brazil (LAC)	Brazil Policy Notes Education	2003	Policy Note
Philippines (EAP)	Philippines Retrospective on Policy Reform in Education	2003	Policy Note
Vietnam (EAP)	Vietnam Cost of Social Services for the Poor	2003	Policy Note
India (SAR)	Secondary Education Policy Note	2003	Policy Note
Africa (AFR)	Can Africa Reach International Targets for Human Development?	2002	Policy Note
Africa (AFR)	Community Support for Basic Education	2002	Policy Note
Slovak Republic (ECA)	Education Note	2002	Policy Note
Africa (AFR)	Skills and Literacy Training for Better Livelihoods	2002	Policy Note
Romania (ECA)	Education Policy Note	2002	Policy Note
Caribbean (LAC)	Education Achievements	2002	Policy Note
Egypt, Arab Rep. of (MNA)	Egypt Education Strategy: Progress and Prospects	2002	Policy Note

(Continues on the following page.)

Table J.2 Continued

<i>Country and region</i>	<i>Title</i>	<i>Fiscal year</i>	<i>Output type</i>
Eritrea (AFR)	Eritrea Education Sector Note	2002	Report
India (SAR)	Karnataka Education Study	2002	Report
Jordan (MNA)	Cost-Efficiency of Education Spending	2002	Policy Note
Kyrgyz Republic (ECA)	Education Sector Note and Technical Assistance	2002	Policy Note
Philippines (EAP)	Philippines Out-of-School Youth	2002	Report
Russian Federation (ECA)	Education Policy Note	2002	Policy Note
Thailand (EAP)	Thailand Secondary Education for Employment	2000	Report
Jamaica (LAC)	“Main Report,” vol. 1 of “Jamaica Secondary Education: Improving Quality and Extending Access”	1999	Report

Note: AFR, Sub-Saharan Africa; EAP, East Asia and the Pacific; ECA, Europe and Central Asia; LAC, Latin America and the Caribbean; MNA, Middle East and North Africa; SAR, South Asia.

Table J.3 World Bank Publications on Secondary Education by Year of Issue

<i>Document title</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Report no.</i>
China: Challenges of Secondary Education	2001	22856
Hungary: Secondary Education and Training	2001	22855
Romania: Secondary Education and Training	2001	22857
Linking Science Education to Labor Markets: Issues and Strategies	2000	21800
Secondary Education in El Salvador: Education Reform in Progress	1999	20963
Los insumos escolares en la educación secundaria y su efecto sobre el rendimiento académico de los estudiantes: Un estudio en Colombia	1998	20934
Background Notes: El Salvador Secondary Education Project	1997	18952
Voucher Program for Secondary Schools: The Colombian Experience	1996	16232
Investing in Junior Secondary Education in Indonesia: Rationale and Public Costs	1996	18813
Public and Private Secondary Schools in Developing Countries	1994	13672
Public and Private Secondary Schools in Developing Countries: What Are the Differences and Why Do They Persist?	1994	21194
The Costs of Secondary Education Expansion	1994	17674
Environmental Issues in Secondary Education	1994	17293
Equipment for Science Education Constraints and Opportunities	1993	17346
How to Raise the Effectiveness of Secondary Schools? Universal and Locally Tailored Investment Strategies	1993	17673
Secondary Education in Developing Countries	1993	17668
Reforming Higher Secondary Education in South Asia: The Case of Nepal	1993	IDP109
Social Gains from Female Education: A Cross-National Study	1992	WPS1045
World Bank Lending for Secondary School Science: A General Operational Review	1992	11401
Secondary Education in Developing Countries: Annotated Bibliography	1992	11312

(Continues on the following page.)

Table J.3 Continued

<i>Document title</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Report no.</i>
Secondary School Science in Developing Countries: Status and Issues	1992	17347
The Empty Opportunity: Local Control of Secondary Schools and Student Achievement in the Philippines	1992	WPS825
World Bank Policy Research Bulletin (3, 1)	1992	18062
What Causes Differences in Achievement in Zimbabwe's Secondary Schools?	1991	WPS705
Vocational Secondary Schooling in Israel: A Study of Labor Market Outcomes	1989	WPS142
Student Performance and School Costs in the Philippines' High Schools	1988	WPS61
Curriculum Diversification, Cognitive Achievement and Economic Performance: Evidence from Colombia and Tanzania	1987	EDT80
The External Efficiency of Diversified Secondary Schools in Colombia	1987	EDT59
Diversified Secondary Curriculum Projects: A Review of World Bank Experience 1963–1979	1987	EDT57
Cost-Effectiveness Analysis of an In-Service Teacher Training System: Logos II in Brazil	1981	DPH8140
Why Males Earn More: Location, Job Preferences and Job Discrimination among Brazilian Schoolteachers	1981	DPH8121

Note: Documents are in English unless otherwise specified.