

**PUBLIC POLICIES
FOR
CAREER DEVELOPMENT**

**Case Studies And Emerging Issues
For Designing Career Information And Guidance Systems
In Developing And Transition Economies**

A.G. Watts*
David H. Fretwell**

March 2004

* Dr. Watts is the the Senior Fellow and Life President of the National Institute for Careers Education and Counseling (which is sponsored by the Careers Research and Advisory Centre in Cambridge, UK); and Visiting Professor of Career Development at the University of Derby; and a Visiting Professor at Canterbury Christ Church University College. He has also been the lead consultant for the OECD Career Development Policy Study which paralleled the Bank's Study.

** Mr. Fretwell is Lead Employment and Training Specialist at the World Bank.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	iii
1. ARGUING THE CASE.....	1
<i>Background</i>	1
<i>Definition</i>	2
<i>Economic and Political Context</i>	3
<i>Issues Faced by Developing and Transition Economies</i>	5
<i>Policy Goals</i>	6
2. TAKING STOCK.....	9
<i>The Main Sectors</i>	9
<i>Schools</i>	9
<i>Tertiary Education</i>	14
<i>Public Employment Services</i>	16
<i>Employer-based Services</i>	18
<i>The Private and Voluntary Sectors</i>	20
3. CHANGING THE MOLD	23
<i>Strengths and Weaknesses</i>	23
<i>Changing Concepts</i>	23
<i>Extending Access</i>	25
<i>Building Self-help Approaches</i>	26
<i>Strengthening Information Resources</i>	27
<i>Improving Differentiated Staffing for Career Guidance</i>	29
4. DEVELOPING A STRATEGY	31
<i>Introduction</i>	31
<i>Policy Co-ordination</i>	31
<i>Strategic Leadership</i>	33
<i>Legislation</i>	34
<i>Financing</i>	34
<i>Assuring Quality</i>	35
<i>Building an Evidence Base</i>	36
<i>International Support</i>	37
5. CONCLUSIONS	38
REFERENCES.....	40

List of Boxes

	<i>Page</i>
Box 1: School career counselors in Poland	11
Box 2: Class guidance programs in Turkey	11
Box 3: Vocational and technical education fairs in Turkey	12
Box 4: Links between the public employment service (ISKUR) and schools in Turkey	13
Box 5: Career bureau in Poland	15
Box 6: Life skills training programs in South Africa	18
Box 7: Guidance provision in relation to skill development levies in South Africa	19
Box 8: Private career development companies in the Philippines and South Africa	21
Box 9: Contracting out of public employment services in Chile and Romania	22
Box 10: Non-governmental organizations in the career guidance sector in South Africa	22
Box 11: A computer-based career guidance support system in Poland	25
Box 12: Career guidance networks for school counselors in Chile	29
Box 13: The ChileCalifica program in Chile	32
Box 14: The National Forum for Vocational Guidance in Poland	33
Box 15: A specialist research center in Romania	37

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Career guidance policies and services are designed to assist individuals at any point in their lives to manage their careers, including making informed occupational and education and training choices. Career guidance services support economic efficiency, by making the labor market operate more effectively. They can help to ensure that individuals' decisions are based on self-assessments and labor market information, thus reducing market failures. For developing and transition economies, most of which have limited resources, career guidance services can increase the efficiency of the use of scarce education and training resources. The services also promote social equity and inclusion by helping to ensure equal access to information on labor market and education opportunities. More generally, the services promote the rights of individuals to make free decisions about their own lives. They are accordingly a key policy instrument of democratic societies.

Public policies on career guidance and counseling are receiving increased recognition and support within developed countries, as demonstrated by the 14-country study initiated by the Education Directorate at OECD, and by the related study conducted by the European Commission as part of its emphasis on career guidance within the context of lifelong learning. In parallel, developing and transition economies are increasingly recognizing the importance of career guidance and have expressed a desire to improve their services. UNESCO recently completed a related study; and the World Bank has financed development of services in a number of developing countries, highlighting such services as an integral part of lifelong learning, and as making a significant contribution to economic efficiency, social equity, and democratic processes.

The following pages summarize the findings of seven case-studies of public policy in career guidance carried out in Chile, the Philippines, Poland, Romania, Russia, South Africa and Turkey. The objectives of this World Bank study were: to identify and describe the distinctive issues faced by developing and transition economies in forming effective policies in career guidance and counseling; to identify emerging examples of best practice, and suggest how such countries can form more effective policies and programs in this field; and to assist the World Bank and other development agencies in determining how they can best assist such efforts. While there are common issues identified between the OECD, EU and World Bank studies, World Bank client countries are often faced with distinctive issues. These include limited public resources, high unemployment and poverty, large informal economies, need for community capacity building, and at times specific family and cultural factors which may have a major impact on career decision-making.

Current career guidance provision in the seven case-study countries is reviewed in terms of five main sectors: schools; tertiary education; public employment services; employer-based services; and the private and voluntary sectors. This provision reflects a traditional policy rationale in which career guidance is viewed in somewhat institutional and reactive terms, as a measure designed to lubricate the operation of the education system and its relationship to the labor market, and to combat such phenomena as unemployment or mismatch.

There are however signs of a more dynamic and proactive policy rationale emerging in middle-income countries, as is the case in developed countries. Career guidance is increasingly viewed as an integral part of a human resource development strategy designed to harness technological and economic change and enable the country to compete effectively in global markets. Under this view, career guidance has an important role to play in encouraging all individuals, including youth and adults, to engage in career planning and learning throughout life, so enabling them to respond more flexibly to the opportunities offered by a dynamic labor market. This view is supported by changing concepts of career development. It requires extending access to career guidance services, constructing more of these services on a self-help basis, strengthening career and educational information resources, and improving staffing in a more differentiated form.

Some examples of new models of service delivery attuned to this new emerging rationale are evident within the case-studies. If however it is to be implemented systemically, stronger policies are needed. A framework for developing such policies is presented, drawing from the case-studies and also from experience in OECD countries. It includes: strengthening structures for policy co-ordination and strategic leadership; exploring the role of legislation; collecting improved financial information and reviewing the role of markets; assuring quality; building an evidence base; and examining the role of international support in enabling middle-income countries to benefit from experiences, materials and systems developed in other countries.

Based on this analysis of the case-studies, four general conclusions are reached to assist middle-income countries in developing services. First, provision of services needs to be viewed as a coherent system, with multiple stakeholders developing different elements of service delivery. Second, governments have a key role in developing the services, but should not be viewed as sole providers. Third, restrictions on public resources require priorities to be established: these include an initial focus on improving career and educational information, followed by investing in self-help services, exploiting the use of information and communications technology, improving staff training, and developing incentives to encourage the private and NGO sectors to develop and deliver services. Finally, an evidence base of client demand, service cost, and service impact needs to be developed to defend investments.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The study reported here was designed to build upon a prior OECD study (OECD, 2004), used an adaptation of its questionnaire and method, and paralleled similar studies being undertaken by the European Union. The authors are grateful to Richard Sweet of OECD for permitting the use of OECD materials and for his help in designing the study. Host Ministries were identified in each of the seven countries in the study. The Bank and Host Ministries agreed on National Consultants who each produced the first draft of a country report based on the adapted OECD questionnaire structure. Subsequently one of the authors of the present paper visited the country for a week to meet policy-makers, researchers and practitioners, to visit a number of career guidance services, and to revise the draft report in collaboration with the National Consultant. The key ministries and individuals involved in the countries were:

<i>Country</i>	<i>Host Ministry</i>	<i>National Consultant</i>	<i>Project Team</i>
Chile	Education Ana Luz Durán	Mario Radrigan	Tony Watts
Philippines	Labor Teresa M. Soriano	Josefina Santamaria	Tony Watts
Poland	Economy and Labor Hanna Swiatkiewicz	Wojtek Kreft	Tony Watts
Romania	Labor Doina Bucinski	Daniela Paşnicu	David Fretwell
Russia	Education Victor Bolotov	Yuri Zabrodin	Tony Watts
South Africa	Labor Ismail Akhalwaya	Lara Kay	David Fretwell
Turkey	Education Salih Celik	Fusün Akkök	TonyWatts David Fretwell

The project team is grateful to all of the Host Ministries, Co-ordinators and National Consultants for the assiduous and highly professional way in which they carried out their tasks, and are also indebted to the various people who helped us in the course of the on-site visits. This included many officials in the various ministries who co-ordinated the official arrangements. The authors are also indebted to the World Bank Country Office staff who supported the study and in many cases participated in on-site discussions, including Mary Canning (Poland and Russia), Richard Florescu (Romania), Norbert Mugwagwa (South Africa), Isak Froumin (Russia), and Ferda Sahmali (Turkey).

The study benefited from the counsel of a Project Advisory Group and peer reviewers including Fusün Akkök (Turkey), Michal Boni (Poland), John McCarthy (European Commission), Richard Sweet (OECD), Helmut Zelloth (European Training Foundation), Ernesto Cuadra (World Bank), and Arvil Van Adams (World Bank). The project was financed by a grant from the UK Department for International Development with additional support from the World Bank Europe and Central Asia Human Development Sector.

1. ARGUING THE CASE

Background

1.1 Career guidance policies and services¹ support economic efficiency by making the labor market operate more effectively. They can ensure that the individual decisions through which the labor market works are well-informed and well-thought-through; they can reduce some of its market failures – for instance, drop-outs from education and training, or mismatches between supply and demand. They can lubricate institutional reforms designed to improve the functioning of the market and improve the efficiency of the use of what are often resources allocated for human capital development. They also promote social equality and inclusion, and access to educational and labor market opportunities. Career guidance can perform a valuable role in raising the aspirations of the disadvantaged and individuals in poverty by making them aware of opportunities, and supporting them in securing entry to such opportunities. It emphasizes and promotes the ‘active individual’, reconciling policy goals with the rights of individuals to make free decisions about their own lives. It is accordingly a key policy instrument within democratic societies (see paras. 1.7-1.11).

1.2 *International context.* Public policies for career guidance services are currently receiving greater international attention than ever before:

- The World Bank has recognized the importance of career guidance in its recent publication on lifelong learning (World Bank, 2002), has financed development of related policies and services in a number of developing and transition economies, and has initiated the study summarized in this paper.
- The Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) is completing a 14-country Career Guidance Policy Review (OECD, 2004).
- The European Commission in its Communication on Lifelong Learning identified information, guidance and counseling as one of six ‘priorities for action’ (EC, 2001), and has set up an Expert Group on Lifelong Guidance to advise it in this area; as part of its preparations for the work of this group, it has commissioned a policy review (using the questionnaire developed for the OECD review) covering all member-states and acceding countries (Sultana, 2004).
- The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) has recently carried out a project on the role of career guidance in relation to technical and vocational education and training (Hiebert & Borgen, 2002).

1.3 *The study.* The study summarized in this report was launched in response to the increasing recognition in middle-income countries, including countries in transition from command to market economies, of the need to develop stronger policies in this area. The objectives of the study were to:

¹ These services are intended to assist individuals make occupational and educational choices and manage their careers (see para.1.6).

- identify and describe the distinctive issues faced by developing and transition economies in forming effective policies in the field of information, guidance and counseling services;
- suggest how such countries can form more effective policies and programs in this field;
- assist the World Bank and other development agencies in determining how they can best assist such efforts².

1.4 The study was designed to complement and build upon the similar studies carried out by the OECD and EU. It has applied an adapted version of the OECD questionnaire to seven countries: Chile, Philippines, Poland, Romania, Russia, South Africa and Turkey. The countries were selected to cover as many as possibly of the main regions of World Bank activity, and on the grounds that they seemed likely to be reasonably representative of developing and transition economies but also to offer examples of good or interesting practice. The study was financed by a grant from the UK Department for International Development with additional support from the Europe and Central Asia Human Development Sector Department at the World Bank, was managed by the same department, and was completed between June 2002 and October 2003.

1.5 Host Ministries were identified in each of the seven countries in the study. The Bank and Host Ministries then agreed on National Consultants who were commissioned to produce the first draft of a report based on the adapted OECD questionnaire structure. Subsequently one of the authors of this paper visited each country for a week to meet policy-makers, researchers and practitioners, to visit a number of career guidance services, and to revise the draft report in collaboration with the National Consultant. The seven country reports (Akkók & Watts, 2003; Kay & Fretwell, 2003; Kreft & Watts, 2003; Radrihan & Watts, 2003; Paşnicu & Fretwell, 2003; Santamaria & Watts, 2003; Zabrodin & Watts, 2003) are available on the Bank's external education/lifelong learning website (http://www1.worldbank.org/education/lifelong_learning/). A synthesis report covering the present study and the related OECD and EU studies is also available (Watts & Sultana, 2003).

Definition

1.6 Information, guidance and counseling services (hereafter referred to as ‘career guidance services’) comprise services intended to assist individuals, of any age and at any point throughout their lives, to make educational, training and occupational choices and to manage their careers. These services are an integral part of lifelong learning (World Bank, 2002) and may include services in schools, in universities and colleges, in public employment services, in companies, and in the voluntary and private sectors. The services may be on an individual or group basis, and may be face-to-face or at a distance (including web-based services). They include career information (in print, ICT-based and

² Although the primary goal of the study was descriptive, it also sought cost, benefit, and impact information. However, the latter was not the primary sought outcome of the study. It will need to be addressed in the future, as more resources are made available to examine the services in depth.

other forms), assessment and self-assessment tools, counseling interviews, career education programs and work taster programs.

Economic and Political Context

1.7 *Economic context.* The growth of career guidance services is closely related to economic development. As such development progresses, the range of occupations expands, alongside opportunities for social and geographical mobility. Informal mechanisms for allocation of work roles tend to prove inadequate; formal interventions, including career guidance services, are needed to supplement them (Watts, 1996).

1.8 Less developed countries, particularly those with large amounts of excess labor, may place development of career guidance services at a lower priority level than developed countries, because occupational choice may be a remote concept for the majority of the population. Expenditure of scarce resources on these services may accordingly have muted impact and return on investment. There are parallels here with Maslow's (1970) hierarchy of needs: the proposition that it is only once lower-order needs like physiological needs and safety have been adequately met that higher-order needs like self-actualization can be addressed.

1.9 On the other hand, middle income and transition economies already face many of the same challenges as more developed countries. All are having to address the opening of their economies to global competition, and rapid changes in technology, including information technology and telecommunications. This argues the need for career guidance to be available on a more extensive and more flexible basis in these countries. As noted above, career guidance services support economic efficiency, make the labor market operate more effectively, and reduce market failure by helping ensure that individuals' decisions are based on self-assessments and labor market information, thus reducing market failures. This is of particular importance in developing countries which have limited public resources to devote to human resource development. And there is emerging evidence both in developed countries and in middle-income countries that provision of career guidance, prior to investing in education and training, can have a significant and positive impact on job placement of graduates of training programs (see paras.1.13-14 following).

1.10 *Political context.* The growth of career guidance services is also related to the development of market economies and democratic political institutions (Watts, 1996). This is particularly relevant to four countries in the present study: Poland, Romania and Russia, all of which have been moving from command to market economies; and South Africa, which has been in transition from policies and structures based on 'separate development' (apartheid) to a more integrated and open society. In Russia under the Communist regime, for example, there was little perceived need for such services: unemployment did not officially exist, and people were largely allocated to their roles by selective processes; 'career' was linked with individualism, and regarded as a social vice. Since the transition, these allocative methods have been replaced by heavy reliance on

personal networks and contacts: this is open to question on grounds both of efficiency and of equity. Career guidance services distinctively affirm the value attached in market-based democratic societies to the rights of individuals to make free decisions within a transparent opportunity structure about their own working lives, linking personal goals to the socio-economic needs of the society in which they live.

1.11 In this sense, career guidance can be viewed as a form of brokerage between individual needs and the needs of the society and economy. It addresses both individual rights and individual responsibilities within a societal context. It is a means of encouraging and empowering individuals to participate in determining their role within, and their contribution to, the society of which they are part. In this sense it is a vital tool of civil society as well as of economic development.

1.12 *Impact evaluation.* Underpinning these arguments is evidence on the gross or net impact of career guidance. Very few studies of this kind have been conducted in middle-income countries, let alone low-income countries. Even the number and types of clients being provided with services, and the unit cost of services, are difficult to identify, because many of them are embedded in more broadly-based services including personal and social counseling (see Section 2).

1.13 Nonetheless, a review of evidence from more developed countries by OECD (2004) indicated substantial evidence of the learning outcomes of knowledge, skills and attitudes which individuals derive from career guidance interventions. These include positive effects, for both adolescents and adults, on career decision making, career exploration, career maturity, and career self-efficacy (Prideaux *et al.*, 2000). This is important, because in general career guidance interventions are concerned not with telling people what to do but with helping them acquire knowledge, skills and attitudes that will help them make better career choices and transitions. In the aggregate, however, there is also growing evidence of positive behavioral outcomes in terms of impact upon participation in learning and in work. With regard to longer-term outcomes the OECD notes that adequate studies have not yet been conducted. In general the review of these studies concluded that evidence on the benefits of career guidance is limited but positive.

1.14 Within the context of evaluating active labor programs, the World Bank has initiated a number of quasi-experimental net-impact studies on career counseling services provided by labor offices to the unemployed. Several of these studies have demonstrated a positive net impact of counseling services on job placement, as well as a positive impact on the success of other downstream programs such as retraining (Fretwell, Benus & O'Leary, 1999, Betcherman, Olivas, Dar, 2004)). In general, however, there are difficulties in mounting such studies because of limited resources and expertise in implementing net-impact studies, difficulties in identifying clients who have had specific and significant services which can be isolated and evaluated, and difficulties in identifying matched-pair control groups.

Issues Faced by Developing and Transition Economies

1.15 *Limited public resources.* Developing, middle income, and transition countries have distinctive issues to confront. For example, the restrictions on public resources in such countries mean that they have to be careful to prioritize their investments. This applies as much in career guidance as in other fields. However, as noted previously, there is increasing evidence (OECD 2004; Fretwell, Benus, Oleary, 1999, Betcherman, Olivas, and Dar, 2004)) that the use of career guidance services can improve the efficiency of the use of resources allocated to education and training.

1.16 *Poverty and unemployment.* Developing countries furthermore have significant problems, if to varying degrees, in relation to poverty and unemployment. Among the countries in the current study, these are particularly acute issues in South Africa, where in some provinces nearly half of the population live on US\$100 a month or less, and where the official unemployment rate is 26% and the expanded rate (including discouraged workers) 37%. This may mean people being drawn to accept any job in order to provide a source of income, suppressing the concept of choice, and leading to career guidance being regarded as relevant only to those who are perceived to have choices – who might be quite a small minority. In many of the countries, there is a substantial gulf between those in professional jobs, those in low-level jobs, and those surviving in the informal economy. A key policy issue is whether career guidance is only relevant to the first of these groups; or whether it can be made relevant to all, and to opening up opportunities for mobility between the groups and for supporting social inclusion.

1.17 *Informal economy.* In general, welfare and unemployment benefit systems are less well-developed in developing countries. This means that many people are likely to seek economic survival through informal activities outside the formal wage economy. Some of these activities may be illegal or even criminal; but many are not, and the informal sector often provides support to the formal sector. In South Africa, only 30% of the labor force work in the formal sector; in Chile, the figure is 74%; in both cases, most of the rest are engaged in micro or survivalist businesses. In Russia and Turkey, it is estimated that the informal sector comprises around one-third of the country's total business revenue, as compared with one-tenth in more developed countries. In such environments, traditional 'career guidance' information sources may be insufficient and incomplete, and the delivery of some services may have to be done through non-formal channels including NGO and social service agencies. There is a strong case in such countries for an emphasis on information and training in entrepreneurship linked to career development concepts, which can help people engaged in the informal economy to develop their enterprises within the formal economy, with access to additional training and support services (see paras.2.25 and 2.37).

1.18 *Community capacity-building.* There may also be a case in this context for strategies focused on developing a stronger relationship between career guidance and

community capacity-building, helping individuals to decide how they can best contribute to their community, and communities to engage in community planning and priority setting (see Aisenson *et al.*, 2002). Such approaches establish links with populist approaches to development, influenced by feminism, environmentalism and ethnocentrism, in contrast to more normative approaches (Youngman, 2000). The interest in South Africa in life skills training (see para.2.25) has potential for moving in this direction.

1.19 *Importance of family structures.* Another means through which people survive outside formal employment is through family structures. Such structures may be stronger in some middle-income countries than in more developed countries. Accordingly, the family may exert a stronger influence on individuals' choices, not least because it is more directly affected by the results of those choices. In the Philippines, for example, older children on leaving college are expected to gain jobs which will enable them to contribute to the costs of sending younger siblings to college. This suggests a need for active parental involvement strategies in career guidance programs in schools; it also suggests that some adult guidance strategies might be addressed to households rather than to individuals (see, again, para.2.25).

1.20 *Emigration.* A further important issue in some developing countries is the option of emigrating or seeking employment abroad in the search for better opportunities. This is a particularly important issue in the Philippines, where students flock to courses where there is a perceived demand overseas, especially in North America. Such emigration reduces unemployment and is a source of foreign exchange; on the other hand, it means a loss of talent. This 'brain drain' is also currently a source of concern in Romania.

1.21 *Cultural factors.* All of these factors are likely to influence both the attention paid to career guidance and the way it is carried out. Cultural factors may play a part here too. Career guidance, for example, seems to be more directive in nature in some middle-income countries. There may also in certain cultures be some resistance to help-seeking, which may be viewed as a sign of weakness, or there may be traditional occupational roles for groups and individuals (defined, for example, by gender, ethnicity or social class) that are difficult to change.

Policy Goals

1.22 The policy goals identified across the seven countries have been divided by OECD (2004) into three categories identified by OECD countries as being pursued through their career guidance services, and these formed a framework for the review and analysis in this study. The first are *learning* goals. These include:

- supporting lifelong learning (for both youth and adults) and the development of human resources to support national and individual economic growth,
- supporting a more flexible education and training system;

- supporting a stronger but more flexible vocational orientation within the school system;
- improving the efficiency of education and training systems by reducing dropout rates and increasing graduation rates;
- strengthening linkages between education/training systems and the labor market.

1.23 The second are *labor market* goals. These include:

- improving labor market efficiency;
- reducing mismatch between supply and demand;
- addressing skill shortages;
- improving labor adaptability in response to market conditions, in terms of both geographical and occupational mobility;
- reducing the extent and duration of unemployment;
- minimizing individual dependency on income-support systems, as these are introduced.

1.24 The third are *social equity* goals. These include:

- supporting equal opportunities in relation to education and employment;
- addressing the needs of disadvantaged and marginalized groups;
- supporting the social integration of ethnic minorities;
- supporting female labor market participation;
- addressing gender segmentation in the labor market.

1.25 The balance between and within the three categories varies across the countries: at the time of the study, for example, the emphasis on social equity was stronger in South Africa than in some of the other countries. Underpinning the rationale for investment in guidance services is the notion that addressing these goals through institutional reforms alone is not enough: that career guidance has a role to play both in lubricating and in supplementing such reforms. In most of the countries, this policy rationale is acknowledged; in some, it is being increasingly articulated; but it is not being strongly implemented in many.

1.26 *The traditional rationale.* In general, the policy rationale tends currently to be framed in somewhat institutional and reactive terms, with career guidance being viewed as a measure designed to lubricate the operation of the education system and its relationship to the labor market, and to combat such phenomena as unemployment or mismatch. These concerns result in a recognition of the need to prepare young people more effectively for entering the labor market, to ensure that their educational choices are informed by the needs of the labor market, and to develop career guidance services for unemployed youth and adults as part of the range of modern labor market instruments and institutions.

1.27 *The emerging rationale.* There are also, however, signs of a more dynamic and proactive policy rationale, viewing career guidance as part of a human resource

development strategy designed to improve economic efficiency, to reduce labor market failures, to respond to technological and economic change, and to enable the country concerned to compete effectively in global markets; as well as to help address social equity, access, and democratization by making citizens equally aware of opportunities. Under this view career guidance has an important role to play in encouraging all individuals, including youth and adults, to engage in career planning and learning throughout life, so enabling them to respond more flexibly to the opportunities offered by a dynamic labor market. In other words, career guidance is seen as an important part of a national strategy for lifelong learning and sustained employability, driven significantly by individuals themselves.

1.28 The key distinction between the two approaches is that whereas the *traditional reactive rationale* focuses mainly on services for young people and initial education, and increasingly for the unemployed, the *emerging proactive rationale* requires guidance to be available to all on a lifelong basis. As will be indicated in Section 2, current provision tends to be based on the traditional approach. Sections 3 and 4 will then examine the case for the emerging approach, and its policy implications.

2. TAKING STOCK

The Main Sectors

2.1 Current career guidance provision in the seven countries can be described and analyzed in terms of five main sectors, each of which will be reviewed in turn:

- Schools.
- Tertiary education.
- Public employment services.
- Employer-based services.
- The private and voluntary sectors.

Schools

2.2 *The role of guidance counselors.* In all seven countries in the study, career guidance in schools is mainly provided as part of a broad guidance counselor role³ which also includes guidance on pupils' learning and behavioral problems and on the personal and social problems to which these may be linked. In some cases the guidance counselors have also been trained as teachers, but in some cases not. In larger schools they usually do not do any teaching themselves; they may, however, support other teachers in implementing guidance-related programs within the curriculum (in South Africa they regularly teach such programs themselves). Their staffing levels, in countries where this information is available, are:

- In the Philippines, the ratio of guidance counselors to pupils that is encouraged by accrediting associations for private schools is usually 1:500; in public schools, however, the actual ratio tends to be much higher.
- In Romania, the official allocation for counselors is 1:800.
- In Russia, across all types of school, the actual ratio of school psychologists to pupils is 1:300 (though some are based outside schools).
- In Turkey, the actual ratio for guidance counselors in secondary schools is 1:905 (the target is 1:500).

In South Africa, many posts for guidance teachers have been frozen in recent years, and the role is to some extent now being supplanted by the curriculum role of 'life orientation' teachers (see para.2.8).

2.3 In most countries, the guidance counselors receive limited support from psycho-pedagogical centers (under varying titles) which may be located in a local or provincial education office and service a number of schools. These services may include:

³ Alternative titles include 'school counsellor', 'psychological counsellor', 'school pedagogue', 'school psychologist' and 'guidance teacher'.

- Offering special diagnostic services to students with special needs.
- Delivering individual and group guidance services in schools which do not have a guidance counselor on their staff.
- Providing a more general support resource to guidance services within schools.

In Poland, Romania and Turkey, such centers are a major part of the service delivery model, particularly in smaller schools which do not have designated guidance personnel.

2.4 *Marginalisation of career guidance.* Within this integrated approach, there is consistent evidence across the seven countries that career guidance tends to be marginalized, in two respects:

- Guidance counselors tend to spend much of their time on the learning and behavioral problems of a minority of pupils, at the expense of the help needed by all pupils in relation to their educational and vocational choices.
- Guidance on such choices tends to focus mainly on immediate educational decisions, rather than on occupational decisions and on longer-term career implications.

There are a number of reasons for this:

- The demands of learning and behavioral problems, and of subject choices, are immediate and pressing, and tend to be viewed by school management as being of higher priority.
- The training of guidance counselors often tends to be strongly psychological in nature, and to pay limited attention to career guidance in general and to knowledge of the labor market in particular.
- Guidance counselors' links with the labor market tend to be weak, and they often have little access to sources of comprehensive and up-to-date occupational and educational information.

In some cases, these problems may be exacerbated by using guidance counselors to carry out administrative tasks which have nothing to do with their guidance role and may indeed (in the case of disciplinary tasks) be in conflict with it: this has been an issue in the Philippines, for example, as it has in some more developed countries.

2.5 *Introduction of career counselors.* Accordingly, in one country (Poland), separate career counselors are now being introduced into schools (Box 1). Consideration might fruitfully be given in other countries, particularly where schools have a team of guidance counselors or might share such a team, to appointing one of the team as a specialist career counselor. This would have the merit of:

- Focusing more attention on career guidance within the school.
- Enabling the specialist to pay attention to the distinctive needs of career guidance work, including keeping in touch with changes in post-school education and training provision and in the labor market.

Box 1: School career counselors in Poland

In Poland, a regulation issued in January 2003 introduced a new role into schools. At every level of education, each school may now employ a school career counselor. Training courses are likely to be part-time, extending over 12-18 months. This position is not obligatory, so it may take some time for this new role to appear in schools all over the country. Initial priority is being given to schools closest to entry to the labor market. In smaller schools, the role may cover more than one school, or be combined with – for example – teaching of entrepreneurship.

2.6 *Classroom guidance teachers.* Alongside the guidance counselors, most of the countries also have a system of classroom guidance teachers or ‘homeroom’ teachers. Under this system most teachers have, alongside their subject teaching, responsibility for the general educational development and social well-being of a particular class. This may include a guidance role, as well as administrative and disciplinary roles: in some countries (e.g. Philippines, Turkey), some attention is given to guidance skills in initial teacher training in order to prepare for this role. It may also incorporate some curriculum time, which can be used for various purposes, including attention to career guidance issues. A systematic approach along these lines is outlined in Box 2.

Box 2: Class guidance programs in Turkey

In Turkey, career education is included as part of class guidance programs in all types of school, integrated with personal and social education. For the 9th, 10th and 11th grades of secondary education, class guidance programs have been developed in order to ensure congruity in weekly guidance hours at secondary education institutions throughout the country, and to prevent the use of these hours for other purposes. Teacher handbooks were introduced in 2000/01 to guide teachers through in-class activities; support is also offered by the school’s guidance counselor(s). On average, half of the guidance program and handbooks cover educational and career guidance topics and activities.

2.7 *Career education in the curriculum.* A few countries have separate career education programs within the curriculum, designed to help pupils learn about the world of work and to develop career management skills. In Russia, a compulsory course along these lines was discontinued in the mid-1990s as part of permitting schools to have increased curricular autonomy. In Romania, such a course has been introduced in vocational schools and in the post-secondary curriculum, but not yet in academic high schools: the course is designed to be assessed like any other subject, and some controversy has arisen about how to ‘grade’ such activities.

2.8 An alternative curricular strategy is to integrate career education into a broader subject within the curriculum. In the Philippines, for example, it is now commonly integrated into ‘values education’. In Poland, it is being incorporated in a new ‘entrepreneurship’ course in secondary vocational schools and in the general lyceum. In South Africa, it is being integrated into a new course in ‘life orientation’, which also covers personal development, study skills, citizenship and physical education, and leads to credits; two hours a week are devoted to this course, of which between 5% and 7% is used for career awareness and guidance activities.

2.9 A final curricular strategy, which tends to supplement these other approaches, is to explore opportunities to integrate elements of career education into mainstream subjects. In Turkey, for instance, work and handcrafts education, and science and social science courses, include some information about related career opportunities. In the gymnasium in Poland, preparation for working life is being incorporated into social science. In Romania and South Africa, all subject teachers are encouraged to make connections between their subject and aspects of career education, though no clear mechanisms to support this have been developed, and implementation is accordingly limited and uneven.

2.10 *Experiencing the world of work.* In all of the countries, opportunities for school pupils to experience the world of work in a direct way are very restricted. Unlike some OECD countries, none operates systematic programs of work experience as part of general education: any work experience is as part of vocational courses, and primarily designed for skill training rather than for career exploration⁴. Some provide school visits to workplaces: this is fairly common, for example, in some schools in Poland and in Russia (where they are termed ‘career probes’). Another popular approach is career fairs, often organized on a provincial (as in South Africa) or municipality basis: sometimes, as in Turkey (see Box 3) and Russia, these are designed particularly to orient pupils to entering technical and vocational education; in Chile and Romania, they tend to be staffed exclusively by representatives from universities and colleges rather than employers, and are in effect education fairs.

Box 3: Vocational and technical education fairs in Turkey

In Turkey, vocational and technical education fairs are organized annually in all cities to exhibit teacher and student products which show the advances made in vocational and technical education and are designed to make this field of education more widely known among the public. Regulations insist that all 8th-grade pupils in the city should be scheduled to visit the fair in groups, as part of a wider program to orient them to vocational and technical education and its relationship to employment opportunities.

2.11 *Links with public employment services.* Some countries have attempted to establish relationships between schools and public employment services (see paras. 2.21-

⁴ There are a few exceptions to this in private schools – for example in the Philippines and South Africa.

26) in order to provide some links with the world of work: this is the case, for example, in the Philippines, Poland, Romania and Russia. A model adapted from Germany has been developed in Turkey (Box 4). In Chile, a pilot program in 1999-2000 included talks in schools by public employment service (OMIL) staff on labor market trends; joint programs to help school drop-outs to mix school and a job; access to school reports for OMIL staff seeing recent school-leavers; plus (to a lesser extent) OMILs acting as brokers between schools and employers (to arrange talks, work visits, etc.). In general, however, public employment services are not resourced to provide such services on an extensive scale. While the model is useful, it only provides limited access of students to career services and information, and may not facilitate development of flexible just-in-time services in schools.

Box 4: Links between the public employment service (ISKUR) and schools in Turkey

Within the framework of a formal protocol agreed with the Ministry of National Education in 1993, visits are organized for primary and secondary school groups to ISKUR Career Counseling Centers in areas where such centers are available. Here ISKUR staff give detailed explanations to students about the importance of choosing a career, its relationship to educational choices, and the sources from which career information can be obtained. These explanations are supplemented by videotapes and films. Such centers also have a resource center where students can examine a variety of career files and other information sources.

In addition, ISKUR staff visit both general and technical/vocational secondary schools to run class and group discussions. Individual counseling sessions may be offered too. Another activity is meetings with parents which aim at enabling parents to adopt more conscious strategies for helping their children with their career choices.

Working groups have been set up to implement the protocol, and their reports are reviewed biannually by a Follow-Up, Evaluation and Implementation Committee. However, ISKUR is not currently equipped to provide such services on an extensive basis. Its network of Career Centers is not easily accessible for many schools, and does not offer materials that students can take with them (i.e. brochures or handouts on career and educational opportunities).

2.12 *Focus on tertiary education.* In practice, the main focus of much guidance in schools tends to be on entry to tertiary education, viewed as an end in itself. This is influenced by the predilections of school staff, the pressure from pupils and parents, and the impact of success in this respect on the school's status. In some cases – Poland and Turkey, for example – it is exacerbated by the complexities of the tactics of choosing which institutions to apply to, which consume much time in guidance provision, and also in Turkey by the use of national examinations which heavily dictate school and career choice.

2.13 *Testing.* In several countries, much time is also consumed by psychometric testing designed to support educational choices both within and beyond the school. This is particularly the case in former centrally planned economies where unemployment was not recognized, services were psychological in nature and primarily focused on

problematic clients as opposed to the bulk of the population, and the needs of the state predominated over the needs and interests of the individual.

2.14 *Career information.* There is little comprehensive up-to-date career information available to counselors, let alone individual students, in most of the case-study countries. Schools tend not to have much information on educational and occupational opportunities openly available for pupils to browse through, largely because of the lack of such materials nationally (see para.3.21). This problem is sometimes exacerbated by a failure to distribute to schools the materials that exist (this is the case, for example, with some public employment service materials in Poland and Turkey). Moreover, there are often limitations on pupil access to the resources available within the school: a few materials may be available in school libraries; but often key resources are kept by guidance counselors in their offices. The growth of career resources on the Internet, and of access to the Internet in schools, could be a partial response to these problems. By comparison with most OECD countries, however, such access is still restricted in most schools, and absent altogether in some.

2.15 *Limitations.* In general, career guidance provision is limited in most public schools in the seven countries (it is sometimes stronger in private schools). In many cases, the problems of mounting such programs are enhanced in urban areas by the crowded facilities, large class sizes (often over 40 and sometimes much larger than this) and (in some instances) split-shift working; and in rural areas by the remoteness of some schools along with shortages of trained staff, materials and information. Such programs as are mounted tend to be focused around key transition points (e.g. entry to tertiary education) rather than being developmental in nature. In some countries (e.g. Chile), attempts to improve provision are complicated by policies relating to allowing schools increased autonomy: whereas in other areas of the curriculum there may be other forces which ensure some minimum standard of provision (e.g. examination systems), this is not usually the case in the area of career education and guidance.

Tertiary Education

2.16 *Policy vacuum.* In tertiary education, it is even more common than in schools for decisions about whether and how to offer career guidance to be left to each institution to decide. This is particularly the case in relation to universities, which in most countries are accorded substantial autonomy. Even where there are policy mechanisms in place to enforce standards of provision, they are not applied to the area of career guidance. Thus in the Philippines, where the Commission on Higher Education has a Student Auxiliary Services Division, career guidance is not included among the 16 services for which the division monitors delivery methods and efficiency; in Russia and Turkey, universities are obliged by law to offer counseling and psychological services, but these may or may not include career guidance.

2.17 *General services.* In most countries, there is accordingly no common model, and not even systematic information about the range of current provision. Insofar as generalizations are possible, it seems that in most of the countries career guidance tends –

as in schools – to be part of broader guidance and counseling services. Thus in the Philippines they tend to be part of guidance offices or student services; in Russia, South Africa and Turkey, part of counseling and psychological services. Within such structures career guidance is only likely to be given prominence if a counselor has had particular training in this area and/or if the university administration accords importance to it.

2.18 *Specialist services.* In some cases, placement services have been set up alongside these broader services to help students to manage their transition into the labor market: this is true of some universities in the Philippines, for example, and of a few in Russia. In a number of cases in Poland, Romania and Turkey, these take the form of more extensive career planning services. In Poland, the growth of such ‘career bureaux’ has been positively encouraged by government policy in the form of a grant scheme for set-up costs (Box 5); there is also a network structure between the bureaux which could valuably be emulated by other countries as such services develop.

Box 5: Career bureaux in Poland

The most important of the tasks of Career Bureaux are job placement services offered to students and graduates. Other tasks may include: individual guidance; workshops on job interviews, self-presentation, communication skills, stress management, etc.; meetings and training sessions in faculties; databases on job vacancies, job descriptions, information on studies abroad, vocational courses, seasonal jobs, etc.; organizing work practice periods, and voluntary and temporary work.

In addition, Career Bureaux co-operate with employers in handling job offers, arranging companies’ presentations, organizing job fairs, and facilitating access of students to employers. They also communicate information on employers’ requirements to the university authorities, allowing them to consider modifying their curricula accordingly.

Most Career Bureau staff are employed by the higher education institution where they work, but some may be employees of provincial labor offices. In Wroclaw, a single center services nine universities: this is, however, an unusual arrangement.

The first Career Bureau was set up in 1993; by 2002 they existed in around 45 institutions of higher education (out of around 386). At the end of 2002 the Ministry of Economy, Labor and Social Policy set up a grant scheme for universities and colleges, offering set-up support for equipment, resources and staff training (though not salary costs) for establishing Career Bureaux. As a result of this and other initiatives, around 135 new Career Bureaux in higher education institutions all over the country had opened by summer 2003. Many belong to a Polish Network of Career Bureaux. Formed in 1998, its activities include information exchange, in-service training, co-operative arrangements for exchange of job-vacancy information and other services, and representing the bureaux in relevant policy fora.

2.19 *Other services.* In most universities, students receive advice from academic staff regarding course choices, but this rarely covers in any depth the career implications of these choices. Some faculties and departments may offer opportunities for work experience, or sessions to develop job-search skills. In a few universities in the Philippines, these have been developed into career development programs including career exploration workshops. In Turkey, student organizations run some career

activities, including liaison with employers. In Russia and Turkey, the public employment service makes some special provision for university graduates.

2.20 *Unmet needs.* In general, however, the career guidance services available to tertiary education students in most countries are very limited. Yet as participation rates grow, as institutions become more diverse, and as relationships between courses and the labor market become more complex and less predictable, the case for such services becomes ever-stronger. Most students enter tertiary education because they believe that it will lead to successful employment outcomes. The investment of public expenditure in tertiary education is based, at least in part, on a similar assumption. More help to students is needed to achieve such outcomes. There is accordingly an urgent need for policies designed to strengthen career guidance services in this sector.

Public Employment Services

2.21 *Main focus on job placement.* All seven countries have public employment services. Their main function is to help job-seekers find jobs. This is addressed particularly to people who are unemployed, but also to people who are seeking to change their jobs. Their success in placing people in jobs is dependent in part on the range of jobs that are notified to them. In Russia, for example, employers are in theory obliged to notify vacancies to the federal employment service, but in practice it seems likely that under 5% are notified, many of them hard-to-fill vacancies.

2.22 *Move to self-service.* In all countries, there is considerable scope for moving towards an approach which makes stronger use of self-service methods. In the Philippines, for example, an internet-based job-matching system is being introduced, but at present only around 50 of the 1,680 public employment service offices have Internet access. Similarly, in Turkey vacancies are now placed on the service's website. A self-service approach which is becoming popular in the Philippines is job fairs where job-seekers can make direct and immediate contact with employers with job vacancies.

2.23 *Compulsion.* Where unemployment benefit systems exist, individuals are normally expected to attend unemployment offices regularly to see job-placement officers as a condition of receipt of benefit. They may also lose their benefits if without good cause they refuse a job offered to them. In several of the countries, however, such benefit systems are still very limited or under development. This is the case, for instance, in Turkey, where the proportion of the unemployed who are entitled to such benefits is still low; in Chile, where an unemployment compensation scheme is currently being introduced; and in the Philippines, where it is still under discussion. In Chile, it is anticipated that the new scheme may result in the expansion of public employment offices, to make them more accessible across the country.

2.24 *Career services.* In most cases, the focus of public employment services is on jobs, not careers. Their primary concern is to get people into any job as quickly as possible, rather than to ensure that they are in sustainable jobs which offer opportunities for progression and are appropriate to their interests and abilities. But in all countries, the

public employment services include, alongside job placement, wider career and employment counseling services:

- In Poland, each of the 373 area labor offices has a unit staffed by career counselors which provides career information and counseling services: most clients are referred to the career counselors by placement officers; some come direct. Furthermore 52 provincial labor offices have Centers for Career Information and Planning which in addition run courses on career planning and job-seeking skills, support job clubs in their region, collect and disseminate regional career information, and have a resource center which is visited by local schools.
- In Turkey, alongside the employment offices which operate in all 81 provinces, there are 43 Career Information Centers which provide resource centers, and 17 Job and Career Counseling Services which also offer individual and group counseling activities; together these cover 41 of the 81 provinces.
- In Russia, the 400-plus employment offices offer some limited career counseling; clients with difficult psychological or career guidance needs can be referred to 85-plus Career Information, Guidance and Counseling Centers, which operate in nearly all of the 89 regions.
- In Romania, there are 227 Career Information and Counseling Centers linked to county employment offices.
- In Chile, there are employment offices in around 233 of the 341 municipalities; 45 of these also provide employment counseling services.
- In the Philippines, some employment offices offer possibilities for employment counseling in a small number of cases where there is a substantial gap between aspiration and reality.
- In South Africa, job-seekers are in principle entitled to request guidance and counseling services; in practice, however, because of low staffing levels⁵, such services are available only on a very limited basis, and only in certain labor offices.

2.25 *Social training programs.* Guidance elements may also be included in social training programs for unemployed people managed by public employment services. A promising example of such provision is outlined in Box 6 on the following page. In Chile, programs designed to help in setting up small enterprises may be linked to implementation of a new Family Enterprise Law which is encouraging households engaged in selling services or products within the informal economy to secure licenses for these activities, so registering them as part of the formal economy, with access to some training and support services.

⁵ In OECD countries, overall staffing in local labor offices averages one staff member per 125 registered job-seekers; in high-unemployment countries in central and eastern Europe, the ratio is around 1:250-300; in South Africa it is in the thousands (Fretwell & Goldberg, 1993; OECD, 2001).

Box 6: Life skills training programs in South Africa

In South Africa, policy is in place to provide life skills training, including a career guidance component, for participants involved in Department of Labor funded training in order to be placed on social development projects and in self-employment opportunities. Life skills training will also be offered to those applicants wishing to register for learnerships. A standards-generating body has been established to develop standards for life skills. Once these unit standards have been developed, the Department aims to outsource the provision of life skills training to private service providers, and to fund this through the National Skills Fund.

2.26 Decentralization. In a number of countries many public services, including employment services, have been significantly decentralized. This can result in stronger local ownership and customization of services, but it has also produced some difficulties in the labor and career counseling field. Specifically, the labor market is a national resource, and labor elasticity requires a degree of occupational and geographical mobility and related information: the move to decentralize can work at cross purposes to development and dissemination of national information on the labor market, and to the harmonious development of services in the interests of labor mobility. In the Philippines, for example, the extent of resources provided for employment services depends significantly on the priorities of the local mayor; services may also be expected, for local political reasons, to give preference to local residents in allocation of job opportunities. In Chile, municipalities are not obliged to create employment offices, and accordingly their number has fluctuated over time, as has their internal structure and mode of functioning; central statistics are no longer maintained on their operations. In Poland, the decentralization policy has meant that employment offices have tended to function in isolation from one another, to be under-financed and to suffer from a high turnover of staff, and maintenance of national labor market information sources is threatened.

Employer-based Services

2.27 Career development within companies. In most of the countries, the employer-based services which have been developing in OECD countries are confined largely (though not exclusively) to international corporations operating in the countries concerned. These may include, for example, regular development review processes and life/career planning workshops. In the Philippines, some companies organize 1/2-day ‘job fairs’ to enable employees to know the jobs and career paths in other departments and even to apply for vacant positions.

2.28 Government support. In at least two countries, governments have paid some attention to encouraging employers to pay more attention to career development issues. In the Philippines, the Department of Labor and Employment has forged a ‘memorandum of agreement’ to this effect with the Personnel Management Association of the Philippines. More significantly, in South Africa provision for career guidance is required of companies which seek refunds on their skill development levies (Box 7). There could be scope for similar strategies to be adopted in other countries with training-levy systems. In Chile, for instance, a tax-rebate scheme allows firms to deduct investments in learning for their workers from their taxes (up to 1% of their wages bill); this is now

complemented by a new training financial mechanism which allows companies to contract with Chilean banks to pre-finance training/education services and for the sums involved (plus a service fee) to be refunded by the government.

Box 7: Guidance provision in relation to skill development levies in South Africa

In order for employers to receive a refund on the skills development levies paid to their Sector Education and Training Authorities, they are required to offer accredited training. This training can either be provided in-house by the company itself, or by outside providers. For a company or private provider to receive accreditation it must offer, amongst other things, guidance and counseling services for learners/employees. It must also employ registered Education, Training and Development Practitioners (ETDP), whose qualifications include unit standards relating to guidance and counseling of learners.

The focus of the services is usually on assisting employees to develop their careers within the company, not on general career choices outside the company. Information provided focuses on career opportunities in the company, the profiles and requirements for various positions, and the training opportunities provided. Assessment focuses on determining a suitable match with requirements of job profiles in the company, and assisting individuals to identify areas for potential development in order to meet job-profile requirements.

These services are mainly offered by the large corporations, which currently employ around 20% of the workforce.

2.29 *Trade-union involvement.* In general, trade unions in the countries in this study (unlike some OECD countries) have not so far taken much interest in career development issues. Most are preoccupied with promoting and safeguarding their members' economic interests, and protecting their health and job security, especially against threats of job loss. Some have shown interest in training issues, which could lead to more interest in career development matters. In the Philippines the Department of Labor and Employment has recently sought within its Labor Education program to encourage unions to include attention to career development matters in collective bargaining agreements. A rare example of direct union involvement in career guidance delivery occurred in Poland, where unions participated in offering training and support for peer counselors in a government-funded program for workers made redundant as a result of economic restructuring in the steel industry. In Russia, some unions may offer career support as part of the social help they provide to workers and their families.

2.30 *Redundancy support.* Inclusion of career guidance elements in reorientation packages for redundant workers is growing, though still limited in scale. In several countries, policy support is being provided for such provision:

- In Poland, Romania, and Turkey, labor redundancy programs include a broad range of services, including in-depth counseling and job placement which have been evaluated (see para.1.14) and found to be effective as a screening for more expensive interventions (e.g. training) as well as in their own right by helping individuals who are frictionally unemployed to rapidly re-enter the labor market.

- In South Africa, the Social Plan agreed by the National Economic and Development Council makes provision for any company that anticipates reducing its workforce by 500 employees, or 10% of the workforce, to notify the Director General of Labor (this is not at present compulsory, though there are proposals to make it so). Upon notification, the Department of Labor, in partnership with the National Productivity Institute, is required to establish a task team to work with the employer to determine how to avoid, or at least minimize, the need for retrenchment. If retrenchments are inevitable, the plan then requires the Department of Labor to provide a range of services for employees facing retrenchment, including the provision of career information and counseling, and life skills training.
- In Chile, where companies lay off workers because of restructuring, they are now able to claim expenditure on retraining provision for such workers against the tax-rebate scheme (see para.2.28). This is slowly encouraging more companies to invest in this kind of provision. Sometimes the schemes include career guidance and employment counselling components, using expertise from private-sector vocational psychologists and human resource development (HRD) experts.

2.31 *Links with HRD.* The growing link between HRD work and career guidance is exemplified by the emergence in a few universities in Poland and Turkey of master's courses in human resource development and career counselling. The same trend has been noted in a few OECD countries (OECD, 2004).

The Private and Voluntary Sectors

2.32 *Individual market.* The private sector is not strongly developed in any of the countries in terms of career guidance services paid for by individuals. A few services have been established in the larger cities in Poland. Usually they employ no more than 3-4 persons. Mostly they provide a wide range of services, not limited to career counseling. A significant barrier to the development of private career counseling services in Poland is the lack of popularly available career information databases, methods and tools that can be used in the private career counselor's work.

2.33 In South Africa, around half of the 5,000 registered psychologists operate as private practitioners in clinical, counseling, educational or industrial psychology. All of these categories, with the possible exception of clinical psychologists, usually offer career counseling as part of their menu of services. Extensive use in such work is made of psychometric assessment, individual counseling and self-assessment. Their clients include companies, individuals, and private schools.

2.34 *Employer market.* The main career guidance services in the private sector, however, are paid for by employers. These include consultancy organizations which offer services to companies that include outplacement services, headhunting services, and various other career development activities. Examples of two such organizations are outlined in Box 8 on the following page. However, in some countries the operations of the services are restricted (see para.2.35).

Box 8: Private career development companies in the Philippines and South Africa

In the Philippines, Career Systems, Inc. (CSI), established in 1983, is recognized as a pioneer in providing consulting services and training programs in career development. It provides a wide range of career development consulting services and training programs. These include: designing and installing career development systems, mentoring, coaching and succession development programs; and conducting training programs which include life/career planning, career coaching, career counseling and facilitation skills. It also conducts life/career transitions programs for retrenched employees to prepare them for another corporate career, for self-employment or for an entrepreneurial career after the closure of their organization.

In South Africa, Chart DMB is a private employment agency which provides comprehensive human resource services to employers, including selection services, career development services for employees, retention strategies, and career transition services for companies undergoing restructuring. Career development services include intensive career counseling to assist individuals to enhance their careers within the company. Retention strategies include assisting valued employees plan their careers within the company, and developing coaching and mentoring programs for these individuals. Career transition programs include outplacement services, and career counseling for departing employees.

2.35 *Private employment agencies.* Much more common are private employment agencies, which provide job-placement services, normally paid for by employers. There is a direct linkage between counseling and job placement, and it is difficult for a private firm to prosper doing the former without the latter. In most countries these agencies have to be officially licensed by government and to meet specified quality standards (though some others may operate illegally). In Turkey, such regulation has just been approved by the Parliament. In Chile, it has been discontinued. In several countries (e.g. Romania and South Africa) there is also a rapid growth of Internet-based employment agencies; and in all countries individuals also of course have access to similar databases in other countries.

2.36 *Contracting-out.* In some countries, certain public employment services are being contracted out to private organizations, including both for-profit and not-for-profit organizations. Two examples are described in Box 9; a further one has already been mentioned in Box 6.

Box 9: Contracting out of public employment services in Chile and Romania

In Chile, some of the initial assessment, career guidance and insertion roles in relation to social training programs have been contracted out to 13 Training Application Centres (CPCs). Some of these are for-profit organizations; some are not-for-profit (universities etc.). The new arrangement is designed in part to ensure that the programs are more accurately targeted at those who need them most. CPCs have to demonstrate that they have attracted three times as many applicants as there are training places, and that they have allocated places to individuals according to set criteria. Clients can however choose which program they enter, within a range of accredited providers. The CPCs thus have the potential to become a new resource for guidance provision.

In Romania, active labor measures for displaced workers, including career guidance elements, have been contracted out to public or private service providers. A gross impact evaluation in April 2002 showed that, as of September 1, 2001, there had been 88 such contracts, with 31,679 clients served, and 6,610 clients placed, at a cost per client of US\$12.46, and a cost per placement of US\$59.70.

2.37 *Non-governmental organizations.* In several countries there are also some other services which incorporate career guidance elements in the non-profit, voluntary sector. These include various church, community and civic organizations. Their target-groups often comprise disadvantaged youth, including street children, and unemployed adults. The non-profit sector has been particularly influential in career guidance provision in South Africa (Box 10) and often includes work in the non-formal sector of employment.

Box 10: Non-governmental organizations in the career guidance sector in South Africa

During the late 1980s and early 1990s a number of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in the career guidance sector flourished, partly because they were able to work across ethnic boundaries and were less compromised than official agencies by the legacy of the apartheid regime. In 1991 a national association of such NGOs was established, the South African Vocational Guidance and Education Association (SAVGEA), which by 1994 had 24 members across the country.

However, 1994 saw a dramatic shift in the priorities of the international, corporate and other bodies that had funded these services. Within two years SAVGEA was forced to close, and by 2003 only three of the original members were still operational: the Careers Research and Information Center (CRIC) in Cape Town, the Careers Resource Center (CRC) in Pietermaritzburg, and the Center for Entrepreneurship and Education Development (formerly the Durban South Career Center) in Durban. Nonetheless many of the policies and programs developed by the sector have been incorporated into government policies, and several people who worked for it now occupy positions within government. The sector also continues to play a significant role in the field, both in the development of career information, and in the provision of services to less advantaged communities.

2.38 *Career information.* A final area in which the private sector has established a strong niche in some countries is publishing career information material. Thus in Chile, Poland, Romania and South Africa there are publishing companies which issue educational guides (mainly on universities), careers guides, job-search handbooks and computer software; in Russia there are privately produced career magazines. Elsewhere, however, the private sector's role in this area is limited or non-existent.

3. CHANGING THE MOLD

Strengths and Weaknesses

3.1 The *strengths* of existing provision in the seven countries include:

- A structure of general guidance services in the school system, and to a lesser extent within tertiary education.
- Some career guidance services within the public employment services.
- Examples of innovative practice, including some programs of world class (those seen during the project visits included Ankara College in Turkey, and Ateneo de Manila University in the Philippines).

3.2 The *weaknesses* include:

- A lack of formal co-ordination mechanisms between the major stakeholders, in particular between labor and education.
- Marginalisation of career guidance within general guidance services in education.
- Excessive emphasis on labor-intensive one-to-one services delivered by psychologists and other specialists to a minority of clients, with little support to the majority of potential clients.
- Excessive emphasis on psychometric testing⁶.
- Limited career and educational information resources, and restricted access to the resources that do exist.
- Limited opportunities for students to experience the world of work.
- Tendency of public employment services to focus more on jobs than on careers.
- Lack of career development services for employees, especially outside large international corporations.

3.3 Addressing these weaknesses is particularly important if career guidance provision is to be reframed to support individual lifelong learning and sustained employability for all, as outlined at the end of Section 1. Moves in this direction are supported not only by changing policy requirements but also by changing concepts of career development.

Changing Concepts

3.4 *The traditional talent-matching model.* In most countries in the study, the dominant model of career guidance practice appears to be based on talent-matching approaches, grounded in differential psychology. The task is seen as one of measuring individual abilities and aptitudes, and then matching these to the demands of different occupations. The method is ‘test and tell’: psychometric assessment, followed by

⁶ Especially so since some of the tests used have not been standardized for use in the country concerned, and most lack predictive validity in occupational terms – i.e. there is no evidence that they predict success or satisfaction in relation to particular occupations.

interviews in which the diagnostic process is completed by a specialist expert and appropriate actions are recommended.

3.5 *Challenges.* In the last half-century, however, this model has come under attack, on a number of grounds which are related to the overall goal of career guidance policies supporting economic growth, addressing market failure, and maximizing the efficient use of public resources while at the same time addressing social equity issues. Specific issues which have emerged, related to the traditional talent matching role are:

- That the matching process should be concerned not just with individuals' abilities and aptitudes, but also with their needs, values and interests: in other words, that it should cover not only what they could offer to their work, but also what their work could offer to them.
- That guidance should be concerned not only with matching of existing attributes, but also with self-development and growth.
- That emphasis should shift from discrete decisions made at particular points in time to the underlying and continuous process of career development through which individuals determine the course of their lives: the developmental theories of Ginzberg *et al.* (1951) and Super (1953) provide a theoretical framework for this approach.
- That the aim of guidance should not be to deploy expertise to make decisions for people, but rather to help people make decisions for themselves. The client-centered counseling approaches of Rogers (1965) have been influential in this respect, shifting the focus from a diagnostic and prescriptive process to a facilitative process; from the content of decisions to the process of decision-making. As Katz (1969) put it: the aim of career guidance should be not to help individuals make wise decisions but to help them make decisions wisely.

3.6 *Newer concepts.* More recently, career guidance practice has been influenced by other theoretical developments. Krumboltz's social learning theory (Mitchell & Krumboltz, 1984) has addressed attention to the importance of behavioral experiences in influencing how individuals see themselves and their futures. Law's career learning theory (Law, 1996) has focused on the cycles through which career learning can progress. Constructivist theories (Peavy, 1998; Savickas, 2002) have emphasized how individuals can be helped to be authors of their career narratives: in other words, to understand what can be learned from their career progression to date and implications for their futures.

3.7 *Trends.* Within these changing concepts, three main trends can be identified:

- Career guidance should be available throughout life, to support lifelong learning and career development.
- It should be viewed as a learning experience, encompassing a range of learning interventions.
- It should foster the individual's autonomy, helping them to develop the skills and knowledge they need in order to manage their career decisions and transitions.

All support the emerging policy rationale outlined in paras.1.27-1.28.

3.8 *Implications.* In policy terms, this suggests a need for:

- Extending access.
- Building self-help approaches.
- Strengthening career and educational information resources.
- Improving staffing, but on a more differentiated basis.

Extending Access

3.9 Current services in the seven countries are heavily labor-intensive, and based mainly within a limited range of institutions – notably educational institutions and public employment offices. If access to career guidance is to be extended to all, on a lifelong basis, innovative and diverse forms of delivery are needed.

3.10 *Information and communication technology (ICT).* While it is recognized that use of ICT has limitations in developing countries, in particular in rural areas, the study indicates that a particularly important role can be played by ICT in middle-income and transition economies. At present, by comparison with more developed countries, the application of ICT to career guidance has been limited and designed largely to support institutionally-based services. One of the most extensive and sophisticated tools developed to date (Box 11) is designed for use within labor offices in Poland. Similarly, the ‘Career Explorer’ system in the Philippines, which matches individual characteristics and preferences to occupations, is available in CD format only in training centers and technical and vocational schools. South Africa has private-sector career information services on the internet, and in stand-alone CD format; and also one that works via a telephone and fax system using a national 800 dial-up number.

Box 11: Computer-based career guidance support system in Poland

‘Counselor 2000’ is a computer program designed to support the work of career counselors in over 500 labor offices across Poland. It is designed for use by clients as well as counselors. It comprises four modules:

- *Navigator.* An information and training module on how to use the program.
- *Client.* Gathers data based on the client’s self-descriptions in relation to their characteristics (interests, skills, etc.) and preferences, which can be matched to a list of occupations.
- *Occupations.* A multi-dimensional database on occupations, including multimedia resources, which can be searched by occupational characteristics.
- *Education.* A database of educational institutions which can be searched by type of course and other criteria.

3.11 *Internet.* In all seven countries, a few nationally-produced career resources are now more widely available on the Internet. Examples include public employment service career files (in Turkey), public databases of job vacancies, and Internet-based private employment agencies.

3.12 The potential of the Internet for expanding career guidance services is considerable, as access to it grows. In most of the countries, the technical infrastructure tends at present to be more limited than in more developed countries. This means that investment in the use of such technologies may have more limited immediate impact, with greater risks of a ‘digital divide’ between those who have access to them and those who do not. At the same time, however, the potential cost-effectiveness of such investment may hold greater possibilities for the rapid expansion of career guidance services than in countries where the current infrastructure of services is stronger. In environments where infrastructure is lacking, stand-alone options on compact discs and hard copy need to be available.⁷

3.13 *Helplines.* Alongside the Internet, there would also seem to be scope for using telephone helplines for career information and guidance, along the lines adopted in some OECD countries (OECD, 2004). To date, no such helplines have been developed in any of the countries in the present study except for the South African phone/fax career information service mentioned in para.3.10.

3.14 *Face-to-face services.* Strategies are also needed for extending access to face-to-face help in more diverse locations, including workplaces and community settings, so that people can find such help close to where they are and in locations where they feel comfortable. As shown in Section 2, the range of locations where such help is available at present is restricted. In the longer term, OECD (2004) suggests that web-based services, telephone-based services and face-to-face services could be viewed as alternative portals into an integrated network of services.

Building Self-help Approaches

3.15 Alongside strategies for extending access to career guidance services, attention is needed to constructing more of these services on a self-help basis, partly to make more cost-effective use of resources, but partly also to support individuals in taking more responsibility for managing their own career development.

3.16 *Career education.* In this respect, a potentially important role is played by career education programs in schools, designed to help pupils develop the knowledge, skills and attitudes they need to manage their careers. As outlined in Section 2, a number of such programs already exist in schools. They need to be extended and strengthened, and supported by more opportunities for pupils to experience the world of work: in all of the countries such opportunities are at present very limited in comparison with some OECD countries. Schemes of this kind require partnership arrangements with employers. Where these do not exist, they might be introduced initially on a pilot basis.

⁷ In the State of Oregon, USA, a very simple low-cost ‘needle sort’ self-assessment instrument, combined with hard copy occupational and educational information, was developed for use in primary school classrooms and libraries.

3.17 *Self-assessment.* There is a case for the emphasis on psychometric testing to be reduced, and replaced or supplemented by self-assessment techniques. In South Africa, many previous psychometric instruments have already been discontinued due to legal requirements to use culture-fair assessment tools. In the Philippines, growing use is being made of paper-and-pencil self-assessment techniques such as Holland's Self-Directed Search. These self-assessments are also usually an integrated component of most ICT-based career information systems.

3.18 *Group methods.* Self-help approaches can also be used within public employment services (see para.2.22). In Poland, Romania, and Turkey, for example, group counseling methods adapted from more developed countries have been used to help unemployed people to build their motivation and engage in career planning; use is also made of job clubs.

3.19 *Physical redesign.* Finally, there is scope to redesign the physical facilities of all career guidance services on a self-help basis. At present, most services in the seven countries are based on consultations with specialists, and it is common for any information resources to be kept in the counselor's office rather than on open display. In many OECD countries, it is becoming more common for a variety of ICT-based and other resources to be on open access, with clear signposting, and with specialist counselors being available for brief support as well as for longer counseling interviews. Diagnostic help can then be provided on reception to help clients decide whether they can operate on a self-help basis, need brief staff assistance, or require intensive professional help.

Strengthening Information Resources

3.20 In reconstructing career guidance services to encourage self-help, an important priority in most of the countries is to strengthen the available career and educational information resources. One of the key roles of career guidance services is to make sure that individuals' career decisions are based on accurate and comprehensive information.

3.21 *Gaps.* In most of the countries, the information currently available is inadequate. Several countries (e.g. Philippines, Russia) do not have comprehensive guides to post-secondary educational institutions: students accordingly have to resort to individual institutions' brochures. With the exception of Poland and Turkey, most do not have occupational descriptions available in a regularly updated form which individuals can use⁸. None has systematic labor market information on projected future supply and demand in different occupations designed for use by individuals in their career decision-making (though Poland has established an Interdepartmental Team for Forecasting Labor Demand as a first step in this direction).

⁸ In the Philippines such information was produced in the 1970s but not updated; in South Africa it was produced until 1994 but then discontinued. In Russia a handbook covering around 200 occupations was issued in 2000 but has not been revised since then.

3.22 *Demarcations.* Even where information exists, institutional demarcations often mean that it is not disseminated as widely as it might be, or one stakeholder will develop their information source (e.g. education will develop information on training programs; labor will develop career information) but not share it with the other. If used in isolation from each other, such systems do not meet the total information needs of the client. In Poland, for example, the distribution of information appears to be determined less by user needs than by provider needs: thus products developed by the labor authorities are distributed only to labor offices, while products commissioned by the education authorities are distributed only to educational institutions; again, information collected by the higher education Career Bureaux is not widely distributed to other guidance providers. Similar problems exist in Romania and Turkey. The result is inefficient use of national resources, duplication of effort in development, and failure to maximize usage of the publicly-funded resources that are produced.

3.23 *Need for integration.* A powerful case can be made for the development of integrated career information systems in which there is strong ‘cross-pathing’ between assessment instruments, occupational information (including labor market information), and educational information. These integrated systems can show, for example, the occupational implications of aptitude and interest assessments, and the educational pathways required to lead to particular occupations. This requires close collaboration between education and labor authorities. ICT-based systems make integration of occupational and educational information easier to deliver. The diagnostic front-end can be included in such ICT-based systems to enable individuals to input their characteristics and preferences and be guided to appropriate occupational and educational opportunities. A system along these lines is operating in Poland and is currently being developed in Chile under the ChileCalifica program; these systems are commonplace in more developed countries. Wherever possible, such systems should be made available on the Internet so that they can be accessible in the home as well as in institutional settings; or in stand-alone CD format to ensure that sites with poor telephone access can use the systems.

3.24 *Course follow-up data.* An important issue for students and parents in choosing tertiary education institutions is the employment record of students emerging from different courses. Such information is not available in any systematic form in any of the seven countries. In Chile an attempt was made to develop information of this kind, but was discontinued following resistance from higher education institutions. An important policy question is whether such resistance should be overcome on the grounds both of public accountability (since many institutions receive at least some of their funding from the state) and of consumer accountability.

3.25 *Quality assurance.* In some cases, the private sector has filled some of the gaps left by public provision. In policy terms, this raises the issue of whether standards should be developed and enforced to assure the minimum quality of occupational and educational information. Standards of this kind have been developed in some OECD countries (OECD, 2004), but not yet in any of the countries studied here.

Improving Differentiated Staffing for Career Guidance

3.26 Finally, enhanced and reframed services along the lines outlined earlier in this section require improved staff training in support of more differentiated staff roles.

3.27 *Current limitations.* In most of the countries, the field has tended hitherto to be dominated by psychologists and generic guidance counselors trained within a psychological tradition. The emphasis has accordingly tended to be on psychometric testing and assessment, and on a one-to-one relationship between expert and client. Attention to the specific competences of career guidance within the training of such psychologists and guidance counselors has in general been limited. In particular, little or no attention has been given to understanding of the opportunity structure and the labor market, or to ways of harnessing resources in support of self-help approaches.

3.28 *Strengthening.* Efforts are needed to strengthen career guidance elements within existing roles. An example of such an initiative is outlined in Box 12. It includes not only training elements but also networking for sustained support.

Box 12: Career guidance networks for school counselors in Chile

Part of the strategy of the ChileCalifica Program in its career guidance component is to form networks of school counsellors from at least five neighboring schools plus local adult education centers who will meet every two months and engage in joint development work. This work will include, but not be confined to, designing a work plan on how to make best use at different stages of the career information system being developed by the program (see para.3.23). The process was initiated by a pilot course on career guidance which was run for 240 school counselors during 2002. During 2003 91 such networks are being established, in 6 regions; by 2005 there will be 318, covering the whole country.

3.29 *More specific courses.* There is also a need to develop more specific training courses in career guidance. Some such courses have begun to emerge. In Poland, Turkey, and Romania, university curricula for career counselors were developed as part of World Bank projects, and are now being used as the basis of programs offered by multiple universities. Such courses need to be framed around new models of delivery. Their theoretical basis needs to be multi-disciplinary in nature; there also needs to be a strong focus on practical competences, including the management of guidance resources as well as direct service delivery.

3.30 *Role definitions.* To support the development of such courses, a clearer definition of the role of career counselor is required. In Romania, a job description and occupational standards for the role have been developed by the Council for Occupational Standards and Assessment: universities take this into account in designing their syllabuses. In Poland, the profession of career counselor was added to the 'Classification of Occupations and Trades' in 1995, and draft role descriptions and standards were developed in 2000 which covered career counselor roles in all sectors. In Turkey, draft legislation has been passed to give a legal status to career counselors, employment

counselors and labor market officers within the public employment service. In most other countries, however, such definitions do not yet exist.

3.31 *Competence frameworks.* There is scope for developing these definitions into a competence framework covering the competences required not just of career counselors but of all professionals and paraprofessionals involved in career counseling roles. A more diversified delivery model necessarily involves a wider range of roles in a wider variety of sectors. This may include, for example, roles relating to information provision, ICT-based service delivery, links with employers, and learning support. A coherent competence framework would both encourage such differentiation and facilitate career progression for career guidance practitioners within and across sectors. Examples of such frameworks have already been developed in some OECD countries (OECD, 2004) and the International Association for Educational and Vocational Guidance has prepared an international standards framework.

3.32 *Updating.* Attention is also needed to continuous professional development and support, to ensure that career guidance practitioners are updated both on new techniques and also on changes in education and training and in the labor market. Examples of current strategies include:

- In the Philippines, in addition to formal courses, guidance counselors receive credits for attending in-service seminars and workshops.
- In Poland, an ‘Information and Methodological Bulletin for Career Counselors’ is published on an intermittent basis.

3.33 *Professional associations.* An important role in this respect can be played by professional associations. Specialist cross-sectoral associations exist in some countries:

- The Career Development Association of the Philippines.
- The Polish Association of School and Vocational Counselors.
- In Romania, the National Association for School and Vocational Guidance.
- The South African Association of Educational and Vocational Guidance.

Elsewhere, however, such associations are less career-specific and more sector-specific (e.g. associations of school counselors) or are much more generic in nature (e.g. associations of teachers or of psychologists). Encouragement needs to be given to formation of specialist associations in these countries too.

4. DEVELOPING A STRATEGY

Introduction

4.1 If the new models of service delivery outlined in Section 3 are to be introduced successfully, stronger policies are needed. This final section outlines a framework for developing such policies including:

- Policy co-ordination.
- Strategic leadership.
- Legislation.
- Financing.
- Building an evidence base (including data on clients).
- Assuring quality.
- International support.

This framework draws on the experience of OECD countries (OECD, 2004). The seven countries exhibit deficiencies on most aspects of the framework, and examples of good practice on which to build.

Policy Co-ordination

4.2 *Policy formation.* Effective career guidance provision needs to span the worlds of education, training and employment, both in its location and in its remit. Since in most countries these are the responsibilities of two or more separate ministries, policies need to be co-ordinated across ministerial boundaries. At present, few of the seven countries have clear or strong policies relating to career guidance provision. In all of them, there are separate processes of national policy formation, usually within education and employment ministries respectively. Where significant devolution to regional and local levels has taken place, this is mirrored by parallel separate processes at these levels too. If devolution applies unevenly to the two sectors, the tendencies towards separation can be exacerbated. The risk is that responsibility for career guidance is marginalized within both sectors, falling in the cracks between them.

4.3 *Co-ordination mechanisms.* In most of the countries co-ordination between education and labor is weak. There is no regular mechanism to ensure such co-ordination. Whatever co-ordination takes place tends to be somewhat ad hoc and specific in nature. In Poland, for example, the two ministries have jointly formed a National Resource Center for Vocational Guidance to form part of the network of such centers across the European Union (which Poland is about to enter): its tasks are performed by two teams, one in each ministry, coordinated by a national steering committee; but its remit is restricted to collaboration with other European countries.

4.4 *Protocols.* In three countries, formal protocols covering career guidance activities have been formed between the two relevant ministries to help address policy co-ordination issues. The one in Turkey, relating to links between the public employment

service and schools, has been described in Section 2 (Box 4). In Russia, an agreement on co-operation between the education and labor ministries stipulates interaction in a variety of fields, including career guidance services for youth and the unemployed, and assisting the employment of graduates from vocational schools. In Romania, a protocol was signed in 1997 between the two ministries and also the Ministry of Youth and Sports to establish a national network of information and vocational counseling centers within their respective spheres; this has subsequently been amplified by two further protocols. Even so, these have not adequately clarified who is responsible for what in relation to development and dissemination of assessment tools, career information, and educational information, and building a system that links these elements together for easy access by clients – this is a common problem in developing and transition countries.

4.5 *Focal points.* In some cases co-ordination across ministries is made more difficult by the lack of a focal point for career guidance within the ministries themselves. Career guidance may form a minor part of a number of portfolios, and thus never be addressed as a coherent entity in its own right. In South Africa, for example, the Department of Labor previously had a dedicated division responsible for career guidance, but this has been discontinued. If career guidance policy is to be strengthened, there is a need for a department of this kind, or at least for a senior official with a coordinating brief in this area of policy, within each of the responsible ministries.

4.6 *Strategic mechanisms.* In a few cases, a strategic mechanism has been established to co-ordinate policy between education and employment ministries in relation to lifelong learning and human resource development. Thus in South Africa the Human Resource Development Strategy was developed together by the two ministries. In the Philippines a ‘trifocalized’ committee on lifelong learning has been formed by the Department of Education, the Commission on Higher Education, and the Technical Education and Skills Development Authority. Career guidance needs to be placed clearly within the remit of such mechanisms. An example of this being done is the ChileCalifica program in Chile (Box 13).

Box 13: The ChileCalifica program in Chile

In Chile, an agreement has been formed between the Ministry of Economy, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Labor and Social Security to initiate the national ChileCalifica program. Supported by a World Bank loan, it is primarily designed to strengthen articulation between grades 11-12 of technical-vocational secondary schools and technical and vocational education within the post-secondary education system, including their links with the labor market. It includes more broadly-based components designed to develop a new web-based career information system, plus related training and support for strengthening the place of career guidance both within the role of school counselors and within the work of the OMILs and other employment intermediation agencies (see paras.3.23 and 3.28).

The functional collaboration initiated by the program has now been institutionalized in the form of a Lifelong Learning and Training Steering Policy Board (Directorio) which is chaired by the Minister of Economy and includes the two other ministers.

Strategic Leadership

4.7 *Involving stakeholders.* Governments have an important role to play in providing strategic leadership for the career guidance field. But they do not have resources to develop all the information nor directly supply many of the services to clients. Much policy in this area can benefit from partnership with other stakeholders. There is accordingly a strong case for a more broadly based body capable of coordinating the existing services and providing leadership for the sector. For example, employers should play a key role in developing occupational information, NGOs in delivering services and identifying client demand, and professional counseling organizations in helping to define staff qualifications.

4.8 *National forum.* One example of best practice in this area is Poland, where a National Forum for Vocational Guidance has been formed with stakeholders (Box 14). The forum has considerable potential as a catalyst for strategic development, though its role in relation to government policy formation still needs to be clarified. In the United States, this problem was recognized some years ago in relation to information in particular, and legislation was passed to create the National and State Occupational Information Coordinating Committees which resulted in clearly designated agency roles for the development and delivery of career information services. The network has recently been disbanded but a strong legacy of co-ordination, information and services remains.

Box 14: The National Forum for Vocational Guidance in Poland

In 2000, the National Forum for Vocational Guidance was established by the Task Force for Training and Human Resources (BKKK), a non-governmental organization responsible for Poland's links with relevant European Union training programs. The Forum is funded as part of a program supported by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

It is planned that the Forum will have a Program Council and a Working Group. The Program Council will consist of representatives of the Ministry of National Education and Sport, the Ministry of Economy, Labor and Social Policy, employer organizations, trade unions, research organizations and labor offices. The Working Group will consist of specialists from the broad field of vocational guidance.

The main tasks of the Forum are:

- to identify the needs and national priorities relating to vocational guidance and counseling, in line with government policies;
- to present the opinions of vocational counselors in matters relating to guidance;
- to exchange experiences and allow integration of staff involved in guidance;
- to expand co-operation of Polish vocational counselors with their European colleagues.

The Forum has already organized conferences and seminars in pursuit of its goals.

4.9 *Broader strategic bodies.* In some cases broadly-based strategic bodies have been formed in relation to lifelong learning and skills development which have potential for providing leadership in relation to career guidance. In South Africa, for example,

Provincial Skills Development Forums have been formed, with representatives of ministries of education and labor and also of other stakeholders. As yet, however, they have not paid any significant attention to career guidance. Steps need to be taken to place it on their agendas.

4.10 *Tasks.* Tasks which might be addressed by such strategic bodies include:

- Coordinating and refining existing policies.
- Stimulating, and coordinating the development of, cross-sectoral instruments like competence frameworks (see para.3.31) and quality standards (see paras.4.18-20).
- Identifying information gaps, and how and by whom they might be filled.

Legislation

4.11 *Role.* The role of legislation in relation to policy formation in the career guidance sector tends to be limited. In the Philippines there is no legislation at all which provides for such services. In most other cases, there is separate legislation which provides for the development of such services within schools and within public employment services. Usually these do not specify what form such services should take. There are however some exceptions. In Turkey the Law on Eighth-Year Compulsory Education is very specific and can serve as an example of good practice:

‘In the second semester of the last academic year of basic education, introductory information shall be given as to the schools and programs students can attend in secondary education, the occupations they can choose after completing such programs, the living standards these occupations can provide them with and the business life; necessary efforts shall be made by the guidance services to help them give the correct decision when selecting an occupation.’

4.12 *Regulations.* In general, the specification of services is carried out through decrees, orders and regulations rather than through legislation. Again, these documents tend to be sector-specific (e.g. covering schools or employment services).

4.13 *Cross-sectoral legislation.* If in due course there are to be moves to create a more coherent career guidance system for youth and adults, there could be a case for new legislation on a cross-sectoral basis. The nearest to this at present is in Poland, where the Constitution of the Republic guarantees the right of access to career counseling services to all Polish citizens.

Financing

4.14 *Need for information.* For effective policy formation, clear information is needed on costs. But in almost all of the countries, very limited information is available on the public funding devoted to career guidance services. This is because the services are usually embedded in broader institutional budgets, and no attempts have been made to disaggregate them. The nearest to an exception is in Turkey, but even here the available

figures (for services in schools) not only cover career guidance within a broader range of guidance and psychological counseling services but also include special education.

4.15 Similarly, very little information is available on costs per output from guidance services. This is more of a problem in education than in labor organizations, where cost per job placement can be roughly determined as it is in Romanian labor offices (see example in Box 9 in Section 2).

4.16 *Information needs.* OECD (2004) reports that such lack of financial information applies in most OECD countries too. It notes that improved information of this kind is crucial if more robust policies are to be developed, and suggests that the ‘ingredients’ approach (Levin, 1983) has the potential to substantially improve policy-makers’ understanding of the resource demands of different types of career guidance programs.

4.17 *Role of markets.* A further important policy issue is the extent to which governments are willing to fund services from public monies, and the extent to which they seek to stimulate and support the development of services funded from other sources, including the market. Services in private schools and universities are in effect funded from student fees; in addition, as noted in Section 2, some services are provided by private employers, and some are supplied through a market supported by fees from individuals and/or employers. The roles of government in relation to such provision might include:

- To stimulate the market in order to build its capacity. Contracting out some public services to the private sector (see para.2.36) can be one way of doing this.
- To assure the quality of services provided to the end-user, in order both to protect the public interest and to build consumer confidence.
- To support development of comprehensive national occupational and educational information which can be used by a wide variety of service providers.

Governments also have an important role in making sure that social equity concerns are addressed within market-based approaches and in compensating for market failure.

Assuring Quality

4.18 *Types of standards.* Quality standards have already been discussed in relation to career information (para.3.25) and practitioner competences (para.3.30-31). There is also a case for organizational quality standards in relation to career guidance delivery as a whole. Some standards of these kinds have been developed in a number of OECD countries (OECD, 2004).

4.19 *Current work.* At least two of the countries being studied here have started work on developing quality standards for career guidance services and can serve as examples of good practice. In Poland, standards for career counseling services have been developed for public employment offices. In Romania, quality standards for counselors, as well as an ethical code for counseling, have been developed by a professional association (the

National Association for Educational and Vocational Guidance). All of these, however, are purely voluntary in status.

4.20 *Broader processes.* In some cases, attention to career guidance services has been included in broader quality-assurance processes. Examples include the application of Total Quality Management (TQM) processes to some schools and to public employment services in Turkey.

Building an Evidence Base

4.21 *Needs.* The need for a stronger evidence base has already been discussed above in relation to financial data, but has a wider applicability. At present the evidence base on which policy-makers can draw is very limited.

4.22 *Data on users.* Even data on usage of services is often hard to obtain. There are exceptions which provide examples of good practice. In Poland, for example, there are data on the number of individuals who have used career information and guidance services in public employment offices, analyzed by sex and by type of counseling or information activity (group or individual); broadly similar data are available in the Philippines and Romania. In Turkey, data exist on the number of students making use of individual and group counseling services (divided into psychological counseling, educational guidance, and career guidance) in schools and in Guidance and Research Centers. If related to relevant cohort sizes, such data can indicate levels of take-up; if linked to staff and other costs, it can lead to unit cost measures.

4.23 *Client needs and impact evaluation.* There is also a need for more studies on client needs, on costs, and on the impact of career guidance interventions, along the lines of those carried out in some OECD countries and in conjunction with World Bank projects (see paras.1.12-14). A review of the ‘evidence base’ on career guidance and counseling in all seven countries in the study uncovered very few instances where systematic or even sporadic information was being collected on what clients use the services, the actual demand from communities, and the costs, benefits, and impact of the services. However, there were several instances of good practice where partial evidence was being collected, which leads one to the conclusion that such evidence can be obtained if policy-makers make it a priority and provide necessary resources. In general, the evidence base is better in labor organizations than in educational organizations. Examples of good practice include: Turkey, where good data on use of specific guidance services in schools and labor offices is maintained; South Africa, where several studies of client demand and impact of services on career maturity have been completed; and studies on the net impact of services on job placement from labor offices in Poland (Fretwell, Benus & Oleary, 1999). The results of this work generally indicate a positive impact on social and employment indicators, but since cost data is usually difficult to isolate, it is difficult to undertake a cost-benefit analysis.

4.24 *Supporting innovation.* Other studies are needed to support the development of assessment devices and other tools and instruments. There could also be a case for a

micro-grant development fund to provide incentives for innovative research and materials development at a grassroots level, the results of which could be documented and disseminated nationally.

4.25 *Specialist research centers.* Few countries have so far developed research centers with a sustained expertise in the career guidance field. However, an example of good practice can be found in Romania (Box 15). In South Africa, the Human Science Research Council was formerly responsible for collecting data on the use made of guidance and counseling services, and there are currently discussions about reintroducing these studies. Potential research centers within universities are beginning to emerge in Poland and in Turkey.

Box 15: A specialist research center in Romania

The Educational and Vocational Department of the Institute for Educational Sciences has been designated as the ‘methodological authority’ for the Ministry of Education’s guidance and counseling network. The researchers working in the department are experts in the field of guidance and counseling. Their educational background is in psychology and educational sciences; most have a PhD in psychology or a master’s degree in educational sciences, guidance and counseling. Research projects completed in recent years have included activity analyses of human resources, staff qualifications, ICT resources, tests, questionnaires, and beneficiaries in psycho-pedagogical assistance centers; of career counseling for adults; and of computerized career guidance programs.

International Support

4.26 In several of the countries, there is evidence of the positive impact of support from multilateral and bilateral development agencies. World Bank programs have been influential in Chile, Poland, Romania and Turkey in supporting the development of career information systems and training courses for career guidance professionals. In addition, a valuable role has been played by European collaborative programs in Poland and Romania, and development of services is a priority within the EU Employment Strategy. Bilateral support for development of career services has also been provided by Germany in Romania and Turkey. Such programs both provide access to resources, and enable middle-income countries to benefit from experiences, materials and systems developed in other countries. Extension of these programs could assist national governments to develop robust and relevant career guidance services for their citizens. We hope that the suggestions and examples in this report will help them in designing such services.

5. CONCLUSIONS

5.1 This report has outlined the current nature of career guidance services in seven developing and transition countries, has indicated the changes that are needed if such services are to contribute effectively to the economic and social development of such countries, and has identified some emerging examples of good practice. In particular, it has addressed the implications of viewing career guidance as a part of a proactive human resource development strategy, linked to lifelong learning and sustained employability, and driven significantly by individuals themselves. While a number of specific technical observations and challenges facing developing countries have been identified in other sections of the report, four key conclusions stem from the overall analysis.

5.2 *First, career guidance provision needs to be viewed as a coherent system.* The system will comprise diverse parts, and be developed and delivered by different stakeholders including schools, tertiary education, public employment services, and by the private and voluntary sectors. But the parts should add up to a coherent whole. This requires much closer co-operation than is common at present between different actors, and in particular education and employment ministries. Effective and efficient development requires the active involvement of all stakeholders in the policy-making process. Special attention in middle-income and transition countries needs to be paid to the labor force requirements of small employers and the informal sector.

5.3 *Second, governments have a key role to play in creating the framework for a coherent career guidance system, including measures designed to assure its quality; but they should not be viewed as the sole providers, or as the sole sources of funding.* Important contributions can be made by the voluntary and private sectors. Some government services can be subcontracted to these sectors. Private educational institutions can be encouraged to provide services for their students; employers can be encouraged to provide services for their employees.

5.4 *Third, the restrictions on public resources in developing countries mean that care has to be taken in defining priorities.* Five priorities in particular emerge from the analysis in this report:

- *Information.* It is crucial that comprehensive educational and occupational information be developed by stakeholders. Without such information, it is impossible to provide effective guidance. The substantial career information deficits in most of the countries in the study need to be addressed as a matter of urgency.
- *Self-help.* There is a need to invest in self-help approaches rather than in approaches which are heavily labor-intensive and encourage dependency.
- *Information and communication technology.* There is a need to exploit the potential of information and communication technology, including helplines as

well as the Internet, to increase access to services. However, it is recognized that ICT may not be appropriate or accessible to all clients.

- *Staff development.* There is a need to encourage more specific staff training courses in career guidance, preferably on a cross-sectoral basis, designed to produce professionals who can manage guidance resources as well as be engaged in direct service delivery.
- *Private sector and NGOs.* There is a need to invest in facilitating measures, including appropriate incentives, designed to encourage the development of career guidance services within the private and voluntary sectors.

5.5 *Fourth, there is a need to strengthen the evidence base to inform policy development.* This includes enhancing the recording of information on who uses what services, overall client demand, client evaluation of services, the costs of developing and delivering services, and the benefits and impact of services. Some countries are already developing this evidence base. Without this information, it is difficult to argue for allocation of resources to career guidance services, particularly in resource-constrained environments.

5.6 *Fifth, when should lesser developed countries consider investing in career guidance programs.* The question is often raised: what is the threshold at which developing countries, particularly lesser developed countries, need to start to develop public policies on career development and to allocate resources to the development of career guidance services? This paper has argued that middle-income and transition economies are already past this threshold. The question of ‘when to start’ is perhaps best answered by examining the political, social and economic factors at play in a particular country. The decision to ‘begin’ will be driven by the extent to which individuals are able to make independent career decisions and the degree to which key stakeholders (particularly public policy-makers in governments) wish to promote independent career decision-making. Authoritarian regimes (e.g. socially planned economies) may not encourage such actions. Societies which are in the midst of civil strife (e.g. Iraq, Liberia) will have a difficult time allocating resources to career development programs. Countries with long-standing cultural and social attitudes toward individual participation in careers may not want to allocate resources; but on the other hand, career policy can be looked at as one method of changing these cultural and social patterns. Similarly, countries with severe economic problems, including very high unemployment and large informal sectors, may not want to allocate resources when many individuals are working at a ‘survival’ level with little possibility of making individual career choices; however, as such economies begin to develop and restructure, career development policies may become an important ingredient in supporting economic development. In the end, stakeholders and policy-makers will need to weigh each of these factors to determine when to begin, what amount of resources need to be provided, and which priorities need to be addressed.

REFERENCES

- Aisenson, D., Bezanson, L., Frank, F. & Reardon, P. (2002). In Hiebert, B. & Borgen, W. (eds.): *Technical and Vocational Education and Training in the Twenty-First Century: New Roles and Challenges for Guidance and Counseling*. Paris: United Nations Education, Scientific, and Cultural Organization.
- Akkök, F. & Watts, A.G. (2003). *Country Report on Turkey*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Betcherman, G., Olivas, K., & Dar A. (2004). *Impacts of Active Labor Market Programs: New evidence from Evaluations with Particular Attention to Developing and Transition Countries*, World Bank Discussion Paper. Washington D.C., World Bank.
- European Commission (2001). *Making a European Area of Lifelong Learning a Reality*. Brussels: EC.
- Fretwell, D., Benus, J. & O'Leary C. (1999). *Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Central Asia*. World Bank Discussion Paper. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Fretwell, D. & Goldberg, S. (1993). *Developing Effective Employment Services*. World Bank Discussion Papers No. 208. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Ginzberg, E., Ginsburg, S.W., Axelrad, S., & Herma, J.L. (1951). *Occupational Choice: an Approach to a General Theory*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Hiebert, B. & Borgen, W. (eds.) (2002). *Technical and Vocational Education and Training in the Twenty-First Century: New Roles and Challenges for Guidance and Counseling*. Paris: United Nations Education, Scientific, and Cultural Organization.
- Katz, M. (1969). Can computers make guidance decisions for students? *College Board Review*, 72.
- Kay, L. & Fretwell, D. (2003). *Country Report on South Africa*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Kreft, W. & Watts, A.G. (2003). *Country Report on Poland*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Law, B. (1996). A career-learning theory. In Watts, A.G., Law, B., Killeen, J., Kidd, J.M. & Hawthorn, R.: *Rethinking Careers Education and Guidance: Theory, Policy and Practice*, pp.46-71. London: Routledge.
- Levin, H.M. (1983). *Cost-Effectiveness: a Primer*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

- Maslow, A. (1970). *Motivation and Personality* (2nd edition). New York: Harper & Row.
- Mitchell, L.K. & Krumboltz, J.D. (1984). Social learning approach to career decision making: Krumboltz's theory. In Brown, D. & Brooks, L. (eds.): *Career Choice and Development*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (2001). *Labor Market Policies and the Public Employment Service*. Paris: OECD.
- Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (2004). *Career Guidance and Public Policy: Bridging the Gap*. Paris: OECD (in press).
- Prideaux, L., Creed, P., Muller, J. & Patton, W. (2000). A review of career interventions from an educational perspective: have investigations shed any light? *Swiss Journal of Psychology*, 59.
- Pașnicu, D. & Fretwell, D. (2003). *Country Report on Romania*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Peavy, R.V. (1998). *Sociodynamic Counseling: a Constructivist Perspective*. Victoria, BC: Trafford.
- Radrigan, M. & Watts, A.G. (2003). *Country Report on Chile*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Rogers, C. (1965). *Client-Centered Therapy*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Santamaria, J. & Watts, A.G. (2003). *Country Report on Philippines*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Savickas, M.L. (2002). Career construction: a developmental theory of vocational behavior. In Brown, D. & Associates: *Career Choice and Development* (4th edn.), pp.149-205. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Sultana, R.G. (2004). *Guidance Policies in the Learning Society: Trends, Challenges and Responses across Europe*. Thessaloniki: CEDEFOP.
- Super, D.E. (1957). *The Psychology of Careers*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Watts, A.G. (1996). International perspectives. In Watts, A.G., Law, B., Killeen, J., Kidd, J.M. & Hawthorn, R.: *Rethinking Careers Education and Guidance: Theory, Policy and Practice*, pp.366-379. London: Routledge.
- Watts, A.G. & Sultana, R.G. (2003). *Career Guidance Policies in 36 Countries: Contrasts and Common Themes*. Thessaloniki: CEDEFOP.

World Bank (2002). *Lifelong Learning in the Global Knowledge Economy: Challenges for Developing Countries*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Youngman, F. (2000). *The Political Economy of Adult Education*. London: Zed Books.

Zabrodin, Y. & Watts, A.G. (2003). *Country Report on Russia*. Washington, DC: World Bank.