

## STAKEHOLDER GROUP (S): NGOs

**Location:** Istanbul Congress Center – Uskudar 2 Meeting Room – Istanbul - TURKEY

**Date:** October 6, 2009

**Participants:**

[See Annex]

**World Bank Participants and Role:**

Filiz Demirayak (WWF Turkey)	Moderator
Michele De Nevers (WB)	Panelist
Gregory Radford (IFC)	Panelist
Kirk Herbertson (WRI)	Panelist
Roger Morier (WB)	Participant
Alexandra Sears (WB)	Participant
Selin Un (IFC)	Participant
Derya Özet (WB – consultant)	Rapporteur

**How did the process fit into ongoing country dialogue (if relevant; for international meetings, please explain how it fit into the topic of that meeting)?**

The consultation helped stakeholders from different countries to better understand the World Bank's efforts to develop a new corporate strategy on tackling environmental sustainability and express their opinions on the concept note and the role of the WBG.

**What were the key issues/themes raised by participants?**

- Access to information about climate change issues
- Lack of understanding in developing countries of the ongoing climate change talks
- Problems in access to energy
- Clean water and sanitation in the developing world
- Impacts of climate change in developing countries and the need for urgent action and mitigation / adaptation measures
- Assessment of World Bank's portfolio in terms of CO<sub>2</sub> intensity
- Strengthening the interaction between the various (sector) strategies of the World Bank
- Strengthening the principles such as accountability underlying the strategy
- Encouraging clean technology investors by greening the Bank's own facilities & activities
- Defining environmental sustainability and thinking of a new model for economic development
- Raising funds for renewable energy and energy efficiency investments.



++The questions in this template were subsequently modified.

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
<b>1. What are the top 3 challenges and the top 3 opportunities to achieving environmentally sustainable development? (country, region, sector)</b>		
[NGO]	Access to energy and electricity is urgent while renewable energy investments are still costly	
[NGO]	Developing Countries are exposed to 70% of the impacts of Climate Change, so urgent action is needed in order to mitigate those impacts	
[NGO]	Developing countries need awareness raising & capacity building for CC and CC negotiations	
[NGO]	Coastal erosion and tourism is a challenge.	
[NGO]	Clean water and NRM are issues.	
[NGO]	Access to clean water and sanitation is important.	
[NGO]	Other issues: encouraging use of organic fertilizers; encouraging eco-villages; encouraging decentralization from urban to rural.	
<b>2. What should the role of the Bank be in addressing these challenges and opportunities?</b>		
[NGO]	Should achieve "zero" fossil fuel in its portfolio and the impacts of the Bank's portfolio should be assessed based on CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	
[NGO]	Should engage civil society in Environment Strategy and	Consultations are planned in WB's local offices,

<sup>1</sup> Summary of main points raised. All participants and stakeholders are invited to send more detailed comments via the website. Please provide your name, title and organization if you would like your comments to be posted on the external consultations website.

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	should have local consultations through country offices to consult at community level effectively	also WB will have video conference consultations.
[NGO]	“The strategy will not be binding. How can it be useful for civil society? Consensus building and awareness-raising is needed. “	
[NGO]	Environment Strategy should be accountable and result-based, including timetables, public reporting, targets, etc.	
[NGO]	Principles underlying the Environmental Strategy of the Bank should be determined (accountability, etc.)	
[NGO]	Need more explicit mention of social issues in the Strategy	
[NGO]	There should be interaction between strategies i.e., social, environmental, energy...	
[NGO]	Should have a program for adaptation and mitigation	
[NGO]	Strengthen environmental and social impact assessment	
<b>3. What should be the balance in the Bank’s role between addressing country specific priorities and global public goods agendas?</b>		
[NGO]	Should cope with local needs i.e., access to electricity, clean water, sanitation while supporting renewable energy and addressing the needs to tackle CC and environmental problems globally	
[NGO]	Civil Society opinions should be taken into consideration to involve different types of demands and to assess the Strategy’s effectiveness	Civil Society is involved through consultations.
[NGO]	Access to information about funding and negotiations should be available to communities, organizations and governments in developing countries	

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
[NGO]	Urgent action is needed to address the impacts of CC, as 70% of the impacts will be on developing countries	
[NGO]	Access to energy or renewable energy? These should be combined and elevated.	
	It will be difficult for the WB to effectively consult civil society because there is a disconnect between them.	
<b>4. What should the role of the IFC be in helping the private sector stakeholders achieve higher levels of performance in pursuing environmental sustainability?</b>		
[NGO]	Raise funding for renewable energy to encourage investments	
[NGO]	To provide risk management programs for private sector in order to encourage them to invest in renewable energy	
[NGO]	Should green its own facilities to encourage such activities	WB is reducing energy use, avoiding too much travel by using video conferences, buying offsets for the remaining part of CO <sub>2</sub> emissions. Headquarters' operations are carbon neutral.
<b>5. Should the Bank put in place a systematic approach to assess environmental sustainability in sector portfolios?</b>		
[NGO]	Should achieve "zero" fossil fuel in its portfolio and assess its portfolio based on CO <sub>2</sub> emissions	"zero" fossil fuel is technologically very challenging since only 1% of the energy supply is coming from renewable energy sources globally.
[NGO]	Strengthen environmental and social impact assessment	
<b>6. How should short term and long term trade-offs between development and environmental sustainability be balanced?</b>		
[NGO]	Encourage investments in renewable energy	
[NGO]	Increase awareness within the bank and developing countries	

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	on environmental sustainability and how to achieve it	
[NGO]	Try to fund renewable for urgent needs of access to energy	
[NGO]	Should assess the available technologies and suggest best option	
[NGO]	Should influence governments and organizations to achieve sustainable development	
<b>7. Any other issues?</b>		
	WB has done useful reviews in the past, including Extractive Industry Review, Ag Review, World Commission on Dams. These should be incorporated into the environment strategy	
	Budget support and utilization of resources is an issue	
	WB should walk the walk with green meetings, paper saving, recycling. And in terms of the climate strategy, how do you measure your own emissions and those of country offices?	
	Civil society needs easy access to information; the environment strategy process is not clear.	
	WB should encourage governments to be climate neutral and/or recycle.	

## Annex: List of Participants

First name	Last name	Organization	Country
Athena	Ballesteros	WRI	United States
Ikot Ossin	Bassey	CATGOL	Nigeria
Ivan	Blokov	Greenpeace	Russia
Emily	Chessin	WRI	United States
Leo	Crippa	ILRC	United States
Filiz	Demirayak	WWF	Turkey
Jovan	Dimitrov	CSO	Macedonia
May	Elbatran	PDF	Egypt
Valeria	Enriquez	FUNDAR	Mexico
Metuge	Fahtia	CED	Cameroon
Kris	Genovese	CIEL	United States
Jesse	Griffiths	Brettonwoods Project	UK
Kirk	Herbertson	WRI	United States
Burghard	Ilge	Both ENDS	Netherlands
Okoro	Kenneth	YDP	Nigeria
Cuma	Kiliç	WWF	Turkey
Serpil	Kyncu	KAGIDFR	Turkey
Raymond	Lloyd	Shequality	UK
Andre	Macq	Antefix GmbH	Germany
Darius	Mans	MCC	United States
Rawya	Mansour	RAMSCO	Egypt
Duru	Özkaban	TOBB	Turkey
Chhith	Sam Ath	NGO Forum	Cambodia
Boubacar	Seck	CONGAD	Senegal
Derya	Sevinç	TEPAV	Turkey
Sekasanda	Silenne		Rwanda
Nguy	Thi Khanh	WARECOD	Vietnam
Knud	Voeking	Urgewald	Germany
Erdi	Yüksel	AIESEC	Turkey

