

STAKEHOLDER GROUP (S): NGOs AND PRIVATE SECTOR

Location of consultation: IADB CSR Forum, Punta del Este, Uruguay

Date: 1 December 2009

Participants (please attach list of participants and their affiliations):
[See separate file]

World Bank Participants and Role:

Marcelo Acerbi, LCSEN, speaker
Valeria Bolla, LCREA, facilitator

How did the process fit into ongoing country dialogue (if relevant; for international meetings, please explain how it fit into the topic of that meeting)?

The consultation was aligned with the topic and discussion which were part of the CSR forum. However, the target audience was waiting for another kind of Bank's role/contribution beyond a specific consultation about its corporate environment strategy.

What were the key issues/themes raised by participants?

Key issues are described in the following form.

Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
1. The World Bank Group is a relatively small source of finance for major economic transformation in developing countries. What should the role of the Bank be in helping developing countries to address the challenges and opportunities they face in achieving environmentally sustainable development?		
[Government]		
[Legislature]		
[Representatives from Civil Soc.]		
[Private sector]	<p>International consultant (Uruguay) – In the presentations governments and institutions were mentioned but nothing is said about people. I have worked a lot in Latin America as a FAO consultant and with other organizations with local producers. The local producer -in Bolivia as example- has a very bad image of the World Bank technician. Everything mentioned regarding the analytical work of the World Bank, has very high costs. And in the management of projects, the bureaucratic costs are high. 80% goes to the bureaucracy costs, and only 20% goes to the recipients. If that is improved that would be an important step for the World Bank.</p> <p>(Uruguay) – I think that sometimes there are policies that are not consistent with the local needs. I work in the Ministry of Industry and I work with the World Bank. And related to action lines in sustainable consume of the countries, it would be important that the World Bank support this line of activities like production and sustainable consume.</p> <p>(Argentina) – I would like to listen to you evaluating the job done in environmental issues. I perfectly know the Argentine projects and It seems to me that what you are</p>	<p>Bank explained that projects have systems in place to ensure proper participation at community level.</p> <p>The Bank is preparing a Sustainable Development Industrial Project. This project will address the priority mentioned by the participant.</p> <p>The bank responded that it was a good point to improve</p>

¹ This summary of key points does not necessarily reflect the official position of the relevant institution(s) or organization(s), and is not necessarily exhaustive. All participants and stakeholders are invited to send more detailed comments via the website, in particular if they feel that key points have not been captured or have been misrepresented. Please provide your name, title and organization if you would like your comments to be posted on the external consultations website.

	saying is science fiction. Which is the real evaluation that you do of the World Bank strategy? Which are the lessons learned? I would like to listen to that first before I give you my opinion about something is not clear to me. I don't know if we are talking about the ideal strategy or about the real strategy, and the possibility to implement it. I think you should prepare a base line and then evaluate the results, and present to us the concrete results.	the baseline information included in the powerpoint presentation.
[Media]		
[Add rows as necessary]		
2. What should be the role of IFC and MIGA be in helping private sector stakeholders to achieve higher levels of performance in pursuing environmental sustainability?		
[Government]		
[Legislature]		
[Representatives from Civil Soc.]		
[Private sector]	<p>(Colombia) – I work in the financial area in Banks and institutions. I would like to see the analysis of local Banks as financial agents in the strategy of the IFC. It would be important not only analyze the banks as institutions that can lend money to environmental projects, but as institutions that could give advice in those cases where the proposals are not adequate.</p> <p>(Chile) –I work in a mine in Chile. In the zone where we are there is a great work in environmental education. What we could see is that the work is not efficient with the local governments. I would like to know if the IFC has any action line in the environmental education area. There should exist a local culture on environmental education not only at a civil society level but a culture coming from the institutions and government aimed to educating in those issues.</p> <p>(Uruguay) – It is very interesting that the IFC sees with good eyes the Social Enterprise Responsibility. We, working in that area, would like to find ways to stimulate government incentives (fiscal benefits) to add more enterprises to this initiative. It would be very positive if the World Bank could support this, so as the governments start to do something. I would like to get more details on the strategy. I think that this consultation was interesting but we needed more time, and it would be</p>	<p>The comment will be transferred to the IFC.</p> <p>The comment will be transferred to the IFC.</p> <p>The comment will be transferred to the IFC.</p>

	<p>good to count with a second instance. But I think that an interesting area to work on would be the inter-ministerial projects for recuperation and recycling of solid waste. Investment is required to start it now. And there is where the Bank –through its different institutions- should get involved because it has a lot to contribute with.</p> <p>(Perú) – I am particularly interested in energy efficiency issues. And I would like to let you know about an experience to suggest an improvement. In 2007, IFC contributed through the BBVA bank the financing of energy efficiency projects in Peru. There was a market analysis and the BBVA was looking for projects with high investments, minimizing energy efficiency projects. At the end, everything ended up in nothing. My suggestion would be that there is needed a major and better promotion, more education about the climate change issue. Because if this is not like this, the Bank's contribution is not sustainable. The society does not even know that this exists.</p>	<p>Bank specialist during the consultation made himself available to provide contacts with EE projects in Bank's portfolio.</p>
[Media]		
[Add rows as necessary]		
3. The World Bank Group has worked to become a country/client driven organization. What should be the balance in the Bank's Groups role between addressing country/client specific priorities and the global public goods agenda ?		
[Government]		
[Legislature]		
[Representatives from Civil Society]	<p>(Uruguay) – Communication and education are not contemplated anywhere in this strategy. This kind of discussions always stays in the academic framework where there is always the same people talking and talking without making this issues reach somewhere else. It is presented today, where there is a determined profile of people. But I don't see in the strategy any component of massive communication and education of this kind of issues. Multilateral organizations should start considering investing resources in education.</p> <p>(México) – I work in the Instituto de Desarrollo Empresarial de Anagua (in Northern México). My experience working with small and medium enterprises let me know that this type of companies does not have an environmental culture and besides they have a defensive attitude because they feel they don't have resources to support this kind of issues. There is a need for diffusion for the average citizen and the entrepreneur to be informed of what they will be talking about. In Mexico we showed them the benefits of adopting eco-efficiency systems and how it could generate</p>	<p>The Bank clarified that each project could include communication and education activities if they respond to the a project's strategy.</p>



	savings for them. When they could see the direct benefit, they were able to get involved in this kind of issues.	
[Private sector]		
[Media]		
[Add rows as necessary]		
4. How can the WBG put in place a systematic approach to assess environmental sustainability in sector portfolios?		
[Government]		
[Legislature]		
[Representatives from Civil Society]		
[Private sector]	(Chile) – I work in a sanitation Enterprise and I am counsel. It is my impression that many of these initiatives are centered in the Government. And not all governments behave seriously or in the same way. And not all the governments have the same capacity. My experience is that going through the differences that may exist among the different countries, you face sectors. There is no networking. This is a Project related to the Ministry of Education, Transport or Environment, but there are relationships, networks that allow threaten this problem jointly with various government institutions. My opinion is that the sustainable initiatives are extended far away from the government and reach the academy and the enterprise. Or at least should be extended. There should stop the talking about who's resources are this or that. And that is achieved only with public-private participation. The same for the World Bank.	
[Media]		
[Add rows as necessary]		
5. How should short term and long term trade-offs between development and environmental sustainability be balanced?		
[Government]		
[Legislature]		
[Representatives from Civil Soc.]		

[Private sector]	<p>(Perú) – I think the strategy presented today does not contemplate the base line. I think the Bank could contribute in that area. In response to the 5th question I think there are missing base line studies for areas like forestry for example.</p> <p>(Venezuela) – It would be really good for the private sector –especially Industrial- to have comparative information of the region, by theme and with an analysis of what could be replicated in each country.</p>	
[Media]		
[Add rows as necessary]		
7. Any other issues?		
[Government]		
[Legislature]		
[Representatives from Civil Soc.]		
[Private sector]		
[Media]		
[Add rows as necessary]		