



INDIA

Report on Multi-Sectoral Consultations

Kolkata – Friday, February 5, 2010

Summary of Consultations

India is a large and diverse developing country and has a wide range of environment challenges. The World Bank Group (WBG) is addressing these challenges at a policy level and through investment lending in the different sectors. The efforts to influence strategic planning and operational strategies are ongoing through sectoral dialogue.

The Environment Strategy consultations provided an opportunity to bring all these sectoral and cross-sectoral learning together, and provided a forum for stakeholders to look at the WBG's environment-related work in its entirety and to provide their feedback. These consultations offered an excellent opportunity for the WBG to re-engage with these stakeholders. In particular, the response received from the Civil Society Organizations and the private sector was substantive, and their feedback significantly enriched the content of the feedback received.

What were the key issues / themes raised by participants?

The following were the key issues / themes that emerged:

1. WBG needs to distinguish between a systematic approach and a systemic approach. The focus should be on area-based development approaches rather than sector-based development approaches, with recognition of interconnectedness with other development initiatives.
2. WBG should not perceive development through a “trade-off” mindset as addressing local concerns is essential for addressing global concerns.
3. WBG needs to establish performance criteria and environmental accounting practices need to be incorporated to assess whether environmental sustainability goals are being achieved.
4. WBG should make natural resource accounting an integral part of the environmental strategy and increase its funding outlay for NRM.
5. WBG should focus on facilitating private sector / industry sector clean up and engage them to utilize their Corporate Social Responsibility policy and budgets to strengthen effectiveness of development initiatives.
6. WBG should establish centres of excellence in various sectors to undertake technology assessment to ensure use of appropriate technologies.
7. WBG should increase its role as knowledge facilitator and share knowledge from projects across countries and across all states in India.
8. WBG needs to curtail the repeated use of the same (often international) consultants. It should identify people with strong implementation experience, hire them as consultants and facilitate knowledge sharing.
9. WBG needs to reduce its project preparation time-line. Its project design should be based on an understanding of local context and multicultural diversity.

Environment Strategy 2010

CONSULTATIONS



Respondent Type	Consultation Response
1. The World Bank Group is a relatively small source of finance for major economic transformation in developing countries. What should the role of the Bank be in helping developing countries to address the challenges and opportunities they face in achieving environmentally sustainable development?	
Civil Society	<p>Development is often politically motivated and not necessarily technically appropriate. In India, development planning was not conscious about environment problems, which has arisen only in the last few years. WBG's role should be to pressurize the Indian Government to have a technically sound environment-conscious development planning. Environmental sustainability in a democratic country can be achieved only if there is something tangible for the people. In a democracy, politicians are likely to change over a 5-year period. Only if tangible outputs are delivered to the people, every subsequent politician will appreciate its need and will there be a genuine movement towards environmental sustainability. WBG should recognize this reality. [IK1]</p>
Civil Society	<p>The current development model that WBG is supporting is not going to take India on a sustainable path. Poverty will not be reduced and environmental sustainability will not be assured. For instance, Orissa has received considerable WBG technical and financial assistance, but these investments have neither helped to reduce poverty nor have they achieved environmental sustainability. There is need to re-think current development models and approaches to determine whether these can achieve environmental sustainability. [IK2]</p>
Academia	<p>WBG should promote a "systems" approach. It needs to develop its investments to look at the interconnectedness between its development initiatives and others in the same area. WBG also needs to understand the difference between systemic and multidisciplinary thinking. Multidisciplinary does not imply interconnectedness. WBG's approach should be systemic in nature. [IK3]</p>
Civil Society	<p>WBG should not use a "one-shoe-fits-all" approach in its project design. India is a diverse, multicultural country with varying local context, which has to be the basis for WBG's project designs. [IK4]</p>
Academia	<p>It is time that WBG reviews its performance criteria. These should be based on what is really happening to environmental resources like air, water and forests. Environmental accounting practices need to be incorporated, which will reveal whether environmental sustainability goals are being achieved. Natural resource accounting should be an integral part of the environmental strategy in terms of how environmental performance is measured. [IK5]</p>

Environment Strategy 2010 CONSULTATIONS



Respondent Type	Consultation Response
Government	WBG's environmental strategy should incorporate a direct engagement with the policy makers and those who influence policies, such as the politicians. [IK6]
Government & Civil Society	Training and capacity-building at all levels – implementation, middle management, top management / policy makers - should be a major role played by the WBG. There is also a need to build the capacity of WBG's own staff on environmental sustainability. [IK7]
Civil Society	The consumption / depletion of resources is directly linked with their pricing . By getting the prices right, environmental sustainability can be ensured. Proper attention should therefore be attached to market pricing. [IK8]
Civil Society	WBG should increase its funding outlay for NRM -related activities. In doing so, the lessons from past projects should be learned and incorporated into the design of the new projects. WBG's environmental strategy should give considerable focus on traditional approaches to NRM. [IK9]
Civil Society	WBG's experience in different countries in different systems and implementing different programs and projects should be gainfully leveraged to provide solutions that are locally adaptable & acceptable. [IK10]
Civil Society	While the WBG may not have investment projects in all states, its role as knowledge facilitator and knowledge sharing should be across all states. [IK11]
Civil Society	WBG should focus on getting the policy implementation at the grassroots level, e.g. at the panchayat level the policies should be correctly implemented or refined to align with the larger climate change or global issue on environment. If that is achieved, then most of the problems will be addressed. [IK12]
Civil Society	Forest resources are being depleted (wood used as a cooking medium) the forest lands have become barren and there is a rapid pace of deforestation. WBG's strategy should set the context for afforestation and reforestation as these are vital for environmental sustainability. [IK13]
Government	WBG tends to use the same consultants repeatedly even though the sectors are very different. Consultants seem to be chosen more because of their knowledge of the WBG's bureaucratic process rather than the development context. This results in the same bureaucratic

Environment Strategy 2010

CONSULTATIONS



Respondent Type	Consultation Response
	rut. WBG should attempt to change its system of consultants by choosing people with strong implementation experience and facilitating their knowledge sharing. WBG needs to generate new ideas constantly. [IK14]
Civil Society & Government	WBG's strategy should provide the framework for considering the following issues in the Indian context: <u>Interlinking of rivers</u> : In principle, reaching water from surplus areas to the deficit areas is a welcome initiative. But an integrated environmental assessment needs to be done prior to implementing such project initiatives. [IK15] <u>Ground water management</u> : Use of ground water should be carefully managed based on its quality. Non-availability of surface water is resulting in a widespread use of ground water without giving cognizance to its quality. [IK16]
Civil Society & Government	<u>Behaviour change</u> : Bringing about individual and organizational behaviour change is vital and can be achieved only through communication campaigns. [IK17]
Government	WBG projects, have a lot of procedural requirements due to the WBG administration, too many acronyms, too many abbreviations and too many consultants. There is lot of money spent and lot of good meetings, but very little to show on the ground that is commensurate to the funds spent. [IK18]
Government	For project preparation, the WBG cycle time is 2 years or more. This is quite serious since developing countries cannot afford such a timeframe. The development challenges are immediate and require a turnaround in a short timeframe. Something fundamentally different or drastic needs to be done to reduce these timeframes . [IK19]
2. The World Bank Group has worked to become a country/client driven organization. What should be the balance in the Bank's Groups role between addressing country/client specific priorities and the global public goods agenda?	
Government	National priorities are paramount . As WBG works primarily with the Government, the global public goods agenda will be second to national priorities. If the nation's environment improves, the global environment will also improve. [IK20]
Academia	WBG should not have a "trade-off" mindset as addressing local concerns is essential for addressing global concerns. [IK21]

Environment Strategy 2010 CONSULTATIONS



Respondent Type	Consultation Response
3. What should be the role of IFC and MIGA in helping private sector stakeholders to achieve higher levels of performance in pursuing environmental sustainability?	
Civil Society	In India, the private sector projects and initiatives are going to influence the development pathway in a significant manner. Private sector and their infrastructure / industry activities should be a focus area of the WBG. [IK22]
Civil Society	WBG should engage the private sector to use their Corporate Social Responsibility budgets to strengthen effectiveness of development initiatives. [IK23]
Civil Society	WBG should endeavor to get the private sector / industry to clean up their act including past environmental impacts. Externalities created by them are having major negative repercussions on society. [IK24]
Civil Society	WBG's focus should be to ensure that technology assessments – through the establishment of centres of excellence in various sectors - are done prior to making investments (largely from the private sector in the future), as it is their technologies that are a root cause of the problem. [IK25]
Bilateral & Multilaterals / Development Partners	WBG should assist Governments develop a long-term low carbon industrial strategy . [IK26]
4. How can the WBG put in place a systematic approach to assess environmental sustainability in sector portfolios?	
Academia	WBG needs to distinguish between systematic approach and a systemic approach. WBG's approaches are systematic within sectors but these are not systemic. A systemic approach in rural development means that the coverage is about the rural system, and not only about rural forestry, rural housing and rural roads. Viewing it as a rural system, allows actual cause-effect relationship to be identified and addressed. Such a systemic approach is missing. Understanding urban systems, rural systems, industry systems will bring the ecosystem concept in system thinking in terms of putting together a new approach to address the environmental sustainability. WBG should also build the capacity in higher environmental education to develop this subject area further. [IK27]
Civil Society	WBG should consider area-based development approaches rather than sector-based development approaches, as it is the latter, which creates secondary and tertiary environmental problems / issues for which there are no funds to implement solutions. This is also linked to

Environment Strategy 2010 CONSULTATIONS



Respondent Type	Consultation Response
	the systemic thinking described above. [IK28]
Civil Society	WBG should develop sector-based checklists on environmental issues and mobilize their implementation and use in a systematic manner across various sectors. [IK29]
Civil Society	Real, practical outcome / results indicators should be the basis of determining environmental performance. Indicators should not be theoretical. It is time that WBG reviews its performance criteria . These should be based on what is really happening to environmental resources like air, water and forests. [IK30]
5. How should short term and long term trade-offs between development and environmental sustainability be balanced?	
Academia	WBG should not have a “trade-off” mindset as what is required in the short-term is essential for the long-term. [IK31]
6. Any other issues?	
	None



Annexes

Participants List: Annex 1

World Bank Participants and Role: Annex 2

Agenda: Annex 3

Photographs: Annex 4

Annex 1

List of Participants

No.	Name	Organization	Stakeholder Type
1	Dr. Dipak Chakrabarti	West Bengal Pollution Control Board, Dept. of Env., Govt. of West Bengal	Government
2	Mr. Subrata Ghosh	West Bengal Pollution Control Board, Dept. of Env., Govt. of West Bengal	Government
3	Dr. Parthasarathi Chakrabarti	Dept. of Science & Technology, Govt. of West Bengal	Government
4	Mr. Arijit Banerjee	Department of Environment, Govt. of West Bengal	Government
5	Mr. Sanjay Khatua	Orissa Development Action Forum	Civil Society
6	Mr. Shyam Kumar Singh	Bihar Sewa Samiti (BSS)	Civil Society
7	Mr. Binod Sharma	Binoba Arogya Andlok Shikshan Kendra	Civil Society
8	Mr. S.N. Jha	Gram Vikas Parishad	Civil Society
9	Mr. Shivadhar Rai	Jayprabha Gram Vikas Mandal	Civil Society
10	Ms. Nirmala	Sarvo Prayas Sansthan	Civil Society
11	Ms. Nibha Devi	Ramawati Prashikshan Kendra	Civil Society
12	Mr. Om Satyam Trivedi	Samanvay Tirth	Civil Society
13	Ms. Devika Biswas	Bihar Voluntary Health Association	Civil Society
14	Mr. Vijay Kumar Singh	Lok Prabhat	Civil Society
15	Mr. Arun Das	Samajik Shaikshanik Vikas Kendra	Civil Society
16	Mr. Joe Madiath	Gram Vikas	Civil Society
17	Ms. Anjana Biswas	Lutheran World Service	Civil Society
18	Ms. Sarika Gupta	Tagore Society for Rural Development	Civil Society

Environment Strategy 2010 CONSULTATIONS



No.	Name	Organization	Stakeholder Type
19	Mr. Silajit Mukherjee	Sahara Utsarga Welfare Society	Civil Society
20	Mr. Chandra Shekhar Ghosh & Mr. P. Bhattacharya	BANDHAN Financial Services Pvt. Ltd.	Civil Society
21	Mr.Rabindranath Middey & Mr.Sayed Tapan Azad	Society for Participatory Action And Reflection (SPAR)	Civil Society
22	Mr. Deepak Mishra	SEEDS (Socio Economic & Edu. Dev. Society)	Civil Society
23	Mr. Raktim Mukhopadhyay	Bharat Integrated Social Welfare Agency (BISWA)	Civil Society
24	Mr. Narendra Kr. Jha	Mandan Bharti Jagriti Samaj	Civil Society
25	Mr. P.S.C. Rao	TRUE (Technology for Rural & Urban Environment)	Civil Society
26	Mr. Manoj K. Pradhan	Council of Professional Social Workers (CPSW)	Civil Society
27	Prof. Ms. Joyshree Roy	Jadavpur University	Academia
28	Ms. Shyamasree Dasgupta	Jadavpur University	Academia
29	Mr. Somenath Bhattacharyya	Institute of Environmental Studies & Wetland Management	Academia
30	Prof. Amalesh Chowdhury	S.D. Marine Biological Research Institute	Research
31	Dr. Rajeev Singh	Indian Chamber of Commerce	Association for Private Sector
32	Ms. Haimanti Poddar	British Deputy High Commission	Bilateral
33	Mr. Shyam N. Dave	UNICEF State Office for West Bengal	Multilateral
34	Dr. Anurag Danda	WWF-India, Sundarbans Programme	Civil Society
35	Ms. Saswati Sen	WWF-India, West Bengal State Office	Civil Society
36	Mr. Dhritiman Ray	SENES Consultants India Pvt.Ltd.	Consultant

Environment Strategy 2010
CONSULTATIONS



No.	Name	Organization	Stakeholder Type
37	Mr. D. Bandyopadhyay	SENES Consultants India Pvt.Ltd.	Consultant
38	Ms. Rita Dey	Development Management Consultants	Consultant
39	Mr. Tapas Ghatak	INICEF & World Bank	Consultant



Annex 2

World Bank Participants and Role

Ruma Tavorath	Senior Environmental Specialist, World Bank, New Delhi. [Coordinator, Environment Strategy Consultations, South Asia Region]
Vaideeswaran S.	Environmental Consultant, World Bank, New Delhi [Facilitator]
Bela Varma	Program Assistant, World Bank, New Delhi
Carmel Gupte	Team Assistant, World Bank, New Delhi



Annex 3

Agenda – Kolkata Consultation Workshop

Venue: The Park Hotel, Kolkata (Room: Galaxy 2)

Date: Friday, February 5, 2010

9:00-10:00	Registration
10:00-10:15	Opening: context and purpose of the consultations
10:15-10:45	Presentation of the World Bank's Environment Strategy 2010 Concept Note: <i>Ms. Ruma Tavorath, Senior Environmental Specialist, The World Bank</i>
10:45-11:00	Discussion to identify key thematic areas for the break-out groups
11:00-11:15	Coffee
11:15-12:15	Thematic Working Groups: Breakout Sessions (Galaxy 2 and The Lounge) <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. What are the top 3 challenges and the top 3 opportunities to achieving environmentally sustainable development in the South Asia region? And the corresponding role of the World Bank group?2. How does (country name) balance trade-off between development and environmental sustainability and the local country-specific priorities and global public goods? What is the balance role played by the World Bank group?3. What kind of systematic approach can be put in place to assess and measure environmental sustainability in sector portfolios?
12:15-1:15	Presentations of working group findings
1:15-2:00	Synopsis and Concluding remarks
2:00	Lunch

Environment Strategy 2010 CONSULTATIONS



Annex 4

Photographs



PRESENTATION OF THE WORLD BANK CORPORATE ENVIRONMENT STRATEGY



THEMATIC WORKING GROUP SESSIONS



PRESENTATION OF FEEDBACK FROM GROUP SESSIONS

Environment Strategy 2010
CONSULTATIONS

