

STAKEHOLDER GROUP (S): MULTISTAKEHOLDER

Location of consultation: Islamabad, Pakistan

Date: January 12, 2010

Participants (please attach list of participants and their affiliations):

A total of 77 participants attended the workshop. Of these, 45 participants were from the federal and provincial governments, Environmental Protection Agencies (EPAs), and the Bank-financed projects; four were from donors; 12 represented civil society; five were from academia; nine came from the corporate sector; and two participants belonged to the media.

World Bank Participants and Role:

Naveed H. Naqvi, Acting Head of World Bank Islamabad
Khawar Saeed Ansari, Operations Officer, IFC, Islamabad
Zia Aljalaly, Senior Social Development Specialist
Javaid Afzal, Senior Environment Specialist, Presenter (Islamabad Office)
Khizra Pervez, Team Assistant,
Sada Hussain, Team Assistant

How did the process fit into ongoing country dialogue (if relevant; for international meetings, please explain how it fit into the topic of that meeting)?

Pakistan faces multi-faceted challenges in the form of increasing population, poverty, depleting fresh water resources, aging irrigation system, widening gap between energy demand and supply, a large portion of the population still uneducated, rapid urbanization and the associated rural-urban divide, and changing weather patterns possibly linked with the Climate Change. The Bank, together with other donors, is actively engaged with the Country to address these developmental challenges, and its current portfolio includes projects in poverty alleviation, water, environment, energy, roads, education, health, social protection, and infrastructure development sectors.

The persistent environmental challenges such as meeting Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), environmental health risks and pollution management, and sustainable natural resource management, as well as the growing challenges of urbanization and climate change – themes that are central to the development of the new World Bank Group (WBG) Environment Policy 2010 – are also the major focus of the environmental management agenda of Pakistan.

What were the key issues/themes raised by participants?

The workshop participants expressed that in a country like Pakistan, it was important to recognize the emerging threats and vulnerabilities for the environmental sustainability, and to achieve development that balances the economic, social and environmental considerations – ie,

sustainable development. The Bank needed to continue working with the Country to achieve sustainable development and alleviate poverty, they asserted.

Most of the participants were of the view that environmental legislation and the associated institutional setup existed in the Country, however, these had so far not been very effective in tackling the wide-spread environmental degradation. They opined that it was important to estimate the cost of this environmental degradation also, in order to raise the awareness at the policy-making level, and also to justify costs associated with prevention/restoration activities. They recommended that the Bank should assist the Country in strengthening institutions and building capacities.

It was pointed out that a considerable majority of the environmental problems associated with any project could be solved with the help of good housekeeping/good management. Furthermore, the participants added, monitoring and evaluation of the projects and other development initiatives were vitally important, and the project cycle of plan-do-check-act should be employed to ensure that these projects and initiatives achieved their planned objectives and desired results/impacts.

It was also recommended by the participants that the Bank should help the country in identifying short-, medium- and long-term environmental problems, and also in devising and implementing action plans to address these problems. The participants asserted that developing strategies and policies were no doubt useful, but actual actions on ground were far more important. In particular, they added, adaptation measures in response to climate change should be a priority in Bank's development strategy, and the projects/initiatives, especially involving natural resource management, needed to be evaluated for life cycle assessments

Regarding the consultations for the WBG Environment Strategy 2010, some participants proposed that the consultation process should be extended to other parts of the country for seeking inputs from various levels and sections of society.

Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
1. The World Bank Group is a relatively small source of finance for major economic transformation in developing countries. What should the role of the Bank be in helping developing countries to address the challenges and opportunities they face in achieving environmentally sustainable development?		
Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should help the Country in capacity building and capacity audit of the key institutions responsible for environmental protection. The capacity building should include an ongoing program of providing trainings to the key staff within these institutions. ▪ The WBG should provide technical know-how and 'knowledge products' to the Country's relevant institutions and departments. It should also be ensured that the transferred know-how is widely disseminated within the country including the provincial departments and institutions. ▪ The WBG should help the Country in ensuring that effective stakeholder consultations are integrated in the overall project cycle. This will ensure appropriate project formulation, smoother project execution, and greater sustainability of the projects. ▪ The WBG should assess the impacts of the projects more objectively, and help the Country in developing systems for this purpose. Particular importance should be given to the long-term and irreversible impacts. ▪ The WBG should help the Country in natural resource conservation in line with the national and WBG policies. 	
Academia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should assist the Country in developing linkages between the national institutions and international bodies. This will help in sharing of expertise, knowledge, ideas and experiences. ▪ The WBG should assist the Country in raising awareness on issues, such as 	

¹ Summary of main points raised. All participants and stakeholders are invited to send more detailed comments via the website. Please provide your name, title and organization if you would like your comments to be posted on the external consultations website.



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	environmental protection and sustainable development, among various segments of the society.	
Civil Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should more effectively help the country in building enabling environment to achieve environmental sustainability. While designing and implementing Bank- and Government-financed projects, the civil society and communities should be meaningfully involved and taken into confidence. ▪ The WBG should play its role more effectively in achieving the ultimate goal of poverty alleviation through its financial resources, technical assistance and knowledge products. ▪ The WBG should focus more on the community-based projects, and help the Country to adopt this approach more effectively. This will ensure greater involvement of the beneficiaries in the project design and implementation, and will also ensure greater sustainability. 	
Corporate Sector	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should give priority to the Country's needs and preferences in devising strategies and preparing projects for the country. ▪ The WBG should work towards removing discrepancies between the Country systems and its own policies. ▪ The WBG should help the corporate sector in integrating the environmental aspects in the design and operation of the private entities. Technical assistance should also be provided to the corporate sector to enable them to comply with the national environmental requirements. 	

Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
2. The World Bank Group has worked to become a country/client driven organization. What should be the balance in the Bank's Groups role between addressing country/client specific priorities and the global public goods agenda ?		
Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should undertake projects that ensure environmental sustainability and meet the country needs/ priorities, and also address the internationally established concerns. 	
Academia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should assist the Country in identifying and implementing adaptation measures in response to Climate Change. The WBG should particularly assist the national institutions involved in Climate Change studies. 	
Civil Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The capacity building and training components should be included in the WBG's projects after careful considerations (i.e. with the help of training need assessment and with the on-ground assessment, rather than preconceived ideas). 	
Corporate Sector	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG policies and strategies should be uniformly implemented across the globe. 	
3. What should be the role of IFC and MIGA be in helping private sector stakeholders to achieve higher levels of performance in pursuing environmental sustainability?		
Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ IFC should carry out monitoring of its projects jointly with the EPAs. ▪ IFC should ensure that the EA of its projects are conducted by suitable and capable consultants to ensure unbiased and impartial assessment. ▪ IFC should place more focus on projects in the infrastructure development, energy, water, and waste disposal. ▪ IFC should ensure compatibility of its procurement rules with the applicable rules in the Country. 	
Academia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ IFC should ensure that the technology being employed in its projects are proven and applicable/useful for the Country. IFC should also ensure technology 	

Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	transfer and capacity building during its projects.	
Civil Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ IFC should place greater focus on the environmental compliance throughout the various phases of the project. The WBG should build capacities in the national institutions to this effect. ▪ All environmental projects should be in the form of grants. 	
Corporate Sector	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ IFC should help the corporate sector for capacity building in environmental management, pollution control and clean technologies. ▪ IFC should play its role in developing corporate culture that respects environment and environmental protection within the Country. ▪ IFC should increase its outreach within the country, and should expand its portfolio, so that it can play a greater role in the growth of the private sector. ▪ IFC should provide soft loans to the private sector. 	
4. How can the WBG put in place a systematic approach to assess environmental sustainability in sector portfolios?		
Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should develop and implement sector-specific sustainable development indicators for its portfolio. ▪ The WBG should ensure environmental compliance during all stages of the project. 	
Academia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should build capacities of the public and private sector institutions for developing appropriate indicators and assessing environmental sustainability. ▪ The WBG should involve experts from the educational institutions for developing environmental sustainability indicators, and assessing environmental sustainability of its projects in the Country. 	
Civil Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should ensure that no projects are initiated without carrying out environmental assessment. Such assessments should also be carried out during various phases of the projects, and also after the project completion (environmental audit). 	

Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should ensure that stakeholder consultations are carried out during different phases of its projects. 	
Corporate Sector	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should develop and implement effective M&E systems for various sectors in the Country. 	
5. How should short term and long term trade-offs between development and environmental sustainability be balanced?		
Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should assist the Country in building capacities of the national institutions and departments responsible for development planning. The WBG should help these institutions and departments in building capacities to evaluate the short-term and long-term aspects of the projects. ▪ The WBG should ensure that the environmental assessments of its projects are carried out effectively, and that these assessments are impartial, unbiased, and objective. 	
Academia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should carry out Sectoral Strategic Environmental Assessments (SSEAs) of its projects, and also help the Country in building capacities to conduct and evaluate SSEAs. 	
Civil Society,	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ While determining the cost of any project/development scheme, cost of environmental degradation should also be considered. ▪ The WBG should only invest in projects which benefit masses rather than specific groups and beneficiaries. 	
Corporate Sector	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should carry out life-cycle assessment of its projects, especially involving natural resource management. 	
6. Any other issues?		
Government	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should increase its role during the implementation and post-project phases, to ensure greater compliance and environmental sustainability, 	

Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
Academia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should assist the Country in establishing bench marks for the key institutions and departments involved in the environmental protection, and should also identify role-model institutions. 	
Civil Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should extend the consultations for its Environment Strategy 2010 to other parts of the Country, ensuring wider participation from different segment of the society. 	
Corporate Sector	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The WBG should assist the Country in establishing well-equipped environmental laboratories and monitoring equipment/systems, particularly in private sector. 	