

**STAKEHOLDER GROUP (S): MULTISTAKEHOLDER**

**Location of consultation:** Manila, Philippines

**Date:** March 17, 2010

**Participants:**

[See Annex below for the list of participants]

Bebet Gozun, - *moderator*

Manuel Gerochi – Title, Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR), Government- *reactor*

Lorenzo Tan, Title, World Wildlife Fund, Philippines, Civil Society- *reactor*

Victor Raner, Title, Company, Private Sector - *reactor*

**World Bank Group Participants and Role:**

Ms. Michele de Nevers, Senior Manager, Environment Department - *speaker*

Ms. Magda Lovei, Sector Manager, East Asia and Pacific Region - *speaker*

Mr. Mark Woodward, Environment Specialist, Manila Office - *speaker*

Mr. Jeff Brez, Senior Communications and Knowledge Management Officer, Environment Department, World Bank

**What were the key issues/themes raised by participants?**

**“Save the environment, save the poor. Save the poor, save the environment.”**

The Strategy must convey a sense of urgency and put environmental degradation in developing countries into historical context.

The three pillars of the 2001 Strategy are still relevant, but the Strategy must be forward looking and plan for the future, not the past, or developing countries will be playing catch up. In this sense, it should **promote “next practice, not best practice.”** Future sustainability will depend on the impacts of climate change. For example, more investments should be made in regional initiatives that plan for population movements.

The Global Polls do not register environment as a priority in developing countries because there is not adequate understanding of the direct links between the environment and the poverty of the people. The Strategy should emphasize this direct linkage as a critical and not a secondary issue (especially due to climate change). Communities already perceive natural resources as their last resort to survival.

The Strategy should promote an active role for local and regional planning entities that allow for flexibility and focus on local realities.

**Environmental governance** should be the key underlying feature of the Strategy, with a focus on institutional structures and functions, and enforcement. Local level data and environmental indicators are necessary for improved governance. Performance indicators for government



## Annex - List of Participants

officials based on water quality and forest cover in their districts, for example, could buttress accountability.

Carbon offsets and climate change-based approaches can help link environmental services and achieve environmental objectives by catalyzing the improvement of environmentally sustainable practices among/within industries (water management, solid waste management, sanitation, etc.). The Strategy should promote this as a big innovation and private sector investment opportunity for developing countries.

Regional solutions are a key element to achieving environmental sustainability: the Asian Development Bank and the World Bank Group can work together on country partnerships.



## Annex - List of Participants

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
<b>1. What should the role of the WBG be in helping developing countries in achieving environmentally sustainable development?</b>		
Government	The Strategy must convey a sense of urgency and put environmental degradation in developing countries into historical and geopolitical context.	
Government	The Strategy should talk about limits and ecosystem carrying capacities, and factor in population and resource availability.	
Government	Management is fundamental: poverty needs to be solved first otherwise there will be a vicious cycle of environmental degradation. Communities tend to abuse the environment because there is nothing else.	
Government	The 2001 basic pillars are still relevant, but an enabling environment must be stressed to promote the achievement in practice of environmental sustainability: lots of assistance to boost investment in research and access to technology is crucial to overcome stumbling blocks including Intellectual Property Rights.	
Civil Society	Climate change creates the necessity of doing a thorough market analysis to identify the shifting opportunity set(s). Comprehensive climate risk assessments should underpin the environmental sustainability of development so that realistic priorities can be determined on the basis of expected opportunities of likely scenarios.	
Civil Society	The global economy will look like a war time economy due to climate change: sacrifices will need to be made. Massive population growth in the Asia Pacific region must be addressed.	
Private Sector	The Strategy must be centered on improving environmental governance, including consistency of government policies and strong legal frameworks. Policies currently change too much due to the lack of laws. This does not encourage private sector investment.	

<sup>1</sup> Summary of main points raised. All participants and stakeholders are invited to send more detailed comments, or rectifications to this summary if deemed necessary, via the website. Please provide your name, title and organization if you would like your comments to be posted on the external consultations website.



## Annex - List of Participants

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
Private Sector	The Strategy should help governments to strengthen the enabling environment for environmentally sustainable investments, including through the provision of predictable and transparent tax incentives	
Private Sector	The Strategy should promote science based policies and regulations, and reduce the number of levels needed to obtain environmental permits and the level of political/personal discretion involved at each step. Currently, too many interests are imposed on investors.	
Private Sector	Payment for Ecosystem Services (PES) based on proper valuation of ecosystem services should be promoted to create self-sustaining sources of funding for reforestation and natural resource management.	
Private Sector	Models of community-based / local management of natural resources, including revenues, should be promoted.	
Local Government	The Strategy should recognize that municipalities can be leaders in environmentally sustainable development, including solid waste management, urban greening (reforestation), vehicle emissions, fishing practices, sanitation and support those efforts as well as help spread lesson learning and exchange of best practices.	
Local Government	The Strategy should promote disaster preparedness training, including among children, to raise awareness on how to cope with environmental disasters including sea level rise.	
Government	Disaster Risk Reduction and climate change should be linked at the national level	
Government	The Strategy should provide more assistance to support coherent policy frameworks that integrate all three WBG Strategy pillars together in practical ways, leaving less discretion at the ground level.	
Civil Society	The Strategy should emphasize capacity building for decision makers to improve access to information for monitoring environmental sustainability. For example, cities may have certain data, but don't have the know-how to analyze it for decision / policy making.	



## Annex - List of Participants

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
Civil Society, Ex-government	There is a need to act differently, outside the box. We must close the box of unsustainable production and consumption. The private sector can provide leadership on sustainable practices in countries.	
Development professional	There are lots of lessons to date from WB environment programs and projects. The involvement and capacity of local governments and partners is critical at both the design and implementation stages.	
Development professional	Education and dissemination of information on environment and links to development outcomes at the grass roots level is also crucial.	
Development professional	Links at the local level between environment and poverty are not understood well enough. For example, sustainable livelihood components of protected areas projects are not working very well. Livelihood projects need to be improved. In particular, when incomes temporarily dip there needs to be an interim “plan B” to ensure long term sustainability.	
<b>2. What should the role of IFC and MIGA be in helping private sector stakeholders address environmental sustainability?</b>		
<b>3. What should be the balance in the Bank Group’s role in addressing country/client- specific priorities and global public goods agendas?</b>		
Civil Society	A country-driven approach is not good enough because population growth will lead to population shifts and displacement that not only will put investments at risk but also will require regional solutions.	
Government	There needs to be a local level emphasis on understanding disaster risks and environmental carrying capacity for example in forest and coastal areas to achieve development priorities in environmentally sustainable ways. There is currently too much unregulated and unplanned development in these areas that puts too much pressure on the environment.	



## Annex - List of Participants

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
Multilateral Development Bank	The Strategy should promote regional approaches and solutions to watershed management and coastal and marine management (Coral Triangle Initiative, e.g.).	
Multilateral Development Bank	The WBG should provide knowledge products on how to achieve “green development” including how to value ecosystem services.	
Civil Society	The government needs to pay more attention to population growth.	
<b>4. How can the WBG put in place a systematic approach to assess environmental sustainability in sector portfolios?</b>		
Government	Rural debt (poverty) is linked to access to transport and technology.	
Government	There is an energy shortage among many poor and a tendency to pollute more due to the high barriers to accessing clean energy technologies. Geothermal energy is available in the Philippines but the capital here is not friendly to such “clean development.”	
Government	Knowledge sharing of successful experiences in deploying clean technologies across sectors is crucial to promote clean development.	
Private Sector	The Strategy should support strong legal and institutional frameworks for water basin management at the watershed level.	
Private Sector	The Strategy should recognize that the sustainable management of forest and mountain ecosystems is the core from which all development depends (water and land degradation). The Philippines has large populations in forests that need to be supported to use natural resources sustainably.	
Private Sector	The Strategy should promote increased access to financial markets for (private sector) water managers and local utilities. They need the increased investment to improve sanitation.	
Government	The Strategy should promote indicators across sectors for environmental sustainability and targets for results based management	



## Annex - List of Participants

Respondent Type	Consultation Response <sup>1</sup>	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
Government	Current Clean Air and Water Acts are examples of legislation that deal with natural resources but that do not address growth. The Strategy should provide policy support to improve legislation across sectors to both ensure environmental sustainability and buttress growth.	
Government	Environmental sustainability should be defined taking population and into consideration and with indicators across sectors including land use.	
Private Sector	Future water management and sustainability at the macro level is key – the Strategy should support prioritizing by the government to send signals for better river and water basin management. Sanitation and solid waste management are both linked to water management and synergies within this environment sector convergence should be exploited to promote financial viability. In short, the practices of these industries must be aligned.	
Private Sector	Carbon offsets can help achieve environmental objectives and catalyze the improvement of environmentally sustainable practices among/within industries (water management, solid waste management, sanitation, etc.). The Strategy should promote this as a big opportunity for developing countries.	
<b>5. How should short term and long term trade-offs between growth and environmental sustainability be balanced?</b>		
Local Government	Information technology should be promoted to increase access to information about future scenarios of resource availability and other information related to climate change, to help optimize decisions on investments in infrastructure, etc.	
<b>6. Other issues and general comments.</b>		



## Annex - List of Participants

Name	Job Title	Organization
Abando, Sheng	Investment Analyst	International Finance Corporation
Abugan, Eddie	Project Development Officer III	Department of Environment and Natural Resources -FASPO
Agub, Sherwynne	Economic Development Specialist	National Economic & Development Authority
Allen, Tom	Former WBOM CD	
Almendras, Rene	President	Manila Water Company
Baskinas, Luz	Program Officer	World Wildlife Fund
Castillo, Olivia	Member	United Nations Secretary General Advisory Board
Cruda, Helen	Environment Specialist	Asian Development Bank
Damasco, Gani	Manager	Cagayan Electric Power & Light Company Inc.
Dolatre, Erlinda	Sr. Adviser	GTZ- German Development Cooperation
Encabo, Sheila Marie	OIC-Director	National Economic and Development Authority
Evangelista, Socrates	Operation Manager	Philippine Council of Evangelical Churches -PhilRADS
Gerochi, Manuel	Under secretary	Department of Environment and Natural Resources
Gotthardt, Susanne	Program Adviser	GTZ- German Development Cooperation
Gozun, Elisea	Consultant	Asian Environmental Compliance and Enforcement Network; Earth Day Network Philippines
Javier, Jennifer	Research Coordinator	Philippine Partnership for the Development of Human Resources in Rural Areas (PhilDHRRA)
Jude, Mila	Chief Technical Officer	Strategic Link for Socio Economic Environment & Energy
Kazuhiko, Ueno	JICA Representative	Japan International Cooperation Agency
Mercado, Elmer	Environment Advisor	Canadian International Development Agency - PCCO
Miral, Romulo Jr.	Executive Director	Congressional Planning, Budget & Research Department
Ortega, Mary Jane	Former Mayor of La Union	LCP/WB-PNC
Pascua, Amor	Area Development Manager	Kababaihan Gabay ng Bayan (KAGABAY)
Pilando, Teofilo, Jr.	Director	Asia Pacific Global Change Forum
Quismundo, Tarra	Reporter	Development Executive Group
Ramos, Victor	Former DENR Secretary	
Regunay, Cristy	OIC-Division Chief	Department of Environment & Natural Resources
Rivera, Aileen Diaz de	Director	Ayala Foundation
Tan, Jose Maria "Lory"	President	World Wildlife Fund
Tatlonghari, Paul Andrew	Planning & Research Officer	Environment Public Waste & Management Division
Teh, Annaliza	Assistant Secretary	Department of Environment and Natural Resources
Toledo, Shem	Project & Info. Officer	Asian NGO Coalition for Agrarian Reform & Rural Development
Villapando, Godof	Manager	Foundation for the Philippine Environment
Zunega, Noela	Division Manager	National Commission on Indigenous People

