

STAKEHOLDER GROUP (S): MULTI-STAKEHOLDER

Location of consultation: IDDRI, Science Po, Paris, France

Date: February 25, 2010

Participants:

See Annex below with list of participants

World Bank Participants and Role:

Urvashi Narain, Senior Environmental Economist, Environment Department
Rachel Winter Jones, Senior Civil Society Specialist, Consultations Co-coordinator-Europe
Cristina Mejia, External Affairs and Counselor, France
Auriane Montreuil, External Affairs, France
Gilles Garcia, Manager, Enterprise Outreach Services, External Affairs, France
Catherine Doody, External Affairs, France

How did the process fit into ongoing country dialogue (if relevant; for international meetings, please explain how it fit into the topic of that meeting)?

The World Bank, through the French Desk of the External Affairs Unit for Europe (EXTEU), enjoys a close and sustained dialogue on urban, environment, and energy/climate change issues with the Agence Française de Développement (AFD), the Foreign Ministry's Directorate-General for Global Affairs, the Ministry of Ecology, Energy, Sustainable Development and the Sea (MEEDDM), the *Institut de Développement Durable et des Relations Internationales* (IDDRI), and the French private sector. This partnership involves joint research, technical cooperation, co-financing, and policy dialogue, bringing French expertise on energy, transport, urban planning, land use, and environment issues to Bank analytical work, projects, programs, and sector strategy consultations. Examples include the consultations in Paris around the Bank's Strategic Framework on Climate Change and Development (SFCCD) in 2008, the urban strategy in 2009, and the energy and environment strategies in 2010; the Urban Symposium in Marseille; and technical cooperation on the Concentrated Solar Power (CSP) Scale-up Program of the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Region (funded by the Clean Technology Fund - CTF) and the Sustainable MED Program for Mediterranean trans-boundary pollution reduction, improved water resources management, and biodiversity conservation, co-financed by several international financial institutions (IFIs) and other agencies. Sustainable MED also has an important governance and knowledge component implemented through the Center for Mediterranean Integration in Marseille.



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
1. The World Bank Group is a relatively small source of finance for major economic transformation in developing countries. What should the role of the Bank be in helping developing countries to address the challenges and opportunities they face in achieving environmentally sustainable development?		
[Government]	<p>Government of the Unified Republic of Tanzania represented by its Ambassador:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Urbanization is growing at a very fast pace in Africa. The question is how can the World Bank support the energy sector? The problem is that for many people there is no other alternative source of energy except firewood as this is the case in the Congo basin and in other countries where the Bank assistance is needed. Transfer of technology is desperately needed and it is very important for WBG to invest in solar and wind. 2. The WB would have a vested interest in energy technology transfers as solar and wind are expensive. 3. Transport – 1 billion people live in Africa with a growing middle class wants increased mobility and where cars are considered a sign of external wealth. A public transport system on a massive scale is missing policies are needed but also investment 4. North / south – south cooperation and exchange of experiences and knowledge. <p>Water management and lack of resources – are the growing</p>	<p>These are all very important issues –how do we get energy to developing countries? The issue of coal is the dilemma and has already been raised in our consultations on the Bank’s Strategic Framework on Development and Climate change from 2008.</p> <p>Once we have any draft strategy – we take that it up to Board – developed and developing countries, and this is discussed as part our governance structure.</p> <p>Under the SFCCD guidance—World Bank investment in projects with a coal component will be only be agreed under certain conditions and only on a case by case basis with a long term planning scenario and coal as a, short term measure. There is a dilemma globally over energy access. The US still investing in coal. Therefore, how can the World Bank in discussion with poor countries say that they cannot invest in has coal. Leadership must also come from developed countries.</p> <p>Also, if there is no global price for carbon this makes things even more difficult.</p>

¹ Summary of main points rose. All participants and stakeholders are invited to send more detailed comments via the website. Please provide your name, title and organization if you would like your comments to be posted on the external consultations website.



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	<p>cause of intra and inter- states' conflicts and mainly due to the impacts of climate change and are therefore "begging" for policy development, management and investments.</p> <p>5. Poverty reduction – African countries need assistance to mitigate the effects caused by their loss of young populations to migration and the continent will remain with an age deficit. All African countries have PRSPs that need to be supported otherwise young people will continue to try and migrate to north (Ambassador Tanzania)</p> <p>Paris regional council: How will the strategy interact with/ ensure the voices of local governments' authorities are considered?</p>	<p>Investing in rural areas is critical – many villages in developing countries are managing their natural resources and services very well and people are migrating back from the cities. These villages should be a source of inspiration and we need to scale up what they are doing, and think about what lessons we can learn from these experiences.</p> <p>Food security is critical – and I agree that there is an important link between environment and agriculture. Soil is critical and we think we need to do a proper accounting of this degradation, and be conscious of the choices being made so future development is not so constrained.</p> <p>Indicators –the international community is not there yet and we have taken a neutral position to the Climate Change negotiation. We of course follow the negotiations this will take commitment from developed and developing countries alike. However, environment and climate issues are development issues. The World Bank cannot wait not to do things – have to incorporate these issues into the development work we do now.</p> <p>Very important that the North not dictate to the South – learning has to be gleaned from everywhere –and the North does not have the have the answers at the moment.</p>



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
		<p>The World Bank is changing and we do recognize a proper role for the public and the private sectors in this debate.</p> <p>I am not trying to sell the world bank to you. It is a multi-cultural organization – voices and ideas are raised from so many parts of the institutions.</p> <p>We are trying to be more responsive and more open. We have a new Access to Information policy which will start to be implemented on July 1.</p> <p>How do we make public transport systems become the first mode of mobility? How do we make that happen? What can we do as the World Bank to suggest that a certain percentage of a countries transport system be public transport?</p> <p>We seek knowledge from every place. The challenges are huge and we have to think outside the box. Business as usual not going to work and we have to reach out to different stakeholders for solutions.</p> <p>Methodology – how do you make sure that environment is part of this growth? We need inclusive growth – If you look at studies on poverty reduction strategy there is very little mention of environment – we need a new growth path.</p> <p>Which energy is suitable? A great deal depends on</p>



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
		<p>resources and which resources are available and affordable. Solar is much more expensive for developing countries which in the meantime have huge reserves of cheap coal....There is great effort on the Concentrated solar power project with GEF funding. The role of the World Bank is to come in and help make that more affordable. However, these energy options still have to be subsidized and unless the international community starts investing now, the costs will not come down anytime soon.</p> <p>I do not have the absolute figures on the environment portfolio --</p>
[Legislature]	Not present	
[Representatives from Civil Society]	<p>NGO Amis de la Terre/ Friends of the Earth France – The World Bank is investing 450 million dollars coal power plant in Africa. 16 percent of its funding is for fossil fuels. Now the Bank is investing in the ESKOM project in South Africa. The local population opposed to this project as it does not have a poverty reduction goal. This ignores the recommendations of the Extractive Industries Review that the World Bank should phase out investment in fossil fuels. Developing countries should be able to skip unclean development and move directly to clean energy and not be dependent on coal, oil and gas like industrialized countries. However, the World Bank is still focusing on fossil fuels. We must first discuss the phasing out of fossil fuels. Transport, forestry and agriculture should be integrated using a ‘methodology’ similar to the one used by AFD. This should be a priority discussion for IFIs.</p>	<p>I encourage you to post your intervention I am aware of the letter – replying to US – procedure. We have to consult with others and there is an opportunity to discuss further this issue of investment in coal and developing countries.</p> <p>When we talk about green growth in the countries we must remember that the basic mission of the World Bank poverty reduction. The link between growth and poverty reduction seems to be taken as obvious. But the links between green growth and poverty reduction need to be explored.</p>



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	<p>WWF France – we need to integrate the rural sector as a cross-cutting sector to bring in environment and governance issues for example, and improve the livelihoods of people who live with natural resources.</p> <p>North / South – South cooperation and exchange of experiences and knowledge.</p> <p>Ingénieurs sans frontières (Engineers without Borders) There needs to be a change in paradigm There is always a north to south transfer of knowledge should operate. However this should increasingly operate by drawing from local experiences; solutions can be found from bottom up.</p>	
[Private sector]	<p>Société Générale Bank indicated that Société Générale is participating in the IFC review process and wonder to what extent the WB environment consultation team coordinates with IFC. SG applies IFC (common) performance standards. Climate change needs to be addressed. It would be good to have some standard methodologies and indication as to the types of technology so that they are clean? Banks and others actors need to have the same methodologies so that can all be aligned.</p> <p>Veolia – With regard to rural communities and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), a lot of people are moving from rural to urban areas and there are related impacts upon access to water and sanitation. What is needed is a methodology e.g. water access with transport, with some energy plus a comprehensive way to supply and manage all the key local services (e.g. family planning, health clinics etc). Knowledge transfer should include small pricing revenue to make ensure the development kick-</p>	



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
	<p>starts. This is how we assess the cross sectoral issues – to help small communities at local government level.</p> <p>Qauntis – consultant – Do teams who work on different projects methodology to evaluate if a project will be developed by the World Bank use cradle to grave methodology that account for climate change impacts? Should these assessments include health and biodiversity?</p> <p>Solar energy – different sources? What is the best energy for which region?</p>	
Think tank	<p>Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique</p> <p>Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique – the energy aspect related to food security is lacking in the presentation.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. How will the agricultural dimension as well as land management be addressed by the strategy? Land use efficiency is often lacking in these types of strategies; fossil energies & biomass are both land consuming. 2. Indicators are also one important dimension that should be covered by the strategy; how will it be dealt with, for, for example crop provision and fossil energy; <p>How will people working under the agriculture sector be covered by the strategy? (as they often fail to be accounted for).</p> <p>IDDR: Investment needs are huge for new growth paradigm. Yet the private sector is not stepping up. They</p>	



Respondent Type	Consultation Response ¹	Preliminary World Bank Group Response* (may be addressed in final reporting back)
[Academia]	<p>continue to do what they are familiar with. Bank needs to open new horizons and introduce innovative ways of financing.</p> <p>INRA: will the strategy cover the bacterial dimension; the protection of water, food and biodiversity means that soils must also be protected. How can the WB lend money to a sector where there is hardly any market for environmental goods, where hardly any of the cash loaned will be refunded unless taxes are increased; Does the World Bank have an opinion on an optimal environment taxation level?</p> <p>Environment and energy – companies want to invest in energy and environment –but they do not how to make linkages.</p> <p>Public transport is not strong – even in developed countries. How can this trend be reversed in developing countries? Poor countries in Africa – population very experienced. Time to consider these experiences to exchange.</p> <p>Will Bank contribute to the Copenhagen green fund?</p>	<p>With regard to the ‘Green Fund’ and role of the World Bank. We do have some experience on with regard to the CIF’s (Climate Investment Funds) governance structure where CSOs and private sector and indigenous peoples groups are very active and all discussion are open to them. The Bank has been able to leverage more funds and has learnt many lessons through this experience.</p>

Salutation	First Name	Last Name	Title	Organization
Mr.	Jean-Jacques	Baraer	Chargé de mission	AIRD
Son Excellence Monsieur l'Ambassadeur	Hassan Omar Gumbo	Kibelloh	Ambassadeur en France et délégué permanent à l'UNESCO/ Ambassador To France/Permanent Delegate To UNESCO	Ambassade de la République Unie de Tanzanie à Paris
Mr.	Olivier	Vedrine	Professeur Groupe INSEECHead Collège Atlantique-Oural	Association des Auditeurs des Sessions Europeennes de l'Institut des Hautes Etudes de Defense Nationale (AAE IHEDN)
Mr.	Sylvain	Augoyard	Analyste	BNP - Paribas
Mr.	Wenjiann	Ku	Directeur	Bureau de Représentation de Taipei en France (B.R.T.F.)
Mr.	Nicolas	Blanc	Directeur de projet	CAISSE DES DEPOTS ET CONSIGNATIONS
Mrs.	Névine	Kocher	Chargée de mission Relations internationales	CEMAGREF
Mr.	Renaud	Tahon	Head of Environment	COFACE
Mr.	Jeremie	Dulouost	expert environnement	COFACE
Mrs.	Claudie	Bony	Responsable réseaux internationaux collectivités localess	Conseil régional d'ile de France
Mr.	Sébastien	Relland	Chef du service de la propsective- Head of prospective analysis	Council of Europe Development Bank
Mr.	Richard	Dambrine	Consultant agricole indépendant	Dambrine
Mr.	Antoine	Burin des Roziers	Controleur général	EDF
Mr.	Séverin	Fischer		EpE
Mr.	Pierre	Girard	Chef de projets vivriers	Fondation FARM
Mr.	Thomas	Legrand	Director	green synergie
Mr.	Dominique	Bernardini	Groupe energie	Ingénieurs sans Frontières



Mrs.	Fabienne	Trolard	Directeur de recherches INRA - UR Géochimie des doles et des eaux	INRA Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique
Mr.	Arthur	Riedacker	Directeur de Recherche	INRA Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique
Mr.	Guilhem	Bourrié	Directeur de recherches	INRA Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique
Mr.	Jean-Marc	Boussard	Economiste universitaire matières premières	INRA-CIRAD
Mr.	Pierre	Matarasso	Directeur Adjoint Scientifique	Institut ÉCOLOGIE & ENVIRONNEMENT
Mr.	Georges	Valentis	Délégué Général	Institut VEOLIA Environnement
Mrs.	Sarah	Lacarrière		IRIS (Institut de Relations Internationales et Stratégiques)
Mlle	Anne Sophie	Simpere	Campagne Institutions financières	Les Amis de la Terre
Mr.	Gilles	David	Chef du Bureau des Exportations	Ministère de l'Ecologie, de l'Energie, du Développement durable et de la Mer, en charge des Technologies vertes et des Négociations sur le climat - France
Mrs.	Marine	Baudet	Biodiversité et développement	Ministère des Affaires Etrangères et Européennes - France
Mr.	Jean-Louis	Maurer	Responsable du pôle eaux	Ministère des Affaires Etrangères et Européennes - France
Mr.	Julien	Bueb	Economiste	Ministère des Affaires Etrangères et Européennes - France
Mr.	Beobjeong	Kim	Adminstrateur	OECD
Mr.	Hervé	Cronel	Conseiller spécial chargé de l'économie et du développement	Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie
Mr.	François-Xavier	Imbert	Chargé de mission	Partenariat Français pour l'Eau
Mr.	Mickaël	Berrebi	Responsable Partenariats Institutionnelset Développement Durable/ Institutional partnerships and Sustainable Development Manager	Planète Urgence
Mrs.	Diana	Carrillo	Directrice Développement des affaires	Quantis



Mrs.	Gita	Esmieu	Sustainable Development/ Développement Durable Groupe -Corporate Social Responsibility	SOCIETE GENERALE
Mr.	Thierry	Hauss	Key Account Manager	SOFRECOM (Groupe France Telecom)
Mrs.	Liliane	Tran	Chef de projet Eco-entreprises	UBIFrance
Mr.	Marc	Hernandez	CHEF DE PROJET	UBIFrance
Mr.	Samir	Jazouli	Chargé d'études - energies renouvelables/ Market research	VEOLIA Environnement
Mrs.	Jean	Lin	Particulier	
Mr	Patrick	Martin		
M	Aurore	Viard-Cretat		EHESS
Mrs.	Céline	Houdin	Consultante en environnement et développement	
Mrs	Yamna	Djellouli	Professeur des universités	Université du Maine le Mans
Mrs	Lucille	Benoit		AgroParisTech