Trust Fund Results at the World Bank

Gisu Mohadjer
OPCS, WB
Nigel Twose
IFC
Context

COUNTRY
- Institutions
- Policies
- Expenditures

Capacity, Outputs

Long-Term Outcomes

WORLD BANK
- Policy Dialogue
- Analytic Work
- Financing

STAKEHOLDERS
- Shareholders
- Funders
- Citizens

RESULTS-BASED PUBLIC SECTOR MANAGEMENT

LEARNING AND KNOWLEDGE FOR RESULTS

COMMUNICATIONS TO STAKEHOLDERS ON RESULTS
Results Monitoring, Evaluation and Reporting at the World Bank

Corporate
- World Bank 4 Results Report
- IDA 16 Results Measurement System
- Corporate Scorecard
- IDA/IBRD/TF Results Stories & Briefs
- IEG RAP

Country
- CAS Results Framework
- CAS CR
- CAS PR
- Client Surveys
- CE4R
- IEG CASCRR

Sector
- SS Results Framework
- SS MCIPR
- Impact Evaluation
- IEG Evaluation

Financing
- PAD Results Framework
- Core Sector Indicators
- ISR
- ICR
- Impact Evaluation
- IEG Evaluation

Analytic Work
- Concept Note Results Framework
- ACS

Policy Dialogue
Progress on Results Agenda in the Last Year

- Corporate Scorecard
- World Bank for Results (WB4R)
- IDA16 Results Measurement System expanded
- Core Sector Indicators (CSI) in more sectors, and encouraged for Recipient Executed Trust Funds
- 500+ online project, country and sector results stories and briefs – including on RETFs
- iPhone App
- Mapping for Results
- Multilateral Development Bank Working Group on Managing for Development Results
- Common Performance Assessment System (COMPAS)
- Staff e-learning
Objective = Mainstreaming

- **Main Level**: variability in results frameworks

- **Recipient-Executed Trust Funds (RETFs) >US$5m**

- **RETFs <= US$5m**: to follow a simplified framework – guidance being developed

- **Bank-Executed Trust Funds (BETFs)**: some use standard results frameworks; improved guidance for ESW/TA results frameworks
Results in Trust Funds

- **Recipient-Executed Trust Fund (RETF) >US$5 m and co-financing grants** results measurement and reporting integrated with the Bank’s results frameworks;
  - Encouraged to use core indicators developed for 14 sectors/themes as of March 2012
  - RETF grants using the results framework as in the Project Appraisal Document;
  - Reporting through the Implementation Status and Results report and Implementation Completion report as done for the Bank-financed operations

### Southern Sudan Umbrella Program for Health System development (Approved 2010) - Multi-donor; $63 million

### Mozambique Water Services and Institutional Support Project
- $83 million; Approved 2007; Africa Catalytic Growth Fund (ACGF) - $15 million; AUSAID $15 million; IDA - $53 million
Results Stories - Examples

BULGARIA
Building NGO Capacity to Deliver
JSDF Facilitates a Key Component of Child Welfare

Trust Across Borders: the Consortium on Infection Surveillance (MECIDS)

Regional disease surveillance networks can be valuable mechanisms for strengthening countries to collaborate on and improve capacity building.

Regional Collaboration

The Regional Disease Surveillance System (RDSS) is an international consortium of public health institutions that aims to improve the capacity of countries to collect, analyze, and share surveillance data. The RDSS is supported by the World Health Organization (WHO) and the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO).

Grantmakers

The Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis, and Malaria (GFATM) is a public-private partnership that provides funding for global health programs. The GFATM has awarded grants to several organizations to support disease surveillance in countries around the world.

Trust Across Borders

The Trust Across Borders (TAB) consortium is a network of organizations that work together to support the development of culturally appropriate approaches to disease surveillance in low-income countries. The TAB consortium has awarded grants to several organizations to support disease surveillance in countries around the world.

Creating a National Conversation through Large-Scale Learning Assessments

The Uwazo Initiative to Improve Educational Outcomes in East Africa

Challenge

Over the past decade, Kenya, Tanzania, and Uganda have adopted new national education policies, increased financial allocations to primary education, and increased student enrollment. To improve these outcomes, some donors have supported these efforts with large-scale learning assessments. These donor-funded initiatives, however, have faced significant challenges in implementation and sustainability.

Approach

The World Bank aims to work with governments and other stakeholders to improve the quality of educational outcomes in East Africa through the funding of large-scale learning assessments. These assessments are designed to improve the effectiveness of education programs and to inform policy decisions. The World Bank provides funding to support these initiatives, and it collaborates with governments and other stakeholders to ensure their successful implementation.
Moving Forward

- **Recipient Executed Trust Funds >US$5m**
  - Stocktaking and Diagnostic Analysis of Existing RETFs:
    - A review of a sample of 65 TFs to assess: (i) the indicators used; (ii) alignment with Bank’s results frameworks; and (iii) how results are monitored and reported
    - Developing a Guidance Note on TF RF

- **Recipient Executed Trust Funds <=US$5m**
  - Mainstreaming results frameworks, including those for Bank knowledge services

- **Bank-Executed Trust Funds**
  - Guidance on results framework for the remaining seven knowledge services being developed
Increase understanding of private sector results — within IFC and amongst stakeholders

Strengthen Results Measurement System — goals, monitoring, and evaluation

Improve real-time feedback on development effectiveness into operations
Building foundations of a strong results measurement system

Goals

INVESTMENT SERVICES

Evaluation

ADVISORY SERVICES

Monitoring
Our progress on strengthening **GOALS** (1)

- Corporate priorities
  - *Job creation*
  - *Poverty reduction*
  - *Economic growth*

- IFC Development Goals (IDGs)
- Additionality

**Goals**

**Evaluation**

**Monitoring**
## IDG Contributions FY12 Q1-3 (Under testing)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Goal</th>
<th>Unit</th>
<th>FY12 target</th>
<th>IS (including joint)</th>
<th>AS (including joint)</th>
<th>Joint IS/AS</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Progress % of target Q3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Increase or improve sustainable farming opportunities</td>
<td>Farmers (t)</td>
<td>365</td>
<td>152.48</td>
<td>28.92</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>181.40</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Improve health and education services</td>
<td>People (m)</td>
<td>1.68</td>
<td>1.84</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>122%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a. Increase access to financial services for Micro Finance Clients</td>
<td>Clients (m)</td>
<td>15.85</td>
<td>12.47</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>13.31</td>
<td>84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b. Increase access to financial services for SME Clients</td>
<td>Clients (t)</td>
<td>1,167</td>
<td>379.14</td>
<td>85.14</td>
<td>6.22</td>
<td>458.07</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4a. Increase or improve infrastructure services - Utilities</td>
<td>People (m)</td>
<td>19.25</td>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>7.75</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12.91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4b. Increase or improve infrastructure services - Transport</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.056</td>
<td>8.00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.06</td>
<td>110%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4c. Increase or improve infrastructure services - Telecom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6. GHG emissions reduced</td>
<td>M metric tons CO2 eq/yr</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Building on a solid monitoring framework (2)

- Project level – Development Results Tracking System
- Country level - Country M&E framework under piloting
## Advisory Services Impact and Reach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>FY10</th>
<th>FY11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Microfinance loans outstanding*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number (million)</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>3.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount ($ billions)</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>4.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SME loans outstanding*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number (million)</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount ($ billions)</td>
<td>44.24</td>
<td>39.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Microfinance loans disbursed*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number (million)</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>4.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount ($ billions)</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>8.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SME loans disbursed*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number (million)</td>
<td>0.67</td>
<td>1.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount ($ billions)</td>
<td>38.98</td>
<td>119.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of financing facilitated by Advisory Services ($ billion)**</td>
<td>844</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People expected*** to receive new/improved infrastructure services as result of PPP advisory mandates (million)</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased sales revenues for MSME clients from IFC project relevant revenue streams ($ million)</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>79.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of investment climate reforms implemented</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct compliance cost savings**** ($ million)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>70.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Adding the third leg to complement monitoring (3)

- Systematic, pragmatic and real time
- Focusing on learning
- Feeding results into strategy
**IFC’s Evaluation Strategy**

- **Developed and approved** by IFC management in Sept 2011

- **Focusing** on learning what worked and why to help ensure resources are invested where we expect the best results for both investment and advisory projects

- **Key areas**
  - Jobs, poverty and economic growth identified through participatory process

- **Progress to date**
  - 12 evaluations to be completed in this fiscal year and 10 more in pipeline
Examples of Evaluation Activities and Results

**China Secured Transactions Evaluation:** Results show that Chinese businesses receiving $3.5 trillion in credit through more than 385,000 loans, with many loans to women and SMEs.

**DSCL Sugar:** Results indicate that more than 20% productivity increase, treatment vs. control, for BoP farmers in India (IS + AS)

**WaterHealth India (ongoing):** Early results show that fewer waterborne diseases among treated villages (vs. control villages), economic gains for rural poor (IS + AS)
Harmonization with other DFI’s in private sector development

Goals
- Sharing of emerging experience on this pioneering initiative is ongoing: Conference with other IFI’s and clients in September 2011

Monitoring
- Increased harmonization on result framework with DFI’s- Conference in September 2011 with potential to use global reporting standard. Further bilateral dialogue this fiscal.

Evaluation
- Collaboration on evaluations where relevant and feasible. Ongoing discussion with FMO and USAID on potential evaluation on Financial Markets and effect on poverty.
IFC purpose: *To create opportunities for people to escape poverty and improve lives.*

Poverty Action Plan: To sharpen IFC’s operational poverty focus, to deepen our understanding of transmission links to poverty, to better articulate our impact on poverty and to strengthen our results framework to measure the impact.

Several ongoing activities towards fulfilling the above objectives including literature reviews, reviewing indicators and aligning evaluation strategy to test and validate lessons as we learn them.

Our operations impact poverty indirectly through growth and directly through inclusiveness… our ongoing work on poverty will help sharpen this understanding.
Increase understanding of private sector results: Focus on Jobs

- **Context**: Pivotal role of the private sector in job creation, one of the most important pathways out of poverty for the poor

- **Objective**: An open source study to develop country knowledge about country conditions to catalyze job creation and to understand how jobs are created in order to inform IFC strategy and operations

- **Some Key Initial Findings from enterprise survey data analysis, meta evaluations, IFC data**
  
  a) Economic growth and jobs are **closely correlated**
  
  b) **Positive** correlation between productivity and job growth- dominant pattern is that productive firms create jobs

  c) **Innovation & factor productivity are closely correlated**- firms using technology innovate more and create more employment

  d) Improving **access to finance** can improve quality and increase the number of jobs created. **Greater effects on smaller firms, and better when finance** was combined with advisory services

  e) **Investment climate reforms** can have **large positive job creation effects**. Economy-wide effects can be large (2.8%). Combining entry reforms with other reforms appears to have stronger effects.

  f) **Indirect job creation** tends to be **much higher**. IFC **invests** relatively more in capital-intensive industries where main job creation effects are **in the supply chain, or indirect**.
How can we move this agenda forward together?

- Develop main level Trust Fund Results Frameworks that reflect both donor priorities and sector strategies?
- Measure the currently unmeasurable, such as indirect effects of engagement, knowledge products, long term outcomes?
- Build a results culture at the World Bank Group and Donor Agencies on Trust Funds?
- Opportunities for further dialogue?
THANK YOU