

**STRENGTHENING WORLD BANK GROUP  
ENGAGEMENT ON GOVERNANCE AND ANTICORRUPTION  
CONSULTATION FEEDBACK**



**BOTSWANA**

(JANUARY 16, 2007)

**Participants:**

- **Government**

Mr. Suku John, Acting Accountant General, Ministry of Finance & Development Planning  
Mr. James J. Tinarwo, Chief Internal Auditor, Internal Audit, Ministry of Finance & Development Planning  
Mr. Ernest Mpofo, Permanent Secretary, Political Affairs, Office of the President  
Mr. Pelonomi Namogang, Auditor General, Auditor General's Office  
Mr. Alpheus Matlhaku, Clerk of the National Assembly, Parliament

- **Parastatals**

Mr. Don Ruhukwa, Board Secretary, Public Procurement & Asset Disposal Board  
Mr. Tshepo Sayed, Economist, Public Procurement & Asset Disposal Board  
Mr. Keneilwe Morris, Commissioner, Dept. of Customs & Excise, Botswana Unified Revenue Service  
Ms Cynthia Ross, Director, Legal Services, Botswana Unified Revenue Service

- **Public Oversight Agencies**

Mr. Tymon Katlholo, Director, Directorate on Corruption & Economic Crime  
Dr. Collie Monkge, Vision 2016 Coordinator, Vision 2016 Secretariat

- **Civil Society**

Mr. Ronald M. Phole, Chairman, Directors Institute of Botswana  
Mr. Steven Mandevu, Administrative Secretary, Botswana Federation of Trade Unions (BFTU)  
Dr. Happy Fidzani, Executive Director, BIDPA  
Prof. Jonathan Mayuyuka Kaunda, Senior Research Fellow, BIDPA (Facilitator)  
Mr. Farai Zizhou, FOPRISA/SADC Research Fellow, BIDPA  
Ms Keneilwe Mapena, BIDPA  
Ms Keneilwe Mpule, BIDPA

**How did the process fit into ongoing country dialogue?**

Botswana is an upper middle income country with which the World Bank has been working on several knowledge activities, including export diversification, infrastructure, livestock, and

the fight against HIV/AIDS. The Bank is currently strengthening its relationship with Botswana through preparing the first ever IBRD projects on HIV/AIDS and transport, and an environment and conservation project making use of a Global Environment Facility grant. We have also established a Development Information Center at BIDPA with partners that include the government, the United Nations and NGOs. A sub-regional strategy note is being prepared by the Bank, including Botswana. The Bank considers Botswana one of the shining examples of good governance on the continent and the consultation on governance and anti-corruption contributed to engagement on this issue, an area that is consistent with our overall engagement in the region. Indeed, the consultation provided a great deal of insight and possible areas where the World Bank could be of additional assistance to the government and people of Botswana. The consultation was rich and panelists were very forthcoming in their assessments, contributing greatly to our understanding of this significant issue. No doubt the discussion and recommendations will inform our ongoing dialogue with the country.

### **What were the key issues/themes raised by participants?**

The consultation spent a good deal of time on the country specific issues before getting to the global questions. Panelists agreed on a number of things: that governance is the manner in which power is exercised; at state level it's how the executive, legislative and judiciary is managed and how it affects people as members of community at large; governance is a very critical aspect of the way things happen—and this is how outsiders perceive us; good governance is when government is accountable and transparent and delivers goods and services to people, has clear intentions. In Botswana, panelists said the country has been looking into the issues such as leadership codes, declaration of assets, ethical ways of protecting people and issues of accountability. They also noted constraints: weak opposition, weak civil society so they can't ensure public officials are accountable for actions—the issue of transparency—perceptions that enforcement is not good—laws aren't comprehensive while some may actually be a hindrance to advancing good governance—more focus needs to be on efficiency and effectiveness, while capacity remains a big challenge. But they also noted some progress in the area of governance and sited several examples.

On the global issues: panelists encouraged the Bank to understand economic governance as a mainstream issue; to better understand individual country situations and not take a one-size-fits-all approach; to encourage country engagement with the Bank in terms that are mutually beneficial. They said there is a need to improve and develop institutional capacity to engage effectively in all the processes and that it's important to engage everybody, not just governments, but that national interests and concerns should always be at the forefront. They said the onus is on a country to protect its own interests and promote itself. They also agreed that the Bank should do much better in its disclosure for non-state actors. They also noted countries need to be able to follow correct processes and procedures in terms of budget and projects, that they need monitoring and evaluation and auditing systems. They said neutral bodies like the United Nations should be more engaged in terms of coordinating national activities on what donors do, but noted harmonization depends on national leadership, and the integrity of leadership, and how it presents its program and to ensure action is coordinated and complementary.

| Respondent Type                                | Consultation Reply   |
|--|--|
| <b>1. Top governance challenges in country</b> |  |
| [Government]                                   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Weak opposition</li> <li>• Leadership should be transparent--there's no "name and shame"</li> <li>• Need code of conduct that is enforced</li> <li>• BIG people seen to get away with things</li> <li>• Need capacity to look at governance issues—should also look at regulations that actually cause corruption</li> </ul>  |
| [Parastatals]                                  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It's all about ethics—Not just about enforcement</li> <li>• Need declaration of assets laws as well as code of conduct – still in consultation process</li> <li>• Procurement a problem—people don't know why tenders given or why cancelled</li> <li>• Capacity a big challenge—people don't even understand what they are passing in parliament—they don't understand the legislation</li> <li>• We could use assistance from the World Bank on procurement skills and technical skills</li> <li>• Tax evasion a major issue—institutions not well-resourced to deal with problem—tax compliance</li> </ul> |
| [Civil Society]                                | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Weak civil society—lack of capacity</li> <li>• Privatization could help—business could have code of conduct</li> <li>• Good governance needs to be within people</li> </ul>   |
| [Public Oversight Agencies]                    | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Issues of governance pertain to MDGs as governance necessary for development</li> <li>• Indicators are procurement, enforcement, accountability and transparency in decision-making</li> <li>• We need monitoring and evaluation policies—perhaps World Bank could help us</li> <li>• Service delivery a pressing issue—people asked to "pay fees"</li> </ul>   |

| Respondent Type  | Consultation Reply   |
|--|--|
| <b>(Combined questions) 2. Botswana has engaged in governance reform—what has worked and why?</b><br><b>3. What have been the biggest gains from reform?</b> |  |
| [Government]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Internal audit function at central government level—helps with compliance and local government</li> <li>• Public service reforms have enhanced capacity</li> <li>• Vision 2016</li> <li>• Decentralization has improved performance at local level</li> </ul>   |
| [Parastatals]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Anti-corruption unit and ombudsman integral to attacking and enforcing issues</li> <li>• Prevention measures useful</li> <li>• civil servants know they have oversight body to address grievances</li> <li>• still working on declaration of assets legislation that will be significant</li> </ul>                                     |
| [Civil Society]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Set up anti-corruption unit and ombudsman</li> <li>• Still working on privatization—that will be important</li> <li>• Establishment of Institute of Directors has helped train business on corporate governance</li> <li>• Allowed public service associations to unionize—a big gain to have trade unions within government</li> </ul> |
| [Public Oversight Agencies]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Gains through awareness</li> <li>• Prevention and public education a huge gain</li> <li>• People debate and talk about corruption—even if it doesn't exist the public is mobilized</li> <li>• Enforcement is a deterrence and we've made gains</li> </ul>   |
| <b>4. How should the Bank engage on governance issues to help reduce poverty?</b>  |  |

| Respondent Type   | Consultation Reply   |
|---|--|
| [Government]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Countries went through structural adjustment pain—Bank blamed governments</li> <li>• New paper says bank will be responsible for projects it can control—rather than dictate macro policy</li> <li>• Bank should focus on what it can do, where there can be follow-up and accountability</li> </ul>  |
| [Parastatals]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bank change in strategy should be acknowledged—engagement on mutually beneficial terms right direction—see countries as partners</li> <li>• Bank should not channel funds through budget in countries where leadership is weak or cannot tackle corruption</li> <li>• Bank should fund projects that benefit broad range of people</li> <li>• Bank should engage in capacity building for civil society and empower them</li> <li>• Have better understanding of countries and not approach as one-size-fits-all</li> <li>• Bank should invest in human capital—university students and should give more internships to people from developing countries who need it most</li> <li>• Engage in more institution and capacity-building where there are targets and timeframes</li> </ul> |
| [Civil Society]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• We still need bank assistance—want FDI—can Bank say good things about Botswana</li> </ul>   |
| [Public Oversight Agencies]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• We are MIC and donors have disengaged</li> <li>• We still need capacity building to achieve our main MDG goals and other issues</li> <li>• Can Bank help with monitoring and data collection process?</li> </ul>  |
| <p><b>5. While government is the key counterpart of the Bank, how can the World Bank Group better engage non-governmental stakeholders, including civil society, media, and the private sector?</b></p> |  |
| [Government]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Have to be careful as all groups have agendas and want to receive funding for their agendas</li> <li>• Multi-stakeholder approach has to promote causes of country and not divide us into anti-government program</li> <li>• NGOs say things against the nation in order to get funds from donors</li> </ul>  |

| Respondent Type  | Consultation Reply   |
|--|--|
| [Civil Society]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>World Bank disclosure not good—trying to hide things from civil society</li> <li>Civil society wants to know what government is committing country to if we are to be development partners—need to have transparency to make a useful contribution</li> <li>Forums like this one good—we want more—good to be able to share views so we support multi-stakeholder approach</li> </ul> |
| [Public Oversight Agencies]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Issue is we should all work together as partners</li> <li>Government should give funding to civil society</li> </ul>  |
| <b>6. How to mitigate fiduciary risk in Bank operations?</b>                     |  |
| [Government]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ministry of finance always focal point—expenditure is monitored by MoF and Bank and they ensure project is focused</li> </ul>   |
| [Parastatals]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Botswana has not had the Bank’s country procurement assessment review –OECD is doing a due diligence—should be done to ensure loans repaid and reduce risk</li> <li>bank should focus on procurement—more capacity building in this area</li> <li>Bank should give more for specific projects and not budget support—in some countries 40% of budget might be aid</li> </ul>          |
| [Public Oversight Agencies]  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Have to ensure benefits go to targeted group</li> <li>Need to get monitoring right and should be able to monitor progress at all times and fix things if necessary</li> </ul>   |
| <b>7. The Bank’s role vis-à-vis other donors in supporting governance reform</b> |  |
| [Government]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Let the UN coordinate policies at this level—other organizations should take cue from them</li> <li>Bank should read former president Quett Masire’s memoirs in which he deals with coordination of donor assistance in plain English—he says the onus is on the country to manage donor assistance—countries should tell Bank and</li> </ul>   |

| Respondent Type   | Consultation Reply  |
|---|---|
|   | <p>other donors what they want</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Country has to be resolute—Botswana respected</li> <li>• Countries might want to exchange notes on what has worked and why</li> <li>• Country has to be empowered to know what it wants—then lead with integrity</li> </ul>                                   |
| [Parastatals]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Harmonization has to be enforced otherwise people go from one to another looking for funds</li> </ul>  |
| [Civil Society]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bank funds do not filter down to beneficiaries of civil society—how can we benefit from assistance from the Bank</li> </ul>  |
| <b>8. How to monitor progress in governance and anticorruption at the country level</b> |   |
| [Parastatals]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Benchmarking tool from OECD that gives you a methodology and pillars for assessment</li> <li>• Botswana a pilot country</li> </ul>   |
| [Civil Society]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• the World Bank has a ROSC assessment but not done here—it would be good to have it here</li> <li>• M and E capacity and expertise needs to be raised</li> </ul>  |
| <b>9. Areas for improvement in GAC strategy and country-level support</b>               |   |
| [Parastatals]   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Governance increasingly featuring in other areas—such as WTO</li> <li>• We would like Bank to help in capacity-building in terms of how these agreements negotiated and developed so that we are better equipped to sign agreements</li> </ul>   |
| <b>10. Other key issues</b>   |   |
| [Civil Society]   | <p>Executive Director of BIDPA brought the partnership of World Bank and BIDPA through Development Information Center to attention of all present. He invited people to access the information available in hard copy and on Internet through computers available and suggested more discussion forums would be a good idea to pursue</p> |