STRENGTHENING INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT IN BUDGET EXECUTION:

PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IN BELO HORIZONTE
BELO HORIZONTE

- Third largest Brazil’s capital
- First brazilian planned city
- Inaugurated in 1897
- Extension: 330,90 km²
- Population: 2,412,937
“Shared municipal policy management system” includes more than 80 councils and commissions of municipal, regional or local coverage.

Adding to that, the Participatory Budgeting has been an important mechanism of social participation for the last 15 years.
MODALITIES OF PB

1993
REGIONAL PB
CONSTRUCTION AND LOCAL URBANIZATION

1996
HOUSING PB
HOUSES

2006
DIGITAL PB
CONSTRUCTION AND CITY URBANIZATION
REGIONAL PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING
Biannual process and biannual plan

Decentralized budget debate: People vote for constructions located in the Administrative Region of the city where they live, not for the whole city

Process lasts 9 months

Budget: U$ 43 million for a 2 year plan

Number of participants 2007-2008: 35,000

Number of constructions concluded 1994-2008: 1,000 this year

Number of constructions approved 2007-2008: 98
FUNDAMENTAL CHARACTERISTICS OF BELO HORIZONTE’S REGIONAL PB

1) Rules pactuated between local government and society

2) PB Organized on a territorial basis

3) Impoverished areas are Priorities for PB’s Investments

4) PB has to be framed within Local Territorial Planning

5) Strong Independent oversight – Comforça
INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSION

No laws institute or regulate Participatory Budget’s structure and dynamics. Rules pactuated between local government and society (Comforça)

Instruments for defining rules:

Technical instruments: created from discussion with COMFORÇA

1) methodology book: Related to the PB process: defines criterias for intra-urban division of the budget; defines criterias for participation (the election process step by step - priorities and Delegates of Comforça)

2) guideline book: Related to the execution of constructions: defines which constructions are eligible and which are not.

Financial Restriction
Budget Anual Law approval
INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSION

Specified in 2 brochures, available to civil society, in a very comprehensive language:

• PB’s Methodology book
• PB’s Guidelines book
Belo Horizonte is divided into:

- 81 Planning Units (PU)
- 41 Sub-regions
- 9 Administrative Regions
CRITERIAS FOR INTRA URBAN PB´S DISTRIBUTION

Impovirished areas are priorities

Urban’s Life Quality Index:
Measures, for each PU, aspects related to access to urban services and equipments

Population

So:

The lower the ULQI, the higher is the percentage of the PB that a specific PU is entitled to

The lower the population, the lower is the percentage of the PB that a specific PU is entitled to
Participatory Budget has to be framed within Local Territorial Planning Strategies:

1) PB is executed by the Municipal Secretariat for Planning.

2) PB is an integral formal part of the Municipal Planning System, together with the Master Plan, the Specific Global Plans, the Municipal Sanitation Plan, the Environmental Recovery and Development Program for the Pampulha Basin (PROPAM) and the Program for the Recovery of Waterways, Improvement of Valley Beds and Drainage of Urban Rainwater (DRECURBS).
PARTICIPATIVE DIMENSION

First Round Regional Assemblies
- Municipal Executive informs resources available for each region and the guidelines
- Distributes forms

Meetings

Neighbourhood Meetings
- Indicate construction priorities
- Borough 1
- Borough 2
- Borough 3

Second Round Regional Assemblies
- Definition of pre-selected project proposals
- Election of delegates (326 for 2007-08)
- Sub A
- Sub B
- Sub C
- Sub D

Visits
City Hall technicians visit pre-selected demands and estimate costs

Local Government
Local Government Orientates

Round open to all community
Round open to all community

DELEGATES
Delegates visit pre-selected constructions

Regional Forum for Budget Priorities

- Constructions election: Regional Plan of PB’s Constructions
- COMFORÇA’s Delegates election

PREFEITURA E COMUNIDADE

Municipal Forum of Budgeting Priorities

Community delivers to the Mayor the Regional Plan of PB’s Constructions
COMFORÇA – INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT

COMFORÇA – Regional Follow-up and Control Commission for PB

COMFORÇA = “With power”
COMFORÇA – INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT

326 Delegates elected for 2007-2008

COMFORÇAS’ AGENDA:

Keep close watch over public expenditure

Get information from City Hall representatives

Monitor project development, constructions, schedules and quality of services, including visiting the sites

Monitor the bidding process

Monitor the implementation of the “Biannual PB Investment Plan” (data for each construction, related to: the amount public investment budget, the description of the construction, the responsible board, the project cost. Over 10,000 copies are mailed or distributed)
## REGIONAL’S PB CONSTRUCTIONS

Georeferenced Equipment / Construction Works - OP 94 A 2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Infrastrutura</td>
<td>494</td>
<td>41.72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social care</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>3.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schools</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>9.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>3.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health care</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>10.39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impovered areas infrastructure</td>
<td>308</td>
<td>26.01%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1184</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DIGITAL PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING
BASIC INFORMATION

Biannual process and biannual plan

Centralized budget debate: People vote for constructions for the city
PB organized on city base

Process lasts: 6 months

Budget: U$ 11,5 million for a 2 year plan

Number of participants 2007-2008: **172,000**

Number of votes: **503,266**

Number of countries that visited the web site – **23**

Number of visits to the web site – **192,229**

Number of constructions approved 2007-2008: **9**
GUIDELINES

Constructions for the whole city: benefit a larger number of people

Enlarge participation, bringing in new segments of society

Garantee access to the process to poor people

Garantee security to the voting process

Website: http://opdigital.pbh.gov.br
1) To enlarge participation, bringing in new specific social groups:
   - Simplifying the cost of participating (time).
   - Using another language for communication (youth, cyberspace).

2) To guarantee wide access to facilities and computers (chance to vote):
   - Installing 158 public booths for the voting process in public spaces: schools, malls, drugstores, hospitals, markets etc.
   - Training 1,150 public students to help voters, if needed.

3) To guarantee security to the voting process:
   - Database from the Regional Electoral Trial was used to allow or not someone to vote (only inhabitants of the city of Belo Horizonte could vote, not more than once).
PARTICIPATIVE DIMENSION

1) Delegates of COMFORÇA indicate 36 constructions to be voted

2) City Hall provides information to civil society and space for expressing its opinion: Website
   4 months previous to voting period the website began informing on each choice of public equipment or infrastructure constructions available: videos, drawings, pictures, chat, forums for discussion, interviews etc

3) Voting process: lasts 2 months
   Communities lobbied for constructions (booths with computers)
   Population votes and chooses 9 constructions
PB CONSOLIDATED DATA: 1993 - 2008

1184 Constructions elected (Regional PB)
1000 constructions to be concluded in 2008 (84,5%)
9 Constructions elected (Digital PB)
6.668 houses approved (Housing PB)
3.323 houses built (48%)

343,315 participants (PB Regional and Housing)
172,938 participants (Digital PB)

US$ 420 million (Regional, Housing and Digital PB)