A New Vision for Health Systems in the 21st Century: Investing in People

Julio Frenk
Commission Co-Chair

The World Bank
Washington, D.C.
March 7, 2011
THE WELCH-ROSE REPORT:
A PUBLIC HEALTH CLASSIC

Delta Omega Honorary Public Health Society

A publication by the Delta Omega Alpha Chapter to mark the
75th Anniversary of the founding of the Johns Hopkins University School of Hygiene and Public Health

1916 - 1992
The Commission

Advisory Inputs
- Scientific advisors
- Youth commissioners
- Papers
- Consultations
- Research

Commissioners (20)

Education of Health Professionals for the 21st Century

Global
Multi-professional
Evidence-based
Instruction-institution

THE LANCET

BILL & MELINDA GATES FOUNDATION
THE ROCKEFELLER FOUNDATION
CHINA MEDICAL BOARD
Health Professionals for a New Century:
Transforming Education to Strengthen Health Systems in an Interdependent World
What’s New

• Global outlook

• Focus on all health professions beyond traditional silos, with emphasis on medicine, nursing, and public health

• Long-term perspective on post-secondary education

• Integrative framework

• New vision driving specific recommendations
1. A Century of Progress, a Time of New Challenges
2. An Integrative Framework
3. Major Findings
4. Reforms for a Second Century
General Report Outline

1. A Century of Progress, a Time of New Challenges
2. An Integrative Framework
3. Major Findings
4. Reforms for a Second Century
The Health Revolution of the 20th Century
Emerging challenges

- Epidemiological and demographic transitions
- Technological innovation
- Professional differentiation
- Population demands
1. A Century of Progress, a Time of New Challenges

2. An Integrative Framework

3. Major Findings

4. Reforms for a Second Century
A Systems Approach

Supply of health workforce

Provision

Demand

Needs

Education System

Labor market for health professionals

Demand for health workforce

Provision

Demand

Needs

Health System

Population
Key components of the educational system

**Structure**

**Institutional Design**
- **Systemic Level**
  - Stewardship and governance
  - Financing
  - Resource generation
  - Service provision
- **Organizational level**
  - Ownership
  - Affiliation
  - Internal structure
- **Global level**
  - Stewardship
  - Networks and partnerships

**Instructional Design**
- Criteria for admission
- Competencies
- Channels
- Career pathways

**Proposed Outcomes**
- Interdependence in Education
- Transformative Learning

**Process**

**Context Global-Local**

Transformative Learning

Interdependence in Education
1. A Century of Progress, a Time of New Challenges

2. An Integrative Framework

3. Major Findings

4. Reforms for a Second Century
Systemic failures

- Mismatch of competencies to needs
- Weak teamwork
- Gender stratification
- Hospital dominance over primary care
- Labour market imbalances
- Weak leadership for health system performance
Density of medical schools by region

Density per 10 million

- 2 or less
- 2.1 - 6
- >6
Countries by number of medical schools

Number of medical schools

0 - 1
2 - 3
4 - 5
6 - 10
11 - 20
More than 20

Number of countries

Other
Sub-Saharan Africa
### Institutions, graduates and workforce by region (2008)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Population (millions)</th>
<th>Estimated number of schools</th>
<th>Estimated graduates per year (thousands)</th>
<th>Workforce (thousands)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Medical</td>
<td>Public Health</td>
<td>Doctors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>1371</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>1230</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>1075</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Income Asia Pacific</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern</td>
<td>212</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western</td>
<td>435</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America/Caribbean</td>
<td>602</td>
<td>513</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Africa/Middle East</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>206</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub - Saharan Africa</td>
<td>868</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World</td>
<td>7036</td>
<td>2420</td>
<td>467</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Financing of medical and nursing graduates by region (2008)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Doctors</th>
<th></th>
<th>Nurses/midwives</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Estimated number of graduates per year (thousands)</td>
<td>Estimated $US expenditure per graduate (thousands)</td>
<td>Total expenditure ($US billions)</td>
<td>Estimated number of graduates per year (thousands)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Income Asia Pacific</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>381</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>America</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America/Caribbean</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>132</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Africa/Middle East</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World</td>
<td>389</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>47.6</td>
<td>541</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Investment in total health expenditure and health professional education

**World**
- 98.2% (5.5 trillion)
- 1.8% (100 billion)

**USA**
- 99.5% (2.5 trillion)
- 0.5% (13.8 billion)

- Total health
- Health professional education
- Total Health
- Medical and nursing education
Macro and Micro Estimates of Physician Education Expenditures

Education expenditure in USD (billions)

Regions:
- Africa
- Asia
- Europe
- LAC
- N. America
- Oceania

Macro Expenditures

Micro Expenditures
New medical schools (public and private) in India and Brazil

India

Brazil

Number of medical schools


Public  Private

Time
General Report Outline

1. A Century of Progress, a Time of New Challenges
2. An Integrative Framework
3. Major Findings
4. Reforms for a Second Century
Three Generations of Reform

1900 - Science-based
- Scientific curriculum
- University based

Problem-based
- Problem-based learning
- Academic centers

Systems-based
- Competency driven: local-global
- Health and education systems

2000+
Recommendations

**Instructional**
- Competency-driven
- Local responsiveness with global connectivity
- Inter- & trans-professional education
- IT-empowered
- Educational resources
- New professionalism

**Institutional**
- Joint planning
- Academic systems
- Global networks
- Culture of critical inquiry

---

**Enabling Actions**

- Mobilize leadership
- Enhance investments
- Align accreditation
- Strengthen global learning

---

**Goal**
Transformative and interdependent professional education for equity in health
Models of inter- and trans-professional education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Pre-secondary education</th>
<th>Post-secondary education</th>
<th>Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dominant</td>
<td>Common</td>
<td>Core + specific competencies</td>
<td>Teamwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter-professional</td>
<td>Common</td>
<td>Systematic teamwork</td>
<td>Teamwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans-professional</td>
<td>Common</td>
<td>Systematic teamwork</td>
<td>Teamwork</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Community health workers

Common Core + specific competencies

Systematic teamwork

MD

Nursing

Public health

Other

Teamwork
## Levels of Learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Informative</td>
<td>• Information</td>
<td>Experts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formative</td>
<td>• Socialization</td>
<td>Professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Values</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transformative</td>
<td>• Leadership attributes</td>
<td>Change agents</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Health Workforce Interdependence: Current State

High-income countries

Low-income countries

Inter-Professional Education

Trans-Professional Education

Ideas/Technical
Money/Finances

People: Migration
Health Workforce Interdependence: Proposed State

High-income countries

Low-income countries

Sharing/Learning

Ideas
Innovations

Faculty Training
Capacity building
The Circle of Knowledge
“The pursuit, production, dissemination, application, and preservation of knowledge are the central activities of a civilization. Knowledge is social memory, a connection to the past; and it is social hope, an investment in the future. The ability to create knowledge and put it to use is the adaptive characteristic of humans. It is how we reproduce ourselves as social beings and how we change—how we keep our feet on the ground and our heads in the clouds.”

Louis Menand
The Marketplace of Ideas, 2010