

**UNESCO/World Heritage Center and World Bank Meeting
on
Cultural and Natural Heritage**

March 18, 2004

Aide-Memoire

A delegation from the World Heritage Centre of UNESCO (WHC) visited the Bank in March 18, 2004 to exchange information on cultural and natural heritage, discuss cooperation in safeguard design and enforcement, and promote collaboration in project preparation and implementation. The delegation, headed by Mr. Francesco Bandarin, Director, had as members Messrs/Mmes. Nuria Sanz, Natarajan Ishwaran, and Guy Debonnet, technical staff, and Mmes. Birgitte Moller, Director, Division for Cooperation with Extra-budgetary Funding Sources, and Suzanne Belillo, Senior Public Information and Liason Officer/New York. The UNESCO/World Heritage Center delegation met with Mr. Ian Johnson, Vice-President, ESSD, and Bank managers and staff from ESSD, EASES, MNSIF, EASIN, ESUR, LSFP, AFTS3, TUDUR, WBI and the Cities Alliance (Annex 1 - list of participants; Annex 2 - Program of UNESCO/WHC-WB meetings). This meeting is the third since 2001 to bring together UNESCO and Bank staff to discuss collaboration on culture and development.

- A. Cultural and Natural Heritage in the Perspective of the UNESCO/World Heritage Center and the World Bank.** The initial and final sessions of the meeting served the purpose of allowing for an exchange of information among the two organizations.

In particular, on the Bank's part, it was indicated that:

- Cultural heritage activities have become a small but highly visible and growing part of the Bank's analytical work, technical assistance, and lending programs. There are currently 40 projects, either in preparation or under implementation, which include cultural components or are specifically designed for cultural heritage conservation, management, and promotion of proper use of cultural assets, totaling about US\$630 million in investment.
- Given the increasing interest from client countries in investing in cultural heritage and the consequent growing Bank commitment, a focal point has been created, the Cultural Heritage and Development Group (CHDG). The CHDG will: (i) partner with cultural organizations, donor governments, foundations, private organizations, and regional organizations, to mainstream the protection and proper use of culture assets as a vehicle to community development and poverty reduction; (ii) bring together

international experiences and know-how and channel it in support of Bank cultural heritage initiatives; (iii) provide technical assistance to member countries for the management and development of their cultural resources. The activities of CHDG will be funded through the establishment of a new multi-donor trust fund, gathering contributions from donor governments, regional and international organizations, foundations and the private sector.

- A management group based in the Transport and Urban Development Department of the Bank is structuring the CHDG, and has initiated to implement such functions concerning with information sharing, coordination, documentation, representation and promotional activities. It has also initiated the creation of a website to allow staff and others to exchange information on work underway in support of cultural heritage activities.
- The Bank reiterated that the World Heritage Centre is s a major partner for the CHDG, drawing on its technical expertise. Mutually, CHDG resources and initiatives would serve to strengthen the WHC – Bank collaboration in the conservation and promotion of natural and cultural heritage assets.
- The Cities Alliance experience was presented and discussed as an eventual model for the CHDG multi-donor trust fund. The Cities Alliance doesn't pursue the implementation of pilot urban programs, focusing on the city and its region. It supports tailored city-wide programs by: improving the coherence of effort among on-going programs in the same region; linking grant-funded urban development cooperation with investment follow-up; promoting partnerships between local and national governments; using the resources and experience of Alliance partners to foster new tools, practical approaches and an exchange of knowledge to promote city development strategies.

The WHC, through Mr. Francesco Bandarin, indicated:

- Its commitment to the programs discussed with the Regions, stressing the importance of each initiative and of its continuity in the field. He also expressed the value of these meetings which permitted taking stock of ongoing collaboration between the two organizations, the operational definition of tasks to carry activities one step further, and for the identification of new initiatives for further cooperation.
- the importance of the efforts and experience of the Cities Alliance in the urban sector and the interest of WHC to engage in common activities with it, proposing to reflect on ways to put it into action.

B. Summaries of Specific Meetings

Below, issues raised and agreements reached in specific meetings with Regions and Bank management:

1. **Meeting with Ian Johnson, VP, ESSD.** An ample scope of possible collaboration between Bank and UNESCO was explored, on the basis of the assessment of the existing UNESCO conventions and new ones which are being drafted. Bank projects that currently have UNESCO collaboration were reviewed and discussed. Cooperation on the implementation of Bank safeguards that could profit from the technical expertise of UNESCO was reaffirmed. Finally, the issue of modalities of more permanent funding for cultural and natural heritage activities was raised with the suggestion that mechanisms such as the GEF be looked into.

2. **Meeting with EASES.**

2.1 Laos-Vietnam cross-boundary cooperation in the Annamite Biodiversity Complex:

- (i) Progress and recent developments:
 - The dialogue with and between the Laotian and Vietnamese authorities has advanced since June 2003;
 - Improving collaboration will require continual and patient investment, with both agencies acting as catalysts;
 - Prospects for establishment of a WHS complex covering the set of seven protected areas (PAs) along the Laos-Vietnam border are not clear, and at best would come about slowly; and
 - Still there is interest (especially on the Vietnamese side) in establishing a corridor of PAs along the border, given the importance of the complex and the existing pressures.
- (ii) Next steps:
 - The Bank and UNESCO will continue to pursue the dialogue on cross-boundary cooperation.
 - There are several instruments already in place that could support work in the PAs along the border in the short term, notably the Vietnam Conservation Fund (US\$7 million) set up in the Bank/GEF-funded Forest Development Project. The Bank send to UNESCO a brief description of these instruments.
 - The Bank and UNESCO agreed to invest in preparation of a short (5-page) paper laying out a vision for the corridor of seven PAs and a joint work program to enhance the two agencies' impact in the area, especially taking into account that the PAs have been created, physical entities and regulations are in place, and the key challenge is the strengthening of management capacity and enforcement.

- (iii) Focal points:
- For UNESCO: Natarajan Ishwaran
 - For the Bank: Tony Whitten and Phil Brylski (Country Sector Coordinator, Hanoi)

2.2 Other potential priority “projects” for collaboration

- (i) The Bank has prepared a proposal for a regional study on wildlife trade in the Greater Mekong Area, which could be carried out in partnership with UNESCO and presented as a joint product at the IUCN World Conservation Forum, to be held in Bangkok in November 2004. Funding from the Bank is not yet confirmed; additional resources will be sought from Consultant Trust Funds, UNESCO and GEF. The timeframe may need to be revisited so as to ensure delivery for the Bangkok forum.
- (ii) Other possibilities of cooperation in the East Asia region:
- Possible sites: the Myanmar forest area adjoining Thailand, the Huai Kha Kaeng WHS in Thailand (reviving a 1993 project), and the Laos Khone Falls (linked to the Xe Pian NPA) which are adjacent to Virachey in Cambodia (already a Bank/GEF site and proposed for WHS status).
 - A Bank mission to South-East Asia, scheduled for May/June, will seek to explore the potential for joint work in these areas. UNESCO will pursue the same objective over the coming months, possibly joining the Bank team for this mission.
- (iii) Focal points:
- For UNESCO: Natarajan Ishwaran
 - For the Bank: Tony Whitten

2.3 “Downstream” work (lessons learned, policy guidance, training)

- (i) It was agreed that the two agencies would collaborate on the following:
- A joint workshop on occasion of the IUCN World Conservation Forum, focusing on sustainable natural resource management of World Heritage sites and other PAs, including cases studies of WH sites where the Bank is also active (most likely, in Africa, LAC and Asia). The workshop could be designed to cover a broad spectrum of conservation issues or might focus more specifically on financing of WHS and other PAs or on ecotourism.
 - In addition, a joint workshop/training program on biodiversity (PA) conservation possibly focusing on sustainable livelihoods,

enforcement strategies, and cross-boundary cooperation, to be held in Laos or Vietnam, bringing together international experience.

- (ii) The World Bank Institute (WBI) would be involved in preparation of these events.
- (iii) Next steps:
 - Kathy Mackinnon and Natarajan Ishwaran will take the lead in preparing a proposal for the Bangkok workshop for submission to IUCN by end March.
 - UNESCO will take the lead on booking space and making other arrangements with IUCN for the workshop by end of March deadline.
 - Marian Delos Angeles will be the focal point for WBI.
 - Interest in the workshop in Laos or Vietnam would be confirmed in an upcoming mission of either of the two agencies to the region.

3. Meeting with MNSIF.

3.1 Morocco.

- (i) **Fez Rehabilitation Project.** It was indicated that the support of the WHC in the dialogue with the municipality of Fez and the Government of Morocco, could help in obtaining the demolition of the illegal concrete paving of the Oued in the central portion of the Medina, carried out in late 2002.
- (ii) **Coastal Cities Project.** The World Bank is verifying the interest of the Moroccan Government in identifying and preparing an investment project on coastal cities located in the proximity of future tourist stations. In case the Government asks for World Bank assistance, UNESCO could help on the identification of actions in each cultural and historical site.

3.2 Lebanon. The confirmation of the Italian contribution to the archaeological site management component of the Cultural Heritage and Urban Development Project, would facilitate the involvement of WHC in support of the Direction Generale des Antiquites.

3.3 Tunisia. Cultural Heritage Project. Implementation is progressing satisfactorily. All studies related to both sector strengthening and site improvement will be completed by end 2005. Given the scope and interest of the various improvements that are being recommended on the six project sites, a fund raising campaign will be warranted. It was agreed that the Bank and UNESCO would jointly support the Government of Tunisia in that effort.

- 3.4 Iran. Policy Note on Iran's Cultural Heritage.** Based on the findings of the potential of Iran's cultural heritage for social and economic development, the Bank is considering technical and financial assistance to Iran for the use of its cultural heritage. WHC contributed to the preparation of the Policy Note by seconding a staff to participate in the finding mission of October 2002. The proposed technical and financial assistance consists in helping the Government of Iran establish a Cultural Heritage Fund (CHF) that will finance cultural heritage activities and investment projects promoted by central and local government agencies as well as private institutions. Technical assistance will be provided with financial support from the Italian Trust Fund for Culture and Sustainable Development (ITFCSD).

The Bank is hopeful to continue to work with UNESCO and the WHC concerning the establishment and future operations of the proposed CHF. This cooperation could focus on helping government agencies and private institutions identify and prepare activities and investment projects that could be submitted to CHF funding.

- 3.5 Iran. City of Bam.** The Bank is helping the city of Bam recover from the devastating effects of the December 26, 2003 earthquake. As to the Government's request, such assistance will extend to the city's cultural heritage. It is envisaged that the proposed assistance consist will of: (i) activities to be included in the Earthquake Emergency Recovery Project which is under preparation; and (ii) longer-term activities to be implemented either through a stand alone lending operation or as a component of the proposed CHF project.

The Bank is already cooperating with UNESCO to define the package of activities that may be funded through the Earthquake Emergency Recovery Project. These activities should be complementary and non substitutive to those that other donors could support with grants or soft loans. It is expected that a preliminary definition of the package would take place after the completion of an international workshop on the recovery of Bam's cultural patrimony sponsored by ICHO and UNESCO and planned from April 18 to 20, 2004. Further decisions will be taken after the completion of a subsequent donors conference also being sponsored by ICHO and UNESCO and planned for June 2004.

The long-term vulnerability of the CH patrimony in Iran was also discussed. UNESCO is planning a workshop on this issue in Iran which the Bank is planning to attend.

- 3.6 Iraq.** The World Heritage Centre will invite the Bank to the Donors Consultation Conference which will take place in Paris on May 24-25. The invitation will be addressed to Kathryn Funk, country officer.

3.7 Focal points:

- Anthony Bigio for the Morocco projects and initiatives
- Gianni Brizzi for the Iran and Iraq projects and activities
- Chantal Reliquet for Tunisia.

4. Meeting with EASIN and EASUR.

4.1 Discussion: The WHC/WB recent experiences in project collaboration were positive and there is interest in both parties to establish concrete activities in partnership in the near future. The EASUR and EASIN teams presented their several projects with relevance to cultural heritage conservation and described the increasing needs for policy and strategies on the protection of urban heritage. (See detailed list below.)

4.2 Conclusions: The points of mutual interest that present the most concrete and immediate opportunities for collaboration agreed upon are:

(i) Policy Development. A component on the protection of built heritage for the World Bank's urban upgrading policy will be developed. The agreed countries where this work will take place are first China and then Indonesia. Vietnam is also a possibility.

(ii) Workshop Development. A workshop on urban heritage management will be designed in collaboration with the State Administration for Cultural Heritage (SACH) in China. The workshop will draw on and support the development of the: (1) WHC's concerns on the conservation of historic sites and their surrounding context; (2) World Bank policy on urban heritage protection and its economic development potential; and (3) SACH work on overall policy and guidelines.

(iii) Operational Work. Collaboration between WHC and the Bank on potential regional development projects in Halong Bay, Vietnam; and Siem Reap, Cambodia were agreed on as strong possibilities. Yogyakarta and Bali Indonesia were also mentioned as high priority possibilities.

4.3 Immediate next steps: (i) Send the series of papers on heritage conservation in China to WHC; (ii) Nominate individuals to establish a stable and consistent link between EASUR and WHC and begin supporting collaborations.

4.4 List of Projects and Activities Discussed

(i) China: Shaoxing - Integrated urban upgrading in historic neighborhoods and Study tour for city officials; Shanghai -

Shanghai Cultural-City Strategy and Hongkou District historic sites; Beijing - Evaluation and planning for 30 identified historic sites and Integrated urban upgrading in historic neighborhoods

- (ii) **Cambodia:** Siem Reap - Regional planning and development
- (iii) **Indonesia: Yogyakarta** - Integrated urban upgrading; Bali
- (iv) **Vietnam: Halong Bay** - Regional planning and development
- (v) **Non-Operational activities:** State Administration for Cultural Heritage, Urban Heritage Management Conference II

5. Meeting with LSFP.

5.1 Discussion: LSFP presented the proposed Vilcanota Valley Rehabilitation Program main objective to assist the government of Peru to improve the management and development of the Sacred Valley of Vilcanota, taking into account the interests of the local culture and communities. UNESCO delegation endorsed the decision of the Bank to help this region as well as the proposed project objective and description. They recognize that the proposed operation complements and helps materialize the efforts developed by UNESCO in this particular region. Components to be financed under the projects would include :

- Completion of the Machu Picchu Master Plan;
- Completion of the wastewater treatment plant in Machu Picchu;
- Improving and expanding the solid waste management system in the Vilcanota valley;
- Resettlement of about 60 families living in areas of high risk, and demarcation of the Machu Picchu Pueblo town limits.
- Building of modern interpretation centers adjacent to heritage sites and trail; and development of an education emphasizing the pre-Hispanic Andean heritage program at the level of public schools of Peru, to be developed through a partnership with the National Geographic Society, INC and Ministry of Education GoP;
- Building of Telecentros in remote communities of the valley
- Developing instruments for legal protection of all monuments and sites along the Sacred Valley, including natural protected areas and the Inca trail.
- Strengthening local capacities to carry out sustainable preservation management of tangible and intangible Andean heritage.

- Ensuring Bank's commitment to address the needs of the local communities (i.e. as to the poverty reduction and rural development aspects) in the valley.

5.2 Conclusions: In view of the importance attributed to cultural heritage monuments and natural endowments situated along the Vilcanota Valley, and considering the input of technical resources and funds needed to carry-out the array of identified project activities, it was agreed that the World Bank and World Heritage Center will jointly collaborate with the Government of Peru in the framework of the present project. Towards this end, a letter will be sent by World Bank to the World Heritage Center inviting it to participate and collaborate in the subsequent project appraisal and/or negotiations mission. To improve the communication between UNESCO and the Bank, UNESCO would nominate a point of contact to join the bank in the field missions.

5.3 Focal point at the Bank is Roberto Chavez

6. Meeting with AFTS3.

- 6.1 Discussion: UNESCO presented its activities in DRC. Currently, UNESCO is implementing a large project to conserve the 5 World Heritage Sites in DRC, which are all on the list of World Heritage in Danger, funded by UNF and Belgium. This program comes to an end in 2004 and UNESCO is organizing a high level conference in September 2004, which will try to mobilize resources to continue the activities and ensure high level political commitment from the Government of DRC for the conservation of the sites. UNESCO also presented its new initiative for the forests of the Congo Basin (Central African World Heritage Forest Initiative). This partnership initiative which involves major NGOs, will work to strengthen the conservation of 3 transboundary protected area clusters in Gabon, Cameroun, Congo and CAR and explore the possibilities of designating them as World Heritage Sites.
- 6.2 Conclusions: The World Bank acknowledges the important contribution of UNESCO's initiative in DRC, which intervened at a time when there was virtually no support for conservation in DRC and thus was critical to save the sites. The Bank reiterated their intention to develop a proposal for GEF funding as part of their work in the forestry sector in DRC that will invest in 2 of the 5 sites. A meeting is set up between UNESCO, the Bank and the GEF Secretariat to discuss this. They are willing to participate actively in the September conference. UNESCO will invite Mr. John McIntire, Director of AFTSD and Mr. Emmanuel Mbi, country director for DRC. The Bank will also take part in the technical workshop preceding the conference and would look at the possibility of funding the participation of some DRC participants. The Bank will also keep UNESCO informed on the GEF proposal. As for CAWHFI, UNESCO will send the Bank the

documents relative to this initiative and a closer cooperation in the Region will be explored.

6.3 **Focal point** at the Bank is Joseph Baah-Dwomoh

7. **Meeting on Safeguard Policies.**

7.1 **Discussion:** The World Bank's draft Operational Policy and Bank Procedures 4.11 Physical Cultural Resources was presented. This is an update of the policy in force since 1986. It provides for inclusion of cultural resources within the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) process as well as for managing cultural material discovered unexpectedly during project implementation. Two tools will be available to aid in carrying out the policy: first, a Handbook providing advice and instruction; and, second, for each of the World Bank's client countries, a Physical Cultural Resources Country Profile, giving basic information on cultural heritage assets, laws, institutions and specialists.

7.2 **Conclusions:** Both the World Heritage Centre and the World Bank are interested in encouraging countries to improve the management of their cultural resources, and the information contained in the Country Profiles is valuable in this regard. The presentation on the status and methods of the Country Profiles project, and the samples distributed to members of the World Heritage Centre during the presentation, should stimulate discussion on use of the World Bank's policy, and the accompanying tools, to further the common objectives of the World Heritage Centre and the World Bank. At present, there is a need to identify, in countries that are both clients of the World Bank and parties to the World Heritage Convention, individuals who would be qualified and willing to complete Country Profiles. Suggestions from the World Heritage Centre are welcome.

7.3 **Focal Point:** Arlene Fleming

Annex 1: List of Participants

UNESCO/World Heritage Center

Mr. Francesco Bandarin, Director,
Mr. Natarajan Ishwaran, Chief of Unit, Natural Heritage Section
Mr. Guy Debonnet, Programme Specialist
Mrs. Nuria Sanz, Consultant
Mrs. Brigitte Moller, Director, UNESCO Division for Cooperation with Extra-budgetary Funding Sources
Mrs. Suzanne Bilello, New York UNESCO Office

ESSD

Ian Johnson, Vice President
Ede Ijjasz, Acting Director of Environment (ENV)
Arlene Fleming, Cultural resource Specialist (ESDQC)

EASES

Teresa Serra, Director, EASES
Magda Lovei, Environment Sector Manager, EASES
Robin Broadfield, Sr. Regional Coordinator, EASES
Ede Ijjasz, Sr. Environmental Specialist (ENV)
Kathy Mackinnon, Lead Biodiversity Specialist (ENV)
Marian Delos Angeles, Sr. Environmental Economist (WBIEN)

MNSIF

Anthony Bigio, Sr. Urban Specialist, MNSIF
Gianni Brizzi, Consultant, MNSIF
Elvira Morella, Operations Analyst, MNSIF
Rosanna Nitti, Urban Specialist, MNSIF
Chantal Reliquet, Sr. Urban Specialist (AFTU2)

EASIN, EASUR

Christian Delvoie, Sector Director, EASIN
Keshav Varma, Sector Director Urban, EASUR
Mats Anderson, Sr. Urban Management Specialist, EASUR
Katrinka Ebbe, Consultant (EXTCD)

LCSFP

Maria Emilia Freire, Regional Adviser Urban, LCSFP
Ephim Shluger, Consultant, LCSFU

AFTS3

Laurent Debroux, Forestry Specialist, AFTS3
Joseph Baah-Dwomoh, Sector Manager, AFTS3

TUDUR

Maryvonne Plessis-Fraissard, Director, TUDDR
Vitor Serra, Lead Urban Specialist, TUDUR

World Bank Institute

Jian Xie, Sr. Environmental Specialist, WBIEN

Cities Alliance

Mark Hildebrand, Program Manager, TUDCA

Annex 2

World Heritage Center – World Bank meetings
March 18 – 19, 2004, Washington DC
(All the meetings will be held at Room MC C1-108)

World Heritage Center team:

Mr. Francesco Bandarin, Director,
Mr. Nataranjan Ishwaran, Chief of Unit, Natural Heritage Section
Mr. Guy Debonnet, Programme Specialist
Mrs. Nuria Sanz, Consultant
Mrs. Brigitte Moller, Director, UNESCO Division for Cooperation with Extra-budgetary Funding Sources
Mrs. Suzanne Bilello, New York UNESCO Office

Thursday, March 18, 2004

- 9 - 10 am** **World Heritage Center/UNESCO programs and activities and collaboration with the World Bank**
World Heritage Center/UNESCO and World Bank Staff
- 10 – 11 am** **Meeting with Ian Johnson, Vice President, Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development**
Ede Ijjasz-Vasquez, Acting Director for Environment
- 11 – 12 am** **Meeting with EASES team**
Maria Teresa Serra, Sector Director
Magda Lovei, Sector manager
Kathy MacKinnon
Anthony J. Whitten
- 12 – 12.45 pm** **Meeting with MENA team**
Gianni Brizzi (the City of Bam – Iran)
Anthony Bigio
- 12.45 – 2 pm** Luncheon with Italian Executive Director, Mr. Biagio Bossone
- 2 – 3 pm** **Meeting with EASIN and EASUR teams**
Christian Delvoie, Director, Infrastructure Sector
Keshav Varma, Director, Urban Sector
Katrinka Ebbe
- 3 – 4 pm** **Meeting with LAC team (Vilcanota Valley Rehabilitation Program)**
Mila Freire, Adviser, Urban, Housing and Municipal Services,

Ephim Shluger, Adviser for Cultural Heritage, Finance, Private Sector and Infrastructure, Latin America and Caribbean Region

4 – 4.30

Meeting with the AFTS3 team

Giuseppe Topa, Lead Specialist

Laurent Debroux, Forestry Specialist

4.30 – 5.00 pm

Meeting with Arlene Fleming on Safeguard Policies

5 - 6.00 pm

Cultural and Natural Heritage in the Perspective of WHC/UNESCO and the Bank

Maryvonne Plessis-Fraissard

Ede Ijjasz-Vasquez

Mark Hildebrand, Cities Alliance

Xie, Jian, WBI

Friday March 19, 2004

10 – 11 am

Videoconference with the General Directorate for Development Cooperation, Italian Ministry for Foreign Affairs and with the Italian Executive Director

Mr. Biagio Bossone;

Vitor Serra;

Elvira Morella, Italian Trust Fund for Culture and Sustainable Development