Tackling the Illegal Wildlife Trade Crisis in Mongolia through Multi-Agency Coordination and Law Enforcement

Amanda E. Fine, VMD, PhD
Mongolia Country Program Director
Wildlife Conservation Society

World Bank
March 24, 2009
A Wildlife Trade Crisis?

SILENT STEPPE: The Illegal Wildlife Trade Crisis in Mongolia

The Illegal Wildlife Trade Crisis in Mongolia

July 2006
Public Perception

Bar chart showing the percentage of respondents at different times (50 years ago, 30 years ago, 10 years ago, 5 years ago, Last year, This year) for three categories: Very Rare, Rare, and Abundant.
Population Assessments: Rapid and Drastic Declines

[Graph showing the population decline of various species from 1985 to 2004.]
Economically Important Species

- **Marmot**: 40 million (1940) to 1-2 million
- **Red Deer**: 130,000 (1986) to 8-10,000 (2002)
- **Argali**: 60,000 (1985) to 15,000 (2001)
- **Saiga**: 5,000 (1998) to <800 (2004)
- **Saker Falcon**: 3,000 (1999) to 2,000 (2004)
Trade Records and Harvest Estimates

1925-1935

2004

Red Fox
Corsac Fox
Marmot
Boar
Roe Deer
Gazelle
What Happened?

- Collapse of the Soviet Union
- Collapse of the USSR-subsidized Mongolian Economy
  - Livelihoods
  - Wildlife Management and Law Enforcement
- Political and Economic Change
  - Opening of Borders with China
- Wildlife Becomes the New Currency
  - Open Access
  - Hunting Tradition
Understanding Wildlife Trade in Mongolia
Survey Results

Who Hunts?
- Females in Mongolia “never” hunt
- Hunters younger than 15 and older than 60 are rare
- 30% of Mongolian men interviewed claim to hunt wildlife
  - 50%: 15 to 28 years old
  - 30%: 29 to 42 years old
  - 26%: > 42 years old
Survey Results: Changes in Take

- Numbers of individuals hunting
  - 25,000 (Soviet-style brigade system)
  - 245,000 (reported today)

- Guns and ammunition
  - Cheaper and fewer restrictions
  - All hunters report owning a gun (96%)
  - Police records: 30,000 vs. 240,000
  - Only 8% are “trappers”
### Survey Results: Big Eight

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>Abundance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Siberian marmot</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gray wolf</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red fox</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolian gazelle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wild boar</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corsac fox</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roe deer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fish (Taimen)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hare</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Altai marmot</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red squirrel</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Red deer</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wild ass</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ibex</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brown bear</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argali</td>
<td>&lt; 10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mongolia’s Threatened Wildlife

Overhunting and the excessive trade of animal skins and products have caused populations of endangered species in Mongolia to plummet as much as 90 percent in the last 15 years.

### ANIMALS MOST HUNTED

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANIMAL</th>
<th>NUMBER OF HUNTERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Siberian marmot</td>
<td>160,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Gray wolf</td>
<td>85,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Red fox</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Mongolian gazelle</td>
<td>40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Roe deer</td>
<td>35,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Corsac fox</td>
<td>30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Wild boar</td>
<td>25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Red deer</td>
<td>9,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Red squirrel</td>
<td>7,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Brown bear</td>
<td>4,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ANIMALS WORTH THE MOST MONEY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANIMAL</th>
<th>DOMESTIC MARKET VALUE (U.S. DOLLARS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Dalmatian pelican</td>
<td>$2,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Brown bear</td>
<td>$1,340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Red deer</td>
<td>$985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Yakut moose</td>
<td>$900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Argali</td>
<td>$515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Usurian moose</td>
<td>$400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Gray wolf</td>
<td>$310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Asiatic wild ass</td>
<td>$300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Snow leopard</td>
<td>$272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Siberian ibex</td>
<td>$232</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### ANIMALS KILLED THE MOST BY HUNTERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANIMAL</th>
<th>ESTIMATED FOR 2004</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Siberian marmot</td>
<td>3,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Mongolian gazelle</td>
<td>200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Red fox</td>
<td>200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Red squirrel</td>
<td>180,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Altai marmot</td>
<td>170,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Corsac fox</td>
<td>150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Roe deer</td>
<td>100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Wild boar</td>
<td>30,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Red deer</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Asiatic wild ass</td>
<td>3,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Peter Zahler, Wildlife Conservation Society; pictures by Art Wolfe (marmot), Kenneth W. Fink (pelican)/Photo Researchers and Jamie-Andrea Yanak/Associated Press
Fur Trade

- Largest (volume and value)
- International Market
  - China
  - Russia (limited)
- Species
  - Marmots to Snow Leopards
Medicinal Trade

- Increases
  - Domestic & International
- Markets
  - China and Korea
- Species
  - International: bear gall bladder, siaga horn, wolf parts, musk deer glands, red deer, snow leopard
  - Domestic: marmot, wolf, badger, corsac fox, brown bear, muskrat, roe deer, musk deer, hedgehog, and Daurian parttridge
Game Meat Trade

- Domestic
  - Large Increases?
  - Local Markets
  - Restaurants
  - Species
    - Marmot
    - Gazelle
    - Moose
    - Altai snowcock
Trophy and Sport Hunting

- Increasingly popular
- Promoted by Ministry of Nature and Environment
- Lack of community benefit
- Quotas often exceed recommendations
Trade Chains

- Hunter to:
  - Domestic end user
  - Domestic markets
  - Domestic processors
  - Cross-border markets
  - International trade chains
Trade Chains and Markets
Trade Chains and Transport
Trade Chains and Transport
Impacts of Wildlife Trade

- **Economy**
  - $100 million
  - Hunters: $200/year
  - Traders: $5,000/year
  - Annual per capita GDP: $1,800

- **Biodiversity  Conservation**

- **Rural Livelihoods**
  - Reliance on a dwindling resource
Recommendations and Next Steps

- International Trade Enforcement
- Domestic Trade Enforcement
- Hunting Management
- Trophy and Sport Hunting Management
- Community-Based Approaches to Management
Silent Steppe “Next Steps”

“Law enforcement is the single most critical factor in controlling the unsustainable and illegal hunting that is causing dramatic declines in Mongolia’s wildlife”

-Silent Steppe Report
World Bank/FLEG: Ulaanbaatar Wildlife Trade Survey

- Characterize wildlife trade in and around Ulaanbaatar (confirm role as hub)
  - Species, parts, price, seasonal trends, trade routes

- Assess current levels of wildlife trade enforcement in Ulaanbaatar

- Establish relationships with enforcement agencies
Successes

- Training & Building Relationships
Successes

- Enforcement Action
Conclusions

- Ulaanbaatar: Large-scale illegal trade in wildlife
- Trade is seasonal
- Multi-agency approach to enforcement most effective
- Multi-faceted and large scale issue
- Sustained enforcement effort is critical
NEMO II (2008)
Protecting Mongolia’s Wildlife Through Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement
Project Support:
World Bank’s Netherlands-Mongolia Trust Fund for Environmental Reform, Phase II: NEMO II
Multi-Agency Coordination & Law Enforcement

State Specialized Inspection Agency, Municipal Inspection Agency, National Police, Airport Customs Inspection, WWF-MPO, and other Environmental NGOs
Project Components:
Improving the Legal Environment for Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement, Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement Staff Training & Capacity Building
Project Approach

- Multi-Agency Collaborative Wildlife Projection and Law Enforcement
  - Start: Ulaanbaatar Markets & Collection Points
  - Future: Aimag Market & Collection Points
  - Future: International Borders
    - State Border Defense Agency
    - Border Customs
Project Approach

- Identify core group of team members
  - Representatives from multiple agencies
- Coordinate wildlife trade patrols in Ulaanbaatar and eventually Mongolia
- Learn about approaches in other parts of Asia
- Develop standardized enforcement, information collection and sharing
Multi-Agency Teams

1) detect illegal wildlife trade;
2) take action against illegal wildlife trade (i.e. fines, arrests other enforcement opportunities);
3) direct enforcement resources at critical points in the illegal trade chain; and
4) coordinate enforcement efforts across agencies and jurisdictional boundaries
Pilot Patrols: Marmot Hunting & Trade

- September 2008
- Municipal SIA, Police
- UB markets - Toso, Emeelt, Bayanzurkh
- UB “Green Zone” - Baga nuur, Partizan, Argunt, Bogd khan uul, Nalaikh
- UB Fur Factory - Master door
Results of Marmot Inspections

- A Marmot Hunting Ban has been implementation but...
- Marmot barbeque is on sale (more expensive than skin)
Results of Marmot Inspections

- Mongolian laws broken:
  - Ministers order of Marmot ban
  - Law on Hunting - 7.7.1; 15.1.9
  - Law on Fauna article - 8.8.1
  - Law on hunting license and fee - 5.2.2
  - Law on Weapons - 8.1
Results of Marmot Inspections

- 21 Cases (Violations of Law) Detected

- Confiscations
  - 24 dead marmots (prepared for BBQ)
  - 4 fresh skins
  - 15 guns
  - 6 traps

- Ecological Assessment
  - 1,000,000 MNT

Also: Badger confiscated and released to nature
Multi-Agency Patrols: Trade Season

- Patrol plan- Approval SSIA
- Target markets in Ulaanbaatar
  - Raw Material
  - Restaurants
  - Tourist Shops
Multi-Agency Patrols - Results

1. Grey wolf (*Canis lupus*): skin, meat, parts
2. Brown bear (*Ursus arctos*): paw, skin, oil
3. Marmot (*Marmota sibirica*): skin, oil, bone, parts
4. Red deer (*Cervus elaphus*): parts, horn, female tail
5. Snow leopard (*uncia uncia*): skin
6. Lynx (*Lynx lynx*): skin
7. Argali (*Ovis ammon*): horn
8. Ibex (*Capra sibirica*): horn
9. Red fox (*Vulpes vulpes*): skin
10. Corsac fox (*Vulpes corsac*): skin
11. Mongolian gazelle (*Procurpa gutturusa*): meat
Multi-Agency Patrols-Results

**Action**
- 15 Violations (detected and recorded)
- 8 Confiscations
- 6 Penalties & Warnings
- 1 Crime (reported to Municipal Police)

**Additional Activities**
- UBS and MNT Broadcasts
- SSIA special meeting and press conference on results of multi-agency patrols
Students Surveys in UB Markets (2008-2009)

- NUM Ecology Erdem Club-10 students
- Patrol plan, patrol form
- Survey method
- Raw materials markets;
  Emeelt
  Tsaiz (UB, Nalaikh)
  Baganuur
Student Surveys in UB Markets (2008-2009)

Food markets:
- Narantuul
- Bayanzurkh
- Mercury
  - Restaurants
  - Hospitals
  - Souvenir shops
  - Media advertisements
Students Surveys in UB markets (2008-2009)

1. Чоно /бутэн бие, арьс, мах, эд эрхтэн/
2. Баавгай /савар, арьс, тос/
3. Тарвага /арьс, тос, яс, эд эрхтэн/
4. Буга / эвэр/
5. Ирвэс /арьс/
6. Шилүүс /арьс/
7. Аргал /эвэр/
8. Янгир /эвэр/
9. Унэг /арьс/
10. Хярс /арьс/
11. Туулай /арьс/
12. Шар шувуу /ед, мах/1
13. Цагаан зээр /шилбэн/
14. Бор өрөөс /эвэр, толгой/
15. Хойлогны мах
16. Зэрлэг гахай /мак/
17. Дорго /цус, тос/
18. Зараа /ус/
19. Шилүүс /арьс/
20. Цагаан загас
21. Нохой сугас
22. Байгалийн өмөл
23. Ердийн цулбүүрт
24. Алгана
Student Surveys in UB markets (2008-2009)

- Markets: repeating illegal wildlife trade
- Detected 28 species
- Protected by Hunting, Fauna laws, Red data book, Red list and CITES
- Trade (number of species detected) was decreased compared to last year (51 species)
- Prices for wildlife are similar
Student Surveys in UB markets (2008-2009)

Possible Reasons for Decline (fewer species detected) in Trade
- Enforcement Activities; WTCU
- Public Awareness; WWF-MPO
- Less Survey Effort (shorter time frame)
- More “Hidden” Trade; especially protected species
- Economic Conditions

Further Analysis Needed!
Multi-Agency Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement Study Tour

Lao PDR: January 10-20, 2009
Hosts: WCS Lao office and Vientiane Capital City Illegal Wildlife Trade Unit (Committee) and Lao Department of Forestry
Study Tour Activities: Meetings

- WCS Lao office staff
- Forestry Department
- Forestry Inspection Department
- Vientiane Capital Agriculture and Forestry Department
- Vientiane Capital City Wildlife Trade Enforcement Unit (Committee)
Study Tour Activities: Market Visits

- Huay Mor of Van Vieng
- Phahom
- Morning market
- Danexang
- Pakson
- Tongnamy
Study Tour Activities: Protected Areas

- Houy gnang PA of Vientiane city
- Nam kading NP
- Bolikhamsay PAFO
- Check points:
  - Lao-Vietnam International border
  - Nadee forest check point
Multi-Agency Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement Study Tour

- Comparison of Wildlife Trade Situation in Mongolia and Laos
  - Demand in China---across borders
  - Species, products and trade routes

- Comparison of Legal Structure for Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement
  - Wildlife and Aquatic Life Law, Dec. 2007
  - Agreement: Organization and Role of Dept. of Forest Inspection, March, 2008
Multi-Agency Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement Study Tour

- Comparison to Market and Field Patrols
  - Multi-Agency Market Patrol Teams
  - Ranger and Police Field Patrols
  - Transit Route Check Points
- Comparison of Data Collection and Analysis
  - WCS Laos 5-year Observational Surveys
  - Tracking of violations, warnings, penalties
Multi-Agency Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement Study Tour

- Comparison of Resources and Personnel to Conduct Wildlife Trade Law Enforcement
  - Limited resources; large areas to patrol
- Team Building and Inter-Agency Communication