

Back to Office Report

PRR and EPGI Capacity Building Workshop

November 1, 2005, Vologda, Russian Federation

*Hosted by the World Bank, Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation,
Government of the Vologda Region*

1. This report documents the contribution of the Economic Policy and Gender Initiative (EPGI) to the capacity building workshop held in Vologda, Russian Federation on November 1, 2005, and draws lessons for the further EPGI dissemination.
2. The first section of this report stipulates the workshop background (why the decision was taken to conduct the Workshop in Vologda region), followed by workshop objectives; profile of the participants; presentation of the themes and presenters; evaluation of the content and substance of the workshop; evaluation of the nature of the collaboration with the co-organizers both from outside the Bank (Federal and Local authorities of the Russian Federation) and within the Bank (ECSHD, PREM, WBI Moscow, Moscow Country Office, and PRMGE); lessons learned and possible follow up steps.

Vologda Workshop Background

3. Russian Federation presents a unique situation with regard to gender equality issues. Human capital development opportunities and the equal rights for men and women (equal access to primary and secondary education; health, economic and social areas) referred to in Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) are guaranteed by the Constitution, the Labor Code and other legislation. CEDAW is ratified. The Government of Russia developed Russia's Gender Strategy where key gender issues are addressed. Though the Strategy is not officially adopted (as an official federal government decree), many regions of Russia have developed their regional Gender Strategies based upon it, adopted such strategies officially, and are implementing them.
4. The Russia's Country Gender Assessment (CGA), conducted jointly by the Government of the Russian Federation and the World Bank (first stage -2004, second stage -2005) revealed some gender issues, especially with respect to differential access to economic and productive resources, and to political participation. Evidence suggests a declining ratio of women business administrators and a "glass ceiling" to the professional advancement of women. The CGA also highlighted that both women and men are victims of family violence. Gender gaps were shown to have increased not only due to the worsening of the social and economic position of women (marginalization of their status in the labor market, etc) but also due to the aggravation of the men's gender problems (excessive male mortality within the working age cohorts; alcoholism, spread of drug addiction, devaluation of fatherhood, etc.). The CGA also highlighted differential law enforcement, and regional disparities in the provision of social services (including social protection, education and health).

5. "Mainstreaming Gender in the Delivery of Social Services and Social Assistance in Vologda Oblast of the Russian Federation. Technical Assistance Pilot Initiative " was launched in late 2004 based upon the results of the first stage of the Country Gender Assessment (2004) and in response to the request from the Ministry of Health and Social Development for the Russian Federation to support mainstreaming gender at the regional level. This pilot initiative is a cross-sectoral multi-donor (ILO, CIDA, SIDA, Canada Gender Equality Fund, the DIFID) technical assistance program in support of gender mainstreaming in the Vologda region (North-West federal Okrug of the Russian Federation).

6. The Pilot Initiative objectives were: (i) to support Government efforts to improve the effectiveness (including quality, efficiency, user satisfaction, and financial viability) of the delivery of public services at regional level through the introduction of gender-sensitive procedures and policymaking; (ii) to develop and demonstrate options of effective organization of gender work in Russian regions by providing an example of how gender mainstreaming can be operationalized and its positive impact be felt in improved efficiency of the social services.

7. The Pilot Initiative outcomes are: increased gender sensitivity in provision of social services; increased capacity of regional and local administrations in addressing gender issues. The relevance and significance of gender mainstreaming to regional policy-making has prompted the Administration of Vologda to establish Special Commission on Gender Issues under the Governor of Vologda Oblast to address gender aspects of social and economic development. Significant capacity building activities such as study tours, workshops, and training, were well received by the Vologda Administration authorities and have influenced local decision-making and provision of social services.

8. Dissemination of the results of the Pilot Initiative. The demonstration of positive impact of gender mainstreaming on improved quality, efficiency and effectiveness of social services is a key result of the Pilot Initiative and the presentation of this best practice to federal authorities as well as authorities of other regions of the Russian Federation is an important objective of the overall Bank Russia Gender Program. A dissemination strategy which was developed and discussed with counterparts envisaged that the dissemination of results could potentially be done in partnership with the Gender and Development Group (GDG) which was going to organize a set of training events and seminars on gender mainstreaming and engendering development.

9. The PRR and EPGI Capacity Building Workshop is the first out of the set of Pilot Initiative Results dissemination activities conducted jointly by the Russia Gender Team (comprized of representatives of ECSHD, WBI Moscow, PREM) and PRMGE group.

Overall objectives of the Vologda workshop

10. As seen from the above the workshop was designed: (i) to help meet the need for further improving of capacity of Vologda regional and municipal authorities, NGOs, regional experts in gender and statistics, gender monitoring and evaluation and gender-responsive economic policy; (ii) to facilitate gender mainstreaming experience and knowledge-sharing between Vologda and other regions of the Russian Federation.

11. The one-day workshop was aimed at: (i) presentation of EPGI research papers and PRR "Engendering Development" relevant to the most acute topics of social and economic development faced by Vologda region authorities; (ii) building capacity to perform gender analysis in specific policy-

related work, as well as in monitoring and evaluation of projects and programs; (iii) demonstration of Vologda experience and results achieved through gender mainstreaming to other regions of the Russian Federation.

12. The workshop was timed to best impact the rapidly evolving economic and social development policy agenda in Russia, at a time when the country is implementing broad administrative reform, seeks to reconstruct the division of responsibilities between federal regional and municipal levels and is launching important social initiatives.

13. Some of the specific goals of the workshop included:

- To present gender-aware economic policies, and the importance of applying them for obtaining optimal development, economic growth and poverty reduction;
- To build capacity on how best to perform gender-aware social programs and social services beneficiary assessments
- To build capacity in designing social protection measures in a gender-aware manner.

Profile of participants

14. The workshop was attended by about 125 participants from Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Russian Federation, different departments of Vologda oblast administration, Vologda Social Protection rayon and municipal offices, representatives of the legislative assembly of Vologda region, representatives of local NGOs and of the research institutes. The workshop was also attended by representatives of other than Vologda regions of the Russian Federation and a group of think tanks invited by the Bank. A handful of students from Vologda University have also attended the workshop.

15. The level of representation was very high - first deputy Governors, ministers/ heads of departments, lead councillors. A broad range of civil servants were represented, both in terms of seniority levels and of sectors of expertise. Participants represented regional ministries of Economic Development, Health, Education, Social Protection, Foreign Affairs; Statistics, Migration service, Employment service; Grade levels ranged from Director-General to Counselor. Many were members of the Gender Equality Commission under the Governor. Two Deputy Governors of Vologda oblast as well as Deputy Governor of Komi Respublic have participated in the Workshop.

Themes and Presenters

16. The workshop had three main sessions:

- (1) PRR and EPGI discussion;
- (2) Discussion of Vologda Pilot Initiative results through the perspective of the EPGI topics;
- (3) Gender Mainstreaming Regional initiatives - role of EPGI and need for capacity building .

17. The first session discussed gender development issues, as addressed by EPGI research papers and PRR "Engendering Development" with a focus on labor, pensions, and social protection/social transfers aspects. The international experience and best practices of addressing gender inequality issues across different countries were presented and discussed during this session. The session was designed to make a case for economic and development efficiency of reducing gender gaps in societies. EPGI components introduced the economic theory behind the argument and presented methodologies of how to integrate gender analysis in three specific priority sectors, as identified by the Vologda region Authorities: labor, pensions and social protection policies. Findings and messages emanating from the EPGI research program were presented and, as far as possible, made relevant to the specific situation in the Vologda region for integration into regional economic strategies, development plans and civil society organizations' development activities.

18. The second session addressed the EPGI issues raised and discussed at the first session and demonstrated how actual implementation by Vologda Authorities of the theoretical EPGI provisions leads to economic and social development in Vologda Region.

19. The regional gender priorities as seen by the key stakeholders - representatives of Ministry of health and Social Development, Vologda authorities and invited regional administrations authorities and issues to be supported through the EPGI and Russia's Gender Program in the Vologda Region and other regions of Russia were within the focus of the discussion of the third session of the workshop.

20. The PRR and EPGI topics were presented by Elena Zotova, PhD, World Bank Russia Gender Coordinator, Valery Elizarov, Ph.D, head of the Center for Demographic Studies of Moscow State University, lead Russian expert on gender and development issues; Tatyana Tchetvernina, Doctor of Economic Sciences, deputy dean of Moscow High School of Economics, lead Russian researcher on Labor issues well known internationally; Marina Baskakova, Doctor of Economic Sciences, an outstanding Russian reaeacher who is well known for the studies on pension, and gender; Svetlana Misikhina, PH.D, one of the most well known Russian researchers on social protection and social development issues; Marina Krasilnikova, Ph.D., well known sociologist, with extensive experience in design and methodology of surveys and beneficiary assessments; Dmitry Pomazkin, Ph.D, researcher who is known as one of the top Russian econometrics. All researchers invited to make presentation at the workshop have a long lasting track record of working with the World Bank and have extensive knowledge of Bank products, including PRR Engendering Development and those developed under EPGI.

21. In addition to the general argument for the importance of gender equality for economic growth and development, as presented in the Policy Research Report *Engendering Development*, the workshop participants were presented and discussed the theoretical foundations underlying the general argument for a "growth dividend" of gender equality, and materials on the importance of gender-sensitizing social protection policy design, gender and risks in the design of social protection interventions. Other materials available under the EPGI were also presented.

Evaluation of the Content and Substance of the Workshop

22. The topics of the workshop had been defined with the regional and country context in mind, and were therefore well-tailored to the audience and highly relevant. Moreover, the workshop came at a time when Vologda regional authorities in many ways found itself at a crossroads, and the role of gender

mainstreaming in accelerating of economic and social development increases. The workshop was timely.

23. The workshop sessions were sequenced along the following thread: (i) there is an economic dividend of closing gender gaps; (c) the Vologda region and other regions of the Russian Federation have a particular set of gender issues related to economics; (d) gender analysis matters in specific sector policy design; (e) how to perform gender-aware social policy analysis and social policy design, (f) how to monitor and evaluate policies and statistics in a gender-aware manner. The workshop sequencing worked well and ensured a smooth transition between the different elements. It could easily be replicated for future events, particularly in other regions of the Russian Federation.

24. Participants were particularly interested in discussing tools for actual implementation of gender sensitive social policy. At the Workshop it was decided that the Ministry of Health and Social Development will disseminate the questionnaire for beneficiary assessment which was developed under Vologda Pilot Initiative to all regions of Russia, so that regional administrations could use these in their evaluation of social programs.

25. Participants raised a number of questions during the sessions, most of them technical. Some participants also identified questions that they would like to address to the Federal Government. The representative of the Federal Government will transfer the questions to appropriate units of the Ministry of Health and Social Development for review and comments.

Evaluation of the Collaboration with the co-organisers of the Workshop

26. The workshop was demand-driven and stemmed from the initiative of Russia Gender team, who took on a proactive role in making the event happen. The Russian gender team is cross sectoral and includes representatives from ECSHD, WBI Moscow, PREM. The PRMGE/EPGI team has provided assistance to the Russia gender team as well as materials for dissemination.

Collaboration with PRMGE/EPGI was excellent. In effect, agenda of the Workshop, sequencing of the topics and sessions, presentators candidacies were all discussed and agreed with PRMGE.

Lessons learned:

27. The workshop and preceding discussion of different options of mainstreaming gender in the delivery of social services and social assistance (held with Vologda authorities during the implementation of Pilot Initiative) has stimulated a wide discussion of gender sensitive social policy options and mechanisms among representatives of local authorities, legislative bodies, governmental and nongovernmental structures, gender experts, researchers thus allowing them to exchange views on the different aspects of gender equality issues.

28. The active participation of regional representatives at all phases of preparation and delivery of the workshop was a tangible success of the workshop. The participants' interest and their personal commitment proved the usefulness of this workshop and highlighted key regional priorities in gender development area.

29. The workshop discussions proved the need to get regional business community and trade unions more involved in addressing gender issues. Both business community and trade unions are to become key partners of Vologda Administration in addressing gender issues.

30. The Workshop demonstrated that Vologda region's Administration priorities and development objectives in gender area as outlined in the design of the Pilot initiative were successfully met. At the same time the implementation of the Pilot and the Workshop revealed the need for gender education and knowledge of international standards and best practices on gender equality. The information dissemination, establishing and maintaining of effective gender network are very important for awareness-raising.

31. The dissemination of printed copies of PRR "Engendering Development" and EPGI reports at the workshop as well as dissemination of CD with materials related to Vologda Pilot Initiative was very well taken by the participants and contributed to the success of the Workshop. It is important to provide participants with as much related materials as possible so that after the event they could read the documents and use them in their everyday activities.

Implications of the Vologda Workshop for Future Events

32. In the continued work to disseminate EPGI products and hold capacity building workshops it will be important: (i) to fine tune the mode of the presentation of the EPGI products along with the needs of participants - in Vologda (the gender advanced region in which a Pilot initiative on gender mainstreaming was already implemented) it was evident that the auditorium needs tools and toolkits to address gender in their everyday work rather than theoretical discussions. (ii) that a qualified economist with in-depth knowledge of the EPGI products act as main liaison with the regional unit. The work entails: identifying themes and corresponding EPGI products and speakers; developing modules for the workshop at the correct level of technicality; working closely with speakers to develop the session. The work contains significant amounts of logistics and negotiations between different units and sufficient time should be reserved to carry this out in the liaison's work program.

33. Finally, dissemination of EPGI products should be more continuous an effort but not a one time event. To make it happen it is needed to intensify dissemination of EPGI products within the Bank specifically among GFPs who work with countries on gender issues. Russia took the initiative to pilot such dissemination among GFPs and government officials representing CIS countries of the ECA region. The Two days conference will be organised in Moscow in late November.

Annex: Reference on Economic Policy and Gender Initiative

1. Policy Research Report Series

The papers commissioned for the World Bank Policy Research Report, 'Engendering Development', were subject to quality check from peer reviewers in PRMGE, as well as other reviewers from within and outside the Bank. Where possible, feedback was also obtained through various workshops and seminars.

- Artecona, R. and W. Cunningham. 2002. Effects of Trade Liberalization on the Gender Wage Gap in Mexico. PRR No. 21.
- Cox-Edwards, A. 2001. Social Security Reforms and Women's Pensions. PRR No. 17.
- Ilahi, N. 2000. The Intra-Household Allocation of Time and Tasks: What Have We Learnt from the Empirical Literature? PRR No. 13.
- Lokshin, M. 2000. Effects of Child Care Practices in Women's Labor Force Participation in Russia. PRR. No. 10.
- Lokshin, M., E. Glinskaya and M. Garcia. 2000. The Effect of Early Childhood Development Programs on Women's Labor Force Participation and Older Children's Schooling in Kenya. PRR No. 15.
- Montenegro, C. 2001. Wage Distribution in Chile: Does Gender Matter? A Quantile Regression Approach. PRR. 20.
- Paul-Majumder, P. and A. Begum. 2000. The Export Imbalance in the Export Oriented Garment Industry in Bangladesh. PRR No. 12.
- Rice, P. 1999. Gender Earnings Differentials: The European Experience. PRR No. 8.
- Rodgers, Y. 1999. Protecting Women and Promoting Equality in the Labor Market: Theory and Evidence. PRR No. 6.
- Rozelle, S., X. Dong, L. Zhang and A. Mason. 2002. Gender Wage Gap in Post-Reform Rural China. PRR No. 22.
- Tansel, A. (2000x). Wage Earners, Self-Employment and Gender in the Informal Sector in Turkey. PRR. No. 24.

2. EPGI Working Papers

PRMGE commissioned a number of papers under its Economic Policy and Gender Initiative, most of which were published in the DEC-managed Policy Research Working Paper series. They were subject to the standard peer reviewing guidelines, i.e., clearance from the DEC PRWP administrator and the respective manager, as well as the country director(s) of the countries specifically discussed in the study. In addition, the working papers under the EPGI were subject to internal, and where possible, external peer reviewing.

- Berik, R., Y. Meulen Rodgers, and Zviglich. 2003. International Trade and Wage Discrimination: Evidence from East Asia. Policy Research Working Paper No. 3111.
- Cunningham, W. and C. Ramos Gomez. 2004. The Home as the Factory Floor: Employment and Remuneration of Home-based Workers. Policy Research Working Paper No. 3295.
- Edmonds, E. 2004. Household Composition and the Response of Child Labor Supply to Product Market Integration: Evidence from Vietnam. Policy Research Working Paper 3235.
- Edmonds, E. and N. Pavcnik. 2004. Product Market Integration and Household Labor Supply in a Poor Economy: Evidence from Vietnam. Policy Research Working Paper No. 3234.
- Glick, P., R. Saha and S. D. Younger. 2004. Integrating Gender into Benefit Incidence and Demand Analysis. (e-published in the EPGI website)
- James, E., A. Edwards and R. Wong. 2003. The Gender Impact of Pension Reform: A Cross-Country Analysis. Policy Research Working Paper 3074.
- James, E. The Gender Impacts of Pension Reform: Which Policies Shape This Impact? (Forthcoming as a LAC publication)
- Jarvis, L. and E. Vera-Toscano. 2004. The Impact of Chilean Fruit Sector Development on Female Employment and Household Income. Policy Research Working Paper No. 3263.
- McKernan, S., M. Pitt and D. Moskowitz. 2004. Use of Formal and Informal Financial Sectors: Does Gender Matter? Empirical Evidence from Rural Bangladesh. Policy Research Working Paper. (forthcoming)
- Nicita, A. and S. Razzaz. 2003. Who Benefits and How Much? How Gender Affects Welfare Impacts of a Booming Textile Industry. Policy Research Working Paper No. 3029.
- Oostendorp, R. 2004. Globalization and Gender Wage Gap. Policy Research Working Paper No. 3256.
- Quisumbing, A. R., and Y. Yohannes. 2004. How Fair is the Workfare? Gender, Public Works, and Employment in Rural Ethiopia. Policy Research Working Paper (forthcoming).

3. Operational Tools

A number of operational tools were developed by PRMGE in collaboration with other Bank units under EPGI.

Downsizing Options Simulations Exercise (DOSE) Excel Application.

(Rama, M. and Chong, A. 2002)

Gender Adaptation of Pension Reform Options Simulation Toolkit (PROST).

(James, E., 2004)

4. PREM Notes

- *Minimizing Negative Distributional Effects in Public Sector Downsizing*, April 2004, PREM Note no. 84.
- *Gender Differentiated Impacts of Pension Reform*, April 2004, PREM Note no. 85.
- *Impact of Trade Liberalization on Gender Equality*, May 2004, PREM Note no. 86.
- *Labor Market Regulations for Women: Are They Beneficial?* December 2004, No. 94.

- *Gender Issues in Child Labor* (Forthcoming).

5. Other EPGI-relevant papers

A number of EPGI-relevant papers from various World Bank departments have been added to the initiative where appropriate. They have undergone varying forms of peer reviews, depending on the reviewing guidelines of the respective units.

- Basu, K. and R. Ray. 2001. The Collective Model of the Household and An Unexpected Implication for Child Labor: Hypothesis and an Empirical Test.
- Blunch., N. And D. Verner. 2000. Revisiting the Link Between Poverty and Child Labor: The Ghanaian Experience.
- Cigno, A., F. Rosati and Z. Tzannatos. 2002. Child Labor Handbook. Social Protection Discussion Paper Series. 0206.
- Cunningham, W. 2001. Breadwinner or Caregiver: How Household Role Affects Labor Choices in Mexico? Policy Research Working Paper 2743.
- Dnes, A. 1999. The Effects of Legislative Change on Female Labor Supply: Marriage and Divorce, Child and Spousal Support, Property Division and Pension Splitting. Social Protection Discussion Paper Series No. 9905.
- Ezemenari, K., N. Chaudhury, and J. Owens. 2002. Gender and Risk in the Design of Social Protection Interventions. Social Safety net Primer Series.
- Fox, L. and P. Castel. 2001. Gender Dimensions of Pension Reform in the Former Soviet Union. Policy Research Working Paper No. 2546.
- Grootaert, C. 1998. Child Labor in Cote d'Ivoire: Incidence and Determinants. ESSD Working Paper.
- Gustafsson-Wright, E. and H. Pyne. 2002. Gender Dimensions of Child Labor and Street Children in Brazil. Policy Research Working Paper No. 2897.
- Ilahi, N. 2001. Children's Work and Schooling: Does Gender Matter? Evidence from the Peru LSMS Panel Data. Policy Research Working Paper 2745.
- Paci, P. 1999. A Bundle of Joy or an Expensive Luxury: A Comparative Analysis of the Economic Environment for Family Formation in Western Europe. Social Protection Discussion Paper Series No. 9903.
- Newman, C. 2002. Gender, Time Use and Change: The Impact of Cut Flower Industry in Ecuador. World Bank Economic Review. Vol. 16, No. 3., pp. 375-393.
- Rama, M. 2002. The Gender Dimensions of Public Sector Downsizing: The Reform Program of Vietnam. World Bank Research Observer. Vol. 17. No. 2. Fall 2002.
- Tzannatos, Z. 1998. Women and Labor Market Changes in the Global Economy: Growth Helps, Inequality Hurts and Public Policy Matters. SD Discussion Paper No. 9808.