



REPORT OF THE 7TH MEETING OF THE WORLD BANK EXTERNAL GENDER CONSULTATIVE GROUP

**Washington D.C.
November 17-18, 2003**

Table of Contents:

1. Overview.....	1
2. Progress in Implementing the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy	1
3. Changing Environment for Gender Mainstreaming in the World Bank	3
4. Recent and Planned Initiatives on Gender and Development in the World Bank.....	5
5. Final Recommendations.....	6
Annex 1: Agenda	8
Annex 2: List of EGCG Members Attending the 7th EGCG Meeting	10

Report of the 7th Meeting of the World Bank External Gender Consultative Group November 17-18, 2003, World Bank, Washington D.C.

1. Overview

The World Bank's **External Gender Consultative Group** (EGCG) was established in 1996 to assist the Bank in the design and implementation of its gender policies, and to help strengthen dialogue on gender related issues between the Bank, its partners and interested sectors of civil society. The group met for the seventh time on November 17–18, 2003 in Washington D.C. The purpose of this meeting was to provide an opportunity for Bank staff and management to discuss the World Bank's work on gender equality issues with members of the EGCG and benefit from the advice of EGCG members. The two main topics for discussion included (a) progress in implementing the World Bank's Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, and (b) recent and planned initiatives on gender and development at the World Bank. The discussion also focused on ways to revitalize the EGCG and align it with the Bank's country based gender mainstreaming strategy.

During the two-day meeting, the EGCG members met with senior Bank management, including **James D. Wolfensohn**, President, **Shengman Zhang**, Managing Director, and **Gobind Nankani**, Vice-President, PREM. They also met with **Karen Mason**, Director, Gender and Development, and members of the Gender and Development Board and the PREM Gender and Development Group.

On November 19-20, EGCG members participated in a high-level international workshop on [*Gender Equality and the Millennium Development Goals*](#). The EGCG members played active roles in the workshop as panelists and discussants.

This report summarizes the topics discussed during the EGCG meeting, and highlights conclusions and recommendations. A detailed agenda can be found in Annex 1, and a list of the EGCG members attending the meeting can be found in Annex 2.

2. Progress in Implementing the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy

The EGCG meeting opened with a session that focused on the progress the World Bank has made in implementing its gender mainstreaming strategy. The session was chaired by **Karen Mason**, Director, Gender and Development. Ms. Mason gave an overview of the progress made in preparation of country gender assessments (CGAs), poverty assessments and other core economic and sector work (ESW), country assistance strategies (CASs), Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs), and lending operations. Presentations were also made by representatives from the Bank's Africa (AFR), Latin America and the Caribbean (LCR), Middle East and North Africa (MNA), and South Asia (SAR) regions. Other members of the Gender and Development Board and the PREM Gender Group were also present.

In her overview of the progress made in implementing the gender strategy, Ms. Mason said that results from the monitoring exercises for the first two fiscal years were encouraging. Over 85 percent of the Bank's active countries will have completed CGAs, either self-standing or as part of other ESW, by the end of FY05. More than 80 percent of poverty assessments completed between FY01 and FY03 had adequate or better gender-based analysis of poverty and gender-responsive policies. Close to 80 percent of CASs in FY03 proposed gender-related actions in at least one sector, up from just over 70 percent in FY02. The proportion of PRSPs with extensive diagnosis of gender inequalities also increased in the last two fiscal years. Based on the results of the latest review, close to 45 percent of Bank-supported operations had project components addressing gender issues.

EGCG members commented on Ms. Mason's presentation. **Mona Zulficar**, Senior Partner at Shalakany Law Office in Cairo, Egypt and Chairperson of the EGCG, inquired whether an assessment had been done of the impact of the CGAs on CASs, with eventual impact on results on the ground. **Suzanne Kindervatter**, InterAction, Washington DC, USA, commended the Bank on monitoring the progress in implementing the strategy and the seriousness with which it has been undertaken. She also questioned how the integration of gender followed from policy dialogue to lending operations. Ms. Zulficar also asked about World Bank and IMF Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs) of PRSPs and highlighted the importance of focusing on legal and judicial reforms, echoing some of the institutional reform ideas in the World Bank's Policy Research Report, [*Engendering Development-Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources and Voice*](#). (World Bank, 2001).

In her response, Ms. Mason said that it was too early to assess fully whether CGAs had an impact on CASs and, from there, on lending operations. Ms. Mason also provided information on JSAs, saying that there had been a marked improvement in the attention to gender in those documents in the last two fiscal years. Gender and Development Board members present at the meeting stressed that the World Bank has made progress in its work on gender, beyond what is captured in the monitoring report. **Teresa Genta-Fons**, Senior Council, Legal Department, and **Nadereh Chamlou**, Senior Advisor, Middle East and North Africa Region, identified work done in legal and judicial reform and pointed out that more evidence in the Bank's progress in gender mainstreaming can be found in country-specific and sector reports.

Mark Blackden, Lead Economist, Africa Region, described ongoing work in Africa, including capacity building and tools to address gender dynamics of HIV/AIDS and the gender and law program in eight countries with additional work planned in four countries in FY04 and FY05. For the South Asia Region, **Richard Ackermann**, Senior Adviser, South Asia Region, emphasized the decentralized nature of the Bank's work, with gender focal points in each country supporting gender-related work. He identified the unique situation in each country, such as data needs for preparing a CGA for Afghanistan and the demand for a value-added assessment for the CGA for India. **Nadereh Chamlou** shared the progress made in the Middle East and North Africa, with gender as one of five strategic priorities for the Bank in the region and the completion of the major report on [*Women in the Public Sphere*](#) which was launched at the World Bank and IMF annual meetings. **Jaime Saavedra**, Sector Manager, from the Latin America and Caribbean

Region, discussed the labor market research planned in the region and other initiatives on gender-based violence and the challenges faced by indigenous women.

Following the presentations, the EGCG members made recommendations for future directions for the Bank's work, based on progress already made in implementing the gender strategy. They called for the Bank to promote gender equality more proactively in member countries. In particular, they stressed that the Bank, with its resources and access to global good practices, is in a unique position to facilitate change. The EGCG members identified cultural and religious impediments to gender equality as one set of issues where the Bank needs to be more involved and up front in its support for change. They also identified family law and domestic violence issues as areas where more work needs to be done, especially in identifying indicators and collecting qualitative and quantitative data.

Key points from the session include:

- Need for assessment of the impact of CGAs on CASs, and eventually assessment of impact on the ground;
- Bank-wide monitoring exercises need to better capture the full range of work done by the Bank, which is often captured in country-specific and regional reports;
- Need for the Bank to play a more proactive role in pushing change on cultural and religious issues, family law and gender-based violence;
- Need for the Bank to help prepare indicators and collect data on the developmental impact of those issues; and
- The gender mainstreaming approach ties gender-related work to the priorities of the Bank and its development agenda.

3. Changing Environment for Gender Mainstreaming in the World Bank

On November 18, the EGCG members met with **Gobind Nankani**, Vice-President, PREM. Mr. Nankani thanked the EGCG for their guidance during the drafting of the Bank's gender mainstreaming strategy. He said that the Bank had come a long way since the strategy was adopted in September 2001. The experience of other similar organizations, such as the Canadian International Development Agency, which took more than 10 years to mainstream gender in all its work, was humbling. In that context, the Bank's progress to date is encouraging.

Mona Zulficar agreed that the Bank had come a long way in promoting gender issues, particularly by adopting the gender strategy and a new operational policy on gender (OP/BP 4.20). But she stressed that more work needed to be done to change the Bank's corporate culture on gender equality and increase resource commitments for gender-related work. Reflecting on Mr. Wolfensohn's comment that it takes ten years to develop a corporate culture, Ms. Zulficar said that individual personalities and institutional culture sometimes impeded the work on gender equality in the Bank. She suggested creating more incentives for staff to do gender-responsive work, such as promotions and monetary rewards. Ms. Zulficar also suggested increasing targeted funding for gender-related work along the lines of the Norwegian–Dutch Trust Fund for Gender Mainstreaming (GENFUND). **Rosalba Todaro**, Researcher at the Women's Studies Center, Santiago, Chile, recommended that the Bank undertake a gender-based analysis of its own budget,

similar to the work done by UNDP. She suggested putting in place monitoring procedures and perhaps conducting a gender-based benefit-incidence analysis of the Bank's budget.

Several of the EGCG members also suggested that the Bank undertake a new initiative on gender-based violence. This work could involve looking at all facets of violence, including domestic violence, institutionalized violence, and especially how different forms of violence impede development. Ms. Zulficar suggested that such an initiative might give gender equality in the Bank's work a much needed "boost." **Elizabeth Mary Okelo**, Executive Director, Makini Schools and Makini College, Kenya, noted that there was sufficient evidence on the high cost of violence on development, especially when considering the relationship between violence, HIV/AIDS, and development. **Rokeya Kabir**, Executive Director, Bangladesh Nari Progati Sangha, suggested looking at power relations beneath the incidence of violence. Ms. Mason responded that the World Bank is already discussing increasing its engagement in work on gender-based violence and noted that Mr. Wolfensohn has a strong interest in the Bank becoming more involved in this area.

The EGCG members also commented on how the Bank can address partnership issues with NGOs and civil society organizations. They stated that the Bank's current mechanisms for partnership with civil society were inadequate, especially partnering and consulting with groups working on gender issues. In particular, they suggested that there needs to be a more involved and engendered civil society mechanism at every country office and stressed that the EGCG members could help improve the Bank's partnerships with civil society groups in their respective countries of residence.

Mr. Nankani responded that the Bank's main clients are governments, but that the environment is changing and the Bank is increasingly engaging with civil society. Recently, the Bank and CIVICUS convened the Joint Facilitation Committee (JFC), which consists of participants from 14 networks of civil society organizations (CSOs) and the Bank's senior management. The JFC agreed to undertake a number of tasks, including an assessment of how civil society interactions have influenced the Bank's development, as well as building capacity of CSOs, particularly in developing and transition countries, for more effective engagement with the Bank. Mr. Nankani said that the EGCG's concerns could be addressed through the work of the JFC.

Ms. Zulficar reiterated the suggestion EGCG members made at the sixth meeting for a World Development Report (WDR) focused on gender inequality. She suggested the WDR could address gender within the wider issue of social discrimination.

Suzanne Kindervatter emphasized that a stand-alone WDR on gender would be an important statement by the Bank. Ms. Mason suggested that the timing may not be ripe for a stand-alone WDR, but there may be an opportunity to partner with the Bank's social development unit on a WDR on social institutions. Instead of a WDR or another Policy Research Report, Mr. Nankani suggested a Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) flagship paper, which would involve country teams, and elaborate on the findings reported in *Engendering Development*.

Key points from the session:

- It would be advisable for the Bank to put in place incentives to change corporate culture to facilitate gender mainstreaming;
- Resources need to match the commitment made in the Bank's gender strategy;
- The Bank could undertake a new initiative in 2004 on gender-based violence, culminating in an international conference. This initiative would give gender work in the Bank a boost; and
- The Bank needs to expand partnerships with civil society groups to include women's groups and better reflect gender concerns.

4. Recent and Planned Initiatives on Gender and Development in the World Bank

On November 18 2003, the EGCG members also discussed recent and planned initiatives on gender and development in the World Bank. **Richard E. Messick**, Senior Public Sector Specialist, made a presentation on the forthcoming World Development Report (WDR) on Investment Climate, Growth and Poverty, which will be released in September 2004. The WDR will have three parts. The first covers those actions governments can take to shape the incentives of firms and businesses. The second part addresses the set of standard and traditional reforms, such as taxation and regulation, without which it is difficult for firms to go forward. The last part covers the political economy of reform, going beyond property rights issues. Following the presentation, Mr. Messick solicited comments from EGCG members and specifically asked for examples, data, and anecdotes that could be used in the report.

Mona Zulficar suggested that in addition to property rights and inheritance rights, the WDR could consider the need for women to access different forms of credit. **Naila Kabeer**, Professor at the Institute for Development Studies (University of Sussex), UK, shared the results of a study which found that countries that perform well on corporate governance and other aspects favorable for the investment climate, often fare poorly on gender equality. She wondered if the WDR could tackle this discrepancy, as well as the question of how to encourage businesses to invest but not at the expense of rights. **Rosalba Todaro** and **Rokeya Kabir** also highlighted the need to look at women's participation in the informal sector and its implication for the investment climate. Mr. Messick welcomed the EGCG members' suggestions and also noted that several of them were already being considered in the WDR. He also welcomed the EGCG's offer to be a resource group to comment on different drafts of the WDR.

Nayantara Mukerji, Economist with the PREM Gender and Development Group, made a presentation on the gender and economic policy initiative, an outgrowth of the research commissioned for the report *Engendering Development*. The initiative involves analysis of the gender impacts of economic policies targeted towards World Bank economists and task managers. It focuses on five areas: trade; public expenditure; administrative and civil service reform; labor markets; pensions; and safety nets. **Suzanne Kindervatter** asked why investment climate issues were not included in the initiative. Ms. Mukerji responded that the initiative started three years ago when investment climate assessments were not one of the pillars of Bank's work. **Rosalba Todaro** suggested commissioning work on the social cost of motherhood similar to work done by the ILO. And **Naila Kabeer** recommended a paper comparing women's labor force participation in garment and non-

garment industries in Bangladesh. She also suggested looking at the temporary nature of jobs in the female-dominated sectors.

A. Waafas Ofosu-Amaah, Senior Gender Specialist in the PREM Gender and Development Group, made a presentation on the new initiative on gender and governance and asked for comments on the initiative's draft framework. According to the framework, the Bank's efforts in the area of governance and gender will focus on the areas of legal and judicial reform, public expenditure analysis, and decentralization. The EGCG members commented on the proposed framework. **Rosalba Todaro** endorsed the emphasis on decentralization. She stated that the UN Economic Commission in the Latin American and Caribbean region (ECLAC) was undertaking a project on gender and governance which may be useful to the World Bank. **Naila Kabeer** suggested that the World Bank should look at a study that was recently completed on the wider social impact of microfinance. She also stated that good data on women's political participation are available from South Asia. **Mona Zulficar** suggested that legal and judicial reform and other aspects of gender and governance deserve special attention, perhaps as a special initiative in the next fiscal year.

The EGCG members welcomed the gender action plan for the World Bank Institute, presented by **Gita Gopal**, the World Bank Institute's first gender coordinator. Ms. Gopal said that the WBI's gender objective is to build knowledge and capacity for achievement of the gender equality MDG. The gender action plan is built on a rapid assessment of gender mainstreaming within WBI, and it consists of three components: (i) Mainstreaming Gender into WBI; (ii) Mainstreaming Gender in Client Countries; and (iii) Collaboration with Other Development Partners for Gender Mainstreaming.

Over lunch, EGCG members met **Shengman Zhang**, Managing Director of the World Bank, **Jamal-ud-din Kassum**, Vice President of the World Bank for East Asia and Pacific, and representatives from other regions. Issues discussed included the violence agenda and possible gender violence conference; ways to gain acceptance of special initiatives in the Bank; the possibility of a gender WDR; incentives to ensure staff focus on gender issues; the need to ensure that Bank staff working on civil society work closely with women's groups, and the possibility of having regional Gender Consultative Groups based on the MNA model.

A meeting the previous day with World Bank President **James Wolfensohn** also covered the issues of gender violence (where Mr. Wolfensohn gave his support to a gender violence initiative) and relations with civil society.

5. Final Recommendations

The EGCG members discussed a number of points during their meeting that may be raised as recommendations in their letters to Mr. Wolfensohn and Mr. Nankani. The suggestions included:

i) Improve the Bank's Institutional Environment for Gender Mainstreaming

- Accountability mechanisms for gender mainstreaming remain weak and need to be strengthened. There is a need for clearer incentives for operational staff to mainstream gender and more resources to support them doing so. EGCG members suggested that awards for best projects only be given to projects that are engendered.

- Senior management needs to push gender mainstreaming more continuously and forcefully, and there is a need for more staff in the regions to assist with gender mainstreaming and monitoring thereof, and these staff need to have larger budgets to support their work.
- EGCG members suggested that sensitivity to gender and development issues be a criterion for selecting Country Directors/Managers and Bank-wide batch recruitment processes such as the Young Professional Program (YP).

ii) Launch New Initiatives:

- EGCG members suggested that the Bank should focus on gender-based violence of all kinds, identifying its costs to development and the reasons it exists. In particular, an initiative on gender-based violence should be linked to the MDGs.
- EGCG members recommended that there be a WDR on gender, poverty and development.

iii) Strengthen Partnerships with NGOs and Civil Society:

- The Bank should have a gender-sensitive NGO interface mechanism in every client country. The EGCG recognized that many Bank offices have NGO liaisons, but felt that they often do not liaise with women's groups, who should be consulted on all Bank products.
- EGCG members recommended that there be a link between the country level NGO mechanism and the EGCG, and that there be regional consultations on gender issues, even if there is no standing regional consultative group. They would like EGCG members to be invited to Bank regional consultations.
- EGCG members suggested that mutual capacity building between NGOs and the Bank could be one focus for Bank-NGO interaction.

iv) Clarify EGCG's Terms Of Reference:

- The EGCG members suggested that the group's TORs should be clarified. They felt the EGCG should have a minimum of 11 members, two each from AFR, LAC, SAR, EAP and ECA, one from MNA, and one from Washington DC. There should be rotation of members among different countries in each region.
- The members should represent different disciplines, members should have international exposure – they should be able to operate beyond a strictly local context.
- All members should have expertise and a track record on promoting gender equality; the length of a term should be three years.
- One third of EGCG members should rotate per year. During the transitional period, three of the current members should remain to provide continuity.
- New members could be appointed through a consultative process in which both the Bank and the EGCG nominate individuals, EGCG members interview/review candidates and recommend to the Bank whom to appoint.
- There should be annual meetings of the EGCG. The Bank should cover business class travel and per diem.
- EGCG members should be invited to all regional consultations or country consultations.

Annex 1: Agenda

Seventh Meeting of the External Gender Consultative Group

November 17-18, 2003

Sunday, November 16

EGCG members arrive

Monday, November 17

Venue: MC2-850

- 8:30 – 9:00 **Continental Breakfast**
- 9:00 - 9:30 **Welcome & Expectations for the Seventh EGCG Meeting**
Karen Mason, Director, Gender and Development
Mona Zulficar, EGCG
- 9:30 – 10:30 **Progress in Implementing the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy**
Discussion with *Karen Mason, Director Gender and Development*, and
Representatives from the World Bank's *Gender and Development Board*
Questions for Discussion:
- *What are the areas of progress and the challenges for the World Bank in mainstreaming gender?*
 - *Looking ahead: what are the strategic areas for gender mainstreaming, what aspects of gender mainstreaming need to be strengthened, and what are research gaps that the World Bank should try to fill?*
- 10:30 – 11:00 **Break**
- 11:00 – 12:00 **Continued Discussion on Progress in Implementing the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy**
- 12:00 – 2:00 **Working Lunch and Internal EGCG Meeting**
Venue: World Bank Main Complex, Private Dining Room G
- 2:00 – 3:00 **Internal EGCG meeting continued**
Venue: MC11-N300
- 3:00 – 3:30 **Discussion with Carolyn Long, Women's Edge**
- 3:30 – 5:00 **Internal EGCG meeting continued**
- 5:00 – 5:30 **Meeting with James D. Wolfensohn, President, World Bank**
Venue: MC 12-755
- 7:00 Dinner hosted by Karen Mason
2555 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, Apt #702

Tuesday, November 18

Venue: MC7-W150

- 8:30 – 9:00 **Continental Breakfast**
- 9:00 – 10:00 **Discussion with Gobind Nankani, Vice President, Poverty Reduction and Economic Management**

Chair: *Karen Mason*, Director, Gender and Development

Questions for Discussion:

- *How can the EGCG's contribution be most effective given the changing environment for gender mainstreaming in the World Bank, in particular the country-focused nature of the World Bank's gender mainstreaming strategy?*
- *What are the main issues regarding the World Bank's work on gender, as seen by the NGO and Civil Society community? How can the World Bank best address these?*

10:00 – 10:30

Break

10:30 – 12:45

Discussion on Recent and Planned Initiatives on Gender & Development

- World Development Report 2005: Investment Climate for Growth and Poverty Reduction
Richard E. Messick, Senior Public Sector Specialist, World Development Report
- Gender and Economic Policy Initiative: Accomplishments and Future Directions
Nayantara Mukerji, Economist

Discussion with EGCG on targets for World Bank research on gender and development

- The World Bank Institute: Gender and Development Initiatives
Gita Gopal, Lead Specialist
- Gender and Governance Initiative
Waafas Ofosu-Amaah, Gender Specialist

Discussion

Chair: *Rosalba Todaro*, EGCG

1:00 – 2:30

**Luncheon with Regional Vice Presidents
Hosted by *Shengman Zhang*, Managing Director**

Venue: World Bank Main Complex, Private Dining Room D & E

3:00 – 5:00

EGCG Recommendations, Feedback and General Discussion

Questions for Discussion:

- *Looking ahead, in which strategic areas does the EGCG see the most potential and need for gender mainstreaming; how can gender issues be integrated into sectors beyond health and education?*
- *In terms of training, which ministries and government officials should the World Bank target when conducting training on gender and development; which topics should be covered in such training?*

Chair: *Karen Mason*, Director, Gender and Development

Wednesday & Thursday, November 19-20

Workshop: Gender Equality and the Millennium Development Goals

Annex 2: List of EGCG Members Attending the 7th EGCG Meeting

Naila Kabeer

Institute for Development Studies, University of Sussex, United Kingdom

Rokeya Kabir

Executive Director, Bangladesh Nari Progati Sangha, Bangladesh

Suzanne Kindervatter

Director, Commission on the Advancement of Women, InterAction, USA

Elizabeth Mary Okelo

Executive Director, Makini Schools and Makini College, Kenya

Rosalba Todaro

Researcher, Women's Studies Center, Santiago, Chile

Mona Zulficar

Senior Partner and Chairperson Executive Committee, Shalakany Law Office, Egypt

WB202669

N:\EGCG\EGCG 2003\EGCG report_12-19-2003.doc

January 22, 2004 6:00 PM