

Report No. 37820

Crime, Violence, and Development: Trends, Costs, and Policy Options in the Caribbean

March 2007

A Joint Report by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime and the Latin America and the Caribbean Region of the World Bank



ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ADR	Alternative Dispute Resolution
CEM	Country Economic Memorandum
CFATF	Caribbean Financial Action Task Force
CGNAA	COSAT Guard for the Netherlands Antilles and Aruba
CONANI	Consejo Nacional de la Niñez
CPI	Corruption Perceptions Index
CPTED	Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design
CTS	Crime Trends Surveys – United Nations
DALYs	Disability-Adjusted Life Years
DHS	Department of Homeland Security
EBA	Educación Básica para Adultos y Jóvenes
ECLAC	Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
ENHOGAR	Encuesta Nacional de Hogares de Propósitos Múltiples
EU/LAC	European Union/Latin American and the Caribbean
FARC	Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
ICS	Investment Climate Survey
ICVS	International Crime Victims Survey
LAC	Latin America and Caribbean
OECS	Organization of Eastern Caribbean States
PATH	Program for Appropriate Technology in Health
RNN	Royal Navy of the Netherlands
RSS	Regional Security System
RTFCS	Regional Task Force on Crime and Security
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
WDR	World Development Report
WHO	World Health Organization

Vice President: Pamela Cox
Country Director: Caroline Anstey
PREM Director: Ernesto May
Sector Manager: Jaime Saavedra Chanduvi
Lead Economist: Antonella Bassani
Task Managers: Andrew R. Morrison
Bernice Van Bronkhorst
Gabriel Demombynes
Theodore Leggett (UNODC)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface _____	
Acknowledgments	
Executive Summary _____	ii
Chapter 1. Conventional Crime: an Overview _____	1
The Diversity of the Caribbean _____	2
How to Measure Crime? _____	4
Homicide and Assault _____	7
Violence Against Women _____	12
Property Crime _____	13
Chapter 2. Organized Crime _____	15
Drug Trafficking _____	15
Other Forms of Organized Crime: Kidnapping, Money Laundering, Corruption _____	21
Chapter 3. Risk Factors for Crime and Violence _____	26
Conceptual Foundations of Risk Factors for Crime and Violence _____	26
Macro Analysis of Risk Factors for Crime in the World and the Caribbean _____	27
Risk Factors for Crime at the Household Level: Evidence from Three Caribbean Countries _____	34
Policy Implications _____	40
Chapter 4. Socioeconomic Costs of Crime _____	41
Approaches to Measuring the Costs of Crime and Violence _____	42
Specific Costs of Crime _____	43
Total Costs: Estimates Using an Accounting Approach _____	50
Disability-Adjusted Life Years Lost to Violence _____	53
The Impact of Victimization on Self-Reported Life Satisfaction _____	56
The Impact of Violent Crime on Economic Growth _____	57
Policy Implications _____	59
Chapter 5. Youth Violence in the Caribbean: A Case Study of the Dominican Republic _____	61
Scope of Youth Crime and Violence _____	62
Factors Contributing to Youth Violence _____	67
Policy Recommendations for Strengthening the Response to Youth Violence _____	73
Conclusions _____	79
Chapter 6. Case Study: Criminal Deportations and Jamaica _____	81
The Scale of the Expatriate Population _____	83
Criminal Deportation _____	84
Policy Implications _____	91
Chapter 7. Case Study: Drug Trafficking and the Netherlands Antilles _____	93
Drug Trafficking on Commercial Air Flights: an Innovative Policy Response _____	96
Maritime Trafficking _____	101
Policy Implications _____	102

Chapter 8. The Contributions of Criminal Justice Systems to the Control of Crime and Violence: A Case Study of Jamaica and the Dominican Republic	105
Introduction: Criminal Justice Reform in Civil and Common Law System	105
Country Cases: Two Approaches to Criminal Justice Reform	108
A Quantitative Evaluation of System Performance: Performance Statistics and Indicators	112
Measuring the System's Workload: Reported Offenses	113
Institutional Performance Measures	114
Impact Indicators: Using Crime and Arrest Data for Crime Prevention	122
Conclusion: From Organizational Reform and Performance Measurement to Interagency Governance	126
Chapter 9. Guns and Crime: A Case Study of Trinidad and Tobago	128
Sources	130
Registration of Firearms and Seizures of Illegal Weapons	131
Demand	132
Victims, Perpetrators and their Environment	132
Drug Trafficking and Gun-Related Criminality	133
Policy Implications	136
Chapter 10. Public Policy of Crime and Violence Prevention: Regional and National Approaches	141
Sectoral and Cross-Sectoral Approaches	141
Regional Initiatives to Address Crime and Violence	145
Priority Steps to Achieve Reductions in Crime and Violence in the Caribbean	149
References	141
Annexes	175

FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Ranking of Caribbean Countries in the Human Development Index	3
Figure 1.2: Population Distribution of the Independent Caribbean	3
Figure 1.3: Murder Rates by Region	4
Figure 1.4: Murders per 100,000 Population by Year, Anguilla	6
Figure 1.5: Number of Murders in Guyana, Police and Public Health Sources	7
Figure 1.6: Deaths Rates from Violence in Caribbean and Comparison Countries	9
Figure 1.7: Homicides per 100,000 in Guyana and Jamaica	10
Figure 1.8: Homicides Rates in the Dominican Republic, St. Lucia and Trinidad and Tobago: 1999-2005	11
Figure 1.9: Assault Rates in Caribbean and Comparison Countries	11
Figure 1.10: Rape Rates in Caribbean and Comparison Countries	12
Figure 2.1: Cannabis Eradication in Jamaica	17
Figure 2.2: Shares of Cocaine Flowing to the United States by Transport Corridors	17
Figure 2.3: Origin of Heroin Seized in the United States	19
Figure 2.4: Kidnappings per 100,000 Population in Trinidad and Tobago	23
Figure 3.1: Ecological Model for Understanding Crime and Violence	27
Figure 3.2: Cross-Country Correlates of Crime	29
Figure 3.3: Robbery Rates vs. Mean Consumption by Neighborhood	36
Figure 3.4: Distribution of Victimization by Crime and Quintile in Haiti	37

Figure 4.1: Responses to Fear of Crime in Dominican Republic -What Do People Stop Doing Due to Fear? -----	44
Figure 4.2: Responses to Fear of Crime in Haiti: Where Do People Stop Going Due to Fear? -----	45
Figure 4.3: Impact of Crime on Various Business Practices in Jamaica -----	47
Figure 4.4: Crime Protection Measures Taken by Firms in Jamaica -----	48
Figure 4.5: Private Security Costs for Firms by Size of Enterprise as Percentage of Firm Revenue in Jamaica-----	49
Figure 4.6: Crime Protection Measures Taken by Firms in the Dominican Republic -----	49
Figure 4.7: Impact of Higher Crime on Businesses in the Dominican Republic -----	50
Figure 4.8: How Reliable is WHO Homicide Information for the Caribbean? Homicide Rates According to WHO vs. Official Sources Homicide Deaths per 100,000 Population -----	54
Figure 4.9: Disability-Adjusted Life Years Lost to Violence in the Caribbean, 2002-----	55
Figure 4.10: Disability-Adjusted Life Years Lost to Violence vs. Other Causes Caribbean 2002 -----	55
Figure 4.11 Potential Boost to Annual Economic Growth Rate from Reducing Homicide Rate to Costa Rica Level-----	59
Figure 5.1: Homicide Deaths by Age (10-29) in the Dominican Republic (2000-2005)-----	65
Figure 5.2: Trends of Minor Arrest over Past Decade in the Dominican Republic-----	66
Figure 6.1: Number of Deportees and Number of Murders in Jamaica -----	82
Figure 6.2: Caribbean-Born Populations in the United States-----	84
Figure 6.3: Total Criminal Deportations from the U.S. to the Caribbean-----	85
Figure 6.4: Criminal Deportees from the U.S. per 100,000 Population of Home Country -----	86
Figure 6.5: Total Criminal Deportations to Jamaica: 1998-2004 -----	86
Figure 6.6: Drug Deportations to Jamaica from the United States and the United Kingdom -----	87
Figure 6.7: Breakdown of Criminal Deportees by Crime Type, All Three Source Countries, 2001-2004 --	88
Figure 6.8: Age on Arrival in the U.S. of Jamaican Criminal Deportees (Percent of Headley's Sample) -	889
Figure 6.9: Age on Deportation from the U.S. of Jamaican Criminal Deportees (Percent of Headley's Sample) -----	90
Figure 7.1: Kilograms of Cocaine Seized in Caribbean Territories in 2004-----	95
Figure 7.2: Kilos of Cocaine Seized in the Netherlands Antilles, 1980-2004 -----	96
Figure 7.3: Couriers Detected arriving at Schiphol from Curacao, by quarter -----	99
Figure 7.4: Cocaine Seizures in Trinidad and Tobago -----	103
Figure 8.1: Sentenced and Unsented Prison Inmates, Dominican Republic, May 2003 to May 2006 -	119
Figure 8.2: Prison Deaths, Escapes, and Recaptures, Dominican Republic -----	120
Figure 8.3: Unnatural Deaths and Violent Incidents in Jamaican Prisons, 2000-2005-----	121
Figure 9.1: Distribution of Injury Deaths by Type of Injury: Trinidad and Tobago, 1999-2003 -----	129
Figure 9.2: Police Reports of Narcotics Possession and Murders, and Certified Firearm Homicides: Trinidad and Tobago, 1992-2005-----	133

BOXES

Box 1.1 Crime Definitions-----	5
Box 2.1: Financial Fraud in the Dominican Republic – The Baninter Case -----	25
Box 3.1: Haiti's Entrepreneurs of Violence -----	38
Box 5.1: The Sophisticated Extortion of Santo Domingo Gangs and Drug Lords-----	67
Box 8.1: Using Crime Data and Analysis to Formulate a Multi-Sectoral Crime Prevention Strategy: The Barrio Seguro Program in Capotillo -----	124
Box 9.1: Young Men, Drugs, and Guns-----	136
Box 9.2: UN Resolution and Plan of Action on Small Arms and Light Weapons-----	139
Box 9.3: Gun Buybacks -----	140
Box 10.1. Crime and Violence Prevention Components in Bank-Financed Integrated Slum Upgrading Operations – Jamaica Inner Cities Basic Services for the Poor Project-----	146
Box 10.2. The Pride in Gonzales Initiative, Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago: A Community-Driven Social Development Approach-----	147
Box 10.3. The Need for Better Data on Crime -----	151

TABLES

Table 2.1: Highest Total Annual Cocaine Seizure, 1998-2004-----	21
Table 3.1: Cross-Country Analysis - Basic Regression Results-----	32
Table 3.2: Summary of Micro-Analysis of Risk Factors for Criminal Victimization -----	35
Table 4.1: Effects of Lifetime Physical Violence by Intimate Partner in Haiti -----	46
Table 4.2: The Costs of Crime in Jamaica: an Accounting Exercise -----	52
Table 4.3: Cross-Country Regression Estimate of the Effect of Violent Crime on Economic Growth -----	58
Table 5.1 Youth as Victims: Homicide Rates in Select Countries-----	64
Table 5.2: Highlights of Youth in Numbers in Latin America and the Caribbean-----	69
Table 5.3: Violence Prevention Strategies by Developmental Stage and Ecological Context -----	76
Table 8.1: Homicide Clearance Rates in Jamaica by “Murder Motive,” 2005 and 2006 -----	115
Table 9.1: Murders Committed in Trinidad and Tobago Using a Firearm, 2001-2006 -----	129
Table 9.2: Woundings Committed in Trinidad and Tobago Utilizing a Firearm, 2000-2005 -----	130
Table 9.3: Firearm Seizures in Trinidad and Tobago-----	132
Table 9.4: Modified Haddon Matrix Applied to the Analysis of Gun-Related Criminality (GRC) -----	135
Table 9.5. Possible Interventions Specific to Guns and Criminality-----	138
Table 10.1. Public Policy Approaches and Interventions to Address Urban Violence-----	144

ANNEXES

Annex 1.1. Caribbean Leaders on Crime-----	175
Annex 1.2. Tourism and the Caribbean Economy -----	175
Annex 1.3. Emigration and Crime -----	175
Annex 1.4. Caribbean Police Forces and Prison Populations-----	176
Annex 2.1. The Jamaica Cannabis Trade -----	177
Annex 2.2. Patterns of Drug Transshipment by Organized Criminal Groups -----	177
Annex 2.3. Dates of large Seizures of Cocaine Entering Canada from Caribbean Countries 2004 -----	178
Annex 2.4. Organized Crime in Jamaica and the Dominican Republic -----	178
Annex 2.5. Jamaat-al-Muslimeen in Trinidad and Tobago -----	179
Annex 3.1. Caribbean Homicide Data Sources-----	179
Annex 4.1. Impact of Crime Victimization on Satisfaction with Life-----	184
Annex 5.1. Risk Factors and Policy Responses to Youth Violence in the Dominican Republic-----	185
Annex 5.2. Inventory of Governmental Initiatives for Youth Violence Prevention in the Dominican Republic-----	188
Annex 5.3. Inventory of Civil Society Initiatives for Youth Violence Prevention in the Dominican Republic-----	193
Annex 6.1. Criminal Deportations to Jamaica by Year, Offence, and Sending Country-----	199

PREFACE

This report is the result of a fruitful collaboration between the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and the World Bank. It addresses the issue of crime and violence in the Caribbean, a complex problem that prejudices both the social and economic development of the region.

The Governments of the Caribbean countries recognize the seriousness of the problem and are exploring innovative policy responses at both the national and regional levels. Civil society organizations are doing their part as well by designing and implementing violence prevention programs targeting youth violence, violence against women, and other important forms of violence.

Much, however, remains to be done. Some of the factors that make the Caribbean most vulnerable to crime and violence—the drug trade and trafficking of weapons are two important examples—require a response that transcends national and even regional boundaries. Also, promising initiatives at the national level must be evaluated for effectiveness so that scarce resources can be efficiently invested.

This report is offered as a contribution to the ongoing dialogue in the region on approaches to address crime and violence. It is not intended to provide a definitive blueprint for action, but rather is offered as a tool to engage stakeholders—governments, civil society organizations, citizens, and international partners—in a serious dialogue on crime and violence, based on evidence and good practices from inside and outside the region.

Francis Maertens
Director, Division for Policy
Analysis and Public Affairs
UNODC

Caroline Anstey
Country Director for the Caribbean
World Bank

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This report is a joint product of the United National Office of Drugs and Crime (UNODC) and the World Bank. The multisectoral team was led by Theodore Leggett (UNODC), Bernice van Bronkhorst (LCSFU), Gabriel Demombynes (LCSPP), and Andrew Morrison (PRMGE). Individual chapters were prepared by Mr. Leggett (overview chapters, criminal deportees in Jamaica, narcotics trafficking in the Netherlands Antilles), Mr. Demombynes (risk factors and costs), Linda McGinnis and Peter Holland (HDNCY: youth in the Dominican Republic), and Ms. van Bronkhorst and Mr. Morrison (public policy). The criminal justice chapter was written by Linn Hammergren (LCSPS) and Stephanie Ann Kuttner (SDV), based on a background paper on criminal justice prepared by Todd Foglesong (Vera Institute of Justice) and Christopher Stone (Harvard University). The firearms chapter was written by Bernice van Bronkhorst, Andrew Morrison, and Theodore Leggett, based on a background paper prepared by Yvette Holder (independent consultant) and Folade Mutota (Women's Institute for Alternative Development, Trinidad and Tobago). The team benefited from significant contributions from Ana Maria Diaz (LCSPP) and Mariel Fiat (LCCDO), as well as the excellent assistance of Ane Perez Orsi de Castro (LCSPP) in the preparation of the final report. The team would also like to thank the following individuals for their contributions: Lisa Bhansali, Teresa Genta-Fons, Lillian Mallet Crawford Abbensetts, Willy Egset, Dorte Verner, and Christina Malmberg Calvo.

The team is very grateful for the work and insightful comments of its External Advisory Committee, chaired by Professor Anthony Harriott (Professor, University of the West Indies-Mona, Jamaica) and comprised of Dr. Franklin Almeyda (Minister of the Interior and Police, Dominican Republic), Mr. George de Peana (General Secretary, Caribbean Congress of Labor, Barbados), Professor Ramesh Deosaran (Director, Center for Criminology and Criminal Justice, University of the West Indies-St. Augustine, Trinidad and Tobago), Dr. Len Ishmael (Director General, OECS Secretariat, St. Lucia), Colonel Trevor MacMillan (Chairman, Standing Committee on National Security of the Private Sector Organization of Jamaica), the Honorable Dale D. Marshall (Attorney General, Barbados), and the Honorable Gail Teixeira (Special Advisor to the President and Director, Governance Unit, Office of the Presidency, Guyana).

This task was guided and supervised by Jaime Saavedra (Sector Manager, LCSPP) and Antonella Bassani (Lead Economist, LCSPP). The peer reviewers were Pablo Fajnzylber (LCSFR), Wendy Cunningham (LCSHS), and Anthony Harriott (University of the West Indies, Mona Campus).