Crying Out for Change

VOICES OF THE POOR
Crying Out for Change

Deepa Narayan
Robert Chambers
Meera K. Shah
Patti Petesch

Published by Oxford University Press for the World Bank
Dedication

We dedicate this book to
the more than 20,000 poor women, men, youth and children
who took the time to share their lives with us.
## Contents

**Foreword** ................................................................. xv

**Chapter 1: Perspectives of the Poor** ........................................ 1

  - Summary ................................................................. 1
  - Introduction ........................................................... 2
  - Origin of the Study ................................................... 3
  - The Study Process ..................................................... 3
    - An Evolving Framework ............................................. 4
    - Focus of the Study .................................................. 4
    - Country Selection .................................................. 5
    - Site Selection: Representativeness .............................. 6
  - Experiences in the Field .............................................. 8
    - The Pressure of Time ................................................ 8
    - Establishing Trust ................................................... 9
    - Unprepared to Deal with Loss, Grief and Anger ............... 10
  - Participatory Methods: What Worked and What Did Not ........ 11
  - Data Analyses .......................................................... 15
  - Ethics of Participatory Methods .................................... 16
  - Challenges in Writing This Book .................................... 18

**Chapter 2: Wellbeing and Illbeing: The Good and the Bad Life** ...... 21

  - Summary ................................................................. 21
  - Wellbeing Is Multidimensional ...................................... 22

**Part I. Wellbeing: The Good Life** ......................................... 22

  - How Poor People Put It ............................................... 22
  - Materially, Enough for a Good Life Is Not a Lot ............... 24
    - Material Wellbeing: Having Enough .............................. 25
    - Bodily Wellbeing: Being and Appearing Well ................ 26
  - Social Wellbeing ....................................................... 26
  - Security .......................................................................... 27
  - Freedom of Choice and Action ....................................... 28
  - Diversity by Context and Person .................................... 29
  - Wealth and Wellbeing Are Different ............................... 30

**Part II. Illbeing: The Bad Life** ............................................ 31

  - The Multidimensionality of Illbeing ................................ 31
    - Material Lack and Want ............................................ 31
Physical Illbeing ................................................. 34
Bad Social Relations: Exclusion, Rejection, Isolation and Loneliness .... 35
Insecurity, Vulnerability, Worry and Fear .................................. 36
Powerlessness, Helplessness, Frustration and Anger ......................... 36

Part III. Psychological Experience of Wellbeing and Illbeing ............. 37
The Experience of Wellbeing: Peace of Mind, Happiness and Harmony .... 37
The Experience of Illbeing: Humiliation, Shame, Anguish and Grief .......... 38
Humiliation, Shame and Stigma ........................................ 38
Anguish, Loss and Grief .............................................. 39
The Illbeing of Children ............................................... 42
Reflections .................................................................. 42

Chapter 3: The Struggle for Livelihoods ....................................... 46
Summary .................................................................. 46
Poor People's Priority ................................................... 46
Rural Livelihoods: Producing amid Scarcity ................................... 46
Access to Land ................................................................ 47
Diminishing Inputs and Returns ............................................ 48
Few Institutional Supports .................................................. 49
Common Property Resources under Stress .................................... 50
Migration and Remittances .................................................. 51
Diversified Livelihoods in Cities and Countryside ......................... 53
Getting Hired—Connections Needed ....................................... 54
Lawlessness on the Job ..................................................... 54
Seasonal Fluctuations ....................................................... 55
Money in Short Supply ..................................................... 56
Informal Credit .............................................................. 56
Formal Credit and Banks ................................................... 58
Livelihoods That Steal the Future ............................................ 59
Limited Opportunities ....................................................... 62
Where Life Is Better ......................................................... 63
Individual Breakthroughs .................................................... 64
The Challenge of Livelihoods ................................................ 68

Chapter 4: Places of the Poor .................................................. 71
Summary .................................................................. 71
Introduction ................................................................ 72
The Missing Basics ................................................................ 72
Water—Inadequate and Unsafe ................................................. 72
Isolation and Poor Access .................................................... 75
Chapter 5: The Body ......................................................... 89

Summary ................................................................. 89
Introduction ............................................................... 90
How the Body Looks and Feels ...................................... 90
  Physical Appearance .................................................. 91
  Hunger ........................................................................ 91
  Exhaustion: Poverty of Energy and Time ....................... 92
  Sickness of Body and Mind ......................................... 93
The Body as an Asset .................................................... 95
Body Blows: How Injury, Illness and Their Costs Impoverish ......................................................... 98
Troubles with Treatment .............................................. 100
  Lacking Physical Access and Medicines ....................... 101
  Time Spent ............................................................... 101
  Financial Costs ......................................................... 102
  The Behavior of Medical and Health Staff ..................... 103
  Poor Quality ............................................................. 104
Positive Experiences ................................................... 105
Private Treatment ....................................................... 107
The Challenge ........................................................... 107

Chapter 6: Gender Relations in Troubled Transition ............... 109

Summary ................................................................. 109
Introduction ............................................................... 110
Changing Gender Roles and Responsibilities ..................... 111
  Diversification of Women’s Work ................................. 111
  Increased Work Burden of Women ............................... 114
  Household Gender Roles: A Blurred Divide ................... 115
  Decisionmaking at the Household Level ....................... 116
Male Frustration, Anxiety and Sense of Inferiority .............. 118
Domestic Abuse and Violence ........................................ 119
Definitions of Domestic Abuse and Violence ...................... 120
Causes of Domestic Abuse and Violence ............................. 122
Changes in Levels of Domestic Violence ............................ 124
The Opportunity and Challenge ............................... 131

Chapter 7: Social Illbeing: Left Out and Pushed Down .............. 133
Summary ................................................................. 133
Introduction ............................................................ 134
Who Is Excluded? .................................................... 134
The Bottom Poor ...................................................... 135
The Basis of Social Exclusion ........................................ 136
The Stigma of Poverty ............................................... 136
Lack of Money and Power ............................................ 138
Ethnic, Linguistic, Racial and Cultural Isolation .................. 139
Physical, Mental and Health Disabilities ......................... 140
Behaviors outside Community Norms ............................ 141
Area Stigma ........................................................... 141
Self-Exclusion ......................................................... 142
The Exclusion of Women ............................................. 143
Changes in Social Cohesion ......................................... 145
Strained Social Relations and Reduced Collective Action ........ 146
What Brings People Together? ...................................... 147
The Opportunity and Challenge .................................... 149

Chapter 8: Anxiety, Fear and Insecurities ............................. 151
Summary ................................................................. 151
Introduction ............................................................ 152
What Does Security Mean to Poor People? ......................... 152
Trends and Patterns ................................................... 153
Regional Trends in Security ....................................... 154
Gender Differences ................................................... 154
Types of Insecurity ................................................... 155
Survival and Livelihoods ............................................. 156
Rural: Uncertain Returns to Farming .............................. 156
Urban: Insecure Work, No Bargaining Power .................... 157
Natural and Human-Made Disasters .............................. 158
Crime and Violence ................................................... 159
Persecution by Police and Lack of Justice ....................... 162
Chapter 9: The Character of Institutions .............................................. 179

Summary ................................................................. 179
Introduction .......................................................... 180
Quality of Relationships ......................................................
  Trust ................................................................. 181
  Participation ......................................................... 182
  Accountability ....................................................... 185
  Unity and Conflict Resolution ...........................................
Valued Behaviors ............................................................
  Respect .................................................................. 188
  Honesty and Fairness .................................................. 189
  Listening, Caring, Love and Compassion ......................... 190
  Hardworking Problem-Solvers ....................................... 191
Institutional Effectiveness ...................................................
  Timely, Responsive and Caring Support ............................ 192
  Access, Closeness and Contact ...................................... 193
In Search of Character .......................................................... 194

Chapter 10: Governance: Poor People's Scorecards ..................... 197

Summary ................................................................. 197
Introduction .......................................................... 198
Institutional Ratings ....................................................... 199
  Important Institutions ............................................... 199
  Effective Institutions ................................................ 200
  Ineffective Institutions .............................................. 200
Governance and Accountability of State Institutions .................. 200
  Accountable to Whom? .............................................. 203
  Lack of Responsiveness ............................................. 205
  The Power of Documents ............................................ 208
  Decentralized Governance: Municipalities, Councilors and Mayors
  Empowerment and Partnership ..................................... 211
Interactions with Private Enterprise ...................................... 214
  The Power of Industry .............................................. 214
  Shops and Moneylenders .......................................... 216
Governance and Accountability in Civil Society .............................................. 218
Community-Based Organizations ................................................................. 219
Local Leadership .............................................................................................. 220
Churches, Mosques, Temples, Shrines, Trees, Stones and Rivers .................. 222
Nongovernmental Organizations ........................................................................ 224
Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 232

Chapter 11: Powerless, Trapped in a Many-Stranded Web ......................... 235
Summary ............................................................................................................ 235
Trapped and Tied ............................................................................................... 236
Part I. Lack of Capabilities .............................................................................. 237
Lack of Information ........................................................................................... 237
  Telephones, Media and Information Technology ........................................ 239
Lack of Education ............................................................................................... 240
  The Strain of Costly and Distant Schools ................................................... 241
  Children's Labor Needed ............................................................................ 243
  Problems of Quality and Relevance ........................................................... 244
Lack of Skills .................................................................................................... 245
Low Self-Confidence and Self-Worth .............................................................. 246
Part 2. Keeping Poor People Powerless: The Many-Stranded Web ............ 247
The Many-Stranded Web ............................................................................... 248
Poor People's Descriptions of Linkages ......................................................... 250
Shocks, Stresses and Sequences ....................................................................... 252
Agonizing Choices ............................................................................................ 255
The Challenge of Powerlessness ...................................................................... 260

Chapter 12: A Call to Action: The Challenge to Change ......................... 263
Summary ............................................................................................................ 263
Introduction ...................................................................................................... 264
The Challenge to Reflect: The Meaning of Development ............................. 264
The Challenge of Power: Whose Voice Counts? ............................................. 265
The Agenda for Change .................................................................................... 266
1. From Material Poverty to Adequate Assets and Livelihoods .................... 267
2. From Isolation and Poor Infrastructure to Access and Services ............... 270
3. From Illness and Incapability to Health, Information ............................... 272
   and Education ............................................................................................ 272
4. From Unequal and Troubled Gender Relations to Equity .......................... 275
   and Harmony ............................................................................................. 275
5. From Fear and Lack of Protection to Peace and Security ...............278
6. From Exclusion and Impotence to Inclusion, Organization and Empowerment .........................................................281
7. From Corruption and Abuse to Honesty and Fair Treatment ..........284
The Challenge to Change .......................................................288

Appendix 1 — Acknowledgments ...........................................293
Appendix 2 — Study Countries and Sites .................................298
Appendix 3 — Overview of Study Themes and Methods ...............306
Appendix 4 — About the Authors ...........................................314
Foreword

This book is the second in a three-part series entitled Voices of the Poor. The series is based on an unprecedented effort to gather the views, experiences, and aspirations of more than 60,000 poor men and women from 60 countries. The work was undertaken for the World Development Report 2000/2001 on the theme of poverty and development.

Crying Out for Change brings together the voices of over 20,000 poor men and women from comparative fieldwork conducted in 1999 in 23 countries. The first volume in the series—Can Anyone Hear Us?—brings together the voices of over 40,000 poor people from 50 countries from studies conducted in the 1990s. The final volume, From Many Lands, highlights country case studies and regional patterns. The Voices of the Poor project is different from all other large-scale poverty studies. Using participatory and qualitative research methods, the study presents very directly, through poor people's own voices, the realities of their lives. How do poor people view poverty and wellbeing? What are their problems and priorities? What is their experience with the institutions of the state, markets, and civil society? How are gender relations faring within households and communities? We want to thank the project team led by Deepa Narayan of the Poverty Group in the World Bank, and particularly the country research teams, for undertaking this work.

What poor people share with us is sobering. A majority of them feel they are worse off and more insecure than in the past. Poor people care about many of the same things all of us care about: happiness, family, children, livelihood, peace, security, safety, dignity, and respect. Poor people's descriptions of encounters with a range of institutions call out for all of us to rethink our strategies. From the perspective of poor people, corruption, irrelevance, and abusive behavior often mar the formal institutions of the state. Nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), too, receive mixed ratings from the poor. Poor people would like NGOs to be accountable to them. Poor people's interactions with traders and markets are stamped with their powerlessness to negotiate fair prices. How then do poor people survive? They turn to their informal networks of family, kin, friends, and neighbors. But these are already stretched thin.

We commend to you the authenticity and significance of this work. What can be more important than listening to the poor and working with our partners all over the world to respond to their concerns? Our core mission is to help poor people succeed in their own efforts, and the book raises major challenges to both of our institutions and to all of us concerned about poverty. We are prepared to hold ourselves accountable, to make the effort to try to respond to these voices. Obviously we cannot do this alone. We urge you to
read this book, to reflect and respond. Our hope is that the voices in this book will call you to action as they have us.

CLARE SHORT, Secretary of State for International Development, U.K.

JAMES D. WOLFSOHN, President, World Bank
Poverty is like heat; you can not see it; you can only feel it; so to know poverty you have to go through it.

—A poor man, Adaboya, Ghana