

VOICES OF THE POOR

*Crying Out
for Change*

VOICES OF THE POOR

*Crying Out
for Change*

**Deepa Narayan
Robert Chambers
Meera K. Shah
Patti Petesch**



*Published by Oxford University Press
for the World Bank*

Oxford University Press

OXFORD NEW YORK ATHENS AUCKLAND BANGKOK
BOGOTA BUENOS AIRES CALCUTTA CAPE TOWN CHENNAI
DAR ES SALAAM DELHI FLORENCE HONG KONG ISTANBUL
KARACHI KUALA LUMPUR MADRID MELBOURNE MEXICO CITY
MUMBAI NAIROBI PARIS SÃO PAULO SINGAPORE TAIPEI
TOKYO TORONTO WARSAW

and associated companies in

BERLIN IBADAN

© 2000 The International Bank for Reconstruction
and Development / The World Bank
1818 H Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20433, USA

Published by Oxford University Press, Inc.
198 Madison Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10016

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Oxford University Press.

Manufactured in the United States of America
First printing August 2000
1 2 3 4 03 02 01 00

The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this study are entirely those of the authors and should not be attributed in any manner to the World Bank, to its affiliated organizations, or to members of its Board of Executive Directors or the countries they represent. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this volume do not imply on the part of the World Bank Group any judgment on the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Text printed on paper that conforms to the American National Standard for Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials, Z39.48-1984

Dedication

*We dedicate this book to
the more than 20,000 poor women, men, youth and children
who took the time to share their lives with us.*

Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	xv
Chapter 1: Perspectives of the Poor	1
Summary	1
Introduction	2
Origin of the Study	3
The Study Process	3
An Evolving Framework	4
Focus of the Study	4
Country Selection	5
Site Selection: Representativeness	6
Experiences in the Field	8
The Pressure of Time	8
Establishing Trust	9
Unprepared to Deal with Loss, Grief and Anger	10
Participatory Methods: What Worked and What Did Not	11
Data Analyses	15
Ethics of Participatory Methods	16
Challenges in Writing This Book	18
Chapter 2: Wellbeing and Illbeing: The Good and the Bad Life	21
Summary	21
Wellbeing Is Multidimensional	22
Part I. Wellbeing: The Good Life	22
How Poor People Put It	22
Materially, Enough for a Good Life Is Not a Lot	24
Material Wellbeing: Having Enough	25
Bodily Wellbeing: Being and Appearing Well	26
Social Wellbeing	26
Security	27
Freedom of Choice and Action	28
Diversity by Context and Person	29
Wealth and Wellbeing Are Different	30
Part II. Illbeing: The Bad Life	31
The Multidimensionality of Illbeing	31
Material Lack and Want	31

Physical Illbeing	34
Bad Social Relations: Exclusion, Rejection, Isolation and Loneliness . . .	35
Insecurity, Vulnerability, Worry and Fear	36
Powerlessness, Helplessness, Frustration and Anger	36
Part III. Psychological Experience of Wellbeing and Illbeing	37
The Experience of Wellbeing: Peace of Mind, Happiness and Harmony . . .	37
The Experience of Illbeing: Humiliation, Shame, Anguish and Grief	38
Humiliation, Shame and Stigma	38
Anguish, Loss and Grief	39
The Illbeing of Children	42
Reflections	42
Chapter 3: The Struggle for Livelihoods	46
Summary	46
Poor People's Priority	46
Rural Livelihoods: Producing amid Scarcity	46
Access to Land	47
Diminishing Inputs and Returns	48
Few Institutional Supports	49
Common Property Resources under Stress	50
Migration and Remittances	51
Diversified Livelihoods in Cities and Countryside	53
Getting Hired—Connections Needed	54
Lawlessness on the Job	54
Seasonal Fluctuations	55
Money in Short Supply	56
Informal Credit	56
Formal Credit and Banks	58
Livelihoods That Steal the Future	59
Limited Opportunities	62
Where Life Is Better	63
Individual Breakthroughs	64
The Challenge of Livelihoods	68
Chapter 4: Places of the Poor	71
Summary	71
Introduction	72
The Missing Basics	72
Water—Inadequate and Unsafe	72
Isolation and Poor Access	75

Bad Housing and Shelter78
Energy Scarcity78
No Sanitation—Filth and Stench80
The Politics of Infrastructure and Place81
Trapped in Poor Places84
Environmental Risks84
Seasonal Stress: Worst at Bad Times85
Insecurity and Stigma86
Catastrophic for Children87
The Challenge of Poor Places88
Chapter 5: The Body89
Summary89
Introduction90
How the Body Looks and Feels90
Physical Appearance91
Hunger91
Exhaustion: Poverty of Energy and Time92
Sickness of Body and Mind93
The Body as an Asset95
Body Blows: How Injury, Illness and Their Costs Impoverish98
Troubles with Treatment100
Lacking Physical Access and Medicines101
Time Spent101
Financial Costs102
The Behavior of Medical and Health Staff103
Poor Quality104
Positive Experiences105
Private Treatment107
The Challenge107
Chapter 6: Gender Relations in Troubled Transition109
Summary109
Introduction110
Changing Gender Roles and Responsibilities111
Diversification of Women’s Work111
Increased Work Burden of Women114
Household Gender Roles: A Blurred Divide115
Decisionmaking at the Household Level116

Male Frustration, Anxiety and Sense of Inferiority	118
Domestic Abuse and Violence	119
Definitions of Domestic Abuse and Violence	120
Causes of Domestic Abuse and Violence	122
Changes in Levels of Domestic Violence	124
The Opportunity and Challenge	131
Chapter 7: Social Illbeing: Left Out and Pushed Down	133
Summary	133
Introduction	134
Who Is Excluded?	134
The Bottom Poor	135
The Basis of Social Exclusion	136
The Stigma of Poverty	136
Lack of Money and Power	138
Ethnic, Linguistic, Racial and Cultural Isolation	139
Physical, Mental and Health Disabilities	140
Behaviors outside Community Norms	141
Area Stigma	141
Self-Exclusion	142
The Exclusion of Women	143
Changes in Social Cohesion	145
Strained Social Relations and Reduced Collective Action	146
What Brings People Together?	147
The Opportunity and Challenge	149
Chapter 8: Anxiety, Fear and Insecurities	151
Summary	151
Introduction	152
What Does Security Mean to Poor People?	152
Trends and Patterns	153
Regional Trends in Security	154
Gender Differences	154
Types of Insecurity	155
Survival and Livelihoods	156
Rural: Uncertain Returns to Farming	156
Urban: Insecure Work, No Bargaining Power	157
Natural and Human-Made Disasters	158
Crime and Violence	159
Persecution by Police and Lack of Justice	162

Civil Conflict and War	167
Macropolicy Stresses and Shocks	168
Social Vulnerability	171
Health, Illness and Death	175
In Search of Security	175
Chapter 9: The Character of Institutions	179
Summary	179
Introduction	180
Quality of Relationships	181
Trust	181
Participation	182
Accountability	185
Unity and Conflict Resolution	187
Valued Behaviors	188
Respect	189
Honesty and Fairness	189
Listening, Caring, Love and Compassion	190
Hardworking Problem-Solvers	191
Institutional Effectiveness	191
Timely, Responsive and Caring Support	192
Access, Closeness and Contact	193
In Search of Character	194
Chapter 10: Governance: Poor People's Scorecards	197
Summary	197
Introduction	198
Institutional Ratings	199
Important Institutions	199
Effective Institutions	200
Ineffective Institutions	200
Governance and Accountability of State Institutions	200
Accountable to Whom?	203
Lack of Responsiveness	205
The Power of Documents	208
Decentralized Governance: Municipalities, Councilors and Mayors	209
Empowerment and Partnership	211
Interactions with Private Enterprise	214
The Power of Industry	214
Shops and Moneylenders	216

Governance and Accountability in Civil Society	218
Community-Based Organizations	219
Local Leadership	220
Churches, Mosques, Temples, Shrines, Trees, Stones and Rivers	222
Nongovernmental Organizations	224
Conclusion	232
Chapter 11: Powerless, Trapped in a Many-Stranded Web	235
Summary	235
Trapped and Tied	236
Part I. Lack of Capabilities	237
Lack of Information	237
Telephones, Media and Information Technology	239
Lack of Education	240
The Strain of Costly and Distant Schools	241
Children's Labor Needed	243
Problems of Quality and Relevance	244
Lack of Skills	245
Low Self-Confidence and Self-Worth	246
Part 2. Keeping Poor People Powerless: The Many-Stranded Web	247
The Many-Stranded Web	248
Poor People's Descriptions of Linkages	250
Shocks, Stresses and Sequences	252
Agonizing Choices	255
The Challenge of Powerlessness	260
Chapter 12: A Call to Action: The Challenge to Change	263
Summary	263
Introduction	264
The Challenge to Reflect: The Meaning of Development	264
The Challenge of Power: Whose Voice Counts?	265
The Agenda for Change	266
1. From Material Poverty to Adequate Assets and Livelihoods	267
2. From Isolation and Poor Infrastructure to Access and Services	270
3. From Illness and Incapability to Health, Information and Education	272
4. From Unequal and Troubled Gender Relations to Equity and Harmony	275

5. From Fear and Lack of Protection to Peace and Security	278
6. From Exclusion and Impotence to Inclusion, Organization and Empowerment	281
7. From Corruption and Abuse to Honesty and Fair Treatment	284
The Challenge to Change	288
<i>Appendix 1 — Acknowledgments</i>	293
<i>Appendix 2 — Study Countries and Sites</i>	298
<i>Appendix 3 — Overview of Study Themes and Methods</i>	306
<i>Appendix 4 — About the Authors</i>	314

Foreword

This book is the second in a three-part series entitled *Voices of the Poor*. The series is based on an unprecedented effort to gather the views, experiences, and aspirations of more than 60,000 poor men and women from 60 countries. The work was undertaken for the *World Development Report 2000/2001* on the theme of poverty and development.

Crying Out for Change brings together the voices of over 20,000 poor men and women from comparative fieldwork conducted in 1999 in 23 countries. The first volume in the series—*Can Anyone Hear Us?*—brings together the voices of over 40,000 poor people from 50 countries from studies conducted in the 1990s. The final volume, *From Many Lands*, highlights country case studies and regional patterns. The *Voices of the Poor* project is different from all other large-scale poverty studies. Using participatory and qualitative research methods, the study presents very directly, through poor people's own voices, the realities of their lives. How do poor people view poverty and wellbeing? What are their problems and priorities? What is their experience with the institutions of the state, markets, and civil society? How are gender relations faring within households and communities? We want to thank the project team led by Deepa Narayan of the Poverty Group in the World Bank, and particularly the country research teams, for undertaking this work.

What poor people share with us is sobering. A majority of them feel they are worse off and more insecure than in the past. Poor people care about many of the same things all of us care about: happiness, family, children, livelihood, peace, security, safety, dignity, and respect. Poor people's descriptions of encounters with a range of institutions call out for all of us to rethink our strategies. From the perspective of poor people, corruption, irrelevance, and abusive behavior often mar the formal institutions of the state. Nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), too, receive mixed ratings from the poor. Poor people would like NGOs to be accountable to them. Poor people's interactions with traders and markets are stamped with their powerlessness to negotiate fair prices. How then do poor people survive? They turn to their informal networks of family, kin, friends, and neighbors. But these are already stretched thin.

We commend to you the authenticity and significance of this work. What can be more important than listening to the poor and working with our partners all over the world to respond to their concerns? Our core mission is to help poor people succeed in their own efforts, and the book raises major challenges to both of our institutions and to all of us concerned about poverty. We are prepared to hold ourselves accountable, to make the effort to try to respond to these voices. Obviously we cannot do this alone. We urge you to

read this book, to reflect and respond. Our hope is that the voices in this book will call you to action as they have us.

CLARE SHORT,
Secretary of State for International
Development, U.K.

JAMES D. WOLFENSOHN,
President, World Bank

***Poverty is like heat;
you can not see it; you can only feel it;
so to know poverty you have to go through it.***

—A poor man, Adaboya, Ghana

