

Use of Country Procurement Systems  
Consultation with the Joint Venture for Procurement <sup>1</sup>  
Copenhagen, Denmark  
September 20, 2007

The World Bank took the opportunity of the meeting<sup>2</sup> that was held by the Joint Venture for Procurement during September 19-21, 2007 to present the methodology for the Use of Country Procurement Systems on September 20<sup>th</sup>, 2007. The participants included procurement professionals from most aid agencies worldwide including multilateral and bilateral donors, the UN and representatives from 25 client countries (see attached list of participants). Comments and feedback received have been summarized around the six issues posted on the website.

**1. The World Bank has proposed a detailed methodology for a procurement country system piloting program in 8-10 countries. What remaining questions need to be addressed or clarified about this program?**

The participants wanted to know how the methodology proposed by the Bank fits in with the work being done in the context of harmonization under the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness. Some believed that the Bank is moving separately because there was not a consensus with other donors on a common practice/methodology to move towards country systems.

*The Bank explained that there is no discrepancy with the work being done under the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness but that it defined a methodology to determine the risk it is willing to take and explained further that risks will be different for different institutions/aid agencies. Therefore there cannot be one set of criteria for all; each aid agency will have to set its own criteria in line with the risks it is willing to take.*

Some of the participants also wanted to know how, and if, the harmonization of procedures being done at the regional levels (West Africa, WAEMU and ECOWAS) will contribute towards moving forward to the use of country systems.

*The Bank explained that all procurement reforms being carried out presently will continue and will contribute to increased use of country procurement systems. A large part of the current proposed methodology is intended to increase the effectiveness of capacity development activities and to coordinate donor support.*

Some of the participants wanted to know the level of coordination with other donors and if the Bank's consultations would be with Part I countries mostly.

*The Bank explained that the second set of consultations would include regional consultations with Part II Countries, and that the present group of participants in the Joint Venture for Procurement meeting includes both multilateral and bilateral donors as well as recipient countries. In addition,*

---

<sup>1</sup> The JV for Procurement was established to follow up on procurement in the implementation of the Paris Aid for Effectiveness.

<sup>2</sup> The main objective of the meeting was to assess the experiences and share the lessons learned to date on the use of the OECD-DAC methodology for assessing the quality of public procurement systems.

*the Bank will make a presentation at the next MDB HOP (Heads of Procurement) meeting to be held in Tunis in late October.*

Some participants were not clear as to how the pilot countries would be selected, what should countries do to be included in the process? They asked what would happen if more than 8-10 countries pass the selection criteria. Others wanted to see a more multi-donor approach in this selection.

*The Bank reiterated the methodology proposed for the selection of the pilot countries and explained that there is not a set number of countries that would be selected. The Bank will go ahead with those countries that pass the selection criteria and express an interest to use country systems. As for the multi-donor approach, we encourage involvement of all donors active in a country and feel that this provides an opportunity for increased coordination.*

Some participants wanted to know how long the pilot projects would last and the costs associated with the projects.

*The Bank explained that the pilot projects would be selected from projects already in the CAS and pipeline. The preparation of the projects will depend on the nature of the projects and the pilots will last as long as it takes to execute the projects.*

- 2. The OECD/DAC benchmarking index provides for scoring of 54 sub-indicators on a 0-3 scale with a score of 3 representing best practice. 30 of 54 sub-indicators in the OECD/DAC tool have been identified as critical and require achieving the highest score of 3 for 22 of the sub-indicators or a score of 2 with an agreed action plan for 8 of the sub-indicators. Is this achievement level appropriate and if not, why?**

Some participants believed that countries will not be able to achieve the level of performance defined in the methodology. They asked whether it would be feasible for the Bank to consider partial achievement with thresholds below which use of country systems, acceptable to the Bank, would be allowed and a raising of these thresholds over time based on an improvement of the country's system following regular monitoring of its performance.

*The Bank explained that for procurement, it would be difficult for any country to qualify across the board at the country level i.e. for all sectors and public agencies and it is the reason why the assessment will be carried out at three levels: there will be a first selection of a pool of potential countries based on general procurement and performance track record of the country, then an assessment of the quality of the public procurement system at the national level based on the OECD/DAC benchmarking tool, and how such system meets a test of equivalence with Bank policies, and thirdly an assessment of risks, capacity, and the performance of the implementing agency at the sector/project level. The procurement pilots will be by sector/project rather than by country. In addition, if the country is not close to achieving the level of performance, there would be a joint development of an action plan for capacity building.*

- 3. Under this proposal, not all procurement would be included in these pilots. Should the Bank include complex, high value procurement such as those [e.g. highway construction, power generation equipment, information technology] now cleared by the Operations Procurement Review Committee (OPRC) in the use of pilot country procurement systems?**

The participants did not express any concerns or comments on the above issue but one may deduce, by the overall comments, that they agree that it would be difficult to qualify countries for full use of country systems in all areas of procurement. They suggested thresholds (to be reviewed regularly based on performance monitoring) be applied to all procurement, namely: works, goods and consultants based on the level of performance of the respective countries.

*The Bank explained that this is the current procedure and explained that the new proposal would be to exclude pre-identified specific processes for their complex, high value, or non-standard characteristics.*

**4. Is the proposed handling of the Selection of Consultants in the pilots satisfactory? If not, how can this be strengthened?**

The participants did not raise issues with the proposed methodology for the selection of consultants except as pointed out above.

**5. Are the proposed performance based measures sufficient to address transparency, access to information and governance and anticorruption issues (GAC) that have been raised with regard to the pilots of country systems in procurement?**

Some participants wanted to know if the Bank, in addition to the equivalence of procedures, the CPAR and OECD-DAC benchmarking tool, would take into consideration ongoing reforms that would measure progress in performance from the time the CPAR was carried out.

*The Bank explained that ongoing reforms will be part of the assessment of the performance level of the country and they are also an indication of the country's commitment to have and maintain a transparent and efficient system.*

**6. Do you have other suggestions that will strengthen the World Bank Group's efforts to help countries improve their procurement systems and help us learn from these pilots?**

The participants wanted harmonization among donors, in the use of indicators. They wanted the JV to modify its methodology in the future using feedback from JV pilot countries that have used the OECD-DAC benchmarking tool. They wanted some sort of agreement on a mechanism to deal with disagreement in the validation process of the assessment of the quality of the national procurement systems.

*The Bank participates as a member of the JV for Procurement and in this regard, intends to take suggestions and comments provided by participants into consideration. As mentioned above, harmonization among multi-lateral and bi-lateral donors would be essential.*

## **Overall Conclusion**

As the participants are currently involved in the implementation of the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and are familiar and/or have used the tools that the methodology proposes to use in selecting pilots, their concerns and comments were not so much on the methodology itself but rather on the need to see all donors work together. The overall consensus, at the end of the meeting, was that the Bank has taken a major step in the right direction but that other donors need to follow suit in order

to harmonize the efforts in the area of reforms, use of country systems as was intended under the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness.

**Participant List for the Second Meeting of the DAC Joint Venture for Procurement in Copenhagen, Sep. 19-21, 2007**

<b>Country/Organization</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>EMAIL</b>
AfDB	Reginald Sherman	Procurement Specialist	<a href="mailto:r.sherman@afdb.org">r.sherman@afdb.org</a>
AsDB	Robert Rothery	Principal Procurement Specialist, Central Operations Services Office	<a href="mailto:rrothery@adb.org">rrothery@adb.org</a>
Australia/AUSAID	John Rawden	Procurement Diagnostics Advisor	<a href="mailto:JGR@PANDS.ORG">JGR@PANDS.ORG</a>
Australia/AUSAID	Matthew Fehre	Director Procurement Policy	<a href="mailto:matthew.fehre@ausaid.gov.au">matthew.fehre@ausaid.gov.au</a>
Bangladesh/CPTU/IMED	Mr. AKM Fazlul Karim	DG	<a href="mailto:karim@cptu.gov.bd">karim@cptu.gov.bd</a>
Bangladesh/CPTU/IMED	Sk. A.K. Motahar Hossain	Secretary	<a href="mailto:Skmotahar53@yahoo.com">Skmotahar53@yahoo.com</a>
Bangladesh/CPTU/IMED	Sheikh Nazrul Islam	Director	<a href="mailto:nazrul2000@hotmail.com">nazrul2000@hotmail.com</a>
Belgium	Bjorn Demeulenaere	Legal Advisor Belgium Technical Coop.	<a href="mailto:bjorn.demeulenaere@btcctb.org">bjorn.demeulenaere@btcctb.org</a>
Benin	Aristide Djossou	Assistant du Coordinateur de la Cellule du Suivi-Evaluation	<a href="mailto:aristid_djos@yahoo.fr">aristid_djos@yahoo.fr</a>
Botswana/PPADB	Idah Marumo	Manager - Procurement	<a href="mailto:immarumo@ppadb.co.bw">immarumo@ppadb.co.bw</a>
Botswana/PPADB	Ken Ketshajwang	Manager - Procurement	<a href="mailto:kketshajwang@ppadb.co.bw">kketshajwang@ppadb.co.bw</a>
Burkina Faso	Alexis Balema Nagalo	Direction Centrale, Min. Des Finances	<a href="mailto:nagalexbalimo@yahoo.fr">nagalexbalimo@yahoo.fr</a>
Canada	Diana Viljoen	Senior Policy Analyst	<a href="mailto:diana_viljoen@acdi-cida.gc.ca">diana_viljoen@acdi-cida.gc.ca</a>
Canada	Frederique LaLiberte	Sr. Contracts Officer	<a href="mailto:frederique_laliberte@acdi-cida.gc.ca">frederique_laliberte@acdi-cida.gc.ca</a>
Canada	Davide Pisanu	Counsel	<a href="mailto:davide_pisanu@acdi-cida.gc.ca">davide_pisanu@acdi-cida.gc.ca</a>
Canada	Jocelyn Comtois	DG Contracting Management Division	<a href="mailto:jocelynjean_comtois@acdi-cida.gc.ca">jocelynjean_comtois@acdi-cida.gc.ca</a>
Cape Verde	Leonesa Fortes		
Cape Verde	Antonio Duarte	Consultant	<a href="mailto:aduarte@ine.gov.cv">aduarte@ine.gov.cv</a>
Chile	Andres Ruiz	Lawyer, Procurement and Contracting Bureau	<a href="mailto:andres.ruiz@chilecompra.cl">andres.ruiz@chilecompra.cl</a>
Chile	Adolfo Diaz	Administrative Officer, Procurement and Contracting Bureau	<a href="mailto:adolfo.diaz@chilecompra.cl">adolfo.diaz@chilecompra.cl</a>
Consultant	Rita Roos	Senior Procurement Consultant	<a href="mailto:RitaRoos@gmx.net">RitaRoos@gmx.net</a>
Consultant/Ramboll	Marie Louise Refsgaard	Consultant	<a href="mailto:malr@r-m.com">malr@r-m.com</a>
Consultant/Ramboll	Mette Lassen	Consultant	<a href="mailto:mssl@r-m.com">mssl@r-m.com</a>

European Commission/EuropeAid	Mr Paul Verwimp	Legal Officer	<a href="mailto:paul.verwimp@ec.europa.eu">paul.verwimp@ec.europa.eu</a>
Finland	Vesa Leino	Adviser/Dep. For Development Policy	<a href="mailto:vesa.leino@formin.fi">vesa.leino@formin.fi</a>
France/Embassy Copenhagen	Philippe Martinez		
Germany/GTZ	Ella Schieber	Head of Division, Contracting, Procurement and Logistics	<a href="mailto:ella.schieber@gtz.de">ella.schieber@gtz.de</a>
Germany/GTZ	Karl-Heinz Wäscher	Public Procurement Systems, Procurement Management	<a href="mailto:Karl-Heinz.Waescher@gtz.de">Karl-Heinz.Waescher@gtz.de</a>
Germany/KfW	Wolf-Rainer Kruska	Procurement Manager	<a href="mailto:wolf-rainer.kruska@kfw.de">wolf-rainer.kruska@kfw.de</a>
Ghana/PPA	AB Adjei	CEO of Pub. Procurement Board in Ministry of Fin. And Eco. Plan.	<a href="mailto:abadjei@yahoo.com.uk">abadjei@yahoo.com.uk</a>
Ghana/PPA	Eric Victor Appiah	Director of Pub. Procurement Board in Ministry of Fin. And Eco. Plan.	<a href="mailto:eric.appiah@ppaghana.org">eric.appiah@ppaghana.org</a>
Indonesia	Sugijanti Sugiono	Indonesian Embassy in Copenhagen	<a href="mailto:ekonomi@kbricph.dk">ekonomi@kbricph.dk</a>
Indonesia	Setya Budi Arijanta	Procurement specialist	<a href="mailto:sbarianta@plasa.com">sbarianta@plasa.com</a>
Indonesia	Syahrial Loetan	Executive Secretary of Ministry of Development Planning	<a href="mailto:syahrial@bappenas.go.id">syahrial@bappenas.go.id</a>
Indonesia	Agus Rahardjo	Head of Centre Public Procurement	<a href="mailto:rahardjo@bappenas.go.id">rahardjo@bappenas.go.id</a>
Indonesia	Sarah Sadiqa	Procurement specialist	<a href="mailto:sarah@bappenas.go.id">sarah@bappenas.go.id</a>
Indonesia	Dwi Wahyuni Kartianingsih	Procurement specialist	<a href="mailto:dwi.wk@bappenas.go.id">dwi.wk@bappenas.go.id</a>
Inter American Development Bank	Sabine Engelhard	Chief Procurement Specialist	<a href="mailto:sabinee@iadb.org">sabinee@iadb.org</a>
Inter American Development Bank	Tomas Socias	Procurement Specialist	<a href="mailto:tomass@iadb.org">tomass@iadb.org</a>
Ireland/IrishAid	Orla O'Flanagan	Procurement Officer	<a href="mailto:orla.oflanagan@dfa.ie">orla.oflanagan@dfa.ie</a>
Japan/JBIC	Shigeo Nakagawa	Advisor, Procurement Policy and Supervision Division	<a href="mailto:s-nakagawa@jbic.go.jp">s-nakagawa@jbic.go.jp</a>
Kenya	Robert Hunja	Chief Procurement Advisor, Min. of Finance	<a href="mailto:rhunja@treasury.go.ke">rhunja@treasury.go.ke</a>
Lao PDR	Mr Thone Phonephachanh	Dir. Procurement and Monitoring/Min. Of Finance	<a href="mailto:thone_2004@yahoo.com">thone_2004@yahoo.com</a>
Lao PDR	Sila Viengkeo	Ministry of Finance, Deputy Director General	<a href="mailto:sila_viengkeo@yahoo.com">sila_viengkeo@yahoo.com</a>
Lao PDR	Dathsadachanh Xayaphet	Committee for Planning and Investment	<a href="mailto:dxayaphet@yahoo.com">dxayaphet@yahoo.com</a>
Malawi	Ipyana Mwabumba	Principal Monitoring Officer, Office Pub. Procurement	<a href="mailto:dmwabumba@odpp.gov.mw">dmwabumba@odpp.gov.mw</a>

Malawi/ODPP	Bright Mangulama	Director Office Pub. Procurement	<a href="mailto:odpp@malawi.net">odpp@malawi.net</a>
Moldova	Ms. Lucretia Ciurea	Head of Section	<a href="mailto:lucretia.ciurea@gov.mol">lucretia.ciurea@gov.mol</a>
Mongolia	Bolorchimeg Bor	Procurement Monitoring and Auditing Expert, Procurement Policy Coordination Department, Ministry of Finance	<a href="mailto:bolorchimeg_bor@yahoo.com">bolorchimeg_bor@yahoo.com</a>
Mongolia	Gantsogt Khurelbaatar	Director General, Procurement Policy Coord. Dept., Ministry of Finance	<a href="mailto:gantsogt@gmail.com">gantsogt@gmail.com</a>
Mozambique	Benjamim Uate	Economist, UFSA - MOF	<a href="mailto:benjuate@yahoo.com">benjuate@yahoo.com</a>
Niger	M. Wassalké Boukari	Sec Exéc Agence de Régulation des Marchés Publics	<a href="mailto:armp@intnet.ne">armp@intnet.ne</a>
Niger	M. Mahamadou Halidou	Dir. Des Appuis Techniques, ARMP	
Norway/Norad	Tore Selvig	Sr. Advisor	<a href="mailto:tsg@norad.no">tsg@norad.no</a>
OECD	Elodie Beth	Administrator (Integrity), GOV/IID	<a href="mailto:elodie.beth@oecd.org">elodie.beth@oecd.org</a>
OECD	Micheal Lawrance	Procurement Advisor DCD/EFF	<a href="mailto:micheal.lawrance@oecd.org">micheal.lawrance@oecd.org</a>
OECD	Kjerstin Andreasen	Project Coordinator/DCD/EFF	<a href="mailto:kjerstin.andreasen@oecd.org">kjerstin.andreasen@oecd.org</a>
OECD	Nicola Ehlermann Cache	Policy Analyst/DAF/ACD	<a href="mailto:nicola.ehlermann-cache@oecd.org">nicola.ehlermann-cache@oecd.org</a>
Paraguay	Jorge Zarate Leiva	Coordinator Official Contracts	<a href="mailto:normas@contrataciones.gov.py">normas@contrataciones.gov.py</a>
Paraguay	Juan Rejalaja Qunonez	DG	<a href="mailto:direccion@contrataciones.gov.py">direccion@contrataciones.gov.py</a>
Peru/APCI	Roddy- Rivas-Llosa M.	Director of Policies	<a href="mailto:rrivas@apci.gob.pe">rrivas@apci.gob.pe</a>
Philippines	Ms. Aida Carpentero	Procurement Director, Dept. Of Education	<a href="mailto:ancarpentero@yahoo.com">ancarpentero@yahoo.com</a>
Philippines	Ms. Ruby U. Alvarez	Exec. Dir., Govt. Procurement Policy Board-Tech. Supp. Office (GPPB-TSO)	<a href="mailto:gppbtso@yahoo.com">gppbtso@yahoo.com</a>
Poland/Ministry of Finance	Konrad Masztal	Chief Specialist	<a href="mailto:konrad.misztal@mofnet.gov.pl">konrad.misztal@mofnet.gov.pl</a>
Royal Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Mogens Strunge Larsen	Chief Advisor/Head of Contracts Secretariat	<a href="mailto:moglar@um.dk">moglar@um.dk</a>
Royal Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs	Stine Jørgensen	Trainee	<a href="mailto:stijor@um.dk">stijor@um.dk</a>
Rwanda	Augustus Seminega	Executive Secretary	<a href="mailto:aseminega@ntb.gov.rw">aseminega@ntb.gov.rw</a>
Rwanda	Silas Nsengiyumva	Director of Monitoring Unit	<a href="mailto:silasns@ntb.gov.rw">silasns@ntb.gov.rw</a>
SIDA	Pernilla Gertell	Procurement Adviser	<a href="mailto:pernilla.gertell@sida.se">pernilla.gertell@sida.se</a>
South Africa	Henry Malinga	Chief Director, Supply Chain Policy, National Treasury	<a href="mailto:henry.malinga@treasury.gov.za">henry.malinga@treasury.gov.za</a>
Sri Lanka/NPA	Daya Liyanage	CEO National Procurement Agency	<a href="mailto:ceo@npa.gov.lk">ceo@npa.gov.lk</a>

Sri Lanka/NPA	Gamini Rathnayake	Senior Manager (Monitoring) NPA	<a href="mailto:gamini@npa.gov.lk">gamini@npa.gov.lk</a>
Sri Lanka/NPA	Ivan Tissera	Director/Capacity Building, Research & Development, NPA	<a href="mailto:ivan@npa.gov.lk">ivan@npa.gov.lk</a>
Tanzania/PPRA	Ayubu Kasuwi	Director of Monitoring and Compliance	<a href="mailto:ayubu.kasuwi@ppra.go.tz">ayubu.kasuwi@ppra.go.tz</a>
Tanzania/PPRA	Mary Swai	Manager of Research and Documentation	<a href="mailto:mary.swai@ppra.go.tz/mswai@hotmail.com">mary.swai@ppra.go.tz/mswai@hotmail.com</a>
Tanzania/PPRA	Ramadhan Mlinga	CEO of the Public Procurement Regulatory Auth.	<a href="mailto:ceo@ppra.go.tz">ceo@ppra.go.tz</a>
Uganda	Edgar Agaba	ED Pub. Procure. and Disposal of Pub. Assets Authority	<a href="mailto:eagaba@ppda.go.ug">eagaba@ppda.go.ug</a>
UK/DFID	Robert Hyland	Policy Advisor	<a href="mailto:r-hyland@dfid.gov.uk">r-hyland@dfid.gov.uk</a>
UNDP	Torben Soll		
UNDP	Kirsten Ejlskov-Jensen	Procurement Capacity Development Advisor	<a href="mailto:kirsten.jensen@undp.dk">kirsten.jensen@undp.dk</a> / <a href="mailto:kirsten.ejlskov-jensen@undp.org">kirsten.ejlskov-jensen@undp.org</a>
UNDP	Ulrich Jänen	Coordinator	<a href="mailto:ulrich.janen@undp.dk">ulrich.janen@undp.dk</a>
UNICEF	Abiye Dejafie	Contracts Officer	<a href="mailto:adejafie@unicef.org">adejafie@unicef.org</a>
UNICEF	Rudolf Schwenk	Chief, Country Support	<a href="mailto:rschwenk@unicef.org">rschwenk@unicef.org</a>
USA/Millennium Challenge Cooperation	Jeanmarie Meyer	Senior Director	<a href="mailto:meyerjm@mcc.gov">meyerjm@mcc.gov</a>
USA/USAID	Bill Buckhold	Assistant General Counsel, Office of General Counsel	<a href="mailto:w.buckhold@usaid.gov">w.buckhold@usaid.gov</a>
Vietnam	Mr Nguyen Quang Huan	Ministry of Planning and Investment	<a href="mailto:huan@mpi.gov.vn">huan@mpi.gov.vn</a>
Vietnam	Ms Nguyen Thi Dieu Phuong	Depart. of Management for Public Procurement	<a href="mailto:dieuphuong@mpi.gov.vn">dieuphuong@mpi.gov.vn</a>
World Bank	Bernard Becq	Chief Procurement Policy Officer, Head of Procurement Policy and Services Sector	<a href="mailto:bbecq@worldbank.org">bbecq@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Pamela Bigart	Lead Procurement Specialist in Procurement Policy and Services Group	<a href="mailto:pbigart@worldbank.org">pbigart@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Barbara Louise Bech	JPO	<a href="mailto:bbech@worldbank.org">bbech@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Enzo de Laurentiis	Regional Procurement Manager	<a href="mailto:elaurentiis@worldbank.org">elaurentiis@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	V.S. Krishnakumar	Regional Procurement Manager	<a href="mailto:vkrishnakumar@worldbank.org">vkrishnakumar@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Els Hinderdael	Regional Procurement Manager	<a href="mailto:ehinderdael@worldbank.org">ehinderdael@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Dimitri De Pues	Public Procurement Consultant	<a href="mailto:ddepues@worldbank.org">ddepues@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Simon Chirwa	Procurement Specialist	<a href="mailto:schirwa@worldbank.org">schirwa@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Asha Ayoung	Lead Procurement Specialist	<a href="mailto:aayoung@worldbank.org">aayoung@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Cecilia Vales	Lead Procurement Specialist	<a href="mailto:evales@worldbank.org">evales@worldbank.org</a>
World Bank	Joel Turkewitz	Procurement Reform Coordinator, SARPS	<a href="mailto:jturkewitz@worldbank.org">jturkewitz@worldbank.org</a>

Yemen	Nabil A Shaiban	Head Aid Harmonization Alignment	<a href="mailto:nshaiban@gmail.com">nshaiban@gmail.com</a>
Yemen	Yehya Al-Ashwal	Head of Procurement	<a href="mailto:yehyaa@yahoo.com">yehyaa@yahoo.com</a>
Zambia	James Njolomba	Director, Inspection	<a href="mailto:njolomba-j@tenderboard.gov.zm">njolomba- j@tenderboard.gov.zm</a>
Zambia	Mannas K. Simwanza	Director, Purchasing Goods and services	<a href="mailto:Simwanza_m@tenderboard.gov.zm">Simwanza_m@tenderboard.go v.zm</a>