

Roundtable on Mainstreaming Social and Gender Dimensions in Transport Programs: Moving the Agenda Forward

A group composed of Sustainable Development Network (SDN) management: task team leaders; economists; and transport, social development and gender specialists gathered to share innovations from World Bank transport projects and examine challenges, and opportunities for mainstreaming social and gender dimensions into transport operations. The half-day roundtable on June 20, 2007, hosted by PREM Gender group (PRMGE), Social development Department (SDV) and Energy, Transport and Water Anchor (ETWTR), was one of the many collaborative activities to support implementation of the 2006 Gender Action Plan in the infrastructure sectors, which is a commitment of the Sustainable Development Vice Presidency (SDN).

Caroline Kende-Robb, Sector Manager, SDV, opened the Learning session stating that “Transport is not just about roads; it is about development for people with different needs and access.” She also stressed that the Sustainable Development Network needs to address three specific areas in their operations – (a) inclusive growth with social responsibility, (b) achieving the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and (c) enhancing access of women and vulnerable groups to infrastructure services, so that they are able to benefit equitably from these investments. She stressed that “transport investment has to understand that the third goal of Millennium Development Goals (MDG) is: women’s empowerment, which is lagging and we need to address this if we have to achieve the MDGs”.

Introductory Remarks

In her introductory remarks, Maryvonne Plessis-Fraissard, Director, Social Development Network Vice Presidency stated that the 2007 Independent Evaluation Group (IEG) audit of the transport portfolio (*A Decade of Action in Transport*) showed economic effectiveness and efficiency but poor performance on the social and gender dimensions. She suggested that the new transport strategy, which focuses on safe, clean, affordable transport addresses the environmental, local and global impact of the sector, could provide a framework to address this weakness. She noted that “the merger of ESSD and INF and the new SDN Vice-Presidency provides an opportunity to bring the social and transport networks together upstream—not at the eleventh hour, so that transport operations can be more socially and environmentally responsive.”

Ms. Plessis-Fraissard highlighted the importance of addressing the social and gender dimensions of transport with striking statistics. Seventy percent of the goods transported in Africa are headloaded, mostly by women. This transport takes up a good portion of their days. Transport is the second highest expenditure of the urban poor and is insufficiently evaluated. Isolation – lack of access to transport that is less than two kilometers away – is an important issue in rural areas. In Ethiopia 70 % of the population is affected. In Urban areas lack of money for bus fare limits the access of the poor to urban transport. The link between distance to school and girls participation is clear – the 20 minute limit is the same everywhere. Families need girls time for livelihood activities. There is also the lack of access to medical facilities, leaving women dying in childbirth. The map of the HIV/AIDs in Africa corresponds with the transport network. The way the transport industry is structured it does not generate jobs for women. Once transport becomes motorized it becomes masculinized. Women commercialize goods when there is

walking access to markets. Once access is motorized, male middlemen take over, and charge their profit margins. Even transport equipment is built for men such as the bikes with the cross bars which are difficult to ride for women wearing saris or boubous.

The Critical Role of Infrastructure for Implementation of the Gender Action Plan

Dominique M. Lallement, Consultant SDN, provided a framework showing the critical role of infrastructure for the implementation of Gender Action Plan (GAP) on Women's Economic Empowerment.. The GAP focuses on MDG Three -- women's economic empowerment. Infrastructure increases women's access to all four key markets--product, financial, land and labor targeted in the GAP because of their potential to produce rapid and sustained increases in women's productivity and incomes. She noted that economic empowerment is "not just an increase in capital and incomes; it also requires health, education and safety which affect women's ability to access infrastructure services and increase income."

Drawing lessons from her recent visit to Liberia to assess women's economic empowerment through their participation in the labor market created by infrastructure projects, Ms Lallement stated that "listening to women's needs would benefit not only in improving the design and implementation of infrastructure projects, but in return, these can provide business and income earning opportunities to women for moving them out of poverty, as well greater economic returns on the projects." Her work in Liberia looked at how women benefit from the labor market in road rehabilitation and urban infrastructure repairs, which includes an investment of \$100 million in road construction. Women make up 15-20 percent of the total labor force; men earn three times as much as women because women get lower paying jobs and participate less in the labor market. Many women are illiterate and have limited technical skills. She recommended building human capital to give women more access to this labor market. She found that women working in construction are respected and there has been no reported violence or harassment. Women are using their income from road work to send children to school, improve family nutrition, and invest in agriculture. Another positive impact of women's participation is in rebuilding a sense of community.

Presentations on Innovations in Mainstreaming Social and Gender Dimensions in Transport

Using Public Participation Techniques to Improve Transport Project Design in China

Christopher Bennett, transport specialist, EASTE, explained that urban transport in China has traditionally been driven by engineers and policy makers who focus on investments in capital works – mainly ring roads. Similarly, the international agencies, including the World Bank only recently started addressing social and gender issues in transport project design. Traditionally their focus has been, like that of the Chinese Government, on economic efficiency with little attention to ensuring that projects addressed the needs of the intended beneficiaries.

Liaoning China, one of the nation's most urbanized areas, is part of the "rust belt" that once was the industrial center and now has 60% unemployment and is one of the greatest regions for unrest. Government leaders proposed construction of new ring roads for

“Transportation has to be more than building ring roads” said Mr. Bennett. The Liaoning Urban Transport Project was the first participation project in China, funded by the government. The participatory process was integrated into the project development cycle and is being implemented in three phases: at the project design and feasibility stage to identify the major transportation concerns of the public, at the project appraisal phase to get public reaction to the way that their concerns were incorporated into the project design. In the implementation stage, the project is designed to involve the public in project monitoring and evaluation and to assess public satisfaction with the project. The participation recruitment plan focused on mode-drive groups (walkers, bus users, bus drivers, three-wheeled vehicle drivers) and vulnerability-driven groups of transport users (the poor disabled, migrants and seniors) and separated the consultations with men and women in these groups to enhance female involvement.

Focus group discussions and interviews revealed that most men and women walk, use bicycles, or public transport; they do not own motorized vehicles. It also showed that most men and women use transport for their livelihoods, not for social visits, entertainment, going to school, or to health centers/hospitals. Key transport issues for local people were poor secondary road pavement and drainage, poor sidewalk and road facilities, lack of separation between the motor vehicle and non-motorized vehicle users of the road, and the lack of street lighting and signage. Women were even more dissatisfied with the transportation system than men – particularly safety and security issues –poor lighting, long waits for buses due to infrequent services, lack of pedestrian walkways and crossings. The needs expressed by local people, particularly the voices of women, changed the initial project design towards improvement of secondary roads, traffic management, sidewalks and crossings, public transport services and street lights. The Taiyan Urban Transport project is repeating the participatory approach used in Liaoning.

Shomik Raj Mehndiratta smehndiratte@worldbank.org, Task Team Leader (TTL), Liaoning Urban Transport Project;; **Christopher Bennett** cbennett2@worldbank.org, TTL, Taiyan Urban Transport Project:

Rural Roads in Yemen

“The Yemen Rural Access Program aims to reduce isolation and improve livelihood by improving year-round access to markets and services,” said Jerome Leyvigne, Transport Specialist, Finance Private Sector and Infrastructure Group, MENA. In 1994 the overall school enrollment rate was 55 percent but only 24 percent for girls. A nation wide survey in 1997 showed that 43 percent of mothers did not deliver their babies at a health clinic due to poor access. Transportation costs for one health visit could be as high as 32 percent of the total cost. Women and children spent hours collecting fuel wood and water.

The participatory approach included local consultations and participation in the planning process. Separate consultations with women, using female interviewers, which revealed very different concerns than those of men. “The strong participation and interest of women in roads in Yemen Rural Access Project had an impact on road design and implementation,” reported Mr. Leyvigne, Women focused on safety and proximity of roads to houses and schools. They also asked for small earthen dams for harvesting water for agriculture. Solutions adopted in the revised design of the project included --speed bumps, pedestrian access paths, retaining walls and minor realignment of roads.

Local government officials signed a social framework agreement with the local community on how to manage the social impact during construction -- including issues such as road alignment, proposed works, access to construction materials -- before construction. The government recognized that a consensus on the organization and implementation of the road improvement was important to avoid disruption by local tribes. The positive impacts of the road included improved access to health services, water and education. Time required for travel to the nearest market or service was reduced between 50 percent to 75 percent in seven villages. Key to the mainstreaming of social and gender dimensions was the dedicated central management office which included a division for environmental and social management.

Jerome Leyvigne, jlevigne@worldbank.org, TTL Yemen Rural Access Project,.

The Peru Second Rural Roads Project: Mainstreaming Gender Along the Road: Walking Toward Women's Empowerment

The Peru Second Rural Roads project mainstreamed gender based on the findings of the assessment of the first Rural Roads project. Luz Caballero, consultant, Latin America and the Caribbean STR, described women's participation in road maintenance microenterprises. Between 1995 and 1999 only four percent of the workers in road maintenance enterprises were women. A study of gender relations in rural Peru produced a matrix on gender issues which informed the project design for two lines of action: 1) gender policy informing the transport agency officers and creating gender focal points; 2) operations, mainstreaming gender in intensive labor-based works.

The project required that women constitute at least ten percent of the members of road rehabilitation and maintenance microenterprises. This necessitated revising the criteria for participation in these microenterprises to recognize women's experience in agriculture and leadership in women's groups as adequate qualifications for the types of tasks requires (such as patching, traffic sign maintenance, cleaning curbs, culverts, riverbeds, and ditches and removing stones from slopes). Women received training on road rehabilitation and maintenance as well as business management. Women's organizations played an important role in mobilizing support for women's participation in road works and providing training to women, road committees and local government.

The project enabled illiterate women to become entrepreneurs in road rehabilitation and maintenance, establish other businesses, and earn income for the first time. This provided a basis for their economic empowerment and an increased voice in community decision-making. In addition, the project fostered a culture of inclusion in the transport agency, Provias Descentralizado (Ministry of Transportation and Communications).

An important lesson learned was that women provided more pragmatic suggestions about what was needed in transport. In the consultations women's inputs were the richest and most fruitful and they have had a significant impact on the road design.

Informed by the lessons learned in studies and impact evaluations of the previous two projects, the Peru Third Rural Roads project will address social inclusion, civic engagement and democracy.

Nicholas Peltier Thiberge npeltier@worldbank.org, TTL, Peru Third Rural Roads;; lcaballero@worldbank.org .

Bangladesh: Women's Economic Empowerment Through Rural Transport and Markets

“The Bangladesh Second Rural Roads and Market Project (1996-2003) provided women the opportunity to access labor, product, and financial markets for their own economic empowerment, where previously women had to remain within their households without any income,” said Nilufar Ahmad, Senior Social Scientist SDV/SSADV. In the 1980s Bangladesh was a gender segregated society and women's literacy was only 13 percent. Half of the population was below the poverty level but women's poverty was greater. Fifteen percent of the households were headed by women, 96 percent of whom were below the poverty level. Women had limited skills and no access to the formal labor market. Even when women received microcredit from NGOs, their only option was to buy inputs and sell products to middlemen so their profits were negligible.

In preparation for the Rural Transport and market Project, the government conducted a social and gender assessment, assisted by the World Bank. Consultations with village women, women leaders in local government and NGOs revealed a demand for mechanisms to provide women access to labor and product markets, equal wages, participation and decision-making. The mechanism selected by the project was reserving 30 percent of the road construction jobs, 30 percent of the market management committee positions, 30 percent of the shops and 100 percent of the tree plantation and maintenance work for women. The project also facilitated the formation of women's contracting societies, traders associations, Self Help groups (SHG) with savings and revolving loan funds, and microenterprises for road rehabilitation. There were partnerships with local government institutions for scaling up and strengthening the activities.

Gender was also mainstreamed in the government agency to ensure sustainability after the completion of the project and to scale up the approach in other sectors e.g. water management, urban development and flood protection. Mainstreaming in the Local Government Engineering Department (LGED), which is the implementing agency included recruitment of women community organizers, social scientists, gender specialists and engineers. A Gender Forum within the LGED helped with advocacy, training and monitoring. There were partnerships with NGOs and microfinance institutions for social mobilization, group formation and microfinance services, strategic plans, projects, and staff training. There was gender awareness training for contractors and local government leaders. An important external factor was establishment of compulsory primary education and female stipends for secondary school supported by a large NGO movement.

As a result of this project, women gained social empowerment, enhanced skills, access to information, labor, product and financial markets. Women entrepreneurs were able to buy and sell products themselves increasing their profits. In one market nearly 90 percent of the shops are owned by women. There was a 50% increase in women's employment and equal wages. Girls' and boys enrolment in schools has increase dramatically as well. Women's bargaining power increased through their trader associations and contracting societies. There was increased institutional and policy level support for women traders and increased women's voice in decision-making and local governance.

The Bank, ADB, DFID and GTZ have scaled up this approach to cover the entire country.

Nilufar Ahmad, nilufarahmad@worldbank.org, Sr Social Scientist, South Asia

Rural Accessibility and Gender differences in School Enrolment in Nepal

Shyam KC, Consultant ETWTR, reported on his research on the impact of rural isolation on girls and boys access to education in Nepal-- a land-locked country with severe accessibility problems. He found that enrolment decreased with isolation – distance from a road—at a higher rate for girls. Adolescent girls are expected to perform tasks leaving little time for education. Parents do not see the value of educating girls. Forty-three percent of the girls who never attended school had parents unwilling to send them compared with twenty-two percent of the boys who never attended school. Inaccessible areas are poorly served by piped water, electricity and non bio-fuels, all of which could ease the transport burden of girls and boys. Limited access also affects the supply and quality of teachers and health services. Beyond 30 minutes from the road, half of the households have no female teacher in the nearest primary school and 40 percent of the households have only one teacher.

CDD and Transport: the Azerbaijan Experience

Mr. Satoshi Ishihara, Social Development Specialist ECA, described Community Driven Development (CDD) infrastructure projects for municipalities in Azerbaijan which posed very different challenges. Sharply contrasting the top down technical approach of many transport sector led projects, these were very participatory. Women were significantly involved in planning and social issues were paramount. However, the technical design of the roads component had many flaws and was not part of a national or even district transport system design. Hence the roads to larger centers remained in poor condition, limiting access to markets. Often paved roads were constructed when gravel would have been adequate for the traffic flow at significantly lower cost. The design flaws resulted in potholes, cracks, inadequate maintenance and other problems such that the roads did not respond to community women's and men's needs. To address these problems, the task team instituted road design standards, beneficiary cost criteria, and the requirement to make a strong case before paving a road. How to reconcile the different strengths and weaknesses of the top-down engineering and economics driven approach to roads, and the bottom-up CDD socially driven approach is a challenge that must be addressed to achieve sustainable outcomes. Satoshi concluded with the question: can CDD road projects become a form of public/private partnership?

Satoshi Ishihara, sishihara@worldbank.org, Social Development Specialist, Europe and Central Asia

The Gender and Transport Resource Guide

George Banjo, Senior Transport Specialist Africa TTR, provided a tour through the web and CD-ROM- based *Gender and Transport Resource Guide*, a virtual library of tools, training materials, guides, check lists, case studies, web links, PowerPoint presentations and other resources on mainstreaming gender in transport. Mr. Banjo described the genesis of Guide in the context of efforts to mainstream gender in the transport sector in the Africa region over the past decade.

A need was recognized to integrate gender into the Rural Travel and Transport Program which resulted in the Gender and Rural Transport Initiative (GRTI). This initiative was conducted in collaboration with PREM Gender and the SubSaharan Africa Transport Policy Program (SSATP) -- a unique partnership of countries, regional economic communities, public and

private African institutions and organizations, international organizations and development partners - all dedicated to the goal of ensuring that transport plays its full part in achieving the developmental objectives of Sub-Saharan Africa, poverty reduction, pro-poor growth, and regional integration. Key elements of GRTI included: policy dialogue; awareness raising and gender sensitization workshops; capacity building and advisory services; country level gender studies; pilot projects to promote gender responsive approaches and; information dissemination

The concern that gender was not being integrated into the World Bank transport portfolio led to a survey of approaches in ten countries, funded by the Japanese Trust Fund. In an effort to capture the findings of these two sets of studies and disseminate them widely, the Gender and Transport Resource Guide was developed. The Guide expanded to make other resources easily accessible such as: web sites and discussion groups; short issues and strategy papers making the case for gender mainstreaming in transport; case studies; toolkits and guides; training materials; sample terms of reference; technical reports; donor strategies; reference lists and; PowerPoint presentations on mainstreaming gender in transport. The six modules of the Guide include: Why Gender and Transport?; Challenges in Mainstreaming Gender and Transport; Promising Approaches; GRTI; Tools; Resources. In addition to the web-based Guide, CD-ROMs enable users without internet access to benefit from these resources.

Mr. Banjo noted that, after a flurry of interest and articles between 1998 and 2000, interest waned. "Now we have a second chance to move the social and gender agenda forward," he said. Toward that end, he encouraged task team leaders committed to mainstreaming gender into their programs to form a cohort of champions and use the Guide. He also described plans to pilot and update the content of the Guide and to make it more interactive.

George Banjo, gbanjo@worldbank.org, TTL Gender and Transport Resource Guide,

Group Discussions on Challenges, Opportunities, Entry Points, Results and Resources

Participants were asked to address the following questions and share examples from their experience in small groups discussions held at six tables:

1. Based on the presentation and your own experience, what are the major challenges faced in mainstreaming social and gender issues in transport projects?
2. What are the most effective strategies or approaches to overcome these challenges?
3. What are the key entry points for mainstreaming gender in transport projects?
4. What were the most interesting results of the innovations discussed today?
5. What impacts have your own social/gender innovations had on the effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of transport programs?
6. Do existing resources serve your operational needs for mainstreaming gender? If not, what types of resources and earning opportunities would be useful?

The content of the flip charts prepared by the discussion groups is presented in Annex 2.

Caroline Kende Robb summarized key points made in the presentations and discussions:

Challenges: transport is not seen in a strategic long term perspective, both client countries and the Bank have institutional barriers. Sometimes, gender is viewed as an add on. **Strategies:** how can we bring this to policy level dialogue? Social Development is gearing up to be more

responsive to infrastructure task team leaders. We have to build on the information that we have and recognize that they want how-to notes. Involving people makes project design more complicated so we still have to make the case, project-by-project, based on what works.

Entry Points and Strategies for Mainstreaming Social and Gender Dimensions in Transport

EETWTR consultant Mari Clark briefly summarized suggestions made by Bank transport and social development staff, many of whom who could not attend the learning event, on potential entry points and strategies for mainstreaming social and gender dimensions in transport. A critical point was winning high level support within and outside the Bank by setting up a cadre of task team leaders committed to mainstreaming gender, progress reports to the Transport Sector Board, and inputs into national sector strategies, and training for client country engineers as mainstreaming advocates. Input from social scientists who understand transport operations through transport training for social scientists, embedding social scientists in transport departments, and environmentally and socially responsible procurement were proposed as strategies to increase the social and gender dimensions of transport operations. Collaboration with NGOs with strong capacity to mobilize people and promote women's participation in transport was another strategy. Finally transport TTLS asked for practical, simple, operations-oriented, region and country specific tools telling them how to mainstream social and gender in transport projects.

In a discussion led by Dominique Lallement and George Banjo, participants examined various strategies for moving forward with gender mainstreaming in transport. Jean Noel Guilloso, Senior Transport Economist, Sustainable Development Department South Asia Region, said that task team leaders in transport need more than awareness building. They need social scientists working within regional transport sector teams who understand the transport sector well and can provide practical advice on what to do to mainstream gender. Without this help "I will be left alone," he said, "to recreate the wheel" as was his experience when HIV/AIDS prevention became a transport mandate. George Banjo, added that "sector managers need to recognize that the social development is a core area for transport, and be given the same kind of recognition HIV/AIDS expertise now receives." Otherwise transport savvy social scientists leave the Bank for work in other agencies where they feel they can make a difference.

Another participant made the point that the way that task team leaders view gender and transport is very important – is it a narrow view to give some road work to women or a broad view for women's empowerment. Another said that task team leaders need to be willing to respond to social/gender dimensions as a part of improving efficiency, poverty reduction and achieving the MDGs. Lucia Fort, PRMGE, suggested the need for short guidelines for task team leaders on how to mainstream gender in preparation and supervision as well as sex-disaggregated monitoring indicators as a part of a learning agenda in the bank system.

Another participant noted that out of 800 infrastructure projects in last decade, only eight were coded for gender. The presentations today suggest that there is a lot more activity out there that is not being coded. Other organizations look at these figures and say the World Bank is not addressing gender in transport. She asked: how can we get task team leaders to code projects for

gender? The issue of task team leader accountability was also raised. Currently there is no mandate to address social or gender dimensions in transport. Several participants suggested adding gender requirements to the ISRs (Implementation and Supervision Reports).

At the Transport Sector Board presentation of Social Analysis in Transport projects, the board stressed the need for social scientists to understand the transport sector, said Kathleen Kuehnast, SD. She also suggested that the UN convention on disabilities, which includes considerations for women and elderly, can provide another means to bring in social and gender dimensions. Dominique Lallement suggested that the transport sector is actually ahead of the other areas of infrastructure and could serve as the “locomotive” to lead gender mainstreaming in infrastructure as a whole.

Wrap Up and Next Steps

Speaking on behalf of PRM Gender, Lucia Forte noted the wealth of materials already developed, including the Gender and Transport Resource Guide and the task team leaders who have experience mainstreaming gender, such as today’s speakers. The key issue is: how do we get the message out to convince and enable more task team leaders in transport to incorporate social and gender dimensions in their projects. She offered to work with SDN to identify opportunities to add gender components to existing staff training in transport, working with sector managers and regional learning coordinators. She also proposed to take stock of existing materials and examine whether the messages on how to gender mainstream could be presented more effectively through short notes, e-learning tools, video conferences, clinics, help desks, and modules to be integrated into regional sector training programs. She posed the question of whether there is a need for a community of practice on gender mainstreaming in transport and stressed the need for funding for the learning agenda – to initiate it and make certain that it is sustained over time. She also offered PRM Gender assistance on gender sensitive monitoring and evaluation --an important aspect of the Gender Action Plan. We need to examine how to use monitoring and evaluation results to make the case for gender mainstreaming, to monitor whether it is being done, and to learn from it to improve future mainstreaming efforts.

Speaking on behalf of Caroline Kende-Robb and the Social Development Department in SDV, Nilufar Ahmad stressed that the SDN anchor is committed to support PRM Gender in the development of case studies, short notes, videos, and the overall learning agenda for mainstreaming gender in transport. She appealed to the transport sector managers to provide transport 101 training for social scientists. She mentioned that a SDN gender portfolio is being conducted by SDV and based on the findings a Learning agenda for capacity building of staff will be developed. The portfolio review will indicate the status of gender and social mainstreaming in SDN, and provide a strategy on how to move forward.

John Hine, ETWTR, and Chair of the Transport and Social Responsibility Thematic Group, and Advisor on Rural Roads, speaking for the Transport Anchor, concluded the session, saying that we need a new way of looking at transport, bringing in social dimensions to relate transport to people. We need to change the mind set about what we are trying to do. He noted that Maryvonne Plessis Fraissard is giving a presentation on “Building Roads for Communities” at the Low Volume Roads Conference next week that offers some suggestions for how to do that.

A consensus around a four-pronged approach emerged out of discussions of entry points and strategies: (1) need for dedicated social scientists with gender and transport expertise in transport teams; (2) report on progress on gender mainstreaming to the Transport Sector Board every six months as agreed with Jamal Saghir, Chair of the Transport Sector Board at a March meeting; (3) include performance on gender mainstreaming in ISRs; (4) develop a Gender and Transport Learning Agenda, which will include developing an introductory transport training for social scientists (Transport 101), developing simple two-four page Guidelines for regional and country level social and gender dimensions and simple checklists on how transport can facilitate achieving the MDGs; and (e) documenting and disseminating good practices.

The three Anchors agreed to get the message out on how to mainstream gender in transport projects in a practical, usable form:

- Disseminate the Gender and Transport Resource Guide
- Develop simple guidelines (Bank-wide, regional and country-specific)
- Case studies
- E-learning
- Videoconferences