It’s a Jungle Out There
Reflections on Conservation Criminology Research for the Bank

W. B. Magrath, Lead Natural Resource Economist, South Asia Region
DEC Visiting Experts Program
August-October, 2013
HOLD STILL SO I CAN LIBERATE YOU FROM YOUR OPPRESSORS

THE FIRST "WORLD POLICEMAN"

Non Sequitur by Wiley Miller
### What do thieves want?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner absent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Owner/Manager unaware of inventory and value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential witnesses indifferent or hostile to owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff untrained and underpaid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asset unsupervised/unguarded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lax business practices/procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loot easy to sell</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## They’ve Found It!

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owner absent</th>
<th>✓</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Owner/Manager unaware of inventory and value</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential witnesses indifferent or hostile to owner</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police untrained, under equipped, uninterested</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Easy to bribe way out of trouble</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff untrained and underpaid</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asset unsupervised/unguarded</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lax business practices/procedures</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loot easy to sell</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Presentation Outline

• Describe the issues and their importance
• Present some organizing framework of Environment and Natural Resource Law Enforcement (ENRLE)
• Go through the key elements ENRLE and highlight some of what is emerging in the literature
• Propose some research priorities and options
• Open for discussion
Environment and Natural Resource Crimes

• Timber theft/illegal logging
• Wildlife poaching/smuggling
• Illegal, unregulated, unreported fishing
• Arson
• Encroachment/land grabbing
• Pollution/toxic discharges
• Associated forms of corruption
• Money laundering
“Al-Shabaab and the Lord’s Resistance Army are partially financed by the illegal trade of ivory and rhinoceros horn”¹

“Indonesian Official Arrested for Running $150m Illegal Logging Ring”²
Elephant Trade Information System estimated Trends in Ivory Trade 1996-2011

Transactions Index and Weights Index aggregated over ivory classes and countries with 90% credible intervals.

doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0076539
http://www.plosone.org/article/info:doi/10.1371/journal.pone.0076539
Rising Profile

• UN Crime Commission
• U.S. Presidential Task Force on Wildlife Trafficking
• “... [commit] to tackle the illegal trafficking of protected or endangered wildlife species.”² 2013 G8 Leaders’ Communique
• Planned 2014 UK Prime Minister’s “Summit”
## Summary of Illicit Markets and Values

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Market Estimated Value of Illicit International Trade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Drugs: $320 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humans: $31.6 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wildlife: $7.8 to $10 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counterfeiting Total: $250 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counterfeit Pharmaceuticals: $35 to $40 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counterfeit Electronics: $50 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counterfeit Cigarettes: $2.6 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Organs: $614 million to $1.2 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Arms &amp; Light Weapons: $300 million to $1 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diamonds &amp; Colored Gemstones: $860 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oil: $10.8 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timber: $7 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fish: $4.2 to $9.5 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art and Cultural Property: $3.4 to $6.3 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold: $2.3 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total: $639 to $651 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approximation: $650 billion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Jeremy Haken, Transnational Crime in the Developing World (2011)
Bank Role

- Early work on social and community forestry driven by firewood theft and pilferage
- History of work on Forest Law Enforcement and Governance (FLEG) over last 15 years
- Assorted due diligence
- EITI (Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative)
- Land governance
- International Consortium for Combating Wildlife Crime
## Forest Law Enforcement and Governance Components in the Forestry Portfolio, by Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Total number of projects</th>
<th>Total Number of fleg projects</th>
<th>Total cost (US$ millions)</th>
<th>Cost as percent of total forestry portfolio</th>
<th>Bank commitment (US$ millions)</th>
<th>Fleg amount (US$ millions)</th>
<th>Fleg as percent of total forestry portfolio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>515.1</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>289.7</td>
<td>108.9</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asia/ Pacific</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>772.9</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>431.1</td>
<td>40.3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe/Central Asia</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>396.5</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>265.6</td>
<td>32.7</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America/ Caribbean</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>691.9</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>328.8</td>
<td>123.1</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East/ North Africa</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>203.5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>139.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>127.1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>108.2</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>51</strong></td>
<td><strong>35</strong></td>
<td><strong>2707.0</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>1562.9</strong></td>
<td><strong>310.8</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Components of natural resource law enforcement

- Compliance and Sustainability
- Prevention
- Suppression
- Detection
- Recovery
Compliance and Sustainability

- Law and Economics (Becker, Cohen, Polinsky, Clarke) Harm, Rational Choice
- “Green Criminology” (White, Wyatt, Naylor) Victimology, Animal rights
- “Conservation Criminology” – Risk Management, NRM, Criminology (Gibb)
Sources of Harm

- Policy Distortions
- Accident
- Negligence
- Crime
Prevention – disruption of the mechanisms that cause crime

- Psychological causes
- Structural causes—Development (Bourguignon)
- Situational causes—Market reduction (Schneider); Timber Theft Prevention (Magrath)
Detection

• Optimal Patrols (Milind, Lemieux, Wildlife Conservation Society)
• Elephants and ivory (Underwood, Burn, Milliken)
• Intelligence Systems (Fahlman)
• DNA (Wasser)
Suppression

"We need to put the heat on poachers and traffickers in the tiger range countries and around the globe with intensified interdiction at hot spots."

Robert Zoellick, World Bank President, 2010

- Organized crime (Reuter, Naylor, Skaperdas, Pires and Clarke)
- Police Performance (Rand, UNODC)
- Anti-Money Laundering (Goncalves)
- Narcotics (Keefer and Loayza) Unintended consequences and costs
- Piracy (Quy-Toan Do) Incentives
- Global Policing (Andreas and Nadelmann)
Recovery
Some Bottom Lines

• Need for caution about “organized crime” and terrorism links
• Countries don’t arrested their way out of a crime problem
• But, none has ever abandoned, a reactive police dimension
• Serious global public good problem in quantity and quality of enforcement
Some More Bottom Lines

• Bank, and international work in general, on ENRLE, is not as well informed as it should be by basic conclusions from standard criminological work

• The Bank’s historic bias toward prevention and rules of the game insulates from doing too much damage

• Increased risks going into “harder” ends of enforcement call for better knowledge base
Some Murky Areas

- Police Budgets and Budgeting
- Reform paths of corrupt enforcement agencies
- Costs and sustainability costs
Some Possible Follow Up

- ENRLE Financing Needs (for UK Summit)
- Enforcement Indicators (UNODC)
- Intelligence Systems Design (AFR GEF Elephant Project)
- Bank-hosted research seminar?
FOSDICK TRIUMPHED AGAIN! "AH BET TH' COMMISSIONER'LL GIVE HIM A BIG BOOST FO' THIS!!"

"YO' IS SO RIGHT!! LOOKIT TH' NEXT PITCHER!!"

THAT'S THE MOST IDIOTIC DEDUCTION IN ALL THE ANNALS OF CRIMINOLOGY. "EGAD! HOW I DON'T KNOW I KEEP COOL UNDER THESE CIRCUMSTANCES!!"
References


Assistance, Justice. "Intelligence-Led."


References (continued)


References (continued)


~