Needs Assessment Study for the Roma Education Fund
Background Paper

HUNGARY
I. Situation Analysis

1. DEMOGRAPHY

1.1. Estimate of Numbers

According to a 2003 national representative survey the number of Roma is between 520,000 and 650,000 in Hungary today. However, in the 2001 national census 190,046 people claimed themselves being of Roma nationality.

1. Table

Data of the national censuses of 1990 and 2001:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Majority in Hungary</th>
<th>Those claiming to speak their native language</th>
<th>Those claiming to belong to their nationality</th>
<th>Those bonding to the cultural values and traditions</th>
<th>Those using the language in the family and among friends</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Roma</td>
<td>48,072</td>
<td>48,685</td>
<td>142,683</td>
<td>190,046</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Hungarian Central Statistical Office (KSH), 2002

1.2. Locations

Between 1993 and 2003 – similarly to the previous decades – there were a lot of changes in the geographical dispersion of Roma. Their number and proportion significantly increased in the northern region (Borsod-Abaúj-Zemplén, Heves and Nógrád counties). The number of Roma increased, but their proportion within the whole Roma population decreased in the eastern region (Szabolcs-Szatmár-Bereg, Hajdú-Bihar and Békés counties), in the region of the Great Hungarian Plain (Bács-Kiskun, Csongrád and Jász-Nagykun-Szolnok counties), in the industrial area of Budapest (in the capital and in Fejér, Pest and Komárom-Esztergom counties) and in Southern Transdanubia (Baranya, Somogy, Tolna, Veszprém and Zala counties). There were shifts also among the different types of settlements, and the difference between the national data and the distribution of the types of Roma-dwelt settlement is becoming less and less. The number of Roma living in towns is 293,000 at the moment, which is the 48.8% of the Roma population, exceeding the 47% proportion of people living in towns, which is national data. This urbanisation process, however, was only partly related to moving. Between 1971 and 1993, then later, between 1993 and 2003 many settlements were declared towns, so a lot of Roma and non-Roma became town-dwellers without moving. This process affected both Roma and non-Roma. Now 41% of the Roma and 36% of the whole population of Hungary live in villages.

In 1971 two-thirds of the Roma lived in traditional, isolated Roma settlements amidst poor living conditions, and this number had drastically decreased by 1993. In the past 10 years new settlements like these have rarely been established, but number of villages and settlements with a population characterised by Roma majority is increasing. There are residential areas with striking proportions of Roma population in 28% of all settlements. This means that segregation according to the place of living is characteristic to every third settlement among the Roma-dwelt settlements. The settlement-like isolation of Roma will occur the more, the higher their proportion is within the population in a given settlement.
1.3. Age groups

Within the 22 years between 1971-1993 the number of live births among 1000 Roma citizens decreased by 10%. This decrease continued after 1993, too, and the number of live births among 1000 Roma is by 15-20% less now than in 1971. However, the decrease in the number of births at a national scale was much greater than this. In 1970 the number of live births per 1000 citizens was 15, 11.3 in 1993, went under 10 in 1997 and is still below 10 at a national scale. The number of live births in Hungary was 152 000 in 1970, 116 000 in 1993 and 97 000 in 2001. According to the 1993 survey 13 000 Roma children were born in that year, so, within the whole number of children in Hungary more than 11% were Roma. According to the survey the number of Roma children born in 2002 can be estimated 15 000, so, more than 15% of the children born in this year were Roma. In 1971 6% of the children due to start school were Roma. In 1999 this proportion was 11%, in 2008-09 it will be 15%, and later, it will continue to increase.

The number of children is much greater among Roma, but the number of deaths is much greater, too. As a common result of the greater number of children and deaths, the number of children under 15 is twice as big as within the whole population: 16.8% of the whole population is under 15, while this proportion is 37% among the Roma population. However, the proportion of 60-year-old or older people is five times bigger than in the Roma population: 20.2% in the whole population and 3.9% among the Roma. The whole proportion of fertility – in other words: the average annual number of children - is 1.4 among women in Hungary today, while it was 2.7 in 1997 among Roman women.

2. Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age group</th>
<th>Roma</th>
<th>Whole population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-14 years</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-59</td>
<td>59.3</td>
<td>63.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>21.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Hungarian Central Statistical Office (KSH) and Kemény 2003

1.4. Spoken languages

Roma in Hungary belong to three language groups. These are: romungros speaking Hungarian (who claim themselves gypsy musicians), vlah Roma, who speak two languages – Hungarian and the Roma language (who calim themselves Roma or rom), Romanian Roma speaking two languages – Hungarian and Romanian (beash Roma). Between 1993 and 2003 the proportion of those with beash as a native language further decreased: from 5.5% to 4.6 %. However, within the population of those with Roma-language as a native language the language-change did not continue. On the contrary: it increased rom 4.4% to 7.7%. Appropriately, the number of those with Hungarian as a native language decreased from 89.5% to 86.9%. So, a part of the vlah Roma returned from language-change to a language re-change. (According to certain opinions the 1993 data of those with vlah Roma language as a native language was not realistic.)

3. SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC SITUATION OF THE ROMA

2.1. Stratification
12-15% of the Hungarian population live on an income which is below the half of the average, and one third live under the minimum subsistence wage. The most immediate cause of poverty is unemployment. A further cause is the deterioration of the level of the benefit system. The benefits provided for the almost 2 million poor people was 0.8% of the GDP in 1998, and 0.6% in 2002. \(^8\)

The Hungarian Roma society is strongly polarised – basically along structural factors. The process of “becoming middle-class” started among the Roma, too, and by today 1/5 of the Roma live above the social average levels. \(^9\) (This is of course very difficult to measure, as the Roma “becoming middle-class” disappear from before the eyes of the researchers, as the Roma examined as the “subject” of researchers are identified with a certain way of live, and this lifestyle is not characteristic of the “middle-class” Roma any more. At the same time an “underclass” is being established, which includes not exclusively Roma, but is strongly over-represented by them. Underclass is understood as a group of the population which is in a more disadvantaged situation from the economical point of view than any other groups of the society, while it is excluded from the body of society in a caste-like manner. \(^10\) In this perspective, Roma does not simply mean an ethnic category, but refers to a particular position of class (and is therefore caste-like), which is separated due to both their appearance and lifestyle. According to the category everybody is a Roma who is like a Roma.

3. Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample type</th>
<th>Segregation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At the place of living</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary Whole population</td>
<td>21,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary Roma</td>
<td>54,9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Ladányi-Szelényi

\*A household in which two or more people of working age have no job

\**A household in which none of the members have higher education than the completed elementary education

The geographical, special distribution of Roma is not even in the country. Compared to the whole population they are present in the biggest proportion in the small-village regions of the country (Northern-Hungary, Borsod and Szabolcs-Szatmár counties, in Southern Transdanubia, Baranya-Ormánság). At the same time these are the most depressed regions of the country, with the worst economical conditions. Their previous economical structure was characterised by a heavy industry and agriculture exporting to the countries of the eastern block. After the collapse of this market practically no economical branches could be set up in these regions. In the depressed, small-village areas a noticeable tendency is that the Roma population becomes dominant, sometimes exclusive in a given small village. In the big towns the Roma are represented in a proportion that exceeds the average. This condensation, that is the pouring of poor people or people without property into the towns is a new-age process. It is also a typical phenomenon that the poor (Roma) pouring into the towns live in the transitional areas or the slums of the cities in significant proportions. So, the most populated “settlement” which can be characterized by Roma population is the most rapidly deteriorating transitional district of Budapest: the 8th district.
A strange – and compared to the processes of previous centuries - contradictory development of the 90’s is the fact that the proportion of moving out of the cities exceeds the proportion of moving into the cities. This is only partly an effect of the new “suburbanisation”. Moving out of the cities is also characteristic of the poorest part of the population, left without jobs – it is partly due to lower real estate prices and costs, and partly to the more expanded possibilities of self-supporting. This process is congruent with the strengthening of mostly village segregation: parallel to the appearance of Roma moving out of the cities of returning there the moving out of the non-Roma population makes the proportion of Roma dominant in the small-villages characterized by a more and more prevailing Roma presence.

2.2. Level of Poverty

There are twice or five times more poor people among the Roma than among the non-Roma people. Regarding financial relations the proportion of Roma population in the lowest third of the society is about 20%, but the lower we look, the bigger is their proportion. In the lowest 500,000 it is about 50%. That is, almost the half of the poorest 500,000 people in Hungary are Roma. So, poverty is not identical with the problem of Roma, but the rate of poverty is very high among the Roma.

18% of Roma households belong to the middle third of the population of the country: they can cover their daily costs, can live on their income, but cannot afford bigger savings or investments. 82% of Roma households belong to the lowest third of the population of the country: they can only partly satisfy even their essential needs. 56% of Roma households belong to the lowest income tenth of the population, they are poor in the strictest sense of the word, and cannot even eat satisfactorily. 

2.3. Employment

After the change of the political system more than half of the Roma of working-age lost their jobs. The level of their employment is roughly the half of the level among the non-Roma population, their rate of unemployment is 3-5 times more, the proportion of the number of dependents per one wage-earner is 3 times more than the proportion among the non-Roma population. 21% of the 15-64-year-old Roma population are employed. Within that the employment rate is 28% among men and only 15% among women. There are only few Roma who have jobs, and even fewer who have stable, full-time jobs. Even those who work can find jobs only in the lowest segment of the labour market. 70% of the working Roma work as unskilled or semi-skilled workers. 22% work as skilled workers or trained blue-collar workers. At the same time it is only 8% who work in white-collar positions or as a member of some uniform-wearing body. Hardly 60% of the working Roma have full-time jobs, the work of the rest secures only irregular, low or illegal opportunities to earn some income. There is a strict correlation between the level of education and the level of employment: while only 10% of the men lacking even the 8-class primary school education, 25% of the Roma having the 8-class primary school education, 50% of the skilled workers and 61,3% of the Roma with secondary school leaving certificates work. 4,2% of the mothers without the 8-class primary school education, 13% of the mothers with a primary school education, 49,4% of the skilled worker mothers, and 38,7% of the mothers with secondary school leaving certificates took jobs.

Roma living in more segregated environments had less chance to get jobs than those living in surroundings with greater non-Roma population around.

2.4. Housing
If we compare the changes in the income, employment and standard of living indexes of the Roma with the indexes of non-Roma population with similar education, living environment and (earlier) employment, the differences will be radically smaller than in the case of a general comparison of Roma and non-Roma data. According to a 2000 poverty survey the real difference can be seen in the housing conditions. While only 14% of the homes of the poor non-Roma lacks water supply, this proportion is 40% with the Roma, and regarding the WC within the house this proportion is 17% and 50%. It is especially terrifying that 41% of the Roma children live with two or more other people in a room, which effects their school results, too.  

2.5. Health

Health condition indexes are significantly worse among the Roma than the Hungarian average. Their life span is 8-10 years shorter, and as many of them had been working among unhealthy and demanding conditions, there are more disabled or pensioned off people among the Roma compared to the average. The occurrence of tumours, heart diseases and diseases of the respiratory system (e.g. T.B.), asthmatic diseases and – especially because of their hopeless situation – of mental diseases is much higher among the Roma. The proportion of infant mortality is still much higher among the Roma, and – within this – the occurrence of perinatal mortality (the death of the newborn before he/she becomes six-day-old) is especially high.

The results of a 1999 research show that the discriminative treatment resulting from prejudices influences the worse chances of Roma to access health services. Considering all that, the significant lag of death and illness indexes of the Roma population compared to the average result not so much from health services and the unequal access to them, but more from lifestyle, nourishment and other conditions of poverty.

3. TRENDS OF ENROLLMENT, DROPOUT AND COMPLETION

3.1. Main Trends in Education

In the school-year 2002/2003 2 300 000 people received nursery school education, school system education or higher education. This is almost the quarter of the entire population. Their proportion compared to the 3-22-year-old population is 82%. This proportion is 9% higher than in 1990. 35 000 of the students learn according to the special education plan for handicapped children, and further 18 500 disabled students receive integrated education.

In the past decades the most remarkable index of Roma shortfalls in education was the early, primary school dropout. Today this proportion is of negligible extent. Today the biggest inequality emerges at the level of getting into secondary education. One important hindering factor of stepping on from primary school is the fact that a significant proportion of Roma children attend special classes, classes for handicapped children or other, “second rate”, separated classes, which offer no chances of stepping on towards secondary education because of the quality of the training received there. A further inequality factor is the question, what secondary school Roma children succeed to get in. While in 1990/91 44% of secondary school students learned in short vocational training schools, this proportion became 23% in 2002/2003. The proportion of general secondary schools changed from 24% to 34%. The proportion of students attending secondary vocational schools increased from 33% to 43%.
According to the regulations of the act on public education, at the end of the 90’s virtually all students were enrolled into some kind of secondary school who completed primary education, but still significant differences could be experienced between the secondary education of Roma and non-Roma students. The data show that in the school-year 1998/99 the order of preferences among non-Roma students was: 1. secondary vocational school; 2. vocational training school; 3. general secondary school. As opposed to this, the order of preferences among Roma students was: 1. vocational training school (57%); 2. secondary vocational school (15%); 3. special short vocational training school (9%). 4% of the Roma students continued their studies in general secondary schools, 2% in higher education, 15% did not continue their studies.

During a research conducted in the Hungarian Institute for Educational Research in the spring of 2000 strong segregation tendencies were experience concerning the education of Roma children both among schools and within schools. 4% of the sixth-class children attended “pure” Roma schools, 29% attended schools with Roma majority, and only 3% attended schools where there were only a few Roma children apart from them. The data also showed that Roma children mostly learn in primary schools which count the least prestigious schools in the settlement, accommodating - apart from the Roma children - the children of the poorest families living in the area. So, at the level of primary schools not only ethnic but also a social segregation can be experienced, that is, what we can say about the education of Roma children, most possibly can be said of the disadvantaged non-Roma, too. According to a 2003 survey conducted in primary schools segregation among schools kept increasing, but segregation within the schools decreased. Roma children are segregated within schools in new, more hidden ways. Children are grouped on the basis of a certain achievement-based grading, which means that they are divided only when learning certain subjects, and not the classes themselves are separated form each other. If the proportion of Roma children within the school reaches one third, the process leading to “roma-dominance” becomes strikingly rapid, and the parents of non-Roma children start to take their children to other schools. Lagging behind in education is generally considered to be due to the lack of aspiration of the parents. The lack of ambition and intention to send their children to school was really characteristic for a long time, but by the turn of the millennium this has significantly changed. Roma parents – just like the parents of non-Roma children – know that not only primary education, but also the successful completion of some kind of secondary education is necessary for their children to survive.

3.2. Enrollment

While 70% of non-Roma children start school at the age of 6-7 on average, this proportion is hardly more than 50% among Roma children and at the same time more than 10% of them start school at the age of 8 or above. So the time of starting school is postponed in the case of Roma children. The proportion of Roma and non-Roma children starting school older than 8 is the biggest in the schools of the smallest settlements. This is related to the fact that Roma children have the least chance to get to nursery schools in the smallest settlements. As the fact of non-attending a nursery school can postpone the time of school-starting (e.g.: children who did not attend nursery school can be qualified mature for school-start by the educational advisory centre later), these children start school later. But according to researches this affects not only Roma children, but children living in small settlements generally. In small settlements the proportion of non-Roma children starting school at the age of 8 is higher than the average, which suggests that probably many of them did not attend nursery school.

3.3. Attendance in special schools, number of private students
Today in Hungary 49 000 pupils are considered disabled. In 2002 the proportion of children considered disabled in the European Union was around 2.5%. This proportion is 5.3% in Hungary. On the basis of 1993 data (the Act on the Rights of the National and Ethnic Minorities does not allow any registration according to origin) 42% of the children declared disabled were of Roma origin. According to the most recent data of the KSH (Hungarian Central Statistical Office) 9% of the children under 14 are disabled. On the basis of the most recent data of a not yet entirely processed research this proportion is 40% among the Roma. According to a 2003 survey the proportion of Roma students in special schools in the countryside is three times bigger than it could be expected on the basis of their proportion within the population.

Up to now researchers have paid very little attention to the actual procedures, methods which are used in rendering Roma children into special schools, or into classes with lowered number of students. As long as we accept the many times justified statement that it is not organic injuries, or damages occurring around the birth and leading to irreversible mental disability that play a role in declaring Roma children disabled, but primarily the qualification of the so-called “socio-cultural, family-based” disadvantage, the following questions emerge: What do the tests in use measure? Can the measurable achievement be improved by appropriate, pre-school development, preparation and practice? Is the established system of general and special schools appropriate for the children’s professional development, rehabilitation and for the promotion of their later social integration? The separated education of Roma children is treated by the experts concerned, as if a child coming from a Roma family of multiply disadvantaged situation and by the age of 6-7 showing symptoms characteristic of slightly mentally disabled children needed the same special education as mentally disabled children with organic damages. It happens because this way of education cannot be supported by any professional or legal argument, what is more, the phenomenon contradicts both the declared integrative aims of the educational system and the basic human rights.

Today in Hungary there are two different ways of special education for disabled children: one is the special school, the other is the special class or branch with a different curriculum within the ordinary school. Between 1990 and 1999 the proportion of students attending these special branches increased by 15%, although during the same period the number of all children attending primary schools decreased by 200 000. Between 1999 and 2003 however, the number of students attending branches with a special curriculum significantly decreased: it fell back to the 1990 level. The change in educational policy obviously played a part in this process.

Roma students become private students with an eight times higher probability than non-Roma students, so today 10% of the 14-15-year-old Roma do not go regularly to school.

3.4. Dropout

Beside the 100% participation of the age group in education nearly 9% of the 15-16-year-old students do not complete the 8th grade. Non-Roma children basically leave school at the age of 15 (within this 70% at the age of 14). Nearly 3% leaves school at the age of 16, and a negligible per cent leaves primary school at an age older than this. Only 40-50% of Roma children leave primary school at the age of 14, around 30% leave school at the age of 15 and about 15% leave school at the age of 16. The proportion of students leaving primary school at the age of 17 or 18 is – understandably – very low. In the past 5 years there have been no change in these proportions, and a stable 10% is the proportion of those who do not complete primary school at all.
According to the data of a research conducted in 2000, 22% of the parents of sixth-class children would like their children to go to a secondary school providing a secondary school leaving certificate, 57% would like their children to complete secondary education in a vocational training school (17% was uncertain concerning their children continuing their studies, and 4% did not plan to send their children to secondary education). These enrolment plans are in accordance with the experiences which show that Roma children having completed primary education get into some kind of secondary school in higher proportion year by year. At the same time interviews conducted with school headmasters and form masters show that behind the relatively favourable proportions in continuing studies there are a lot of failed attempts, which means that Roma students enrol but often drop out early before completing secondary school. If we compare the number of Roma students dropped out to the number of Roma students, we receive the result that 36% of enrolling Roma students drop out from the 9th class, and 29% from the 10th class. According to the data of vocational schools more than the average drop out from the 9th and 10th classes of schools in county seats. Here the number of Roma students becomes halved every year in the first two years of vocational schools, that is, three-quarter of Roma students enrolling in vocational schools have not even the chance to start learning a trade. So Roma students compared to other students are much more “endangered” at the moment from the point of view that they do not complete the secondary school they started. As data show that their school results are not worse than the average of students studying in the given schools, we can assume that the majority of dropouts are not (only) to be explained by learning failures. In 70% of schools Roma children leave school at their age of 18 the latest, and there is no final dropout in these institutions. But the remaining 30% is strongly divided on the basis, to what proportion Roma students finally drop out from them. The extent of dropouts is not influenced by the number of people living in the settlement, the regional situation, the size of the school, the proportion of Roma children, and the proportion of endangered children among 1st class students. It is not influenced by the fact either whether there is a Roma minority program in the school, or whether there is special training for disabled children. The proportion of Roma children participating in English classes, computing or romology training does not influence the extent of dropouts either. There is no connection between the extent of dropouts and the age when Roma children start school. The dropout extent is independent from certain “hard” parameters, but depends on the attitudes of school leading. The age-structure of Roma children is the most favourable in schools where the leaders regard human factors (language, nursery school) as the most important cause of dropouts or failure: in these schools the proportion of Roma children completing their studies by the age of 14 is the highest and the proportion of dropouts is the lowest. In schools where leaders consider weak abilities and lack of effort as the cause of failure (so they do not regard external causes important and pass responsibility) the successfulness that can be measured in the age-distribution of school leaving is similar to the previous case. But in schools where the leaders blame exclusively financial and housing conditions for the failure, successfulness is obviously worse than in the school-types that can be characterized by the leading attitudes mentioned above: the proportion of Roma children leaving school at the age of 14 is 10% lower than in the case of the two previous types, and the proportion of children dropping out is nearly 5% higher.

4. EDUCATIONAL QUALITY, STUDENT PERFORMANCE AND OTHER PROXIES

4.1. Educational Quality and Other Proxies
In Hungary the 1993 Act on Public Education created the bases of the renewal of both content and structure of public education. In this process schools that were in a situation with better possibilities to enforce their interests gained significant advantage in improving students’ achievement and in obtaining resources accessible within the field of education. The essential characteristic of this competition was that achievement orientation and a claim to improve the efficiency of education have received more emphasis during the past ten years. At the same time in many institutions the broadly interpreted educational and social functions were pushed in the background. As a result, disadvantaged students and students with fewer chances of success in making their own ways in life got more and more ousted from quality education. In the case of disadvantaged students, what happens to them in the educational system is much more decisive from the point of view of their later chances in society than in the cases of students who have grown up in average middle-class families and whose parents are able to compensate the weak quality of school services by family socialization or by supplementing (buying) these school services. By accessible means of enforcing their interests (choosing a school, interfering in educational affairs) they are usually able even to achieve that their children receive the best quality from the possible services. On the contrary, disadvantaged children can be regarded disadvantaged (among other reasons) because there stands no family behind them who are able to enforce their interests and supplement or compensate school services, so the responsibility of their education is exclusively related in the hands of the state. Today probably the increasing differences between students, the falling behind of significant layers, strong school selection, and a separation becoming segregation in extreme cases mean one of the major problems in Hungarian education. The results of measurements indicate that in international comparison the quality of Hungarian education is deteriorating, and from the point of view of social status and social surrounding unacceptably great differences are being established.

4.1.1. Elementary School

According to national data in 1999 11% was the proportion of disadvantaged pupils in elementary schools. The same proportion was more than 60% among Roma pupils, so the two populations overlap each other to a great extent. Roma children learn mainly in schools which are regarded the least prestigious ones and which accommodate - apart from the Roma children - the children of the poorest families living in the area. So not only ethnic, but also social segregation can be experienced at the level of primary schools. What we can say about the education of Roma children, most possibly can be said of the disadvantaged non-Roma, too. Disadvantages originating in the family often co-occur with the disadvantageous conditions of schools, so the schools with a so-called majority of “poor and Roma” children are operated among much worse conditions than average schools. Buildings of schools accommodating the most Roma children need renovation more often than average schools. The schools with the highest proportion of Roma and disadvantaged pupils have the fewest computers. This applies to Internet access, as well: the more Roma pupils learn in a school, the less chance they have to access the Internet. The teaching staff of primary schools surveyed in 2001 included 90% teachers with college degrees, 5% with university degrees and 4% with secondary school leaving certificates without any qualifications. In the schools surveyed the proportion of teachers without qualification was more than the double of the national average (1.7%). The more Roma pupils attend a school, the bigger is the proportion of teachers without qualification, so Roma pupils are more likely than the average to learn in schools where teachers have no proper professional qualification. According to the 2003 research the proportion of teachers without qualification decreased compared to the 2000 survey, but the issue, whether there are
proper teachers of particular subjects in a school is still a serious problem. The successful education of disadvantaged children cannot be imagined without pedagogues or assistants having special knowledge. Hardly one third of the schools employ specialists of the treatment of disabled children, and only the half of the primary schools providing special education employ professional specialist of the treatment of disabled children, and only 13% of the schools providing ordinary education. Practically none of the schools employ psychologists. Schools educating a great number of Roma pupils lag behind the average not only regarding teachers’ qualification, but also regarding “assistance” supposed to help the work of the pedagogues.

Schools educating a great number of Roma pupils struggle with a lack of teachers despite the nationwide characteristic problem of pedagogue-unemployment. There was a lack of teachers in 62% of the schools surveyed in 2001; more often than the average in schools operating in areas with mixed ethnicity and in schools where the proportion of Roma pupils was high. So, teachers most often left and were the most difficult to replace in schools where they would have had to struggle with the most difficult pedagogical problems. In many cases the lack of teachers can be solved only by substituting teachers qualified in another subject than needed. Last year it occurred in 63% of the schools surveyed that a certain subject (or more) was not taught by a teacher with the proper qualification. This occurred more often than the average in schools in settlements with mixed ethnicity and in schools with a high proportion of Roma pupils, so exactly where well-qualified teachers would be needed the most.

4.1.2. Secondary School

Although the results of continuing studies after primary school are much better today than in the past decades or just at the beginning of the 90’s, in the school-year 1999/2000 non-Roma students still had 4,1 times bigger chance to attend a general secondary school and they continued their studies with a 3,3 times higher probability in a secondary vocational school than Roma students. As opposed to this, Roma students continued their studies in vocational training schools with a 1,7 times higher probability, enrolled in some short vocational training school with a 3 times higher probability and it occurred to them 10 times more often that they could not continue their studies. All sociological surveys indicate that the efficiency of teaching and education is basically influenced by the intensity of the relationship between the pedagogue and the students, which depends on the number of students he/she has to teach. According to the 1999 national data in primary schools one pedagogue had to deal with 11 students, which means fairly favourable working conditions. The number of students per pedagogue was similar in general secondary schools (10 students), where – generally known – the fewest disadvantaged students learn. The number of students per pedagogue is almost the double of this in secondary vocational schools (17 students), where the proportion of disadvantaged students is higher, and almost three times higher in vocational training schools (27 students) where the most disadvantaged students go. Several different types of sociological surveys prove that there is a relationship between the pedagogues’ professional qualification and the quality of education. In secondary vocational schools the proportion of teachers without qualification was pleasingly low by 1999 – only 2%, and in general secondary schools this proportion did not even reach 1%. At the same time the proportion of teachers pursuing theoretical training without pedagogical qualification was 14% in vocational training schools, and even higher (20%) in vocational training schools with a high number of disadvantaged students (over 25%).
The proportion of students continuing their studies compared to the annual number of pupils leaving primary schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Continuing studies</th>
<th>1996/97</th>
<th></th>
<th>1998/99</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-Roma</td>
<td>Roma</td>
<td>Non-Roma</td>
<td>Roma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not continue his/her studies</td>
<td>2,3</td>
<td>16,5</td>
<td>3,2</td>
<td>14,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short vocational training school</td>
<td>4,4</td>
<td>8,6</td>
<td>3,2</td>
<td>9,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational training school</td>
<td>36,5</td>
<td>61,6</td>
<td>36,8</td>
<td>56,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary vocational school</td>
<td>38,3</td>
<td>9,3</td>
<td>38,1</td>
<td>15,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General secondary school</td>
<td>18,3</td>
<td>3,7</td>
<td>18,4</td>
<td>3,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Hungarian Institute for Educational Research

4.2. Student Performance

The successfulness of education is of the lowest level in schools which are attended by the highest number of disadvantaged students. It can be observed already in primary schools that the proportion of pupils who failed and had to repeat a year is twice as high as the average and the proportion of pupils who could not receive a mark at the end of the year because of the great number of missed classes without any justification is three times as high as the average in schools where there are many disadvantaged pupils. Comparing secondary schools we experience that repeating a year and the high number of missed classes occur 1.5 times more often in vocational training schools than in secondary vocational schools and more than twice as many times as in general secondary schools. So, insufficiencies appearing in conditions influencing the quality of education are strictly related to the result of education. The proportion of disadvantaged students is related to the proportion of students who fail to complete secondary school and drop out without obtaining a certificate, and so increase the number of those whose secondary school studies ended up in a failure and will probably start their adult careers as unemployed people, hopelessly falling behind. On the basis of the data of the past ten years we can see that the proportion of dropouts always remains the highest in schools where the most disadvantaged students are educated. While a definite decrease was experienced in the proportion of dropouts both in general secondary schools and in secondary vocational schools, the proportion of students not completing their studies increased from 25% to 36% in vocational training schools.\(^{38}\)

5. LIST OF ROMA GROUPS AND ASSOCIATIONS ACTIVE IN EDUCATION

II. Policy and Final Assessment

6. POLICIES ARE NEEDED FOR THE ROMA TO ENSURE EQUAL ACCESS TO EDUCATION
Public education faces several challenges which have to be examined in relation to each other, otherwise the problems can be solved only partly and temporarily. The results of measurements indicate that in international comparison the quality of Hungarian education is deteriorating, and from the point of view of social status and social surrounding unacceptably great differences are being established. In the last three years public expenditure on public education has been significantly increased (in 2002 it accounted for 5.5% of the budget), and reached the same level as the average of countries with a similar level of economic development, so there are no financial reserves here. From the point of view of economic efficiency it is an essential problem that in spite of the strongly decreasing number of students, the number of pedagogues hardly changes, so the proportion of students per pedagogue and the number of classes per pedagogue is only three-quarter of the average of the OECD countries. Further, it makes the treatment of problems especially difficult that in the local self-government system any state resource received for any kind of special reason increases the unshared funds of the self-government. So the self-government’s aim-oriented deployment of resources received for special programs cannot be followed and checked. As a secondary effect of this financing-mechanism, effective and real methods of solution that reflect the problems of educational policy - and which would entail extra costs - may become the victim of the competition for resources among different branches. Who admits his problems and deals with them, pursues an expensive and wasting economy, is “weak” and may lose his resources. A real and existing material interest of the self-governments is to make educational authorities accept programs entailing the most possible specialities and extras, then - having succeeded in obtaining the money - to operate its special programs with the least possible actual expenditure. In this respect the low quality and low cost education of Roma is to be explained by hard material, financial interests too, and not only by prejudice and other mental characteristics. This is what the new form of financing and operating tries to change by introducing the “integrative normative finance”.

From the point of view of the possibility of maintaining public education one of the main challenges among the aims of educational policy is the role of balancing opportunities. As the successffulness of education is essentially defined by family environment and social status, an educational policy focusing on disadvantaged students would make the whole system more effective. However, the aim of balancing opportunities does not occupy the proper place in the system of educational policy. By ensuring the freedom of school-choice, increasing the degree of freedom of local curricula and by re-organizing the 6 and 8 grade general secondary schools the Hungarian public education policy created such a space of mobility that makes not only the separation of Roma students easier, but also the separation of slow -learners or children of lower qualified, poor parents belonging to the majority. “We can talk about social disadvantages which identify student groups in the input of the system. They are those, who live in small settlements, or whose parents are poor or divorced, or belong to some ethnic minority, or are girls and not boys. And we can talk about the problem of falling behind: about children who after some painful, difficult years spent with struggles in the educational system drop out of the system as failed people, without having obtained a profession, or after having obtained a profession that makes them able of nothing else than living unemployed. This problem of school failure is a category that refers to the output, the successffulness of the system. Because of which it is not entirely invalid or unfounded that we almost always make the two groups equal, that is, if we project these two student groups onto each other, we will see that the two groups are amazingly identical. But this means that Hungarian school does nothing else than shortcut the relationship between social disadvantage and educational failure, which is a rather dramatic conclusion about the efficiency and successffulness of the Hungarian educational system. The real basic question in this relation is, how the Hungarian school or the Hungarian educational system can be made
able to compensate for the effects that different social disadvantages have on school results. This ability of compensation is in the very centre of the whole circle of problems.\footnote{42}

The unsuccessfulness of Roma students can be traced back to four overlapping groups.\footnote{43}

The positions of Roma minority in the inter-ethnic system of relations: differences of status, demographic characteristics, the problems of formal and informal institutional support. The educational policy model that can be defined in this case is the employment of means of affirmative action in education. These policies take it as a starting point that people belonging to a minority have to count with the disadvantages striking the whole group. The system of affirmative action uses basically two kinds of system of means: preferential and developing support. The preferential system of means includes defining quotas or support systems like scholarships or school fee support. Developing support includes programs preparing students for entrance exams.

The lack of enforcement of minority rights: although the great majority of Roma population speak Hungarian as their native language, the possibility of acquiring the Roma and Romanian (Beash) native languages – which form a minority even among the Roma, and the access to culture in their own language in their case is often not ensured. This is not only “minority” problem, but quite often makes lagging behind at school probable already when a student starts school. A further problem (as indicated above) is that starting special educational programs is often in the interest of those who maintain it, of the majority, and so the space of mobility of Roma minority self-organization in influencing decisions on education is rather limited and subordinated to financial interests. The obligation (imposed on self-governments but usually not enforced in practice) that in settlements where the minority population is over 20% schools have to (should) integrate programs in their curriculum which provide information, knowledge on the minority is also a “minority right”. Since the lack of knowledge about minorities is the hotbed of prejudices. These problems could be solved partly by providing minority educational programs (the word “nemzetiségi” /national minority/ is used for this in Hungarian), and partly by extending minority cultural autonomy to education, as well. Minority programs include education in the native language, bilingual education, inter-cultural education or a wide range of extra-curricular programs (like Sunday school, cultural programs, etc.).

The lack of enforcement of human rights: the open, institutionalised and hidden forms of negative discrimination. The educational policy answer to this is the combination of a definite anti-discriminational and a multicultural educational policy. In this combination three elements have to be unified inseparably: the enforcement of the prohibition of negative discrimination, the mainstreaming of children who have been separated in illegal ways, and the establishment of a more accepting and integrating, multicultural atmosphere. The precondition of an anti-discriminational educational policy is the integration of prohibition into the legislation which regulates the operation of education. So that it can be enforced, an appropriately deterring sanctioning is necessary, or the statement of procedure regulations in case of breaking the prohibition. The practical enforcement of the prohibition has to be promoted by active supports and services.

Inequalities experienced in the quality of education: the obstacles originating from the characteristics of the school system and standing in the way of access to quality education, the undifferentiated character of education and its low ability to adjust. From the point of view of Roma children quality education is something that is open to the whole group, takes into consideration the educational needs of each child, adapts to the educational needs of the target group and to the constantly changing demands of the whole society towards education. To achieve this it is necessary to establish conditions which convey the improvement of quality and successfulness to the aimed institutions in a way that takes the peculiarities of the aimed institutions as a starting point.
The main conclusion of the analysis of Roma education development strategies born in the 90’s was that all the strategy documents were in a way strongly reductionist. It emphasized one or another element of the complex educational policy outlined above, while ignored others. So far the Hungarian educational policy has been unable to prepare and make accepted a Roma educational strategy which is structured in a holistic way, in accordance with other steps of the educational policy. Consequently, changes in the field of the education of Roma students can be regarded as the consequences of basically spontaneous processes taking place in the educational system and not as the result of a carefully considered and implemented educational policy.  

It is a tendency that every program operating with grants that can be obtained via tenders are oriented to improve the offer of different services. In most cases the question, what demand is there for the services to be developed, remains out of the scope of the drafts. It is difficult to give account of this as there have been no researches on the subject, but we do know – as mentioned above – that there has been a shift in the parents ideas about their children continuing their studies (According to the data of a research conducted in 2000 22% of the parents of sixth-class children would like their children to go a secondary school providing a secondary school leaving certificate, 57% would like their children to complete secondary education in a vocational training school, 17% was uncertain concerning their children continuing their studies, and 4% did not plan to send their children to secondary education). Furthermore, according to a research not fully processed yet  Roma parents disapprove of any kind of separation and do not claim minority programs. Roma parents can be characterised by a certain aspiration to assimilation. The wish of the schools is somewhat unarticulated: they do not demand what they do not know about. 

“If one wishes to identify the schools which concentrate a great proportion of disadvantaged students on the basis of the national data, he/she should print only a 400-line-list of elementary schools and a 50-line-list of vocational training schools from the annual national statistics, and all the educational institutions (with names and addresses) would be at his/her disposal, where urgent intervention is necessary in order that quality education could be provided, that is, where the money intended for quality assurance in the budget should be concentrated. Unfortunately, those who control education have failed to do this for several years. Consequently, in spite of the fact that the (previous) government spent several billions under the label of quality assurance, where quality improvement would have really been necessary, no change has taken place up to now, because neither the honest consideration of problems nor any effective intervention occurred. And it is not surprising that the inequality of opportunities has not decreased, but definitely increased.” (Liskó, 2002).

Concerning the issue of the education and the catch-up of Roma, several important political aims did not appear in the past years’ programs of educational development at all, or appeared with only a slight emphasis on them.

---

1 Quality control in education began in 1998, then after the change of government the experimental quality assurance program, the COMEINUS 2000 was started– integrating 1400 educational institutions, this was one of the biggest developmental program of educational policy. The next government started a new quality development program, including even innovation based on nursery school and school self-development. Consequently, quality control appeared in the National Development Plan of the country, in the educational policy development plan of the Ministry and in the operative programs related to the EU accession. The Act LXXIX of 1993 on Public Education made it compulsory for the maintaining self-governments and for the institutions of public education to prepare quality control programs. Experiences indicate that an effective system can only be established, if the maintainer is part of it, too. The Act tries to help this process by providing a precise description of the tasks of the maintainer and the institution, and their relationships to each other within this activity.
There were hardly any words spoken about the significance of nursery schools. (The last year of nursery school – a kind of school-preparation year – is obligatory in the Hungarian public educational system, it is part of the compulsory education.)

Although it is evidently proven that the school career and catch-up of children who have attended nursery school permanently since they were 3 years old is much more successful than that of those who have not attended nursery school, it is still a tolerated practice that the unemployment of any of the two parents can provide appropriate reason for the nursery school to refuse to admit the child – saying that there is no need to take care of the child if the parent is at home anyway. (Appropriately, the power of evidences is weakened by the fact that (in accordance with what was said above) only those Roma children attend nursery school, whose parents work, that is, who are practically not poor and segregated.)

The decisive power of nursery school lies in the fact that children are taught and get used to norms there, which are expected later at school. If someone cannot meet these norms when starting school, most likely he/she will start his/her school career with failures which cannot be compensated later, as the school is not able to handle children who have not been socialized for school. But the question could be raised, why the ordinary educational program of the first class does not include the making up for the disadvantages of children as a normal part. Why is it only possible in nursery school to teach children how to use cutlery at meals, wash hands, use the toilet, and why is it impossible to acquire these skills at school? Teacher training could include acquiring the “skills of nursery school pedagogues”. Even from a general point of view, it would be useful for the whole Hungarian public education, if the first four classes could come closer to the spirit and world of nursery school teaching, in contradiction to present tendencies, when it is just the nursery school that comes closer to the school-like occupation of the first four classes, and its spirit of evaluation and competition.

The “welfare” role and capacities of schools could be considered beyond this, too. Simply speaking: school is the place where children spend their days. If they are hungry, dirty, smelly and tired here, they will not be able to learn, either. From this circle the necessity of eating is generally acknowledged – but bodily, hygienic needs, appropriate and clean clothes are hardly ever mentioned, neither is the fact that a 6-year-old child might need some relaxation after lunch, especially if the morning was exhausting. This is very strange, since today in Hungary in almost all institutions where people spend their days – in social institutions offering daytime care called old-age clubs or homeless shelters – it has become quite an obvious requirement that it should be possible to have a bath, to wash and patch clothes there if it is not possible anywhere else. For schools fulfilling these “welfare” functions is a strange, not perceived requirement now. Knowing this, we could consider programs which partly prepare teachers for these social functions that help satisfy basic needs; for the perception of problems and finding solutions for them in a tolerant way, not humiliating the children concerned. (A child might smell not only because he/she is a Roma – but also because he/she has not had a bath in a while. In this case it is not exclusively human right that usually helps – but a shower and a soap, too.) Programs could be considered too, which could help equip schools – showers, washing- and sewing machines, mats in the classroom which are appropriate to have an afternoon nap on, etc. These civilizational and welfare programs have to be essential elements of real integrational programs. If we want to achieve that children enjoy each other’s company without anxiety, that they have an appropriately differentiated image of each other and are able to build and maintain relationships by differentiated personality means – then children struggling with disadvantages have to receive help to adapt to the generally accepted norms of existing in a relationship.

We fully sympathize and agree with programs and policies which place educational integration in the foreground – but there exist situations in which integration is hardly possible at all. These are typically the cases of small settlements and their schools, where the
presence of the Roma is dominant. But the search for the chances of integration cannot be excluded even in these cases – e.g. by implementing school buses, by transporting children to schools which provide the opportunity of later continuing their studies. These programs would require partly the solution of children’s mobility, and partly the utilization of the abandoned school building for community aims (day-time care of children and old people, community Internet access, library, etc.). But sometimes not even this works. The improvement of these “ghetto-like” schools, their supply with appropriate equipment and material goods is an essential humanitarian goal, but no generous “provision with trousseau” is worth too much in itself. Probably these school should work out pedagogical programs which are able to handle not-discussed, even taboo themes in a wise and tactful manner. Such a question is that of mobility – the efforts of avoidance or breaking out cannot be and must not be treated as “betrayal” or “unfaithfulness” in the school’s system of values. It is also the representation of wise and thoughtful principles that is necessary in respect of the perspectives of subsistence, and in respect of the issue, how school can provide better help in preparing children to be able to get along as adults. Therefore, for example, it would be useful to realize that ordinary labour-market conjunctures do not work in depressed regions, and the most successful and most probable ways of earning an income and making a living find their forms within the frames of self-employment and small enterprises. Given this situation, it would be worth considering the integration of certain “school-cooperatives” in school programs, which could provide appropriate frames for the acquisition of attitudes characteristic of self-employment and small enterprises.

It would be a special employment of the integrative philosophy – for example in the case of “ghetto-like” small settlements and schools – if building and maintaining all possible forms of relationships would become a more emphasized element of educational programs. We usually regard summer camps, common sport events, children’s festivals, common playful competitions, etc. as spare-time activities, although their significance goes far beyond simply spending time. Maybe it is a childish idea – but establishing home and international meetings, relationships between children living in similar situations might boost their self-confidence and self-esteem. It would definitely do good for the self-esteem and self-confidence of both children who close in themselves, cannot trust their own abilities and have negative self-evaluation, and communities, if sometimes they had the opportunity to experience: they can enjoy themselves together with other people and they can please other people, too. It is highly probable that integration with a negative self-evaluation is impossible: why would others accept and acknowledge you, if you do not find yourself as worth accepting and acknowledging?

7. ANALYSIS OF ATTEMPTS, INCENTIVES AND INSTITUTIONAL EFFORTS TO INTEGRATE ROMA CHILDREN INTO REGULAR CLASSES AND SCHOOLS

7.1. Legal framework

The greatest result of the policy of equality of opportunities was the creation of the Act CXXV. of 2003 on the Promotion of Anti-Discrimination. The act on anti-discrimination absorbed the anti-discrimination parts of the amended act on public education (Act LXI.of 2003) that came into force just a couple of months earlier, so the ministry has no direct means to sanction discriminative educational practice. According to those who criticise the anti-discrimination law, the biggest insufficiency of the act is that the complainant cannot go directly to court, but only if an authority to be established later, or the results of the investigation conducted by the authority agree to do so.

48
The ambitions to public education integration of the Ministry of Education are reflected in the amended act on public education and in the structure of financing education. One of the most important changes has not come into force with the amendment of the act on public education, but with an earlier amendment of a Ministry of Education decree 11/1994 (VI. 8.) on the operation of public educational institutions. According to this, two new normative finance support constructions were introduced in the school-year of 2003/2004: the ability-evolving normative finance and the integrative normative finance. The goal of the first support is the inner catch-up and the integrative normative finance, which can be claimed in an upward proceeding system (by students of the 1., 5. and 9. grade) aims at the decrease of the extent of segregation among schools, branch-schools and classes. School maintainers participating in the integrative program can claim the triple amount of the normative finance support titled support for children and students in special situation, if they undertake to fulfill two conditions: they organize catch-up programs for students taught separately which enables them to continue their studies in ordinary classes from the next year. The second condition is that they reduce the extent of segregation at least by 10% every year. Unfortunately the decree does not include the motion, according to which children under state-care should get into the target-group of the ability-evolving and the integrative preparation, and the introduction of both ways of preparation should be extended to secondary schools (beyond short vocational training schools). The Ministry tries to limit the two well-proved ways of selection – declaring someone a private student and the exemption form certain subjects - in rules of law.

According to the amended act on public education the age limit of compulsory education increases from the earlier age of 16 to the age of 18, or in certain cases, even further. (The compulsory education of a student with special educational needs can be extended, maximum until the end of the year in which he/she becomes 20 years old). This is important because according to surveys almost one quarter of Roma students around 20 have not completed the 8th class of elementary school. By this measurement it becomes possible to reduce the proportion of people who have not completed elementary education. In the act a new element is the phrase “special educational needs”. This serves the aim that the revision of the present system of declaring someone mentally disabled can be started, as today this has become one of the most threatening means of segregating Roma students. A significant part of Roma children do not attend nursery school, and 11% of Roma children are left out of nursery school education even after their age of 5, although nursery school education can effectively prepare their more successful studies in elementary school. According to the new regulation admitting disadvantaged children to nursery school will be compulsory, so the three-year-pre-school education might improve the troubles of school-start. (A disadvantaged child or pupil is someone, who is taken in protection by the town-clerk because of his/her family circumstances or social situation, or someone after whom a regular child-protection support (???) is paid.”)

In the first three grades of elementary school there will be no failure to pass. So the proportion of over-age pupils will be lower, and those who may become mature later can have opportunities to catch up with the others. The act supports the method of “after school classes” (tanoda???), which helps the school successfulness of disadvantaged children with extra-curricular activities. The most important aim of this method is to make more and more disadvantaged or Roma students obtain the secondary school leaving certificate. Today 70% of the whole young-age population obtain the secondary school leaving certificate, and this proportion does not even reach 10% among Roma people. An important result of the change is that in the neediest institutions it will be compulsory to employ pedagogues specialised in development and leisure time organisation, who may hopefully influence the school and out-of-school lives of disadvantaged students in a positive direction.
The Ministry of Education formulated a proposal for the amendment of the Government Decree 269/2000 (XII.26.) on the General Rules of Admittance Procedures of Institutions of Higher Education (???) in order to promote the integration of disadvantaged young people and social mobilization. Its essence is that from 2005 on a disadvantaged candidate can be admitted for a first basic training, who reaches the 80% of the score-limit stated for the given subject or pair of subjects financed by the state, or at least 72 points with the maximum being 120. The proportion of students admitted this way can be maximum 20% of the guide number at the given subject, pair of subjects or department in an institution. This measurement offers help for young people who were under state-care during their secondary education age and disadvantaged candidates whose parents during his/her secondary school years were entitled to receive regular child-protection support because of their social situation, and the parents who are in legitimate charge of the child have completed a maximum education of 8 grades of elementary school. So according to the ideas of the ministry 500-1000 young people could be admitted to colleges, universities every year.39

The greatest dilemma of the liberally led Ministry of Education is that legislation gave the most important licences of practical educational policy in the hands of school-maintainers, mainly settlement self-governments already at the beginning of the 90’s. The ministry has only three indirect means left to influence the process of public education: it can state general principles in the Public Education act, define a new direction for the central curriculum-regulation, and shape the structure of financing according to the priorities of educational policy. As a result the ministry wishes to realize its integrative goals by means of legislation including sanctions, too, and financially supported programs. At the same time it is obvious that the means of the ministry are limited, and in case of strong resistance from self-governments the ministry is helpless against local efforts of segregation.50

7.2. Institutional efforts, incentives and attempts

The Ministry of Education is the only ministry which appointed a ministerial commissioner of Roma issues and separated significant amounts of money for measurements aiming at the prevention of segregation processes, and tries to concentrate more resources for the support of participating settlements or schools. The reform-concept of the Ministry of Education based the necessity of changes on two statements of the PISA 2000 survey. According to the report, it is the Hungarian educational system among all European ones that provides the least equal opportunities for children from poor families of from families with a low level of qualification, and it is the most selective. There is a double tendency in the Hungarian public education: a two-direction, merciless selection and a secondary school expansion. Families of higher social status choose schools which are appropriate for them, and schools of higher status choose children who best suit them, then quickly exclude the non-desired ones. At the same time, the proportion of students who enrolled in secondary schools has significantly increased. The general trends of public education affected Roma students, too. The freedom of school-choice and the selectivity of the school-system quickly increased “spontaneous” and artificial segregation. As many as 700 “Roma-classes” operate in Hungary, and 20-22 % of Roma students are enrolled in special classes for children with slight mental disabilities, which is a proportion higher than ever.51 But the secondary school expansion counterbalanced the negative consequences of segregation in the case of Roma students, too. (see Table 4).

A shift of emphasis took place in the 90’s: from problems of ethnic nature towards problems which are neutral from the point of view of ethnicity. The new ministry avoided addressing its new programs and supports directly to Roma students. It wanted to put the successfulness of education of disadvantaged students in the centre (and not that of Roma students), because it is very likely that disadvantages originating in the social situation are primarily the causes of
school failures in the case of Roma students, too, and at the same time, there is no reason to exclude non-Roma, only disadvantaged students, or the schools teaching them from the program. So the socio-economical status and the ethnic background of the students were not divided, and the problems, aims and means of development related to Roma students always appear “embedded” in the concept of “disadvantaged situation”. The ministry designated two target groups: those in disadvantaged situation and those with special educational needs. The category of disadvantaged situation has objective criteria: here belong families, who have completed a maximum education of 8 grades of primary school and are entitled to receive regular child-protection support because of their financial situation. Special education need means slight or medium-degree mental disability, which makes it necessary to enrol the child in a special school. The ministry wishes to change three types of school situations of these two target groups. Integration wishes to reverse the process of segregation among schools, branch-schools or classes. Ability-evolving aims to change the practice of teaching children who have partial disturbances of ability, hyperactivity, or other learning difficulties, but are not regarded as mentally disabled separated within the school and according to a system of diminished requirements. The aim of the program “From the last desk” is to replace children who were directed to special schools unjustified, that is “pseudo-disabled” children back to ordinary training.

In 2004 the ministry further expanded the network of integration and started the reform of enrolment in special schools. The school provision of children qualified mentally disabled is very uneven in Hungary. On the average we can say that while in the often live-in institutions maintained by the county necessary therapeutic conditions are partly provided, branches and classes operating beside ordinary schools that accommodate great numbers of disadvantaged and Roma children often do not provide even the minimal conditions. It is a general practice that in branches with different curricula operating beside schools with ordinary curricula education takes place in merged classes, or in the upper four classes one single teacher teaches. In the past years rules on the basis of which an expert committee can decide on the issue of slight mental disability have become stricter. The Ministry of Education decree 14/1994. (VI. 24.) amended in 1999 includes restrictions concerning the issue that children can be related to schools with special curricula only in well-founded cases. These regulations need further revision and restrictions. Although qualifying someone as mentally disabled is possible only on the basis of strict medical-diagnostic points of view, the generally accepted 70 IQ points limit of qualifying someone as a slightly mentally disabled person has to be reaffirmed. According to the data of Expert Committees so far 86 IQ points have been the limit when someone was qualified as mentally disabled. According to the Parliamentary decree 100/1999. (XII.10.) programs for the development of special curricula have to be elaborated in pedagogue-training and in-service training on the basis of the National Disability Program, on the basis of which pedagogues will be prepared to bridge the behavioural and learning difficulties of mentally disabled children even under ordinary school conditions. The conditions of supporting the preparation of pedagogues for special requirements and their in-service training are being elaborated, as well as the mapping, supporting and spreading of models which created the conditions of replacement by developing students qualified mentally disabled. Students of successful schools have to be supervised, “normal” education has to be started in these schools and their methods have to be spread. In September 2003 the supervision of all first and second grade children qualified slightly mentally disabled started; supervisions have been conducted by independent expert committees or expert committees from other counties. Pseudo-disabled children are replaced in classes working with ordinary curricula, and this process is supported by a new normative finance. The construction pays 70% of the special education normative finance above the basic normative by every student replaced into ordinary branches. This amount is received by
the school-maintainer for two years. Due to the integrative efforts about 20% of children who have been qualified mentally disabled unjustified will get back to ordinary public education. 53

7.3. Structure of Finance

So that the school achievement of disadvantaged children can come close to the results of average students, the employment of pedagogic methods aiming at this and the increasing of resources spent on education can be regarded the most often employed and most obvious means. These two kinds of means are not so far form each other. The development and employment of new pedagogic methods usually involves expenses, and therefore the education of disadvantaged children is more expensive due to its specific nature. In the decentralised system of education of Hungary the education of disadvantaged students according to pre-defined methods cannot be made compulsory. So, beside creating the possibility of an education which is able to compensate for disadvantages, the means of financing have to encourage schools, maintaining self-governments and parents to the greatest possible extent to make decisions which are most appropriate for the aims of the program. The form of support which operated in the past years and the one operating now are both capitation (???) type of supports. Self-governments receive a specific amount of support by each disadvantaged student who previously participated in the catch-up education, and from September 2003 in the integrated education. It is in the case of capitation (fejkvóta???) type of support form that the role, autonomy and responsibility of the school-maintaining self-government is the greatest. The advantage of this form of support is that it is simple, virtually does not entail extra costs of administration, and no anxieties concerning the distribution of support can emerge, while in the system of tenders the practice of evaluating individual claims remains always disputable. At the same time, one of the most essential problems of the capitation type of supports is that the extent of support necessary to reach the given goal is difficult to define, besides, the system of support cannot handle individual cost-differences. Individual cost-differences are related primarily to the size of the school, the number of disadvantaged students and their proportion within the school. Furthermore, the supplementary capitation support given to the school maintaining self-governments does not necessarily mean that school-costs increase at least to the same extent, as self-governments are not obliged to spend single-amount supports received for various purposes on the given purpose. Another problem is that it is difficult estimate in advance, to what extent school-costs should be increased in order that the expected level of improvement of school-results of students participating in the program can actually take place. A part of self-governments are only interested in increasing supports, but another part definitely has the goal of really reducing disadvantages at school. In the case of the latter integrated capitation provides a certain degree of financial opportunity. If school segregation depends directly on decisions of the self-governments and the schools, integrated education will probably improve the education of disadvantaged students. But altogether it does not necessarily lead to the significant reduction of separation, as school segregation does not exclusively result form decisions of self-governments and schools. Both local segregation and the school-choice of the parents are definitely very important factors. One of the biggest dangers of supplementary capitation support assuming integrated education is that schools which are disadvantaged because of local segregation, or a part of the self-governments maintaining these schools fall out of the circle of those entitled to the support: in settlements where the great majority of students are in disadvantaged situation, there is no possibility to start integrated classes. For this situation the National Network of Integration in Education invited for tenders, in which 22 schools won. At the same time, according to the most recent data the number of schools with more than 50% Roma students is around 180. 54 Furthermore, this form of support does
not provide solution for the segregation problem related to the parents’ decisions on school-choice. While the effect of local segregation – for example where the composition of the people living in a settlement makes it impossible for the school to start integrated classes – seems to be relatively easy to handle (the self-government would be entitled to exceptional support), problems related to decisions on school-choice do not seem to be so simple to deal with. Supplementary capitation type supports paid to the self-governments mean only a weak encouragement to decrease learning disadvantages because of the lack of relatively strict requirements concerning local educational programs. Stricter criteria are easier to enforce in a system of financing schools via tenders. Tenders or project-financing are not unfamiliar in the practice of Hungarian public education. The main advantage of the tender-system is that it makes possible not only the enforcement of requirements concerning school input, the process of education and the successfulness of programs, but also a financing that takes the parameters of the school and the programs to be introduced into consideration, too.

Tender-system and supplementary capitation type supports differ from each other not only in respect of the expected effect and costs. Tender-system financing is reasonable when the great majority of disadvantaged students learn in a relative small number of schools. So, the tender-system is a form of support that can be adapted to the present situation characterized by the significant separation of disadvantaged students. A further problem is indicated by the way tender-systems describe target-groups. For most of the programs good aiming means the claim that the direct beneficiaries of the programs should be exclusively Roma. This usually can be achieved only if the program includes exclusively Roam (this requirement is characteristic not only of educational, but also of employment and social programs). But the consequence of this seemingly technical requirement is that programs which theoretically strengthen integration, actually pursue a strong segregation themselves. They pretend as if the roads towards integration would lead through an even stronger segregation. (This theoretical contradiction is one of the most characteristic factors of the rather frequent failures of Roma programs financed from national or international, state or private resources.) Of course, this does not exclude that the diminishing of segregation is there among the stated goals. This way of financing suits the approach, according to which the resources at our disposal possibly have to be used in a concentrated way in order that schools obtaining supplementary resources can become suitable and able to educate the targeted disadvantaged Roma students more effectively. Contrary to this, capitation financing is based on the most important goal: to cease school segregation. This form of support remains reasonable even if the relatively even distribution of disadvantaged students among schools can be achieved: what’s more, because of the reasons mentioned above, in this situation this form seems more advantageous than financing aimed exclusively at Roma in tender or any other form.

All types of financing – even the integration-supplementing capitation financing – practically completely entrusts the achievement of stated goals to the school-maintaining self-governments. Tender-based financing, however, provides greater opportunity for the central government to actively control the realization of the aims and policy of money-spending, while it builds primarily upon school autonomy and initiatives, and intends to give school maintaining self-governments a smaller role.35

7.4. Budgetary Expenses

In 2003 the ministry allocated 900 million HUF (4 423 000 USD) for the support of national and ethnic minority tasks. From this amount 750 million HUF (3 686 000 USD) was intended for Roma programs. They planned to spend 500 million HUF (2 458 000 USD) on the integrative network – which amount was increased by 100 million HUF (491 000 USD) from the reserves from the previous year. According to the plans the 50 integrative base institutions
were to be established from this amount. The invitation to tender stated two requirements for the future base institutions. One of the conditions was that the applying institution does not and did not pursue the practice of segregation. According to the other requirement a school winning the title of “base institution” has to establish contact to at least 5 schools in the area which start anti-integration programs. Finally, the third resource is the PHARE project which aims at the promotion of socially disadvantaged young people, primarily Roma youth. Its goal is to establish Roma community houses, set up training in Romology and elaborate pedagogical programs. The total amount of the PHARE project is 2.4 billion HUF (11 794 000 USD), and a quarter of the amount to be paid by the applying party was financed by the Ministry of Education. The PHARE projects affect social backwardness, discrimination, school backwardness and especially issues developing Roma culture and community. From the list it is immediately obvious that ethnic and social issues overlap each other in the programs, which so often occurs in relation to Roma issues. PHARE principally aims at supporting not only Roma but also disadvantaged people, but the community house program or the training in Romology affects exclusively Roma. This might even suggest that not only every Roma is poor, but every poor person is also a Roma.

The budget of 2004 allocated 890 million HUF (4 367 000 USD) for the support of minority and ethnic tasks, which amount was later supplemented with the 150 million HUF (736 000 USD) support of the “Opportunity to Study” Public Foundation. Within this there is a sum of 330 million HUF allocated for programs affecting Roma. Compared to the year 2003 the budgetary chapter source diminished, but it is counterbalanced by the sum of money intended to be spent on the sub-regulation Ensuring equal opportunities for disadvantaged students in the education system of the National Development Plan Operative Program of Human Resource Development (HEFOP) with a priority of Struggle against social discrimination by helping the entrance into the labour market in 2004. The first three tenders announced by the NFT HEFOP definitely fit the aspirations of the ministry.

The support of integrated education of students with special educational needs within the frames of institutional cooperation (HEFOP 2.1.2) supports the replacement of pseudo-disabled children with 600 million HUF (2,944 000 USD) during two years: each applicant can apply for an amount between 12-40 million HUF, so the number of possible beneficiaries is relatively low. The reform of enrolment into special schools is served by the reform of tests which have been used by expert committees for several decades: this process is supported with 100 million HUF by the National Development Plan. The tender The support of the integrative preparation of disadvantaged students within the frames of institutional cooperation (HEFOP 2.1.3.) supports applying schools with a significantly bigger amount – 1 billion 800 million HUF (8 831 000 USD). The aim of this tender is to diminish segregation among institutions. The participating consortia can apply only for amounts between 12-15 million HUF. The small amount raises doubts in itself, whether the use of the support can be effective at all. An unspoken aim of the invitation was that base institutions can receive supplementary sources indirectly, so in the hope of success applicants necessarily have to involve some of the base institutions into the consortium, although during the period of application there existed base institutions only in regions, where a lot of Roma lived. The tender made it possible that applicants – instead of a real inter-institutional integration – build their projects upon the adaptation of integrative experience. Several consortia applied which consisted of remote schools without any kind of connection between them and base institutions situated even further away. It is quite sure that the efficiency of the HEFOP tender of the biggest amount will be rather low.

The aim of the third public education tender is the support of “after school class” (tanoda???) type activities (extra-curricular) of model value serving the school successfulness of disadvantaged students (HEFOP 2.1.4). The tender supports “after school classes” (tanoda???)
with a total of 300 million HUF (1 472 000 USD) during two years, 12-15 million HUF per units of “after school classes” (tanoda??). 56
According to the 2004 report of the Ministry in the first school-year of the program the ability-evolving normative financing was claimed per 24 117 students, while the integrative normative finance was claimed per 10 160 students by the school maintaining self-governments. 45 integrative base institution have been established so far, especially in regions where a great number of Roma live, so in many schools the program started without appropriate developing background. (see Annex 6).

8. POLICIES AND COST ESTIMATES FOR SPECIAL PROGRAMS, FOR CATCH-UP PROGRAMS FOR YOUTH, VOCATIONAL TRAINING, HIGHER EDUCATION AND ADULT EDUCATION NEEDS FOR ROMA

8.1. Short Vocational Training School

In the past decade secondary vocational schools stood in the centre of the development of vocational training within the school system. As a result of successfully realized programs their appeal increased to a great extent and the number of students studying in secondary vocational schools grew. Consequently the situation of students in short vocational training schools became even more difficult and a larger proportion of disadvantaged children enrolled in these schools. 57 The previous three-year model of vocational education changed to the 2+2 year model after 1998. General education takes place still in 9-10th grade, supplemented with career orientation in the 9th grade and basic vocational training in the 10th grade. But those who did not complete the 10-grade training can have acquired only trades against which certain prejudices have formed in the labour market. Short vocational schools compelled to undertake the treatment of social disadvantages are able to fulfil their basic functions and meet the requirements of the labour market assuming competitiveness only in a limited way. Because of the more and more serious problems of short vocational training schools, the Ministry of Education elaborated a three-year-long development program concerning short vocational training schools. The essential goal of the program, which is to be realized between 2003-2006, is the development of general skills, competencies and knowledge which help the students’ confident getting on in life on the one hand, and improve the opportunities to enter the labour market, and increase the value of skilled workers’ beginning their careers in the labour market, on the other. Five components and four thematic projects have been elaborated in the program. The goal of Component A is the innovation of the content of general, vocational and trade-group training, raising its level, the improvement of the material conditions of the training, the development of teachers’ methodological and professional knowledge, the teaching and distribution of successful solutions. This is necessary because the students do not learn the trade in the first two years, so those, who drop out during this period, get out of school without any professional knowledge. The goal of Component B is to increase the value of career-beginning skilled workers in the labour market, to ensure a safer start of the professional career and to establish a more effective and more practical training in short vocational training schools so that professional careers can be corrected later in a more effective and more successful way, and finally to ensure a training which better suits the labour-demands of economy. Component C focused on children dropping out of vocational training, on those, who drop out without having completed the 8-grade elementary education or in the 9ths or 10th grade. In the one-year-long catch-up courses based on competence pupils will be prepared to return to the regular training, after which they can still spend 2-3 years learning a trade. In order to achieve this, the component focused on disadvantaged students of short vocational training schools includes the changes which concern the conditions of
starting to learn the trades listed in the National Training Register. Within the frames of Component D1 personal conditions are being elaborated which are necessary for the establishment of an institution that is able to develop itself – so, short vocational training schools will be able to adapt to the continuously changing demands. Finally, in Component D2 an important stage of quality-development becomes realized by preparing the leadership of the school for self-assessment. The realization of the goals formulated in the components are helped by four thematic projects. The foreign language project addresses both teachers of foreign languages and teachers of professions. The task of the project is to raise the level of teachers’ linguistic communication, to introduce linguistic elements in subjects of the profession, and to make the preparation for the profession more successful in order to help direct participation in professional relations within the European Union. The aim of the project is to increase the importance of learning foreign languages in short vocational training, too, so collaborators plan to elaborate professional contents suiting the vocational training and dictionaries of the profession. Furthermore, the project lays great emphasis on the innovation of the methodology of teaching foreign languages. The task of the information science thematic project is to create and develop the material and human resource conditions which are necessary for the user knowledge of information science of the participating institutions, their supply with equipment, and the use of information science as a means in and apart from the classes. The goals of the short vocational training school measurement and evaluation project is to reveal the weaknesses and strengths in the students’ knowledge, skills and experience in an objective way, by methods that can be easily employed in schools, too. Further developmental work and the use of pedagogic, methodological means can be reliably built on the results of this survey. These means – appropriated to certain subjects, groups of subjects, modules – serve the development of skills which are necessary for learning a trade and getting on in the labour market. The career orientation project is the development of contents and methodology related to career orientation. It is an activity helping the enrolment in short vocational training schools on the one hand, and it serves as help with the students’ studies in short vocational training schools on the other. Career orientation deals with the education-organizational, content and methodological problems of conveying the knowledge necessary for finding employment and the beginning a professional career in the last years of short vocational training schools. 318 applications arrived for the program “Development of short vocational training schools”. Altogether 154 applications of the 902 winning schools received support. In 2002 the budget allocated 13 billion HUF (64 291 000 USD) for the four years of the program.

8.2. Adult education, catch-up programs

The most difficult stratum-political function of adult education is the support of the education and training of disadvantaged adult strata. From the point of view of education primarily people with the lowest level of education and without any professional qualification and - as a result - often and/or permanently unemployed belong to these strata. The increasing of their learning activity and ability and the treatment of their social problems need complex solutions. At the same time we have to strive to promote the school-system training – using the European terminology, the training in so called second-chance schools – of often young adults, and the extension of labour-market training which can be effective for them. For the latter the regular employment of combined, multi-graded vocational training programs is necessary, which include catch-up training, vocational founding training, and job-searching and/or personality developing techniques. The support of the training of disadvantaged people is solved from a legal point of view, and models have been elaborated and introduced for their special training, but at the same time there are several practical obstacles in the training of
greater numbers of people (e.g. there are not enough places for special training, the provision of special conditions is not solved in a wide enough scope). The “education of adults” in Hungary started in 1948. This meant the elementary school education of workers. The quotation marks are not accidental, as these institutions retained only their names by the 80’s and 90’s and underwent a significant change of function during the decades. Today their task is not the education of the former target-group - adult industrial workers -, but of young people who dropped out of elementary school system for some reason, and whose age is rarely above 20. The significance and number of students of workers’ elementary schools have strongly decreased in the past years, decades. This decrease of the number of students can be explained by demographic changes, and by the fact that more and more students complete the 8th grade of elementary school by the age of 16. The number of young people dropping out without the completion of elementary education still exceeds the number of people getting in adult education every school-year to a great extent. Catch-up education have been established so that also these young people can have a second chance to join the educational system. The catch-up education is available only for people who have not completed elementary school education. Those who have completed 6 grades, attend a two-year program, those who have completed 7 grades, attend a one-year program. Contrary to workers’ elementary schools operating in adult education earlier, students participating in catch-up programs can complete not only elementary education, but also get an opportunity to learn trades which are marketable in the labour market. According to a recently completed research drop-out rates are high in catch-up education, too, which is not surprising if we consider that students participating in the programs arrive in these institutions with a series of school failures behind them. The proportion of continuing studies after catch-up programs is difficult measure yet. The data of schools which already have students arriving there after catch-up programs indicate that only 40% of students who have successfully completed catch-up programs continue their studies. This means that catch-up education hardly achieves its main goal, that is, directing students who dropped out of elementary school back to the educational system in a way that they are provided with the opportunity of acquiring a trade, too. A significant number of young people expect only the completing of elementary school education from catch-up education, and do not think of continuing their studies or acquiring a profession following it. So far, catch-up education introduced a couple of years ago has not been able to fulfil the hopes attached to it. The unsuccessfulness is indicated by the low number of catch-up institutions (probably less than 20), and by the low number of students participating in the education (hardly a few hundred). Even workers’ elementary schools written off by many for several years have significantly greater numbers of students than this new form of education which intends to provide the opportunity of acquiring a trade, too. So earlier concerns that because of the double capitation by students participating in catch-up education many schools will grab the opportunity to introduce this new form of education, and so it will create significant extra-expenses for the budget cannot be held. The fact that so far only a few hundred young people have applied for catch-up education indicates clearly that it is exactly the people who are most concerned, who dropped out of elementary education for some reason, whose attention could not be drawn to this new opportunity to learn, which can be regarded a second chance.

It is necessary to treat the adaptation of disadvantaged adults to the labour market by starting and supporting central government training programs (of labour), and with special attention. Programs for disadvantaged require extra expenses and equipment (because of their more differentiated training needs), and do not fit in the expense-norms elaborated for labour-market trainings. So, in order that special programs can be realized, it is necessary that every year decisions are made on the sources (and their expansion) which are essential for the provision of personal, methodological and material conditions necessary for supplementary
services. In 2004 there are almost seven times more central resources for the support of unskilled or disabled adults than last year. This means that this year 2.9 billion HUF can be spent on the improvement of the labour-market situation of unskilled or disabled adults, which solves the training of about 31 000 people. In 2003 the training of 5340 people was possible using 475 million HUF. In 2003 a further support was the 965 million HUF obtained from the basic part for adult education of the Labour-Market Fund, which made the professional training of almost 20 000 disadvantaged citizens possible. On the basis of the government decree on adult education the normative support of the training is possible. Almost all of the adult education programs supported by the labour department are typically re-training or in-service programs offering professional training. During the participation in trainings like these, it is possible for the participant to receive aid-like supports e.g. substituting falling out incomes for the period of the training. The speciality of the professional, especially of the retraining and in-service programs is that only people with an appropriate basic training can participate in them. For the acquiring of the missing basic training as an adult there are practically no appropriate constructions and resources. The labour department does not wish to participate in the financing of the relatively and unpredictably long public educational programs which have adults as a target-group. Financing professional trainings that last only a short and definite period of time is a much easier and more comfortable task. In the system of public education there are educational capacities at disposal – e.g. because of the diminishing number of children –, but the educational system is not able to provide social incomes and other social supports for the period of the trainings.

8.3. Higher education

From 2005 on, a disadvantaged candidate can be admitted for a first basic training if he/she reaches the 80% of the score-limit stated for the given subject or pair of subjects financed by the state, or at least 72 points with the maximum being 120. The proportion of students admitted this way can be maximum 20% of the guide number at the given subject, pair of subjects or department in an institution. This measurement offers help for young people who were under state-care during their secondary education age and disadvantaged candidates whose parents during his/her secondary school years were entitled to receive regular child-protection support because of their social situation, and the parents who are in legitimate charge of the child have completed a maximum education of 8 grades of elementary school. So according to the ideas of the ministry 500-1000 young people could be admitted to colleges, universities every year.

The Romaversitas Invisible College wishes to offer opportunities for talented Roma youth to deepen their knowledge in their chosen field and acquire all the skills and experiences (knowledge of foreign languages, computing, techniques of academic research, etc.) which are necessary for the high-level practice of their profession or the post-graduate training providing academic qualification. Applications are accepted from young Roma who have completed at least two semesters in some state-financed institution of higher education or at a state-acknowledged branch of a not state-financed institution of higher education in regular (full-time) training and their school results reached the average of the branch. Romaversitas provides tutorial training, opportunities to learn foreign languages, training in computing, different community activities (free university, summer camp, conference) and provides financial support for the admitted students.

The Open Society Institute (OSI) supports Roma university students within the frames of the grant program called Memorial Grant Program of Roma Higher Education (???). In the first two years the financial background of the program was provided by the gold that was looted
by the Nazis during the 2nd World War and then remained in the hands of the Allies after the war. A part of the fund that derived from the gold-reserve controlled by the government of the United States was allocated for the program. The financial background of the following years will be provided by the Open Society Institute, the C.S. Mott Foundation and the German “Memory, Responsibility and Future” Foundation. The grants can be applied for by Central- or Eastern-European students who will start their first semester at one of the state-accredited universities/colleges of their country in the autumn of 2004, or are senior, full-time students, or receive already a grant from the program and are entitled to it in the next school-year, too. Students of political science, journalism, economics, sociology, history, law and state-administration are preferred.

9. Estimates of required policies and cost implications

The most important guideline of the Hungarian educational governing in the field of Roma education is the strengthening of integration, and the support of ethnic and cultural mingling, diversities. In almost all civil-welfare sectors the old experience is that structures mostly follow the changes of regular budgetary frames, that is, the financing which serves to cover current expenses. Civil services move towards structures, institutional and service models, in which salaries, overhead expenses and other current expenses can be financed safer and among better conditions. With regard to this, the main aspiration of the government is that through normative supports, capitation tariffs, and the changes of managing techniques of programs schools should become interested in employing integrative forms. During this transformation the Government reckons that the majority of resources of operation (normative supports) can be realized by the rearrangement of the present normative supports without significant extra-resources. That the calculation is well-founded is confirmed by the fact that beside diminishing numbers of children the unchanged budgetary frames still hide improving conditions of financing. On the other hand, if the formation of the resources of operation is primary among the dynamics of changes, it means that the significance of program- and project-type money is only secondary compared to the regular techniques and extents of financing current expenses. Despite this point of view, practically only the expenses of separated programs and projects of development can be indicated as governmental “Roma budget” – as beside integrative forms and diversities nobody can classify and count children on the basis whether they are Roma or not, what is more, nobody can be made to make similar declarations, either. Project-centred financial calculations are problematic not only because they regard a financing element of secondary significance as exclusionary, but also because the increase of Roma budgets strictly entail the separation of institutions, programs and the strengthening of segregation effects. However paradoxical this might be, the expansion of the frames of Roma financing allocated on the basis of an integrative-inclusive motivation strengthens Roma segregation. This paradox can be applied to Hungarian Roma-programs, too. The amount of the Roma budget keeps growing year by year, totals 11,5 billion HUF in 2002 (around 40%-40% goes to employment and education, the remaining 20% is divided among culture, social-policy, protection of the interests of minorities, protection of rights, etc). We can add the 45 million Euros that was the frame-amount of definite Roma projects among Phare programs between 1999-2003, and other amounts (of smaller volume) coming from international inter-governmental organizations (e.g. World Bank) and private (e.g. Soros-OSI, Mott, etc.) supports. The effects and results of these “developmental projects” would be very difficult to measure – but all in all, developmental projects can be regarded as failures, as in spite of the expenses the social indicators of the Roma population have not improved compared to the average of the society, but worsened.
10. A COMPARISON OF THESE GOVERNMENT GOALS, POLICIES AND COST ESTIMATES

The comparison of government expenses with the expert proposals indicated above is an almost unsolvable task. From the point of view of government expenses, and - beyond this - from the point of view of Roma policy in general, the most important question is the financing of operational costs and the encouraging effects exercised by the current financing of operation. International resources cannot be spent on expenses of operation, only on programs or projects of development and investment. So, the basic question is not the co-effect of theoretically incomparable amounts of expense items, but whether the system can be operated more effectively and among better conditions as a result of the developmental programs, by using the available resources of operation. A further complication is that the resources of development are rather diverse: beside the different – centralized and decentralized – national resources there are significant foreign resources, too, primarily the still existing, but running out PHARE program of the EU, and the Operative Program of Human Resource Development (HEFOP) of the National Development Plan (NFT) financed from the Structural Funds. To coordinate all these is a significant task in itself. To clarify the problem it is worth differentiating the developmental-investment programs. Seemingly, the most important difference is the one between projects which mean innovation regarding their quality and investments aiming at the even distribution and equal accessibility of standard, well-functioning procedures, techniques and institutions. Financing expenses of developmental programs is realistic primarily in the cases of developments aiming at the alleviation of regional and other inequalities. In these cases a relatively accurate description can be given of the “unity” of the project, to which “tariffs” and “unit prices” considered necessary can be rendered. If we multiply these by the number of new units to be created, we will get the total cost of the project as a result. A similar expense-claim definition is possible in the case of the reconstruction or conversion of “ghetto-like” schools, so schools in the worst situation. Today we usually speak of 700 schools which provide only minimal opportunities for the children to continue their studies. Regarding that these schools are situated almost exclusively in small villages, practically the description of two kinds of standard project might work. According to one, children would be transported by school buses to the well-equipped “town” schools providing good-quality education, and simultaneously village schools could be converted into community institutions, day-time care centres of old-age people or children, etc. The other standard solution is the reconstruction of the existing schools, accompanied by the establishment of an infrastructure that is necessary for the fulfilment of welfare functions (bathroom, shower, washing-machine, leisure time rooms, playing rooms, etc.). The average expense of both projects can be estimated about 20 million HUF. In this case the total expense of the program is 14 billion HUF. This amount can be distributed for a 5-year period of realization, and we could even say that there is Roma majority only in the half or two-thirds of the 700 schools concerned. (In this case the expense is 7-10 billion HUF for the 5 years.) It is also likely that developments becoming realized this way strengthen the realization of integrative political goals; on the other hand, regular resources may assure the maintainable conditions of operation in the long run. (Similar calculations can be made concerning the issue of nursery schools – in this field HEFOP plans can be accepted as a good ground.) But the expenses entailed by the proposals mentioned above can practically not be defined. We proposed the elaboration, testing and introduction of new qualities and innovative methods, which do not have standard routines or usual prices, what is more, not even the circle of potential users can be described with an acceptable accuracy. The case of “unit prices” is similar: the specific expenses of innovative programs are always higher than that of industry-like production. Summing up we could say that the adaptation of welfare-social elements into
the system of education and the everyday life of schools is a new quality, the trial or introduction of which can be started at more or less places at the same time. As a reasonable measure we have to state that there have to be an appropriate number of experiments so that those concerned can find out about them and they can represent a perceptible new fashion and norm. The same could be said of the integration of nursery school elements and pedagogic methods into educational programs for the lower classes of elementary schools. All programs with a similar orientation should start with the elaboration of new programs by significant expert participation.

III. Program and Project Survey and Identification

11. A REVIEW OF ALL PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS AIMED AT ROMA

- The Ministerial Commissioner Responsible for the Integration of Disadvantaged and Roma Children elaborated a system creating equality of opportunities with the working title “Creating opportunities from the nursery schools to the university degree” (Annex 1)
- Roma programs planned in collaboration with other ministries, connected to the Government Decree 1021/2004 (III.18.), and other Roma programs in 2004 (Annex 5.)
- HEFOP/2004/2.1.2 “The support of the integrated education of students with special needs, within the frames of institutional cooperation in the field of public education” (Date of announcement: 25.02.2004)
- HEFOP/2004/2.1.3 “The support of the integrative preparation of disadvantaged students within the frames of institutional cooperation in the field of public education” (Date of announcement: 25.02.2004.)
- HEFOP/2004/2.1.4 “The support of after school classes (tanoda???) type (extra-curricular) activities in order to promote the school successfness of disadvantaged students” (Date of announcement: 25.02.2004.)

12. LIST OF IDEAS FOR PROJECTS OR PROGRAMS

- Resources, services and developments have to be conveyed in an aimed way. So that this can be realized we have to know, where the children concerned are to be found, we have to be able to identify the target institutions and student groups. Today, the Hungarian information system of education is completely useless from this point of view. (We pour extra supports in the system, but we do not know where they are related and whether they find those whom they were intended for.)
- Measurement and evaluation have to provide feedback on the efficiency and successfulness of the operation of schools, primarily in the education, instruction and training of disadvantaged children. To identify the institutions providing unsatisfactory achievement is not enough in itself – developmental packages of intervention have to be forwarded to them
- Accumulated knowledge and well-functioning innovations have to be distributed at a system-level. Programs of innovation have to be recorded and the schools adapting them have to be connected in networks in order to promote horizontal learning, and additional resources have to be forwarded to the schools so that they will be able to adapt these programs.
- The integration of different learners’ groups has to be promoted: the replacement of Roma children who were educated in a segregated way earlier, and the integration of slightly mentally disabled children, etc.

- Transition from elementary school to secondary school is more significant from the point of view of mobility than the transition form secondary school to higher education. It would be a reasonable conclusion of profession-policy to concentrate efforts strengthening mobility on this point of selection. It is necessary to the change the regulation environment which makes the existing, strong selection effects possible on the one hand, and it is essential to elaborate forms of support corresponding the existing regulation environment, which somewhat compensate for the effects of the social background (information services, increasing the opportunity equalizing role of preparation taking place before the points of selection, learning route, career planning, career advice, etc.)

- Social supports related to education have to be employed in a much more effective way. It is important to be able to select the means of social support which serve pedagogic aims and aims of educational policy, and therefore can effectively help their enforcement. So that school can adequately fulfil its functions of mobility, a more significant material investment would be needed both at an institutional level, and from the point of view of the support of students. We can influence parents’ calculations in a positive direction if we reduce the costs of studying. It can be similarly encouraging if the income-structure appropriately rewards higher qualification.

- The transition between education and the labour-market has to be strengthened, and the most different means making this easier have to be employed to a much greater extent, just as career-orientation services or professional trainings of modular system.

- Adult education programs have to be made available during one’s whole life. These make the return to studying possible in any stages of life, while struggling with any kinds of problems, and – through this – also changes, and adaptation to changes become easier. This has to mean a significantly greater offer of adult education than the existing one.

- It is not enough that researchers and developers of education elaborate effective pedagogic methods. Their values have to be justified before the broader public opinion, too.

1 Kemény István, Janky Béla: National Roma Research of 2003
2 Kemény, Janky, 2003
4 Kemény, Janky, 2003
6 Kemény, Janky., 2003
8 Több roma, változatlan szegénység, an interview with István Kemény, sociologist, Népszabadság, 12. November 2003
9 Ladányi János, Szelényi Iván: A kirekesztettség változó formái, Napvilág Kiadó, Budapest 2004
10 Kemény István, Janky Béla: A cigányok foglalkoztatottságáról és jövedelmi viszonyairól, on the basis of the National Roma Research of 2003
11 Kemény, Janky, 2003
12 Habics László: Szegregáció a cigánygyermek tanulmányok, oktatásában, Bp., 2001
13 Ferge Zsuzsa, Tausz Katalin, Darvas Ágnes: Közdelem a szegénység és a társadalmi kirekesztés ellen – Magyarországon, Nemzetközi Munkácsy Múzeum, 2002
14 A Magyar egészségügy és szociálpolitika az EU csatlakozás után, www.romacentrum.hu
16 Neményi Mária, Egészségre ható tényezők strukturális, etnikai és kulturális összefüggései, MTA Doktori Disszertáció, 2000
Liskó Ilona: A hátrányos helyzettanulók oktatásának minősége, Új Pedagógiai Szemle, 2002/11
Havas Gábor prepared a representative survey on the situation of Roma children in elementary schools in 2003. This research is still under process.
Havas Gábor research, 2003
Kende Anna: Együtt vagy külön? A szegregált iskolarendszer és a speciális oktatási szükségletek megállapításának problémái, In: Iskolakultúra, 2004/1
Havas Gábor research, 2003
Babusik Ferenc, 2003
Liskó Ilona: Cigány tanulók a középfokú iskolában
Babusik Ferenc, 2003
Liskó Ilona: A hátrányos helyzetű tanulók oktatásának minősége
Csapó Beno: Az iskolai osztályok közötti különbségek és az oktatási rendszer demokratizálása, In: Iskolakultúra, 2003/8
Liskó Ilona: A hátrányos helyzetű tanulók oktatásának minősége
Liskó Ilona: A hátrányos helyzetű tanulók oktatásának minősége
Havas Gábor research, 2003
Liskó Ilona: A hátrányos helyzetű tanulók oktatásának minősége
Liskó Ilona: A hátrányos helyzetű tanulók oktatásának minősége
Liskó Ilona: Cigány tanulók a középfokú iskolában
Kovács István Vilmos: Esélyteremtés hátrányban, In: Új Pedagógia Szemle, 2004/1
Radó Péter: A leszakadó, hátrányos helyzetű társdalmi csoportok oktatásának, képzésének lehetőségei a tudásalapú társadalomban, www.oki.hu
Radó Péter: A Humán Eroforrás Fejlesztési Operatív Program (HEFOP) értékelése a roma tanulók oktatásának fejlesztése szempontjából, IFM Humán Eroforrás Hattértanulmányok, TÁRKI, Budapest, March 2003
Radó Péter: HEFOP értékelés
The most recent research on Roma children in elementary school by Gábor Havas
Havas Gábor research, 2003
Pik Katalin: A cigány gyerekek és az óvoda esete In: Esély 2000/6
OM professional material prepared by the Office of the Ministerial Commissioner Responsible for the Integration of Disadvantaged and Roma Children, 2003
Zolnay János, 2004
Havas Gábor, Kemény István, Liskó Ilona: Cigány gyerekek az általános iskolában, Oktatáskutató Intézet, Új Mandátum Kiadó, 2002
Radó Péter: HEFOP értékelés
Zolnay János, 2004
Havas Gábor research, 2003
Hermann Zoltán – Horn Dániel: A hátrányos helyzettanulók oktatásának finanszírozási módszerei
Zolnay János, 2004
Mayer József: “Kémiát és fizikát oktatni szakiskolásoknak, az fából vaskarika!” Hátrányos helyzetű tanulók a szakiskolában, Új Pedagógiai Szemle, 2003/10
Tomasz Gábor: Felzárkóztató oktatás ma, vizsgálati beszámoló, Nemzeti Szakképzési Intézet, 2004
Hétszeres forrás felnőttképzésre, Magyarország.hu, 8. February 2004
Esélyteremtés az óvodától a diplomáig, OM Sajtóiroda, 23. September 2003