Agricultural Trade Reform and the Doha Development Agenda

Editors

Kym Anderson and Will Martin

A copublication of the World Bank and Palgrave Macmillan
CONTENTS

Foreword ix
Acknowledgments x
Contributors xi
Acronyms and Abbreviations xiii

Part I: SETTING THE SCENE 1

1. Agriculture, Trade Reform, and the Doha Agenda
   Kym Anderson and Will Martin 3

2. What’s at Stake: The Relative Importance of Import Barriers,
   Export Subsidies and Domestic Support
   Thomas W. Hertel and Roman Keeney

3. Special and Differential Treatment for Developing Countries
   Tim Josling

Part II: AGRICULTURAL MARKET ACCESS

4. Consequences of Alternative Formulas for Agricultural Tariff Cuts
   Sébastien Jean, Lionel Fontagné, and Will Martin

5. Reducing Tariffs Versus Expanding Tariff Rate Quotas
   Harry de Gorter and Erika Kliauga

6. Is Erosion of Tariff Preferences a Serious Concern?
   Antoine Bouët, Lionel Fontagné, and Sébastien Jean

Part III: EXPORT SUBSIDIES AND DOMESTIC SUPPORT

7. Removing the Exception of Agricultural Export Subsidies
   Bernard Hoekman and Patrick Messerlin
8. Rethinking Domestic Support Disciplines  
   *Chad E. Hart and John C. Beghin*

9. Consequences of Reducing AMS Limits  
   *Hans G. Jensen and Henrik Zobbe*

10. Reducing Cotton subsidies: The DDA Cotton Initiative  
    *Daniel A. Sumner*

**Part IV: DOHA REFORM SCENARIOS**

11. Holograms and Ghosts: New and Old Ideas in Agricultural Policies  
    *David Orden and Eugenio Diaz-Bonilla*

12. Market and Welfare Implications of Doha Reform Scenarios  
    *Kym Anderson, Will Martin, and Dominique van der Mensbrugghe*

**INDEX**

**Figures**

1.1 The Declining Share of Agriculture and Food in Merchandise Exports for World and Developing Countries, 1970–2003


2.1 Welfare Gains for Developing Countries from Freeing Trade in Services and from Trade Facilitation Compared with the Standard Removal of Merchandise Tariffs and Subsidies

4.1 Converting the Harbinson Formula into a Tiered Formula

4.2 A Tiered Tariff-Cutting Formula without Discontinuities

5.1 In-Quota Imports with and without Quota Fill

5.2 Imports with Quota Full or Underfilled
5.3 Out-of-Quota Imports with and without Quota Fill  
5.4 Overquota Imports  

6.1 European Union Trade Policy, 2004  
6.2 U.S. Trade Policy, 2004  

7.1 The Incidence of All Notified Export Subsidies  
7.2 The Incidence of Quad Export Subsidy Commitments  

Tables  

1.1 Import-Weighted Average Applied Import Tariffs, by Sector and Region, 2001  
1.2 Import-Weighted Average Agricultural Import Tariffs, by Region, 2001  
1.3 Effects on Economic Welfare of Full Trade Liberalization by Economy and Products, 2015  
1.4 Distribution of Global Welfare Impacts from Removing All Agricultural Tariffs and Subsidies, 2001  
1.5 Welfare Effect of Alternative Doha Reform Scenarios, 2015  
1.6 Effects on Bilateral Merchandise Trade Flows of Adding Nonagricultural Tariff Cuts to Agricultural Reform under Doha, 2015  
1.7 Annual Average Growth in Output and Employment from a Comprehensive Doha Reform as Compared with the Baseline Rate, by Region, 2005–15  
1.8 Decreases in the Number of Impoverished under Full Trade Liberalization and Alternative Doha scenarios, 2015  

2.1 Modeled Regions by Type of Economy  
2.2 Agricultural Domestic Support in Selected High-Income Economies  
2.3 Average Applied Import Tariffs, by Sector and Region, 2001  
2.4 Average Import Tariffs in Developing Countries  
2.5 Percentage Changes in Developing-Country Imports from Removing All Tariffs and Agricultural Subsidies  
2.6 Percentage (and Volume) Changes in Developing-Country Exports from Removing All Tariffs and Agricultural Subsidies  
2.7 Regional Welfare Effects of Removing All Agricultural Tariffs and Subsidies  
2.8 Developing Countries’ Welfare Gains from Removing All Agricultural Tariffs and Subsidies  
2.9 Developing Countries’ Welfare Gains from Removing All Nonagricultural Tariffs, Agricultural Assistance, and Merchandise Trade Distortions  
2.10 Welfare Effects of Liberalizing All Merchandise Trade  
2.11 Welfare Decomposition from Merchandise Trade Liberalization for Developing Countries  

4.1 Key Features of Applied Agricultural Tariffs, by Selected Countries and Regions, 2001  
4.3 Summary Description of the Agricultural Reform Scenarios
4.4 Base Level and Reductions in Average Bound Duties, by Agricultural Reform Scenario
4.5 Reductions in Base Tariffs for Average Applied Tariffs, by Agricultural Reform Scenario
4.6 Cross-Product Coefficient of Variation of the Power of MFN Tariffs: Base and Reduction by Agricultural Reform Scenario
4.7 Implications of Alternative Formulas for Market Access, Base Tariffs, and Reductions by Agricultural Reform Scenario
4.8 Implications of Alternative Scenarios for Protection by Commodity: Reductions in Global Average Tariff
5.1 Value of Production for TRQ versus Non-TRQ Commodities in OECD Countries, 2000
5.2 Value of Trade for TRQ versus Non-TRQ Commodities in OECD Countries, 2000
5.3 Value of Trade by Regime
5.4 Effects of Trade Liberalization on Value of Trade, by Regime
5.5 Estimates of Water in the Tariff for Selected TRQs
5.6 Value of In-Quota Trade and Fill Rates by TRQ Administration Method
5.7 Value of In-Quota Trade and Fill Rates by TRQ Additional Regulation
5.8 Fill Rate by Administration Method and Additional Regulation
5.9 Value of TRQ Trade by Economy
5.10 Value of Trade by Commodity
5.11 Changes in Administration Methods
5.12 STE, Domestic Policy Responses, and Rice Tariff quota in Japan
6.1 Decomposition of the Average Duty Faced by Each Exporting Country, 2001
6.2 Average World Applied and MFN Tariff Protection Rates, 2001
6.3 Average True Preferential Margin by Country, by Sector and Commodity
6.4 Simulation of the Impact of a Proportional Cut in Bound Duties under Scenarios 1 and 2
6.5 TRQ Rents Received by Selected Developing Country, in 2001 and after Scenarios 1 and 2
6.6 Sectoral and Geographical Breakdown in the Simulation Exercise
6.7 Simulated Impact of Two Alternative Agricultural Tariff Cut Scenarios on World Trade and Welfare
6.8: Simulated Impact of Two Alternative Agricultural Tariff Cut Scenarios on International Prices of Developing-Country Exports
6.9 Simulated Impact of Scenario 1 on Welfare, Terms of Trade, and Returns to Land, by Region
6.10 Detailed Impact of Two Tariff-Cutting Scenarios on Selected Sub-Saharan Countries
7.1 WTO Commitments and Notifications of Used Export Subsidies, 1995–2000
7.2 WTO Commitments and Notifications of the EU, by Product, 1995–2000
7.3 Export Subsidy Rates for Selected WTO Members, by Commodity
7.4 EU Export Subsidies and OECD PSEs, 1996–2002
7.5 EAGGF Subsidies by Commodity, 1995–2002
7.6 EAGGF Export Subsidies as a Share of All Subsidies, 1995–2002
7.7 EU Subsidization Rates (Relative to Value of Production), 1995–2002
7.8 EAGGF Refunds as a Percentage of EU Farm Exports, 1995–2002
7.9 Export Subsidy Equivalents for Major Users
8.1 Reported Domestic Support from the United States, 1995–2001
8.2 Reported Domestic Support from the European Union, 1995–2000
8.3 Reported Domestic Support from Japan, 1995–2000
Reported Domestic Support from Brazil, 1995–98

Market Price Support as a Percentage of Reported AMS, 1995–2001


U.S. Sugar Program AMS Calculations with Actual World Prices, 1995–2001

U.S. Sugar Program AMS Calculations with Actual Domestic and World Prices, 1995–2001

Current Total AMS, 1999, by Country and Commodity

Payments Not Included in Current Total AMS due to de Minimis, 1999, by Country and Commodity

EU15 AMS Notifications, by Commodity, 2000/1

United States AMS Notifications, by Commodity, 2001

Domestic Support Base Levels, New Commitments, and Latest WTO Notifications

 Domestic Support Reductions Needed

Agenda 2000 and MTR Intervention Price Reduction

EU15 AMS Adjusted for Intervention Price Changes

U.S. AMS Adjusted for Administered Dairy Price and Market Loss Assistance Payments

Domestic Support Reductions for Selected Countries

Alternative Reform Strategies

Value of the U.S. Peanut and Tobacco Buyouts

Cost of Possible Buyouts of the Main U.S. 2002 Farm Bill Support Payments

Average Tariff Protection Applied, by Economy or Region, Early 2000s

Effects of a Tiered Formula Cut in Agricultural Domestic Support, 2001

Import-Weighted Average Applied Tariffs, by Sector and Region, 2001

Import-Weighted Average Applied Tariffs, by Sector and Country, 2005

Impacts on Real Income from Full Liberalization of Global Merchandise Trade, by Country or Region, 2015

Impacts on Selected Trade Indicators from Full Liberalization of Global Merchandise Trade, 2015

Regional and Sectoral Sources of Gains from Full Liberalization of Global Merchandise Trade, 2015

Change in Developing Countries’ Shares of Global Output and Exports under Full Global Merchandise Trade Liberalization, by Sector, 2015

Impacts of Full Global Trade Liberalization on Agricultural and Food Output and Trade, by Country/Region, 2015

Impact of Full Liberalization of Global Merchandise Trade on Self-Sufficiency in Food and Agricultural Products, Selected Regions, 2015

Impacts of Full Global Merchandise Trade Liberalization on Real Factor Prices, 2015

Impact of Full and Partial Liberalization on Agricultural Value Added, 2015

Summary of Doha Partial Liberalization Scenarios Considered

Average Applied Tariffs for All Goods by Country/Region, for 2001 and 2015 Baselines, and for Doha Scenarios by 2015

Change from Baseline in Real Income under Alternative Doha Scenarios, 2015

Welfare Effect of Retaining Agricultural Export and Domestic Subsidies, 2015

Changes from Baseline in Bilateral Trade Flows from Full Global Liberalization and from Doha Scenario 7, 2015

Average Annual Agricultural Output and Employment Growth under Alternative
Scenarios, 2005–15

12.18 Share of Agricultural and Food Production Exported, by Country or Region under Alternative Scenarios, 2001 and 2015

12.19 Changes in Poverty under Alternative Scenarios, 2015

12.20 Impacts on Real Income from Full Liberalization of Global Merchandise Trade with and without Endogenous Productivity Growth, 2015


A12.2 Global Average Top-Level Armington Elasticities in the GTAP-AGR and LINKAGE Models, by Product

A12.3 Comparison of Base Case in 2015 versus Comparative Static Cases in 2001 for the Effects on Real Incomes of Full Liberalization of Global Merchandise Trade, by Country or Region
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The editors are extremely grateful to all the contributors to this volume for the collegiate way in which they worked so effectively as a team to produce a unified analysis of this important issue. Our thanks also extend to the Opening Discussants who participated in the workshop in The Hague, 1-2 December 2004, where first drafts were examined. In addition to the authors of chapters they include Nicolas, Imboden, Sam Laird, John Nash, Carlos Primo Braga, Wyatt Thomson, Rod Tyers, and Frank van Tongeren. Three referees also provided useful comments on the entire manuscript.

We are grateful also to the major funder of this research project, namely the United Kingdom’s Department for International Development. As well, the Dutch agricultural economics research institute, LEI, is to be thanked for superb local organizing of the December 2004 workshop in The Hague.

The usual disclaimer applies, that is, the material in this volume represents the authors’ own views and not necessarily those of their employers or of the World Bank Group, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments those Directors represent.
CONTRIBUTORS

Kym Anderson, Lead Economist (Trade Policy), Development Research Group, World Bank, on extended leave from his position as Professor of Economics and Executive Director, Centre for International Economic Studies (CIES), University of Adelaide, Australia

John C. Beghin, Professor of Economics, Head of Trade and Agricultural Policy Division in the Center for Agricultural and Rural Development (CARD), and Director, Food and Agricultural Policy Research Institute (FAPRI), Iowa State University, Ames, USA

Antoine Bouët, Economist, Centre d’Etudes Prospectives et d’Informations Internationales (CEPII), Paris, France

Eugenio Diaz-Bonilla, Executive Director for Argentina and Haiti, Inter-American Development Bank, Washington, DC, USA

Lionel Fontagné, Director, Centre d’Etudes Prospectives et d’Informations Internationales (CEPII), Paris, France

Harry de Gorter, Professor, Department of Agricultural Economics, Cornell University, Ithaca, USA

Chad E. Hart, Research Scientist, Center for Agricultural and Rural Development (CARD), and US Policy and Insurance Analyst, Food and Agricultural Policy Research Institute (FAPRI), Iowa State University, Ames, USA

Thomas W. Hertel, Distinguished Professor, Department of Agricultural Economics, and Executive Director, Center for Global Trade Analysis, Purdue University, West Lafayette, USA

Bernard Hoekman, Senior Advisor, Development Research Group, World Bank, Washington, DC, USA

Sébastien Jean, Economist, Centre d’Etudes Prospectives et d’Informations Internationales (CEPII), Paris, France

Hans G. Jensen, Research Fellow, Danish Research Institute of Food Economics, Royal Veterinary and Agricultural University, Copenhagen, Denmark

Tim Josling, Senior Fellow, Stanford Institute for International Studies and Professor Emeritus, Stanford University, Stanford, USA
Roman Keeney, Graduate Research Assistant and PhD student, Department of Agricultural Economics, Purdue University, West Lafayette, USA

Erika Kliauga, Graduate Research Assistant and PhD student, Department of Agricultural Economics, Cornell University, Ithaca, USA

David Laborde, Economist, Centre d'Etudes Prospectives et d’Informations Internationales (CEPII), Paris, France

Will Martin, Research Manager, Trade Unit, Development Research Group, World Bank, Washington, DC, USA

Dominique van der Mensbrugghe, Senior Economist, Development Prospects Group, World Bank, Washington DC, USA

Patrick Messerlin, Professor, Institut d’Etudes Politiques de Paris and Director, Groupe d’Economie Mondiale

David Orden, Senior Research Fellow, International Food Policy Research Institute, Washington DC, on extended leave from his position as Professor of Agricultural Economics, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, USA

Daniel A. Sumner, Frank H. Buck Jr. Professor, Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics, and Director of the Agricultural Issues Center, University of California, Davis, USA

Henrik Zobbe, Associate Professor, Danish Research Institute of Food Economics, Royal Veterinary and Agricultural University, Copenhagen, Denmark
### ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACP</td>
<td>African, Caribbean, and Pacific Group of States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGOA</td>
<td>African Growth and Opportunity Act (of the United States)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMS</td>
<td>aggregate measure of support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANZ</td>
<td>Australia and New Zealand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANZCERTA</td>
<td>ANZ Closer Economic Relations Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN</td>
<td>Association of South East Asian Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVE</td>
<td>ad valorem equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAP</td>
<td>Common Agricultural Policy (of the EU)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBI</td>
<td>Caribbean Basin Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEPII</td>
<td>Centre d’Etudes Prospectives et d’Informations Internationales, Paris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CES</td>
<td>constant elasticity of substitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGE</td>
<td>computable general equilibrium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGIAR</td>
<td>Consultative Group on International Agricultural Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSE</td>
<td>consumer subsidy equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDA</td>
<td>Doha Development Agenda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAGFF</td>
<td>European Agricultural Guidance and Guarantee Fund (of the EU)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBA</td>
<td>Everything But Arms (agreement of the EU)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC</td>
<td>European Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFTA</td>
<td>European Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPA</td>
<td>European Partnership Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GATS</td>
<td>General Agreement on Trade in Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GATT</td>
<td>General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEP</td>
<td>Global Economic Prospects (World Bank annual publication)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GSP</td>
<td>Generalized System of Preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GTAP</td>
<td>Global Trade Analysis Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HS6</td>
<td>Harmonized System version 6 (trade classification)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC</td>
<td>International Trade Centre (in Geneva)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAC</td>
<td>Latin American and the Caribbean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDC</td>
<td>Least developed countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAcMap</td>
<td>CEPII’s trade and protection data base</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFA</td>
<td>Multifibre Arrangement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFN</td>
<td>Most favored nation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPS</td>
<td>Market price support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTN</td>
<td>Multilateral trade negotiations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAFTA</td>
<td>North American Free Trade Agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSE</td>
<td>Producer subsidy equivalent, or producer support estimate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTA</td>
<td>Preferential trade agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quad</td>
<td>The United States, European Union, Japan, and Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R&amp;D</td>
<td>Research and development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RER</td>
<td>Real exchange rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REER</td>
<td>Real effective exchange rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROO</td>
<td>Rules of origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACU</td>
<td>South African Customs Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDT</td>
<td>Special and differential treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSM</td>
<td>Special safeguards mechanism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STE</td>
<td>State trading enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIM</td>
<td>Trade Implementation Mechanism (of the IMF)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRQ</td>
<td>Tariff rate quota</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCTAD</td>
<td>United Nations Conference on Trade and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UR</td>
<td>Uruguay Round</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URAA</td>
<td>Uruguay Round Agreement on Agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>