

**WORLD DEVELOPMENT REPORT (WDR) 2008**  
**Agriculture for Development**  
**Bamako Consultation– 2 to 3 April, 2007**

**Rapporteurs: Samuel Asuming-Brempong and Harouna Koné, assisted by Niama Nango Dembélé and John Staatz**

This report summarizes the key issues raised by the participants at the Bamako workshop to review the draft WDR. The list of participants appears in the annex. The participants strongly expressed their thanks to the World Bank for holding the consultation, thereby allowing them to have input into the WDR and making the process of developing the report collaborative rather than an “in-house” World Bank exercise.

**Key Issues from the discussions on day 1 - Monday ( 2 April 2007)**

*Comment*

Most decisions in the past seemed to have been taken outside Africa, and Africans have only been consumers of such decisions. This meeting is an opportunity to change that.

*Issues*

- Globalization is a reality in our world, and Africa is competing with other regions and countries (e.g. India, Malaysia, China, etc). Growth is therefore important, but the debate seemed to centre on a balance between growth and pro-poor policies. If we concentrate only on commercial smallholders, we cannot be sure of the distribution of gains.
- The report should reflect an ambitious and pro-active Africa willing to compete on the global market. For example, producing high-value crops for the global market like India and other countries, or taking advantage of the renewed interest in bio-fuels.
- There seems to be consensus on the need for agriculture to be demand-driven. We seem to emphasize the supply side most of the time. Can the value-chain approach be emphasized in the report as one of the key pillars for promoting agriculture in Africa? For example, the way Malaysia has handled oil palm, developing it from the seed to the market? Processing and its role in promoting agriculture should form a key component of the report.
- There was a debate here about the role of family farms in commercial agriculture. Can family farms be incorporated into commercial agriculture? There is need to evaluate the performance of different scales of agriculture. How do we improve livelihood in the rural areas?
- One key issue is what is needed to spur growth in agriculture.
- What about subsidies? e.g. SMART subsidies?
- The issue of regional protection?
- The debate about the determinants of growth ... is it lack of extension?
- What are the constraints to technology adoption? Is it availability of good technology? Is it the cost of adoption? The issue of natural resource management (NRM)? etc.

- The smallholder should be supported to integrate into the market. It should not be a question of EITHER large scale operators OR smallholders, but an integration. We must take advantage of dualism – large scale farmers, commercial smallholders and subsistence agriculture co-existing.
- The issue of the impact of urbanization on agriculture should be given much coverage in the report. For example, how the urban-rural linkage was affecting use of land (land tenure) and consumption patterns which affect demand for certain commodities (rice versus sorghum).
- A debate on the role of the state has not been addressed adequately. This should also include how public-private partnership can work to promote agriculture.
- A key issue is the development of rural infrastructure – roads, small-scale irrigation, rural electrification, information system (ICT), etc to facilitate agricultural development; in addition to effective macroeconomic policy environment.
- The role of regional trade and integration, and how they impact agriculture has not been sufficiently discussed in the report. How can the report take into account the existing programs, such as ECOWAS/CAADP?
- Discussion regarding diversification should be encouraged among small producers, taking into account the facilitating roles of infrastructure, incentives and institutions.
- But is there a trade-off between diversification and specialization in a market economy?

### **Key Issues from the discussions on day 2--Tuesday (3 April 2007)**

#### ***DECENTRALIZATION***

- Decentralization could be a key vehicle in transforming governance and grass roots participation in decision making in Africa. But difficult challenges confront the implementation process, including (i) fear of losing control by the central administration (e.g. payment of salaries), (ii) procurement processes, and the difficulty for communities to participate, and (iii) the large number of districts, and the problems of coordination of fragmented sub-sectors and many MDAs. What is the appropriate level of scale to promote agricultural growth; and what are the arrangements to allow inter-community coordination to achieve that scale.
- Decentralization looks more like the transfer of responsibilities from the central to the local level, but not transfer of requisite power and authority as well as adequate resources (human and financial) to manage the responsibility.
- Also, there is the problem of revenue collection (taxes), and the issue of accountability at the community level (who accounts to who?). It seems there is no mechanism to make appointees and elected officials accountable. There is clearly need for new institutional reforms to facilitate the decentralization process
- The need for capacity building was stressed; and a way to resolve the conflict of interest that seems to exist between the central ‘power’ and the local ‘power’ as both struggle to take ownership. In addition, there seems to be some inherent difficulty for new appointees to the communities and the old guards to cooperate

- and/or collaborate. Also how to get better cooperation between central government and local government representatives, and civil society and different community level organizations to take advantage of existing human resources. How can such conflicts be resolved to facilitate the decentralization process?
- A key issue to resolve is whether decentralization is good for agricultural development. What should be decentralized, and what are the potential benefits of decentralization to agriculture? Are there any support mechanisms and complementarities at the community level that will help agriculture benefit more from decentralization?

### ***REGIONALIZATION***

- The report needs to take better account of on-going regional efforts particularly the priorities identified in the NEPAD ECOWAS/CAADP process and these should go beyond just trade and research.
- There is need to rationalize regional efforts related to agriculture through the creation of strategic partnerships among organizations. For example, currently there are 45 different organizations working on economic integration in West Africa.
- There exist a number of programs in the sub-region, and there is a clear need to harmonize these into a coherent whole. One clear advantage seems to be the use of inter-regional trade to bridge the gap among countries in the sub-region, but this requires substantial levels of investment which seem to be lacking. What levels of investments will be required to promote inter-regional trade? How can the existing trader organizations (e.g. the ROESAO) be assisted to promote trade, and how can the potential of ICT be harnessed to support trade and regional integration, building on the experiences of PASIDMA, MISTOWA, and others?
- There was a discussion of regional protection against dumping of products commonly produced in the sub-region. Could a common tariff be arranged to deal with dumping in the sub-region, including issues relating to sensitive products?
- The issue of competitiveness in the face of high transaction cost in the sub-region (e.g. cost of crossing borders) was discussed. What can be done to make products in the sub-region competitive vis-a-vis the domestic and world markets in the face of existing high transaction cost? Where should the emphasis be? If we can reduce transaction cost, shall we need protection, for example?
- There was the issue of the regionalization of research. The problem was how to coordinate research in the sub-region to support the four pillars of CAADP. For example, how do we deal with the diversity and heterogeneity of the sub-region to respond to specific needs, such as the identification of products that have high potential to contribute to growth; and how do we gain economies of scale in research through more productive networks.
- The issue of ageing research capacity in the sub-region was stressed. A clear need emerged to revamp institutional research capacity, in particular, there is need to

include the universities more in the agricultural research system and to strengthen their capacity to train the next generation of researchers.

### ***NON-FARM PATHWAYS OUT OF POVERTY***

- The non-farm enterprises are generally far from the urban centres, so the emphasis should be on the creation of profitable high labour use for increased marketable surpluses, especially for high value products. A key question is whether subsidies are needed to jump-start this process? What kind of subsidies might be needed, targeted subsidies or subsidies in the form of packages that address various aspects of the value-chain?
- The participants strongly expressed the need for the report to analytically raise the issue of subsidies and protection as part of an agricultural growth agenda for Sub-Saharan Africa.

### ***CONCLUSIONS***

One of the key challenges is how to implement proposed strategies, which comes down to problems of governance. Currently, the agenda dealing with agricultural development is split up, in most countries, across many different ministries, leading to problems of coordination and implementation.

The WDR team emphasized the following points that they drew from the discussions over the two days in Bamako:

- The report needs to give more emphasis to regional efforts, such as CAADP and the role of regional networks of traders
- There is a need for some more direct addressing of the issues regarding subsidies.
- Strengthen the emphasis on the role of value chains, agribusiness and the private sector and how they develop (e.g., through private-public partnerships).
- There is perhaps more scope for a positive role for biofuels in SSA, based on oil palm, cassava, jatropha, etc.
- The new roles for the state in promoting agriculture for development are complex and require new skills and capacity. The report needs to stress the need to develop such capacities (e.g., in managing value chains, developing private-public partnerships, dealing with coordination across sectors, and doing all this within a system of decentralized governance. The capacity building needs are particularly great at the local levels, but includes both the state and new actors, including the private sector.
- The discussions in Bamako reinforced the importance of promoting growth, through the most dynamic parts of agriculture, as part of an agriculture-for-development agenda. The challenge is how to make such growth as compatible as possible with poverty alleviation. There is a need to make the interface as broad as possible between the growth and poverty agendas.
- The discussions also stressed the importance of decentralization, but also using decentralization as a means for creating new opportunities for employment and

growth poles—e.g., through a territorial development approach. The challenge for decentralization is to go beyond just providing health and education to provide the other public goods necessary for agricultural growth.

- The discussions also reinforced the rising importance of well-functioning labor markets to help transfer some of the benefits of agricultural productivity growth into poverty alleviation via employment creation. The rise of production of higher value added activities in extended agriculture will increase the importance of labor markets.
- A challenge in Sub-Saharan Africa is the need for a comprehensive approach to get agriculture moving for growth and poverty alleviation (due to missing public goods, etc.). Thus, coordination is very important, but very difficult. The team would appreciate receiving information on good examples of such coordination.
- The issue of implementation is a question of political economy—the need to build coalitions to lobby for pro-growth agricultural policies and for budget for agriculture. Are there good case studies available of this being done?

**Réunion sur le Rapport du Développement Mondial 2008**  
***Agriculture pour le Développement***  
**Liste des participants**

<b>No</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Country</b>	<b>Designation</b>	<b>Adresses E-mail/Tel/Fax</b>
1	John IGUE	Bénin	Former Minister of Industry medium and small scale enterprises and Consultant	08 BP: 0592 - Cotonou Tel: (229) 21 30 76 95 or 73 Fax: (229) 21 30 52 41 Email: <a href="mailto:clubdeveille@yahoo.fr">clubdeveille@yahoo.fr</a> / lares@intnet.bj
2	Soulé Bio Goura	Bénin	Directeur du LARES Cotonou	08 BP : 0592 - Cotonou Tel : (229) 21 30 52 40 Fax : (229) 21 30 52 41 Email: <a href="mailto:soule_goura@yahoo.fr">soule_goura@yahoo.fr</a> / lares@intnet.bj
3	Bernard Lédéa	Burkina	Président, Fédération Nationale des Groupements NAAM (FNGN)	BP: 100 Ouahigouya, Burkina Faso Tel: (226) 40 55 04 11. Cell: 70 20 74 20 Fax: (226) 40 55 01 62 Email: <a href="mailto:fugn@fasonet.bf">fugn@fasonet.bf</a>
4	Dramane Coulibaly	Burkina	Coordinator of Food Security Programs CILSS	03 BP 7049 Ouagadougou 03 Tel: (226) 37 41 25/26/31/33 Cel : (226) 70 26 19 12 Email: <a href="mailto:Dramane.coulibaly@cilss.bf">Dramane.coulibaly@cilss.bf</a>
5	François Lompo	Burkina	INERA, Burkina-Faso	03 BP 7192 Ouagadougou 03 Tel:(226) 70 26 12 04 Fax (226) 50 34 02 71 Email : <a href="mailto:frlompo@yahoo.fr">frlompo@yahoo.fr</a>

6	Mushtaq Ahmed	Canada	Economic Policy Advisor –Agriculture CIDA-ACDI	Canadian International Development Agency 200 Promenade du Portage, Gatineau (Québec) Canada K1A OG4 Tel: 819-934-8505 Fax: 819-953-63 56 Email: MUSTHTAQ_AHMED@acdi-cida.gc.ca
7	Botty Rosalief	Cote d'Ivoire	Présidente, ROESAO National Coordination, Abidjan	15 BP 690, Abidjan 15 Tel: (225) 0578 5782 ; Cel: 07 293949 Fixes: (225) 22 52 29 47 Email: <a href="mailto:rosaliebotti@yahoo.fr">rosaliebotti@yahoo.fr</a>
8	Agesheka Harouna	Ghana	Secretary General ROESAO-GAPTO	P.O. Box: Tel: (233) 24 43 79 268/ 233 21 672357 Fax: (223) 21 67 2357 Email: <a href="mailto:gaptosheka@yahoo.com">gaptosheka@yahoo.com</a> /gapto@4u.com.gh
9	Kofi Debrah	Ghana	Chief of Party, MISTOWA Project, IFDC Africa Division.	PMB: 284 CT, Cantonments, Accra, Ghana Tel: + 233 21 78 08 30; + 233 244 21 44 89 Fax: + 233 21 78 08 29 Email: <a href="mailto:kdebrah@ifdc.org">kdebrah@ifdc.org</a> ; kofidebrah@usa.net
10	Sam Asuming-Brempong	Ghana	Department of Agricultural Economics & Agribusiness , College of Agriculture and Consumer , Sciences University of Ghana , Lagon, Accra, GHANA	P.P. Box LG 68, LEGON, ACCRA, GHANA Tel: 233 244 28 78 21 Fax: 233 21 500629 Email: <a href="mailto:samasum@ug.edu.gh">samasum@ug.edu.gh</a>
11	Abiodun O. Falusi	Nigeria	Professor of Agricultural Economics University of Ibadan	BP: U.I. P.O. Box 19979, Ibadan, NIGERIA Tel: 234 806 43 88 382 Fax: Email: <a href="mailto:afalusi@yahoo.com">afalusi@yahoo.com</a>
12	Saidou Koala	Niger	Regional Director ICRISAT Sahelian Center, Niamey, Niger	BP 12404 Niamey, Niger Tel: 227 20 72 2626/72 25 27 Fax: 227 20 73 43 29 Email: <a href="mailto:s.koala@cgiar.org">s.koala@cgiar.org</a>

13	Jupiter Ndjeunga	Niger	Principal Scientist ICRISAT Sahelian Center, Niamey Niger	BP 12404 Niamey, Niger Tel: (227) 72 27 25/25-29 Fax: (227) 20 73 43 29 Email: <a href="mailto:n.jupiter@cgiar.org">n.jupiter@cgiar.org</a>
14	Samba Ly	Niger	Directeur Général INRAN Niamey, Niger	BP: 429, Niamey, Niger Tel: (227).2179 0321/ 9698 0668 Email: <a href="mailto:asambly@yahoo.fr">asambly@yahoo.fr</a> / <a href="mailto:inran@intnet.ne">inran@intnet.ne</a>
15	Baba Dioum	Sénégal	Coordinateur Général CMA/AOC	BP 15799 Dakar-Fann Tel: (221) 869 11 90 Fax: (221) 869-11-93 Email: <a href="mailto:cmaoc@cmaoc.org">cmaoc@cmaoc.org</a> , <a href="mailto:bdioum@cmaoc.org">bdioum@cmaoc.org</a>
16	Mbaye Yade	Nigéria	Regional Coordinator SAKSS - West Africa IITA	IITA, c/o L.W. Lambourn & Co Carolyn House, 26 Dingwall Road Croydon, CR9 3EE UK Tel: (234) 241 2626 Fax: (234) 241 22 21 Email: <a href="mailto:M.YADE@CGIAR.ORG">M.YADE@CGIAR.ORG</a>
17	Paco Sérémé	Sénégal	Secrétaire Exécutif CORAF/WECARD	BP 48 Dakar, Sénégal 7, Avenue Bourguiba Tel : (221) 869 96 18/22 Fax : (221) 869 96 31 Email: <a href="mailto:paco.sereme@coraf.org">paco.sereme@coraf.org</a>
18	Dunstan Spencer	Sierra Léone	Dunstan Spencer & Associates	27 Guy Street, PMB 108 Freetown Tel: (232)76610441 Fax: Email: <a href="mailto:dscspencer@gmail.com">dscspencer@gmail.com</a>
19	Dr. Kandeh Yumkella	Sierra Leone	Director-General , UNIDO	UNIDO Headquarters Vienna International Centre Wagramerstr.5 P.O Box 300 A- 1400 Vienna, Austria Tel: + 43 (1) 26026-0 ext. 3001 Fax: + 43 (1) 26922669

				Email: <a href="mailto:k.yumkella@unido.org">k.yumkella@unido.org</a>
20	Eklu Daniel	Nigeria	Directeur ECOWAS Department of Agriculture and Rural Development	PMB 401 Abuja, Nigeria Tel: (234) 93 14 76 36 / 234 80 4221 49 56 Fax: (234) 9314 3005 Email: <a href="mailto:daneklu@yahoo.fr">daneklu@yahoo.fr</a> ; <a href="mailto:deklu@ecowas.int">deklu@ecowas.int</a>
21	Moustapha Amadou	Mali	Directeur Général Institut du Sahel, Bamako-Mali	BP:1530, Bamako - Mali Tel: (223) 222 23 37 / 223 40 67 Cell: (223) 674 41 20 Fax : (223) 222 78 31 Email: <a href="mailto:dginsah@insah.org">dginsah@insah.org</a>
22	Bakary Kanté	Mali	Spécialiste des questions agricoles au Millennium Challenge Account, Bamako, Mali	BP : 2385, Rue de l'Yser, Porte 610 Imm CSLP, Bamako – Mali Tel: +223 (222) 0959- Bureau Fax : Email: <a href="mailto:kanteb56@hotmail.com">kanteb56@hotmail.com</a>
23	Bino Témé	Mali	Directeur Général Institut d'Economie Rurale, Bamako, Mali	BP 258 Bamako Tel: (223) 222 19 05 or 222 26 06 or 222 01 16 Fax : 223-223 37 75 or 222 73 55 Email: <a href="mailto:bino.teme@ier.ml">bino.teme@ier.ml</a>
24	Bréhima Sangaré	Mali	Director Planning and Monitoring Division Commissariat Sécurité Alimentaire	Tel: (223) 229 15 36 Fax : (223) 229 85 73 Email: <a href="mailto:csa@cefib.com">csa@cefib.com</a>
25	Ba Diao Maty	Mali	Institut du Sahel, INSAH, Bamako- Mali Expert en sécurité Alimentaire	BP: 1530, Bamako - Mali Tel: (223) 222 80 86 Cell : (223) 640 69 81

				Fax: (223) 222 78 31 Email: <a href="mailto:mbadio@insah.org">mbadio@insah.org</a>
26	Diarra Aminata	Mali	President FENAFER	BP: 05 Koulikoro – Cel (223) 638 38 48 Tel: (223) 221 87 25 / (223) 226 22 91 Fax (223) 221 87 37 Email: <a href="mailto:apcam@apcam.org">apcam@apcam.org</a> ; <a href="mailto:mmdiarra@hotmail.com">mmdiarra@hotmail.com</a>
27	Konaré Nafissatou Guindo	Mali	Consultante	BP 1684 Bamako, Mali Tel: (223 221-73-85 (domicile), Cell: (223) 679-78-78 Fax : Email: <a href="mailto:nafguindo@yahoo.fr">nafguindo@yahoo.fr</a>
28	Moussa Ouattara	Mali	Coordinateur National Millenium Challenge Account (MCA) Mali	BP : 2385, Rue de l'Yser, Porte 610 Imm CSLP, Bamako – Mali Tel : +223 (222) 0959- Bureau Cel : + 223 (675) 8124 Fax : Email : <a href="mailto:ouattaram@mcamali.org">ouattaram@mcamali.org</a>
29	Sangho Yeyande	Mali	Chargé Principal des Operations du Développement Rural, Banque Mondiale Bamako – Mali	BP : 1864 Tel : (223) 222 22 83 Fax : Email : <a href="mailto:ysangho@worldbank.org">ysangho@worldbank.org</a>
30	Souleymane Keita	Mali	ROSAO-CONOESAM Bamako, Mali	BP : 49A Kati Tel : (223) 227 21 85 / 221 87 25 Cel : (223) 639 06 12 Fax : (223) 221 87 37 Email : <a href="mailto:smkeitapfp@yahoo.fr">smkeitapfp@yahoo.fr</a>
31	Bonny R. Ntare	Mali	Chercheur Principal et Représentant résident de l'ICRISAT/Mali Bamako	BP : 320, Bamako - Mali Tel : 223 222 33 75 Fax : 223 222 86 83 Email: <a href="mailto:b.ntare@cgiar.org">b.ntare@cgiar.org</a>

32	John Staatz	USA	Professor and co-Director, Food Security Cooperative Agreement Dept. of Agricultural Economics MSU, USA	205 Agriculture Hall East Lansing, MI 48824-1039 Tel. 1 (517) 355-1519 Fax: 1(517) 432-1800 Email: <a href="mailto:staat@msu.edu">staat@msu.edu</a>
33	Niama Nango Dembélé	Mali	PROMISAM Coördinateur Président de MSU Bamako	BP: E2906, Bamako - Mali Tel: 222 34 19 ; Cell: 631 71 99 Fax: (223) 223 34 82 Email: dembele@msu.edu
34	Alain de Janvry	USA	Professor Department of Agricultural and Resource Economics, University of California/Berkeley	211 Giannini Hall, University of California Berkeley, CA 94720-3310 Tel: + 1- (510) 642-3348 Fax: + 1-10-643-89 11 Email: <a href="mailto:alain@are.berkeley.edu">alain@are.berkeley.edu</a>
35	Derek Byerlee	USA	World Bank	World Bank 1818 H Street NW Washington DC 20433 Tel: + 1 (202) 458-7287 Fax: Email: <a href="mailto:dbyerlee@worldbank.org">dbyerlee@worldbank.org</a>
36	Karen Brooks	USA	Sector manager, Agricultural and Rural Operations, Africa Region World Bank	World Bank 1818 H Street NW Washington DC 20433 Tel: (202) 473 04 20 Fax: Email: <a href="mailto:kbrooks@worldbank.org">kbrooks@worldbank.org</a>
37	Mark E Cackler	USA	Sector Manager Agriculture and Rural Development Department The World Bank	1818 H Street NW, Washington DC Tel: 202/473 8999 Fax: 202/676 0199 Email: <a href="mailto:mackler@worldbank.org">mackler@worldbank.org</a>
38	Patrick Kormawa	Sierra Leone	Specialist Assistant to Director General, UNIDO	UNIDO Headquarters Vienna International Centre Wagramerstr.5 P.O Box 300 A- 1400 Vienna, Austria

				Tel: + 43 (1) 260263011 Fax: + 43 (1) 26922669 Email: P.Kormawa@unido.org
39	Harouna Koné	Mali	DRPSIAP/SIKASSO	BP: 22 Tel: 2620 301 Fax: 2620 301 Email: <a href="mailto:harounkone@yahoo.fr">harounkone@yahoo.fr</a> ; <a href="mailto:drpsdb@datatech.net.ml">drpsdb@datatech.net.ml</a>