DIAGNOSTIC STUDY ON GOVERNANCE IN THE REPUBLIC OF COTE D’IVOIRE

Final Report

Executive Summary and Recommendations

December 2010
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Institutional and Methodological Factors and Activities Conducted

The CERFE and CREA, partners in this World Bank-commissioned project (with CERFE playing the lead role), have conducted a “Diagnostic Study on Governance in Côte d'Ivoire,” based on the terms of reference prepared by the World Bank.

The purpose of this study is to assess the problems related to governance in Côte d'Ivoire, especially in the social sectors (education and health, in particular), and to obtain qualitative and quantitative data on the quality of basic services and the scope of corruption.

This study included:

- A quantitative household survey (a national sample\textsuperscript{88} of 920 household members composed of two sub-samples of 460 adult household members—the head of household or another adult member—and 460 persons who had recently used social services, in particular health and education services) conducted in July/August 2010;
- A quantitative survey targeting government employees and elected officials (380 persons in different categories: elected officials at the central and local levels, government employees at the centralized and decentralized levels, etc.) conducted between July and September 2010;
- A qualitative review of the press (articles appearing in Côte d'Ivoire's main newspapers between July 1 and October 31, 2010);
- A qualitative consultative process with leaders/representatives of civil society organizations, conducted in October 2010; and
- A qualitative review of other studies and documents (dated 2009 or 2010) reflecting the views of heads of enterprises and companies.

This study is part of the World Bank's broad research program on governance. Based on the approach adopted, governance refers to all processes used to exercise authority in the

\textsuperscript{88} The two quantitative surveys were conducted in the two urban districts of Abidjan and Yamoussoukro and in the following six regions: Bas-Sassandra, Haut-Sassandra, Savanes, Bandama Valley, Zanzan, and 18 Montagnes.
management of economic and social resources for development. Governance encompasses the good quality, capacity, and functioning of government and the public and/or public interest sector in the broad sense of the term (including such services as justice, transport, health, and education) and in relation to society (enterprises, citizens, etc.). Based on this definition, six components are included in the concept of governance: voice and accountability, political stability and absence of violence, government effectiveness, regulatory quality, rule of law, and control of corruption.

The analysis of data is based, inter alia, on an interrelation among the various sources of information (including available documentation and scientific literature) and the perspectives obtained (comparative analysis). Comparisons were also done with other similar studies, to the extent possible, particularly those conducted by the World Bank in other countries or those already conducted in Côte d’Ivoire.

The study documented, insofar as possible, the situation with respect to governance by noting:

- Specific events experienced personally by the different actors (through their families, enterprises, etc.) or those that they know of (including events that sound initial alarm or warning bells; that is, events that may occur just once but are considered symptomatic of a major problem, weakness, or disturbing practice); and
- Opinions/points of view in the strict sense of these terms.

Work on this diagnostic study started in April 2010 and ended in December 2010.

**Governance in Côte d’Ivoire: Strengths and Weaknesses**

The main results of this study are summarized below:

Based on this diagnostic study, the governance situation in Côte d’Ivoire seems to be serious in several respects. By way of illustration, mention can be made of the following findings:

a) The level of confidence in the ability of institutions in Côte d’Ivoire (Office of the President, Office of the Prime Minister, Parliament, and ministries) to resolve the main problems facing the country is very low:

- Among government employees/elected officials, this level never exceeded 46.1 percent for any problem related to the Office of the President and was even lower for other institutions; and
- Among households, this level never exceeded 46.5 percent for any problem related to the Office of the President and was even lower for other institutions.
b) The level of confidence in and perception of civil society are also not very favorable. For example:
- With respect to problems facing civil society, government employees/elected officials pointed to a lack of credibility (81.3 percent), a low level of civic participation (76.6 percent), the lack or low level of leadership skills and competencies (83.9 percent); the lack or low level of independent economic resources (75.5 percent); and involvement in conflict (64.5 percent—a slightly lower percentage);
- Close to two in five citizens and the same proportion of government employees view civil society organizations as lacking credibility with respect to combating corruption; and
- Civil society representatives themselves pointed to numerous of weaknesses, among them the lack or low level of leadership skills and competencies and the lack of independent economic resources.

c) Problems also exist with the quality and accessibility of social services (government effectiveness). With regard to health services in general and university hospital centers in particular (but not exclusively), mention can be made of:
- The shortage of staff to provide various services (noted by 20.4 percent of citizens who responded);
- The shortage of medication and other supplies needed to perform the services sought (25.7 percent);
- Attempts by staff to make direct sales of medication or other necessary supplies to users (32.4 percent);
- Long waits (over two hours) to receive the services sought (58.8 percent); and
- Poor sanitation conditions (31.2 percent) and a shortage of toilets (28.1 percent).

d) In the case of education services, we found the following:
- The lack or shortage of teaching materials or books (mentioned by 22.8 percent of citizens who responded);
- School buildings in poor condition (26.6 percent);
- Poor sanitation conditions (30.9 percent) and a shortage of working toilets (36.5 percent).
- The revelation by the Ivorian press of a very serious national education crisis in Côte d’Ivoire.

e) An even greater number of problems were identified with the judicial system. They include:
- The protracted nature and complexity of proceedings in this sector; with 74.7 percent of citizens mentioning the former problem and 73.6 percent the latter;
- Corruption and a lack of transparency, which was mentioned by two-thirds of respondents;
• The lack of equity in decisions handed down and prohibitive costs. This places the justice system virtually out of the reach of the most disadvantaged citizens (a situation noted by 67.2 percent of respondents); and
• The lack of independence, mentioned by 60 percent of respondents, of the judicial system relative to the other “powers” (in particular the Executive and major economic players).

f) Moreover, the rule of law is not fully upheld. For example:
• One in six citizens noted that, in the past ten years, either they or someone very close to them was searched without a warrant;
• One in six citizens noted that, in the past ten years, either they or someone very close to them was arrested without a warrant and imprisoned;
• One in twenty citizens noted that, in the past ten years, possession was taken of their home or of the home of someone very close to them without a legal decision;
• More than two in three citizens indicated that, owing to the many obstacles faced with access to the justice system, some individuals, especially the poorest groups, are shut out of the system; and
• One in seven citizens indicated that, in the past twelve months, they (or a family member) had used a mechanism other than the justice system to resolve a conflict.

g) Lastly, economic activity is stymied by:
• Numerous obstacles to the conduct of business with the Government (the most serious being payment delays by the Government and the complexity and lack of transparency in bidding and procurement procedures noted by government employees, as well as serious political instability, the very low rate of effectiveness and efficiency of government administrations, the shortage of available infrastructure, and inefficiencies in the justice system noted by entrepreneurs);
• Very great difficulty gaining access to credit;
• Very high average costs, including investment capital for new business start-up; and
• The absence of a real national industrial and recovery policy for post-crisis production activities.

More specifically, the situation as it relates to corruption is also difficult. We can point in particular to the findings derived from this diagnostic study.

a) All persons interviewed perceived corruption as one of the most serious problems, placing it on almost the same level as problems associated with the high cost of living, poverty, or price increases. The intensity of this phenomenon was stressed by all civil society representatives interviewed. In particular, corruption in the public
sector was placed on the same level as other serious problems, on a par with those that we have mentioned briefly and with which the country has been grappling in recent years, as indicated by close to 90 percent of respondents (in particular by 88.7 percent of adult household members and by 91.3 percent of government employees interviewed). Corruption is viewed as less of a problem in the private sector, although it was cited by almost 70 percent of household members and 62 percent of government employees.

b) One in four persons mentioned corruption, generally in the different public interest services. On a service by service basis, the number was never more than one in nine (in the case of education, for example). However, if we also take into account access to the different services, as we should (thus taking into account the net rate of corruption), the situation changes radically in that corruption in the public sector is not merely perceived but actually experienced by households in Côte d’Ivoire when they interact with the services in question. To cite a few examples, the numbers of persons who indicated that they paid bribes in the past two years are as follows:

- One in sixteen persons who had contact (directly or through a family member) with the health services;
- One in eight who dealt with the education services;
- One in six who had contact with the police force;
- One in four who dealt with mayoral offices;
- One in five who dealt with offices issuing drivers’ licenses;
- One in three who dealt with the customs authorities;
- Two in five who had contact with judges and court officers; and
- Two in five who dealt with the traffic police.

c) Furthermore, there is a general lack of transparency in procedures that govern central and local government administrations in the areas of both internal decisions and the creation of public sector contracts. In this regard, it should be borne in mind that:

- One in every three government employees/elected officials pointed to a total or near-total lack of transparency in decisions related to personnel management in their institutions;
- Virtually the same number (one in every three government employees/elected officials) pointed to a lack of transparency in budget decisions;
- Slightly more than one in five government employees/elected officials pointed to a total or near-total lack of transparency in the determination of contractual procedures;
- One in six government employees/elected officials indicated that, based on their direct or indirect experience, subordinates of their colleagues, their
colleagues, and their superiors “buy” their positions frequently or very frequently; and
• Lastly, one in two government employees/elected officials indicated that contracts and procurement between the State and enterprises are either never or rarely concluded in a transparent manner.

d) The problem of corruption, in terms of both perception and reality, is therefore serious. We also realized that, in practical terms, acts of corruption are frequent and widespread, but not very extreme. We note that the minimum amounts paid by citizens to public services, at least those most often visited, range from CFAF 300 to CFAF 500 (US$ .60 to slightly over US$1). Using average values, these amounts are significant for most citizens, though they are not particularly high. We note that these sums increase to:
• Roughly CFAF 13,200 (approximately US$27) in the case of national education, where one would assume that these sums are paid for the service in general, such as illegal annual “tuition,” rather than on an ad hoc basis each time access is gained to a service;
• Approximately CFAF 4,800 (a little over US$10) for health services;
• Slightly over CFAF 1,700 (a little over US$3.50) for municipal services; and
• Roughly CFAF 1,600 (slightly over US$3) in the case of the traffic police.

As we have seen in the first part of Chapter 6 (but also in the preceding points), corruption, in terms of practices in the government administration, seems to have a much greater impact on the careers of staff than on budget management or procurement. In this case, we are also probably looking at small rather than large scale corruption (though the latter certainly does exist).

e) Of course, this small scale corruption is also accompanied by large scale corruption, through which various “power groups” try to influence public decisions for private ends. This situation exists in the area of public sector contracts (it should be borne in mind also that the maximum bribes in some services are as high as CFAF 100,000, CFAF 200,000, and CFAF 300,000). In this regard—as has been noted by virtually all civil society representatives interviewed, along with the media from time to time, and as confirmed in the documentation reviewed on transactions in business circles—illicit payments are made in order to:
• Do business with customs (56.6 percent of cases);
• Expedite judicial procedures (55 percent of cases);
• Obtain a public contract (52 percent of cases); and
• Influence financial and economic policies, laws, and regulations (29.2 percent of cases).

Furthermore, these persons suggest that the percent of an invoice that businesspersons are required to hand over in order to receive payment is thought to be around 19 percent.
Governance in Côte d'Ivoire: Positive Aspects/Strengths

Despite the picture we have just presented, the situation is not entirely negative. We can, in fact, point to a number of positive aspects.

a) The governance situation, as it relates to the “voice and accountability” component, is fairly good, and is characterized by the following aspects, among others:
   - Easy access to information (according to 95 percent of citizens interviewed and all government employees) and a range of information sources (several newspapers, extensive access to international channels, etc.);
   - Near total freedom of information (a point also stressed by all civil society representatives interviewed and by the press itself, despite a few unfortunate incidents);
   - Small but positive signs pointing to the capacity and willingness of government administrations to be accountable to their citizens (in particular, one in eighteen citizens is thought to have participated in public initiatives to prepare local budgets); and
   - Fairly frequent partnering between government administrations and civil society (62.1 percent of government employees mentioned this, as did a majority of citizens and civil society representatives).

b) Furthermore, we note the fairly significant involvement of citizens in civil society groups. By way of example:
   - More than one in three women is a member of a women’s association;
   - Nearly one in five citizens is a member of a village development committee;
   - Nearly one in eight citizens is a member of a cooperative or association of farmers, fishermen, livestock producers, or artisans; and
   - Close to one in four citizens is a member of a religious group or movement or of a faith-based group.

c) The conflict with which the country has grappled in recent years seems\(^{89}\) to be much more of a political crisis than one linked to ethnic, religious, cultural, or socio-economic problems (we are not playing down the latter but are not linking them directly to the conflict), and thus to endemic situations that are much more difficult to manage and overcome.\(^{90}\)

\(^{89}\) We note that this study was conducted prior to the events that followed the second round of presidential elections. Moreover, the crisis that erupted right after the election seems more like a very severe political crisis than an ethnic or religious crisis.

\(^{90}\) We note that this study was conducted prior to the events that followed the second round of presidential elections. Moreover, the crisis that erupted right after the election seems to be more a very severe political crisis than an ethnic or religious crisis.
In this regard, it should be borne in mind that the “persistence of ethnic, religious, and/or linguistic tensions” was indicated as an obstacle to the stabilization process by “only” one in two respondents, while other obstacles such as “the fragmentation of the country,” “the economic crisis facing the country,” or “the persistence of armed groups” was cited by virtually all respondents or by four in five.

All told, this situation attests to the relatively low level of violence associated with the conflict situation in the country, the number of victims of which has been small (although we do not want to downplay the extremely serious nature of these deaths) compared to similar situations in other countries, such as Sierra Leone, Liberia, or Rwanda.

In other words, the political instability and violence seen in the country in recent years do not seem to have been defined by structural factors and can thus be resolved through a political process similar to the one currently underway in Côte d’Ivoire (which, of course, is plagued by many problems) since 2007.

d) While the problems associated with the quality of social services cannot be described as very serious (as we have just noted), the two services, among others, in which we are most interested (health and education), since they are the ones most frequently used, received fairly favorable assessments. An examination of the four services used by over 40 percent of citizens in the past two years reveals that:

- The quality of health services score is +10 (on a variable scale of -100 to +100);
- Using this same index, the score for education services is +4;
- The score for the Ivorian Electricity Company is +33; and
- The score for the Water Distribution Company is +39.

While it is true that there are other services that received very low scores, such as the traffic police, the police force, the judicial system, and the customs authorities (-70, -50, -16, and -72 respectively), only 10 to 15 percent of the population has contact with these services.

e) Furthermore, for all four services used by more than 40 percent of the population over the past two years, most persons noted an improvement in quality during that period. Respondents noted an improvement in:

- Public health services (57.1 percent of cases);
- National education services (47 percent of cases);
- The Ivorian Electricity Company (65.8 percent of cases); and
- The Water Distribution Company (68.9 percent of cases).

91 For each service, this score is calculated as the difference between the evaluation—expressed as a percentage—of positive qualities, and the evaluation—expressed as a percentage—of negative qualities.
Side by side with widespread corruption throughout the country is the strong desire by most respondents to change the current situation, despite the numerous obstacles that exist and the fact that the system allows for only very limited opportunities to transform this widespread desire to combat corruption into concrete action. In this regard, we can summarize a number of the findings of this diagnostic study.

a) In light of the fact that virtually all respondents view corruption as one of the most serious problems plaguing modern-day Ivorian society and only a small number of citizens (11.3 percent) and government employees (8.7 percent) tended to deny existence of the problem, it is therefore reasonable to conclude that only one in ten Ivorians is not actually interested, at least based on the information provided, in the problem of corruption and its effects.

b) This seems to be borne out by the fact that most respondents (close to 83 percent of households and 89 percent of elected officials) in fact indicated a strong desire for a change in the current situation and hold the view that anti-corruption efforts should be one of the biggest priorities of the country’s Government. The view is also shared by the majority of civil society representatives interviewed.

c) Moreover, it seems clear that most respondents are not willing to justify the actions of persons who benefit from widespread and entrenched corruption and do not intend to live in such an environment. In this regard, it should be borne in mind that:
   • Approximately two-thirds of the citizens and government employees who actually responded to this question hold the view that the low salaries of government employees in no way justify the solicitation of bribes; and;
   • More than one in two citizens and two in five government employees disagree with the assertion that “corruption is a tradition and a habit.”

f) As a result of the calculations obtained from the credibility index92 in the context of anti-corruption efforts, it was possible to identify, based on the information of respondents, the existence of actors who, although they had few opportunities to play a specific role in anti-corruption efforts relative to those vested with legislative, judicial, and executive powers, can facilitate a shift in the culture associated with this phenomenon. In this regard, we note the actors with a positive credibility index:
   • International organizations (index +48.3);
   • Catholic church (+40.3);
   • Imams and mosques (+32.8);
   • NGOs (+16.1);93 and
   • Academicians and professors (+0.2).

---

92 The difference between positive values (those who view the entities in question as completely or almost completely credible) and negative values (those who view the entities in question as having little or no credibility).

93 It should be noted that several civil society organization leaders see themselves as playing a significant role in anti-corruption efforts.
However, this strong desire to change the status quo and combat corruption seems to be stymied by deficiencies in the current political and judicial instruments; the former are virtually unknown to most of the population and have a limited impact on daily lives, and the latter are very slow, complicated, and above all, inefficient. Consequently, the following reasons account for failure to report cases of corruption:

- For almost two in three respondents (citizens and government employees), the view that even if a decision is made, it will be met with impunity;
- For almost two in three respondents, the view that no investigation will be held following a report of corruption;
- For almost two in three respondents, the view that cases of corruption are impossible to prove; and
- For almost one in two respondents, the view that the process is too long and complex.

Lastly, in most instances, knowledge of anti-corruption instruments is lacking. We note, for example, that only one in twenty citizens and one in three government employees are aware of the existence of the National Governance and Capacity-Building Secretariat (Secrétariat National à la Gouvernance et au Renforcement des Capacités SNGRC), and those who are aware of it view it as having little effect.

The Challenges Posed By Corruption

It would therefore seem that, far from being a country where corruption “simply” exists as an endemic phenomenon, Côte d’Ivoire is, like most countries with a similar history, a country with two opposing currents corresponding to two contextual situations. Corruption is influenced by the prevalence of one current over the other and thus (in a positive sense) by the possibility of moving the equilibrium point between these two contexts toward a more robust and more effective effort to combat corruption, based not only on the intent of actors, but also and above all, on the possibility and capacity to take action to achieve this goal. This ultimately entails identifying and implementing largely political solutions based on popular consensus, on the capacities of leaders and administrators, on the clarity of objectives, on the actual desire to eliminate obstacles, on the ability to determine effective instruments, and on the availability of funds.

---

94 We note that almost two in three officials view the tools available to the SNGRC (65.2 percent) as being inadequate. Furthermore, roughly the same proportion of respondents (68.9 percent) thinks that this entity does not actually monitor its instructions.
Reform Possibilities: Agents of Change

In light of the findings of this diagnostic study that we have just outlined, we sought to identify the areas of strength that can support good governance and can serve as agents for reform and improvement of the situation (or agents of change).

First, we tried to identify these agents of change among institutions, taking into account various Ivorian public and private sector agents based on their integrity, competence, and credibility in the anti-corruption sphere. It turned out that the entities that were considered the “best” based on the findings of this diagnostic study (international organizations, religious institutions, NGOs, professional associations) pose specific political problems, given that they can play only a supplementary or, in any event, a partial role in promoting good governance, while the others pose problems in the areas of credibility and trust. The entities that would normally play a central role in promoting good governance in Côte d’Ivoire, such as the government, parliament, government administration, judicial sector, political parties, enterprises and the media do not seem to enjoy much credibility or to be held in high esteem by the population.

Clearly, it is absolutely impossible to exclude these collective entities from any formulation, promotion, and/or strengthening process aimed at improving governance in the country. However, in light of our findings, these entities alone are deficient or, stated otherwise, in their present form they do not measure up, at least in part, to a task of this nature.

We therefore shifted our attention from collective entities to social actors capable of effecting change in these institutions. In this regard, and based on the findings of this diagnostic study, we identified two groups of individuals (from civil society or citizens and the government administration or government employees/elected officials) who very much want to change the status quo by improving the quality of life and, above all, governance in the country.

In the case of citizens, these are persons who exhibit good or outstanding civic-mindedness (gauged by their membership in civil society organizations and the fact that, having observed deficiencies in public/public interest services, they became involved in the preparation of local budgets); a desire for reform (gauged by their opinions expressed with respect to integrity within a number of governmental and non-governmental Ivorian entities, the nature of corruption in Côte d’Ivoire, and the scope/ gravity of the country’s problems).

Based on these criteria, of the 920 household members interviewed, we were able to identify a total of 302 individuals (close to 32.8 percent of the sample). The three main characteristics (with respect to the other characteristics, the group selected was similar to the others) were the following:
– Individuals tended to have a fairly high level of education (18.7 percent had university degrees);
– Individuals came from families with the highest incomes; and
– Individuals were concentrated in the south of the country.

The high level of education, good quality of life, and residence mainly in urban areas (in fact, five of the six main cities in the country are in the south) suggest that these persons come from the country’s middle class.

In the case of government employees/elected officials, individuals were high-ranking professionals who were mainly interested in learning and access to new opportunities, in the social status and personal satisfaction derived from being a public official, and in reform (judging from their opinions expressed with respect to integrity within a number of governmental and non-governmental Ivorian entities, the nature of corruption in Côte d’Ivoire, and the scope/gravity of the country’s problems).

These criteria led us to identify, among government employees/elected officials, a core group of 48 persons (12.6 percent of the sample in question), who were no different from the others in terms of age, gender, or income. These persons had slightly more education than other government employees and tended to have slightly more responsibility (they supervised more staff). Furthermore, they were largely policymakers and employees of the central government, with the representation of local elected officials and government employees in this group being lower. Here again, the group seemed to be composed of skilled or highly skilled human resources from the Ivorian middle class, based on their characteristics.

These two groups—the first composed of citizens and the second of government employees/elected officials—were termed “agents of change,” with this term being used somewhat loosely. In fact, based on the characteristics that we have just outlined, the conclusion can be drawn that persons in both groups are committed or are able to commit to strengthening the reform process and promoting better governance in the country by, among other things, acting within institutions (particularly public institutions) which, as we have seen, grapple with considerable challenges in the areas of integrity, credibility, and quality. Also included were persons who sometimes work collaboratively with institutions such as civil society organizations, which have much better scores in the areas of integrity, credibility, and quality.

Furthermore, it was possible to ascertain, in the context of this diagnostic study, that the “agents of change” tended to have stronger critical thinking or evaluative skills, based on their analysis of the quality of public services. They are thus able, more so than others, to play an important role in improving these services, in particular the education and
health services. This capacity could provide effective “value added” in promoting good governance, at least in the education and health services.

**Reform Possibilities: Social Capacity and Modernity**

Lastly, we turned our attention to one final question: in what country should these “agents of change” act?

We have already provided several pointers. First, these persons should act in a country that has major shortcomings in the area of governance but also has a set of advantages that cannot and, especially, should not be overlooked. Second, they should act in a country where corruption is not clear-cut, where two shared contextual situations co-exist, with the first implicating everyone in this practice and the second getting this very same universe of persons involved in efforts to combat the scourge of corruption.

Based on the findings of this diagnostic study, we can add that Côte d’Ivoire is a country where the strength of its social capital differs greatly from South to North and where the dual phenomenon of corruption and the quality of services seem to move in a somewhat independent manner.

Côte d’Ivoire is also a country that has just survived ten years of conflict. The findings of this study suggest that the political dimension, at least in terms of perception, is considered the most significant, both with respect to the origin of this crisis and to requiring oversight in the context of the stabilization and reconciliation process (with “the breakup of the country” and the “persistence of armed groups” representing obstacles, and “the recognition of the substance of the Ouagadougou agreements,” “the significant disarming of the main groups in the conflict,” and the “restoration of state/public institutions in the CNO zones” representing elements of facilitation; the importance of these is recognized by close to 90 percent of respondents across all categories). Of course, social and economic factors seemed important or very important, but to the same degree that they were in all countries in the subregion that are fairly similar to Côte d’Ivoire, ethnic, cultural, linguistic and even migration-related factors were considered less important (their importance was recognized by close to 60 to 65 percent of respondents across all categories). Furthermore, we should also mention that religious groups or groups of combatants (or ethnic groups) would not tend to exert great influence on the State/public sector (only one

---

95 For purposes of this study, four components were used to measure human capital: cognitive capital (in particular, persons in the pool of respondents with a university or post-graduate degree), which was considerably higher in the south than in the north, citizen involvement (membership of respondents in groups, associations, and other collective bodies in Côte d’Ivoire), which was much higher in the south than in the North, access to information, which was also greater in the south than in the north, and the level of trust which was, however, higher in the north than in the south.
in five and one in eight, respectively, mentioned these); instead, close to two-thirds of all persons interviewed mentioned multinationals and conglomerates.

All these observations, as well as a host of others, among them urbanization, institutional complexity, mobility of the population, the large number and variety of sources of information, and the high level of civil society activity, give the overall impression that, with all its limitations, Côte d’Ivoire is much more a modern country grappling with modern crises and problems and much less an "ethnic" country. We do not wish to downplay (nor do we have the information in this study to do so) the importance of the ethnic factors that persist. However, based on the information that can be derived from this diagnostic study, these ethnic factors seem to fit into a modern framework.

It was only by taking this relatively complex context into account, based on all the findings of this study—and, in particular, the desire of individuals for reform, which we attributed to the Ivoirian middle class—that we can outline the relevant recommendations appearing at the end of this report (lines of intervention, specific guidelines, as well as subsequent recommendations related to the health and education sectors) with a view to contributing to the formulation and implementation of policies and actions that could (or better yet, should) facilitate better governance in Côte d’Ivoire.
RECOMMENDATIONS

1. LINES OF INTERVENTION AND SPECIFIC GUIDELINES

Based on the findings of this diagnostic study (specific findings pertaining to the six components of governance and the overall findings outlined in the third part of this report), it is possible to identify the following five strategic lines that could contribute to the governance reform process in Côte d’Ivoire:

1. Supplement purely institutional strategies with “social” ones;
2. Identify and make beneficial use of the agents of change already working in the country;
3. Boost the quality of human resources within institutions;
4. Adopt a strategic approach to combat corruption; and
5. Make the modernity of Côte d’Ivoire an area of strength for improving governance in the country.

We will also provide a number of operational guidelines for each strategic line, which are not intended to be exhaustive but are provided for illustration only.

1.1. Supplement purely institutional strategies with “social” ones

The first line of intervention is based on the need to supplement the traditional “institutional” approach to public policy and program implementation (including those funded through international cooperation) with a “social” one.

The conditions for this line of intervention, as outlined in the third part of the report, are as follows:

a) The existence in Ivorian society of a high level of what might be called “social energy,” which manifests itself primarily in the zeal and ability of the main social actors (from civil society, the business and professional worlds, and the research
community) and of a significant segment of the citizenry to assume responsibilities for the community96 on one hand; and

b) The general weakness of public institutions in Côte d'Ivoire, which find it extremely difficult to play an effective role in resolving the country’s major problems and ensuring its good governance, on the other.

This social energy, which must still be fully recognized, developed, and utilized, could then compensate, at least in part, for the weakness of the public institutions.

In light of the foregoing, the traditional—and probably essential—institutional strategies should necessarily be supplemented with social strategies that can place the groups working in the country’s economic, social, and political spheres at the heart of this same reform process.

In that respect, consideration may be given to the following specific guidelines.

Assign social actors the task of implementing programs and actions

First, on the basis as well of an even broader understanding of the actors who have a social responsibility, it may be appropriate to increase the number of programs and actions (including those financed by international cooperation) for which the implementing agency/coordinator is not a government administration entity (which is still often the case), but other actors, including, for example, NGO federations, microenterprise associations, small and medium enterprises, professional associations and employers, universities, the research community, and women's organizations.97

Encourage the establishment of partnerships

Second, it seems particularly beneficial to help bring the social actors and public institutions closer together (as is already the case to some extent).98 by establishing partnerships between public, private, not-for-profit, and even multilateral organizations, for example, where each actor commits its resources and expertise for the implementation of development actions and initiatives.

96 See Chapter 11, para. 2 entitled “The Civic-Mindedness of Citizens.”
97 This is already happening in a number of programs funded by international cooperation, such as the Enterprise Revitalization and Governance Project (PARE/PME) in Côte d'Ivoire where, in addition to the Ministry of Economy and Finance, the executing institution is the General Confederation of Enterprises of Côte d'Ivoire [Confédération Générale des Entreprises de Côte d'Ivoire CGECI].
98 We note that almost two in three government employees cite the existence of collaborative efforts or partnerships between government administrations and civil society. And projections are that in 55 percent of cases, they are not infrequent.
Build the capacities of the social actors

Lastly, in order to make these actions, programs, and partnerships more effective, there appears to be a need to make full use of the social actors, taking into account the clear differences, and build their capacity to contribute to the country’s development, for example, through the implementation of initiatives to strengthen institutions, train the leaders of organizations, provide training to citizens throughout the country (even through lifelong learning programs), and build capacity in the specific areas in which each actor is working.

1.2. Identify and make beneficial use of the agents of change

As has already been mentioned on several occasions, agents of change are to be found not only among government employees but, and in much greater numbers, among the citizens in particular, and especially among persons who, owing to their higher level of education or income, belong to (and represent a segment of) what we could consider to be the “Ivorian middle class.”

Identifying and making beneficial use of these agents of change can therefore help secure the buy-in of the Ivorian middle class to the process to reform and improve governance.

Securing this commitment is of particular importance, in that it helps avoid a situation whereby the majority of the middle class displays indifference, if not hostility, toward a process to reform and improve governance. Indeed, it must be borne in mind that members of the middle class have often played a leading role, particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa, in antidemocratic activities or other scenarios (often successfully carried out!) related to “selfish isolation.”

Individuals and groups from other social strata, such as farmers, laborers, and small-scale artisans, who are often involved in development programs in villages or districts, or through unions or CSOs, are of course also viewed as agents of change.

In this regard, we propose two sets of specific guidelines.

---

99 See Chapter 11 in particular.
Identification

First, the segments of society where agents of change can be found must be identified. While we do not claim that this is an exhaustive list, we can indicate the areas where the highest level of the aforementioned “social energy” can be found, namely:

- The professional world;
- Micro, small, and medium enterprises;
- CSOs;
- Village or district networks; and
- Universities and research centers.

Second, for each of these areas and, if necessary, in a collaborative manner as well, opportunities to allow the agents of change to come forward must be provided. These opportunities may entail voluntary training and capacity-building initiatives, calls for proposals to identify best practices, projects to promote innovation, social dialogue initiatives, and so forth.

Another “crosscutting” area—the Ivorian diaspora, in particular skilled and highly skilled migrants—can also be added to this list of areas.

Development

It is then necessary to create the conditions in which the agents of change can effectively perform their role and thus be optimally poised to contribute to governance reform and improvement. In that respect, there appears to be a need to, for example:

- Implement normative and regulatory reforms to facilitate the creation, development, and day-to-day management of micro, small, and medium enterprises, as well as of professions\(^\text{101}\) (streamlined bureaucracy, reduced costs, etc.);
- Support micro, small, and medium enterprises, as well as professions through incentives and facilitations (through access to bank credit as well), capacity-building actions, etc.;
- Implement similar actions and reforms for the CSOs;
- Develop village or district networks through various forms of participation in local autonomous bodies and in decision-making processes and institutional building initiatives;

\(^{100}\) Repeated reference will be made to the agents of change in government administration.

\(^{101}\) The “Ivorian middle class” includes not only government employees, but also the owners of micro and small enterprises, as well as professionals (a number of individuals also figure in two or three of these groups).
- Support scientific research through appropriate public financing, including from international cooperation.¹⁰²

- Develop the potential of skilled and highly skilled migrants and, in particular, with respect to exchanges that are not only economic and financial, but also institutional and social (pertaining, for example, to corporate governance, procedures for oversight of certain social rights, innovative capacity-building practices, etc.), whether or not they return to their country of origin.

1.3. **Boost the quality of human resources within institutions**

Despite their weak capacity, public institutions are and remain key actors in the actual implementation of each program and action aimed at improving governance. In order to strengthen these institutions and, above all, enhance their capacity to perform this task, it is therefore essential to boost the quality of their internal human resources.

In that connection, we propose the following specific guidelines.

**Headhunting**

A type of headhunting process should first be initiated in Côte d’Ivoire’s government administration at all levels (central, decentralized central, and decentralized) and in all public services (in particular, but not limited to, health and education), with a view to identifying the agents of change within their ranks. A “movement for reform” capable of taking action on a day-to-day basis and, better yet, of seizing the opportunities and occasions that will arise, would therefore be in place.

To that end, initiatives could be promoted in government administrations, based on their specific relevance. These include:

- Voluntary programs aimed at improving quality;
- Groups to monitor administrative efficiency;
- Public communication and social dialogue initiatives with users; and

¹⁰² We note, in addition, that scientific research is considered to be a key component of development and poverty reduction efforts. Since 2004, the United Nations Commission on Science and Technology for Development has therefore recommended that countries, including the poorest, set aside at least 1 percent of GDP to finance scientific research.

¹⁰³ This also takes place when persons do not return physically. See Federico Marta, *Migrations et retour, ressources pour le développement – Lignes directrices*, CERFE, Rome, 2009.
- Voluntary capacity-building initiatives to promote innovation.

It is from among those who will subscribe to these initiatives that, in all probability, the agents of change already working in the public sector will be identified.

This headhunting exercise must also be expanded beyond the government administration system (encompassing the Ivorian diaspora) to locate the agents of change who left government service for a variety of reasons (retirement, restructuring, personal decision, etc.) and, insofar as possible, rehire them, if not on a permanent basis, then at least as consultants or partners.

**Strengthening ENA**

Second, with a view to promoting an increasingly robust expansion of this “movement for reform,” the ongoing process to restructure the *École Nationale d'Administration* (ENA)—once one of the most prestigious institutions of its kind on the continent, now plagued by corruption and an appreciable decline in organizational quality levels—must be supported and strengthened.

In addition to the specific teaching programs, the ENA will still have to focus on training government employees with a strong professional orientation, as we previously indicated, (mainly interested in learning and gaining access to new opportunities, in the social status, and in the strong personal satisfaction derived from being a public official), as well as critical thinking skills, and therefore a desire for reform.

Consideration must also be given to the fact that the successful completion of the school curriculum is a prerequisite for entry into ENA. The issue of the poor quality of the Ivorian education system must therefore also be tackled [*upstream*] (we will also address this issue later, which goes beyond the question of the quality of human resources in the public sector and concerns the Ivorian society as a whole—see the section entitled “subsequent recommendations” relating to the education sector).

**New technologies**

The introduction of new technologies in government administration, in particular ICT-based technologies that can in fact help streamline operational procedures and make them more transparent, is a possible “multiplier” for human resource development. These technologies also help ease the work burden, thus ensuring a more efficient use of human capital. While they are already in operation in Côte d’Ivoire’s government administration, they have not been installed in all areas, and are in some cases underutilized. Consequently, there is a need to:

- Disseminate them more widely;
- Boost their technical capacity (through the establishment of networks, ongoing update of operational capacities, etc.);
- Ensure their full and proper use through personnel training on a wide scale.

### 1.4. Strategic approach to combat corruption

In any event, it is necessary, insofar as possible, to combat the scourge of corruption in Côte d'Ivoire, by working to ensure that, of the two contextual situations (practice of corruption and anti-corruption efforts\(^{104}\) that implicitly concern the majority of Ivorians, the latter will prevail over the former.

With a view to addressing this issue in a consistent, far-reaching and comprehensive manner, structural reforms—such as wage increases, the introduction of incentives and prices commensurate with the quality of work, and the implementation of professional career paths based on a combination of entrepreneurial skills and the exercise of social responsibility, a trait that should be inherent in all government employees—would first and foremost be appropriate to discourage corruption.

With respect to the possibility and the procedures for the adoption of these reforms, it is necessary to continue efforts to identify solutions that are sustainable and appropriate (relative to, in particular, available economic resources) and, at the same time, shared by the parties involved.

However, in view of the fact that these measures are complex and cannot be quickly adopted, a parallel and equally far-reaching and comprehensive strategy that can be effectively implemented in a very short time frame must also be adopted.

This strategy could entail the establishment (or better yet, strengthening, in view of the fact that it has already been partially developed) of “counterweights” to corruption. These “counterweights” would consist of forms of “joint government” of public affairs, involving the various actors in society, including civil society organizations (CSOs), entrepreneurs, and the citizens per se (which we covered in section 1.1).

This strategy therefore entails combating corruption by facilitating a strong, active role for all actors involved in programming, managing, and monitoring public interest services and, more generally, public affairs.

This strategy could be realized in the following manner:

---

\(^{104}\) See Chapter 10.
- The formulation and implementation of a social leadership function, on one hand; and
- The identification and implementation of strategies to improve quality, on the other.

**Social leadership**

The social leadership function would entail the following:

- Identification of simple procedures (and where necessary anonymous) to make it easy to file complaints related to dysfunctions (e.g., illicit requests for money and other forms of corruption and extortion, as well as the failure to respect basic rights, deficiencies, etc.);
- Implementation of adequate information campaigns on these procedures;
- Introduction of mechanisms to respond promptly to the problems identified (these mechanisms would facilitate the effective follow-up of the complaints in order to not only identify the perpetrators and, where possible, provide reparations for damages, but also to understand the reasons for these dysfunctions with a view to eliminating or at least reducing them); and
- Joint monitoring of the implementation of these procedures.

**Improving quality**

Efforts to improve quality should include:

- The analysis of the quality of the government administration’s services/internal procedures to be conducted, to the extent possible, in a joint manner, by involving not only government employees and service operators, but also users and citizens;
- The identification of weaknesses, as well as of suboptimal situations and deficiencies (linked primarily to forms of corruption);
- The identification of “quality objectives” that may be achieved in reasonable time frames (under two years), without modifying the normative framework, and using resources that are actually available, or feasible reforms and identifiable resources; for each quality objective, the procedures, actions to be implemented, and the responsibilities of the various actors must be identified (and jointly approved);

---

105 The main aim is to also reduce the “good reasons” for corruption (see, for example, the borderline case involving rural health care workers receiving small “bribes” from users, which help them make ends meet and continue to perform their duties; the issue in question is not one of blaming the “health care worker,” but rather of transforming a secret small scale corruption system into a transparent one that involves small contributions from users toward local health management).
- Monitoring of the process to be implemented with a view to achieving the quality objectives, with the use of new technologies based, among other things, on improved accountability in the government administration; and
- Adequate information and awareness-building campaigns to ensure the maximum involvement of operators/government employees and citizens (as well as other possibly relevant actors) in the entire process.

### 1.5. Make the modernity of Côte d’Ivoire an area of strength

Lastly, it is essential to make the salient features of Côte d’Ivoire’s modernity that we have presented in this report\(^\text{106}\) an area of strength that can be assimilated and acted upon with a view to improving governance in the country.

**Assimilation:** Recognize the country’s modernity and give consideration to its features

In this regard, the implementation of this fifth line of intervention entails the need to effectively recognize (which is not evident in the current debate) the country’s modern—or at least essentially modern—nature (without, however, disregarding the lasting presence of “outdated” cultural and social traits) in social, economic, and political analyses, and thus in the formulation of reforms and other actions aimed at improving governance.

In that respect, the numerous identifiable features of modernity, as we have seen, in Côte d’Ivoire, should be given consideration. These include:

- The existence of several big cities such as Abidjan, Yamoussoukro, Boaké, Daloa, Korhogo, and San Pedro, and, in any event, an urban population that is almost equal in size to the rural population (close to 49 percent, based on the most recent estimates);
- The institutional complexity of the country (based on its Constitution, its institutions, and their interactions);
- The large and diverse number of national and international sources of information channels (those based on ICTs included);
- Large-scale horizontal movement of individuals (we refer in particular to the major internal and external migration movements that occur in this country more than in any other in West Africa);

\(^{106}\) See Chapter 12 in particular.
- Vertical movement (for example, through careers in the economic and administrative sectors, civil society, etc.);
- The spread of entrepreneurship;
- The strong presence of civil society;
- The existence of an educational and scientific research system at the university and academic levels, as well as an important cultural life; and
- The dissemination and penetration of new technologies into the Ivorian society and the lives of the Ivorian people.

The political stabilization and national reconciliation process itself, along with its ebbs and flows, must be considered in this context; only then can it be guided and supported in an appropriate manner.

Taking action:
Building social capital

In this connection, making the most of modernity would entail a number of typical areas of strength, such as:
- The subsequent strengthening of cognitive capital, and thus education, advanced and university training, professional training, and capacity building in general;
- The strengthening of civil society not so much in and of itself, but in particular its enhancement in terms of social responsibility, that is, its actual ability to make an active and positive contribution to development, as well as to poverty reduction and social exclusion, and, in the case of Côte d’Ivoire, to conflict resolution;
- The consolidation of the factors guaranteeing the free and wide circulation of information, and, more generally, territorial factors that facilitate development, such as communication channels, services, other infrastructure, enterprises, etc.;
- The creation of a genuine climate of trust among citizens, between citizens and the government administration, within the government administration itself, between the government administration and international organizations, between representatives of the various political parties, between citizens and entities that were on opposite sides of the fence for all or part of the decade-long conflict, etc.

These four specific guidelines that we have mentioned briefly relate to factors that, based on several approaches (including the one adopted in this study\textsuperscript{107}), correspond to the four components of social capital (cognitive capital, civil society with social responsibility, civil society with social responsibility, civil society with social responsibility, civil society with social responsibility).

territorial factors, and trust), the strengthening of which would therefore facilitate improved governance.

Taking action: Banking on women

In this regard, a subsequent factor that could serve as a type of what we call “positive multiplier” for the other aforementioned ones should also be targeted. We are referring to women and, in particular, to the role of women in development processes. We have already pointed out in this diagnostic study that the very positive role of women in efforts to develop civil society has been recognized, and highlighted elsewhere how women, more so than men, are contributing and can contribute to conflict resolution and to the restoration of a climate of trust, the absence of which may currently be one of the main obstacles to the resolution of the decade-long crisis in Côte d’Ivoire, and thus to the effective launch of a process to restructure and reform governance.

Therefore, with respect to each of the specific guidelines cited thus far (as well as those to follow), it would be appropriate to take into account and develop the gender perspective (to cite just a few examples—with regard to the establishment of partnerships, entry into ENA, involvement in activities related to the social leadership function, headhunting initiatives, monitoring quality improvement practices, etc.).

2. OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS

In addition to these five lines of intervention and the related operational guidelines (which are, in turn, specific guidelines), it is possible to include further recommendations in four specific areas:

a) Improvement of governance in the health sector;

b) Improvement of governance in the education sector;

c) The dissemination of the findings of this diagnostic study; and

d) The continuation of the World Bank’s work program on diagnostic studies on governance.

---

108 See Chapter 4. We note that 69.7 percent of the government employees interviewed cited “the emergence of women leaders in civil society organizations” as one of the factors that facilitate the development of CSOs.

109 See in particular the EU-funded project entitled “Women for Conflict Resolution and Consensus Building in Angola,” which was implemented by CERFE, 2000-02.
2.1. Improvement of governance in the health sector

With a view to improving governance in the health sector, it would be appropriate to:

- Acknowledge the fact that while difficult access to health services and poor quality, which appear to plague the health sector, are, not surprisingly, attributable at times to structural problems and the paucity of resources, they are often linked to situations that can be rectified without any action being taken at the structural level and without (or almost) any allocation of additional economic resources (see Chapter 6);

- Recognize, by strengthening it, the existence of an ongoing improvement process in this area (highlighted by the majority of users), the availability of quality human resources, and a substantial containment of corruption;

- Acknowledge, in accordance with the “lines of intervention” cited, the active role that health service operators and users of these services can potentially play as agents of change;

- Launch a participatory and widespread process to monitor the quality of health services, conducted jointly at the local level by all relevant actors (including citizens), who can not only attest to the situation at the outset but also observe its development;

- Identify potential quality objectives by involving all the actors in their achievement ("quality agreements" covering the objectives to be achieved and to which all parties should contribute, based on their competencies and responsibilities, could, on a case-by-case basis, be established annually or every two years) and in the monitoring of the entire process; and

- Promote the circulation of best practices among the health services.

2.2. Improvement of governance in the education sector

In order to improve governance in the education sector, bearing in mind the deep crisis it faces, it would be appropriate to:

- Take note of the observations that are sometimes made about academic staff and the discovery of an ongoing improvement process (see Chapter 6);

- Once again, in accordance with the previous “lines of intervention,” recognize the active role that academic staff and users of school services (students and their families) can potentially play as agents of change;
- On this basis, and in accordance with proposals made by several parties, promote the organization of national workshops on the Ivorian education system, in order to reassess certain fundamental characteristics of the education system (even, with respect to content, based on what was stated in the previous lines of intervention), and strengthen the system;

- Promote and facilitate the participatory process itself, which has already been proposed for the health sector, by finalizing it in this instance in order to understand how to implement the reform and, subsequently, how to conduct monitoring; and

- Promote the dissemination of good practices, in view of the fact that examples of excellence exist in education as well.

### 2.3. Dissemination of the findings of this diagnostic study

**A broad spectrum of target audiences**

In order to disseminate the findings of this diagnostic study, it should be borne in mind that they are intended for a diverse group of actors, which can be grouped into the following six categories:

- Government and institutional entities (all entities whose core mission is to improve governance and, more generally, Ivorian government administration entities at the central, decentralized central, and decentralized levels);

- The business sector (small and medium enterprises and major economic groups, including individual entrepreneurs and professional associations);

- Civil society (organizations of citizens whose core mission is to combat corruption and promote governance, those that work in the areas of development and poverty reduction, unions and, more generally, citizen movements);

- The press and the other media;

- University academia and the research community; and

- International organizations and bilateral cooperation, including, of course, the World Bank.

**A plethora of instruments**

While it would be advisable to have as wide a target audience as possible, the various procedures and/or diverse methods based on the different audiences should be adopted at the same time as well. Given its widespread use among many of these audiences, online communication would appear to be preferable, and should, if possible, be multidirectional.
through blogs, discussion groups, etc. At the same time, it will be important to schedule programs for broadcast on the television and the radio, with a view to reaching all citizens, including those living in the most isolated rural areas.

It could prove especially beneficial to promote, as quickly as possible, a seminar to discuss the findings of this study, which would be attended by a small number of representatives from the most important target audiences, based on a more effective and concrete implementation of the recommendations outlined in this report.

All the findings of this study should be made available to the Ivorian and international scientific community, even with a view to the subsequent preparation of reports and in-depth studies (including doctoral theses).

2.4. Continuation of the World Bank’s work program on diagnostic studies on governance

In conclusion, based on this diagnostic study, it is possible to identify a number of proposals for the conduct of future diagnostic studies on governance:

- Adopt a broad concept of governance, and avoid, if possible, focusing on (or according priority to) certain components only, such as corruption and the performance of the Government, while giving consideration to all six components;
- Adopt, at the same time, a holistic view where the whole is more than the sum of its parts, in that governance includes not only these six components, but also all the activities resulting from their interaction or, in other words, crosscutting activities (governance should therefore be viewed as a single system);
- Adopt a multi-contextual approach, by providing for consultation on and comparisons (and debate) of the various points of view (citizens, government employees, enterprises, civil society, the press, etc.);
- If necessary, use various survey procedures for consultation on these points of view (quantitative surveys for citizens, individual qualitative consultations for journalists, focus groups for civil society leaders, second-tier surveys for entrepreneurs if recently conducted studies on this group are available; etc.);
- Bear in mind that when a diagnostic study on governance is being conducted, previous studies (or other types of data collection such as “sections” of a census or similar surveys) on the subject or on related subjects have, in all likelihood, been conducted recently in the country in question; before carrying out any field studies, these studies should be taken advantage of, developing the data and information contained therein where possible and relevant.