Disability and Social Safety Nets in Developing Countries

Sophie Mitra
Rutgers University
March 14, 2005
Background: Disability, Poverty and SSNs

Disability Targeting

Physical and Social Barriers of Safety Nets

Disability Inclusion in Design and Evaluation
WHAT IS DISABILITY?

Different definitions have been used.
Charity model:

Persons with disabilities are to be pitied and helped by welfare approaches.
Medical Model:

Disability is a problem of the individual caused by an illness or injury, that requires medical care (treatment and rehabilitation).
Social Model:

- Disability is NOT an attribute of the individual.
- Disability is created by society and requires social change.
- Social barriers include for instance discrimination, inaccessibility of buildings.
The ICF model (International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health)

Health -> Impairment -> Activity Limitations
How many people have disabilities?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Disability prevalence (%)</th>
<th>Disability definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>Activity limitations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>21.7</td>
<td>Activity limitations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Korea</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Activity limitations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>2.58</td>
<td>Impairment-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>12.29</td>
<td>Impairment-based and Chronic Illnesses</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How is Disability related to Poverty?
Disability  ->  Poverty

- Sometimes limited ability to work associated with a disability.
- Extra costs of disability (e.g., medical expenses, equipment, adaptation to housing).
- Foregone earnings of caretakers.
Poverty -> Disability

- Preventable impairments.
  Example: malnutrition as a cause of disability.

- The lack of resources may be disabling for persons with impairments.
  Example: too poor to buy assistive devices.
## Evidence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Households without disabilities below the poverty line</th>
<th>Households with disabilities below the poverty line</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>36-51%</td>
<td>54-62%</td>
<td>Harris-White (1999)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3 villages in Tamil Nadu)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda (urban area)</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>Hoogeven (Forthcoming)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>8.30%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>Fujiura et al (1998)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What is the role of Social Safety Nets with respect to Disability?

- Poverty alleviation and long-term poverty reduction role.

- Disability prevention role:
  - through impairment prevention
  - by preventing an impairment from becoming disabling.
Some safety nets are targeted at persons with disabilities.

- Social insurance programs that protect against the disability contingency (e.g., in South American countries).
- Social assistance programs in a lot of middle-income countries (e.g., disability grant in South Africa). See Table 3.
- In-kind transfers: supply of assistive devices (e.g., canes, wheelchairs).
Disability Targeting

**Advantage**
- Improves the bargaining position of the person with disability within the household.

**Disadvantages**
- High level of additional administrative capacity required: the challenge to administer a disability test and the potential for fraud.
- High level of additional administrative costs, which reduces funds available for transfers.
- May promote segregation versus inclusiveness by providing persons with disability with a separate special program.
Disability Mainstreaming

**Advantages**
- Low level of additional administrative capacity required.
- Low level of additional administrative costs.
- Promotes inclusiveness versus segregation for persons with disabilities.
- Has the potential to affect a large portion of the poor with disabilities.

**Disadvantage**
- May be effective only in the long run, especially when it comes to bringing down some of the social barriers of the program.
How to mainstream social safety nets?

- by removing physical and social barriers that prevent persons with disabilities from accessing the programs.
- through program design and evaluation.
What is accessibility?

- It is the time, effort and cost (i.e. the ease) with which a good, a service or a facility can be reached or used.
- Accessibility is closely linked to both poverty and disability.
Physical Accessibility

Transport system

Household Location

Facility Location
Assessing physical accessibility

Several dimensions.

- accessibility of built environment, including SSN facilities and transport system.
- can social workers go and visit persons with disabilities?
- can a family representative apply, enroll and receive benefits on behalf of a person with disability?
- are there any geographical asymmetries in program coverage (by region, urban vs. rural)?

Decentralized and accessible infrastructure.

Analytical tools: Direct observation and review of program’s manual of operation. Administrative data on beneficiaries, if available.
Assessing Social Accessibility:

- is program information available in different formats (e.g., Braille)?
- how does the program deal with illiteracy among potential and actual beneficiaries?
- is program information delivered through different channels besides the government (media, community)?
- do the attitudes of SSN staff prevent or discourage access to benefits for persons with disabilities?
- do some of the SSN staff have disabilities?
Assessing Social Accessibility (Cont.):

- Analytical tools: Review of existing information materials; semi-structured interviews and focus group discussion with current and potential beneficiaries with disabilities and with program staff.
Physical and Social Accessibility may not be enough

........There is also a need to make social safety nets inclusive in their DESIGN and EVALUATION.
Program Design

- is the cost to apply or collect benefits high for persons with disabilities?
- are some of the eligibility conditions difficult to meet for persons with disabilities?

Analytical tools: Semi-structured interviews and focus group discussion with current and potential beneficiaries with disabilities. Desk review and analysis.
An Example: Designing Inclusive Conditional Cash Transfers (CCTs)

Most CCTs do not explicitly recognize persons with disabilities as potential participants.

Is this a problem?
It depends… see Figure 1.
A Contradiction

In program design, mainstream but with a pinch of targeting.
Program Evaluation

Program Coverage
- what is the proportion of eligibles with disabilities that participate in the program?
- what are the profiles of participants with disabilities compared to non-participant eligibles with disabilities (e.g., demographic characteristics, type of impairment)?

Program’s Impact on Poverty
- what poverty alleviation and reduction impact does the program have on persons with disabilities?

Program’s Impact on Inequality
- how does this poverty alleviation and reduction impact compare to the one that is found for persons without disabilities?

Analytical tool: Household data collection and analysis.
Research Needs

- With regard to disability targeted transfers: an assessment of their poverty reduction impact, as well as their indirect effect on labor force participation for persons with disabilities.
- As for mainstream social safety nets, it is important to assess the baseline disability inclusiveness of social safety nets in specific countries and the effectiveness of new inclusion measures (rigorous evaluations needed).