

**GUIDES FOR COLLECTING INFORMATION ON THE ADMINISTRATION OF  
SOCIAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS**

Prepared by  
The Institute for Urban Economics  
Independent Institute for Social Policy  
The Urban Institute

April 2006

## **PREFACE**

As part of the project, *Technical Assistance to Enhancing Measurement, Monitoring and Analysis of Poverty in Russia (Stage II)*, the World Bank contracted with the Institute for Urban Economics, the Independent Institute for Social Policy, and the Urban Institute for the study, *Strengthening the Targeting Performance of Social Assistance Programs in the Russian Federation*. A critical element in improving targeting performance may be improving the quality of program administration. To understand the opportunities in this direction, the study involves gathering data on program administration in five localities in each of six Russian regions. This document presents the various questionnaires and guidelines used in gathering this information.

## CONTENTS

<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	4
PROGRAMS COVERED.....	5
TYPES OF GUIDES.....	5
COMMENTARY ON SELECTED GUIDES.....	6
<b>ANNEX</b> .....	<b>12</b>
DATA TO BE GATHERED FROM SECONDARY SOURCES.....	12
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR HEAD OF LOCAL EMPLOYMENT OFFICE.....	13
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR HEAD OF REGIONAL EMPLOYMENT OFFICE.....	18
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR IN-TAKE WORKER AT THE LOCAL EMPLOYMENT SERVICE CENTER.....	23
METHODOLOGY OF LABOR MARKET ASSESSMENT.....	26
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR HEAD OF REGIONAL LABOR DEPARTMENT AND DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMY.....	29
OBSERVATION CHECKLIST FOR INDEPENDENT OBSERVER IN A SOCIAL ASSISTANCE IN-TAKE OFFICE.....	32
CHECK LIST AND INSTRUCTIONS FOR CASE FILE ASSESSMENT FOR TARGETED SOCIAL ASSISTANCE FILES.....	38
CASE RECORD REVIEW GUIDE – STATE SOCIAL ASSISTANCE.....	44
CHECK LIST AND INSTRUCTIONS FOR CASE FILE ASSESSMENT FOR HOUSING ALLOWANCE RECIPIENT.....	47
CASE RECORD REVIEW GUIDE - HOUSING ALLOWANCE.....	53
CHECK LIST AND INSTRUCTIONS FOR CASE FILE ASSESSMENT ON CHILD ALLOWANCE.....	57
CASE RECORD REVIEW - CHILD ALLOWANCE.....	63
ADMINISTRATIVE COST ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY.....	67
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR SPECIALIST WORKING IN CHILD ALLOWANCE OFFICE.....	74
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR SPECIALIST WORKING IN HOUSING ALLOWANCE OFFICE.....	83
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR SPECIALIST WORKING IN OTHER SOCIAL ASSISTANCE OFFICE.....	92
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR HEAD OF LOCAL SOCIAL PROTECTION DEPARTMENT.....	101
INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR HEAD OF REGIONAL SOCIAL PROTECTION MINISTRY/DEPARTMENT.....	104
FOCUS-GROUP GUIDES AND MEETINGS PERFORMANCE TECHNIQUE.....	108

## INTRODUCTION

A defining characteristic of transition economies is the breadth and depth of institutional change. Often this means the imposition of new ways of executing basic governmental tasks — in the case at hand, providing help to vulnerable populations in the Russian Federation. The pace of change has been rapid and it would not be surprising if high quality administrative procedures had not always been put in place as part of the reforms.

Generally, studying how well local institutions are discharging their new responsibilities is important for at least three reasons.<sup>1</sup> First and most basic is the question as to whether they are delivering the services they are supposed to. If they are not succeeding in this task, then possible broader impacts of new approaches are significantly undermined.

Secondly, the new institutional arrangements required to implement better targeted, more efficient programs are also vehicles for changing societal attitudes towards such programs. The programs set new rules or boundaries within which officials and clients interact. To the extent that operations are viewed as fair and reliable, acceptance can also heighten political support. As argued by some analysts, changes such as reorientation of government programs can initially affect the complex web of relationships and institutions, and these first-round effects can have second-round feedback effects on the initiating institutions: program acceptance reinforces or impairs incentives for proper administration.

Thirdly, one wants to understand how well new institutions are working as an indicator of how their staff views their legitimacy. Drawing on the new institutionalism in sociology, some analysts argue that the efficiency of program administration depends critically on the extent to which staff agrees with the objectives and structure of a new program, as well as on its formal rules and operating rules of the administering organization. If agencies administering a particular program are consistently working ineffectively, this may well signal deeper problems of program acceptance by the staff and perhaps the program's client group.

The purpose of this document is to present a group of interview and data collection guides developed to obtain information from front-line social assistance offices and higher

---

<sup>1</sup> The next paragraphs draw heavily on R. Struyk, A.S. Puzanov, and A. Kolodeznikova, "Administrative Practices in Russia's Housing Allowance Programme," *Urban Studies*, vol. 38, no.7, 2001, pp.1045-67.

level administrators on administrative practices that affect the quality of targeting benefits (as legally required), the promotion of re-employment of the jobless, and foster a coordinated case management approach across programs. These guides were developed for analysis of the practices in Russian municipalities and rural rayons and the program guidance and management received from responsible offices at the regional level. Because they address common management practices from the perspective of widely adopted principles of good management, the guides may be of use in other transition and developing countries.

### **Programs Covered**

The survey covers the employment service offices administering passive and active labor programs and three core social assistance programs the Child Allowance Program, the Housing Allowance Program and the Regional State Social Assistance Program. Formally, all three programs are means-tested. Benefit levels for the Child Allowance and the State Social Assistance programs are now set at the regional level, and benefit levels for the Housing Allowance program are determined by both national and regional-level regulatory acts. Previously, child allowance benefits were set at the national level and those for housing allowances at the local level. Programs of state social assistance vary considerably across regions, to the extent that many do not have any. Given that the regions to be studied within the project may offer different kinds of child allowances and state social assistance benefits, the research team decides on which programs to include on a case-by-case basis and using the single criterion: the programs should be means-tested.

In conducting the interviews with the Employment Service (ES) offices the team is particularly interested in three elements: the extent to which benefits under passive programs were tied to active search for new a new job, the extent of coordination by ES with social assistance offices, and the extent of outreach by the ES offices to major employers to obtain information on current and future types of jobs that would be in demand.

### **Types of Guides**

The research team developed several methods to gather information. The most common is the semi-structured interviews with program officials, ranging from intake workers in front line offices to the principal administrator at the regional level. Several other techniques are also to be employed, as summarized in Table 1, that include

independent observation of in-take process and location of application centers, review of case records to determine if the means-tests were correctly executed, carrying out focus groups with clients, and more.

In addition to the interview guides and similar documents, the second part of the report includes instructions and explanations for coding data and conducting the focus group sessions.

**Table 1. Data Acquisition Methods**

<b>Method</b>	<b>Examples</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Open-ended interviews	In-take workers; head of local Employment Service offices, heads and department heads in the Regional Social Assistance Departments, Heads of Regional Employment Services, Economy, Finance and Labor Departments	Structured interviews with open-end responses
Observation	In-take interviews, location of offices, information and outreach tools, conveniences available for people waiting to be interviewed	Team will record how the interviews are conducted using a list of points after the overall interview with the in-take worker was concluded
Focus groups	Participants in the three targeted social assistance programs under study	For all programs conducted using a common format, with some variation in instructions to moderator
Analysis of case files	Analysis of completeness of income verification documents in file; accuracy of calculation of benefits	Standard form filled in on basis of information in the file
Management report review	Reports sent by local offices to the region	No guidelines developed for this.
Examination and acquisition of administrative cost information	Information to be gathered on staff wages, size of space occupied by the office, running cost of office, computer services, etc.	Guidelines include instructions on how to use this information to estimate the full—direct and indirect—cost of providing the benefit to the client

### **Commentary on Selected Guides**

This part discusses the development and objectives of several of the guides to explain their objectives and, in some instances, method of development.

*A list of data to be gathered for undertaking a regional labor market assessment.* This assists in the collection of information needed for an assessment of regional labor markets, including data on: the number of registered unemployed; registered level of

unemployment; labor force participation rates; trends in each of the foregoing factors over time and variation across the oblast; operating programs of support to the unemployed (this information may be obtained from the interviews with heads of Employment Services as well); registered level of unemployment (data from employment agencies). This information is fundamental for the identification of the development prospects of target programs in Russia. Research conducted by IISP within the *Accessibility of Social Programs and Services for the Russian Population: Coverage and Inequality* (MPSF, USAID) has shown that with the majority of poor families, poverty is caused either by unemployment of their able-to-work adults, or the low level of wages. Understanding the situation in regional labor markets, its trends and developments will enable the team to formulate adequate regional proposals for improving social protection and social assistance programs.

To prepare this document, we will analyze a set of indicators that characterize social and economic conditions of selected regions and municipalities, as well as available statistical data on labor markets by regions and localities, statistical and administrative reports by regional employment agencies, as well as recent changes in information flows of data associated with the restructuring of the responsible ministry and establishment of the federal employment agency. Regional statistics on employment and unemployment trends, available information on labor migration, current employment programs (enrollment, characteristics of participants, funding, outcomes) will be reviewed. Meetings (non in-depth interviews) will also be conducted with the regional and local sub-divisions of Federal Employment Service in the localities or regions.

*Formalized check list for independent observer of in-take interviews (the location, accessibility, arrangements and other elements of a social assistance in-take office).* An assessment of program application practices and cost demands a series of independent observation of local in-take practices, and we will make several of such observations in each municipality by randomly sitting through an in-take interview. Understandably, presence of an external expert is likely to create a Hawthorn effect that will affect performance of in-take officers. However, it adds significant value of understanding the deviations from the rules and the procedures, which are costly for the client and gives suggestions for possible creaming actions practiced by social assistance offices. Of particular interest is the thoroughness with which the interviewer inquires about the applicant household's income.

In addition to observation of in-take interviews the observation list will include wide range of questions on location of offices, information and outreach tools, conveniences available for people waiting to be interviewed, office open hours, automation etc. This instrument helps to estimate actual quality and accessibility of services provided by the offices. It will enable the team to compare the information received from the population (focus groups) and from the social workers with material obtained by an objective and professional observer.

Description of procedures will be prepared before observations start at the local level, which will let us understand the extent of rationality of procedures, of those fixed in normative legislative acts as well as those practiced in reality, to prepare proposals on improvement of such procedures from the point of view of more efficient benefit delivery that is less time-consuming and costly for all sides involved.

While the number of program implementation factors that distort its outcomes compared to the design varies and cannot be fully covered by a unified checklist, we intend to first collect the data in each region in the same format, in order to facilitate subsequent analysis, and then to complement this information by what will be observed by our experts or by what will be revealed by focus group interviews or interviews with program administrators.

*Semi-structured interview guides and in-depth interview guides.* The Terms of Reference provided sufficient guidance for design of interviews with program managers and staff, and we followed recommendations of Annex 1. Among other guides we used the “Questionnaire on obstacles to access to social protection” developed by the European Committee for Social Cohesion (ECSC) as part of a study that helped to develop policy guidelines aimed at the improvement of access to social benefits and social services. This instrument is helpful in identification and assessment from a multidisciplinary angle of concrete obstacles that people face in access to social protection. It links the benefit access issue to the one of human rights, individual abilities to exercise them, and the activeness of civil society.

An important element in this information is that on the relationship between each cash assistance program and other social assistance and social services programs. Does the office under review even know about the other assistance a client receives? Do programs take account of other programs in determining benefits? Do staff make referrals to other programs? Do the programs share information with each other on beneficiaries? Is there a common in-take form used by several programs?

*Focus group interview guide and meeting performance technique.* This was developed as part of the project assessment tools and contains a detailed methodology for selection of potential participants and organizational arrangements. We intend to conduct focus group interviews separately with beneficiaries from each program, trying at the same time to make sure that the pool of participants is diverse and includes if possible the following sub-categories of program recipients:

- Single-parent families,
- Elderly living alone or in couples,
- Families with unemployed adults,
- Families with disabled children.

Composition of target groups of clients for regional social assistance program may be amended, depending upon program design and clientele.

We expect that the focus group for family representatives from those with an unemployed principal earner will be an important source of information for addressing the questions of the impact of program participation on willingness to work.

One interview with different focus groups of participants will be conducted per municipality per program (total 3 per program). As a result regional authorities will get more specific qualitative information about access to and experiences in participating in their programs.

Program participants will be selected from the program databases kept at the local level. In small rural municipalities where the number of program beneficiaries is small we will invite all of them, making sure that if the number of people exceeds the maximum number of people that can be admitted in a focus group they will receive small presents as gratitude for their willingness to participate.

The focus groups will be conducted in accordance with the following principles:

- 1) participants should not personally know each other, (except the case when the focus group is conducted in a small rural settlement)
- 2) each focus group interview will last approximately 1.5 hours, starting with the moderator's announcement of the objectives and confidentiality rules

- 3) at least 20 invitations will be sent for each focus group interview to ensure sufficient attendance based on an assumption that no more than half of the invitees will actually turn up,
- 4) Each group interview will be conducted in an appropriate isolated room, preferably with a round table. Permanent staff of the IUE and IISP will be involved to make sure such rooms are available in each municipality, and that all necessary requirements are met.
- 5) Each group will be moderated by 1 IUE-IISP experienced team member, which another team member will be writing protocol of the focus group interview. Local or regional program administrators or policy makers shall not be present,
- 6) Written invitations will be sent or phone calls will be made on behalf of local authorities or regional social protection administrators. It will be stated that participation is absolutely voluntary, that only adult household members are invited to represent their families, and that all information about participation will be kept confidential.

In addition, we will organize a short wrap-up tea or distribute presents for focus group participants and they will be able to ask questions about the project. This approach proved very useful in the IUE experience in conducting focus group interviews in previous work, as it helped to attract participants and make their experience more pleasant.

*Case files sampling and verification procedures.* We believe that some of the questions this project seeks to answer (for instance, erroneous exclusion, accuracy of reporting, regularity of re-certification etc.) can be best addressed not through interviews, which bear subjectivity of the program managers and operators as a group of interest, but through analysis of a random sample of the beneficiaries' files kept in the program offices. This verification will look into completeness of information in the files as compared to program requirements, accuracy of calculations, re-certification history, reports from home visits, and related information. A formalized checklist for income test will be included into the procedure. It is a table containing information on the types of income that is confirmed or not confirmed by documents, as well as the total sums of income.

We intend to sample the cases randomly picking between 10 case files per program in each municipality. The selection step will be defined by dividing the total number of case record available (N) by 10 and then starting from a randomly picked case file on a shelf,

each (N/10)th file will be selected. We intend to do this random case file verification for three targeted programs – housing allowances, child allowances and state social assistance, because these are mandated and financed mostly from the regional level, so that uniform analytic methods can be applied to them. By concentrating on three programs and reviewing 10 cases for each of them in each locality, we will have 50 observations per program in each region, which is sufficient to test for the presence of big differences in error rates between regions or between a given region and the average observed level.

*Administrative cost assessment methodology.* This is derived from Annex 2 of the Terms of Reference, complemented by UI-IUE calculator of administrative costs that was developed and tested in a few localities. Its description can be found, in Russian, in the brochure “Organization of administrative monitoring in social assistance programs” issued by the IUE in 2002. The calculator had been adapted for the realities of the actual system of social assistance provision in Russia. Previous version of the IUE administrative costs assessment methodology and references to its application in Perm oblast in 2004 can also be found at our Web site:

[http://www.urbaneconomics.ru/texts.php?folder\\_id=24&mat\\_id=18&page\\_id=5318](http://www.urbaneconomics.ru/texts.php?folder_id=24&mat_id=18&page_id=5318).

## ANNEX

### Data to be gathered from secondary sources

**Employment data** to be gathered at the region and municipal level; for the most recent month available and for the same month or quarter one year earlier

- Current Unemployment rate and 6, 12, and 18 months ago [ILO definition and registered at the region and registered unemployment rate at municipal level]
- Number of persons employed
- Labor force participation rate
- Number of persons who registered for unemployment benefits in that month
- Number of persons receiving unemployment benefits in the month

Subsistence minimum income per capita

- At the regional level for most recent date available

### Statistical Data

- Level and dynamics of the GRP;
- Income dynamics of the population;
- GRP, industrial and agricultural production indexes;
- Consumer price index;
- Level of economic activity and dynamics of the number of economically active population;
- Structure of employment by economic sectors (private, state, municipal);
- Dynamics of the number of the employed by industries;
- Structure of the employed by industries and its changes;
- Number of those employed in small entrepreneurship, their share in the Payroll number of those employed in industry;
- Average wages in the region and by industries, its dynamics;
- Level of wage differentiation;
- Scale and timing of wage arrears;
- Amount of subsistence wage in the region;
- Level of unemployment as measured according to the ILO methodology, structure of the unemployed by sex, age, place of residence (urban/rural), period of unemployment;
- Level, dynamics and structure of registered unemployment (by sex, age, education, professional groups, share of youth under 30 years old, place of residence);
- Availability of vacancies and tension in the labor market (the number of registered unemployed per one vacancy).

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for Head of local Employment office**

Person interviewed:

Date:

Title, address, phone number, etc.:

Interviewer:

Thank you very much for agreeing to meet with me. I hope you saw the letter that was sent ahead that explained the purpose of the meeting. In short, we are conducting research for the World Bank at the request on the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection that has as one objective of improving the coordination between the local Employment Service offices and the social assistance offices.

I am going to ask a number of questions about the responsibilities and operations of your office so that we have a full context for understanding the answers to the questions specifically on the coordination topic.

### **A. Labor Market Conditions**

1. How would you classify the conditions now in the area's labor market? Are there plenty of jobs or a serious shortage of jobs?

2. Are there some types of skills that are in short supply, I mean that firms cannot find enough qualified staff?

3. In the past 12-18 months has the unemployment situation improved? [*We are looking for a qualitative answer here, not a statistical one. So we want an opinion about the growth in the number of jobs and the quality of the jobs on offer; we want the director's opinion.*]

4. What information sources do you rely on for tracking what is happening in the labor market?

[*Ask if there she receives a report (either from another office or her own staff) on a regular basis with this kind of information; if yes, ask if you could have a copy.*]

5. Does your office provide information on jobs in great demand to the vocational schools and universities so that they can adjust their programs to meet the need?

[*If yes, ask whether there is a formal process for this—for example, a committee of educators and officials (and perhaps representatives of big firms) that meet to discuss this.*]

6. Does your office use information on jobs-in-demand to adjust the topics of the training programs being sponsored by your office?

In general, who decides on the courses that a local ES office will offer—the Region or the local office?

7. Do you have computerized data base of job vacancies or it is in paper?

8. How do you cooperate with employers? Who is your main vacancy supplier: large firms or small and medium enterprises?

**B. Activities of the local office**

This last question brings me to the next broad area to discuss: how decisions about the activities of the local ES offices are made.

9. Can you give me an overview of the kinds of programs your office now offers to your clients to help them find work? I mean all of the training programs, short-term work for the city (public work jobs), job clubs, etc. *[Try to get a full listing, and ask how many participants were in each last month.]*

<b>Program</b>	<b>participants</b>
Receiving unemployment benefits	
Training #1:	

10. How does the ES decide on the mix of services it offers, i.e., on the mix of resources devoted to job search assistance, training, direct work experience, seed capital for new businesses, and other areas? *[Check on how much guidance the office gets from the Region ES director.]*

11. How the budget for all of these activities is determined each year?

12. How does the office judge the effectiveness of the various services, in terms of participants placed in permanent jobs, the length of time it takes participants to find a job, and cost effectiveness (cost of person obtaining a job)? How does the office know, what statistics are kept, etc.? *[If statistics are being kept, be sure and review them carefully—ask about who compiles them, how, how often, etc.]*

14. What is the share of the registered unemployed who participate in active labor programs who are placed in permanent job?

15. What performance indicators do you use generally to track how the office is operating? Who decided on these? Who gets reports using them?

16. Do you have any internal barriers (organizational or financial problems) to implementing different active programs? What kind of barriers? *[Probe because you are likely to just get a statement that there is not sufficient funds. So you may have to say something like, “Assume you had sufficient funds, would there still be problems?”]*

### **C. Now some questions about your training programs**

17. How does the ES decide on which specific training courses to offer, e.g., computer program, hair styling? [*Specifically ask if there is some sort of mechanism for consulting with local employers about skills that are in short supply, and, if so, how this information is used.*]

18. Are the trainings conducted by ES staff or are they contracted out? If contracted out, are their incentives in the training program contracts for placing students in permanent positions? What kind? Do you keep any records on whether training participants find jobs, and specifically if the jobs are related to the training received?

19. Are their requirements that participants in training programs must have—certain level of education, some prior relevant experience, etc.—to take each course? How were these determined?

20. In offering training and other services that are not available to everyone, are some groups given priority, e.g., those with no one working in the household, the handicapped, those out of work for more than a year? Is this policy written down? Do all staff members know about these priorities? Are they written down?

21. Do you have any active programs directed to unemployed able-bodied social assistance beneficiaries?

22. Do you have any active programs directed to particular group of people (e.g. young people, disabled but able to work etc.)

### **D. Incentives for finding jobs**

I would now like to ask you about positive incentives that your staff have to help clients find jobs and that the clients may have for getting back to work.

23. What are the incentives do ES staff have to place participants in jobs? Any pay or other type of rewards? If they are good at it, is there a reasonable possibility of a promotion?

24. What requirements does the ES now have for registered unemployed who are receiving benefit payments to search for a new job? How does it monitor whether participants are doing this? What is the penalty if a participant does not search or does not search enough?

25. How the unemployment benefits' recipients are controlled?

Do you think these procedures are effective?

26. How accessible are unemployment benefits for different groups of people (rural inhabitants, young people etc.)?

27. What is the average amount of unemployment benefit per month? Is it enough for the person to escape poverty? [*We are asking about the individual rather than his or her family*]

*because if we asked about the family the answer would depend on the worker's family size. The subsistence minimum income is defined on a per capita basis.]*

28. What incentives do the ES programs offer to stimulate participants to find jobs quickly? *[In the Benefits-to-Wages program, participants were able to continue to receive cash benefits paid by the SA office until the end of their job search contract with the SA. Is there anything like that in this city?]*

29. Has the ES ever thought of entering into a mutually-agreed contract with a participant under which each side commits to doing certain things that will likely lead to a permanent job? *[For example, the ES might commit to the monthly unemployment payments and giving the client information on the maximum number of job openings that are a realistic match with his skills, and the client would commit to searching intensely for work, i.e., visiting the employers for interviews.]*

30. What is the average wage in the new job for clients of the ES who succeed in getting one? Is it enough for the person to escape poverty?

#### **E. Coordination with the local social assistance office on helping certain clients**

31. Do you now coordinate actively with the social assistance office? For example, do you refer clients to each other and give each other information about how certain clients are progressing? Please describe what you do. How often you do it? What data are in exchange? If you do not do it, please, describe the perspectives of possible information exchange.

*[If there is this type of cooperation, get all the details: what information is exchanged, how often; is there a formal agreement for cooperation—get a copy]*

32. Does your office and the social assistance office work out comprehensive plans for certain clients that are designed to address various problems that keep the client from working, e.g., the SA office arranging child care and the ES office providing training and job search assistance?

*If this is not now done, does he think it would be feasible? be a good idea?*

33. For the clients you and the SA office coordinate about, do you exchange information on them? What form does this take, i.e., exchange of forms in physical copy or in electronic form? Is there a common data base for your clients and the SA office's?

*[If there is data exchange, ask if someone can show you what is exchanged after the interview is over.]*

*If there is not such an exchange or it is in a limited form, does he think it would be feasible to do this? would be useful in improving the efficiency of the ES programs?*

34. Do you have a technical possibility to make a monitoring of unemployed persons from poor households in cooperation with social assistance office?

35. Do clients of the SA offices get any priority for the training and other programs of your office? If yes, is this a formal policy? Is it written down? *[Get a copy.]*

36. One idea to improve the effectiveness of SA and ES programs is to locate them in the same place, i.e., to create a so-called “One Stop Shop.” What do you think about this idea? *[Press if necessary to find out the reason for his opinion.]*

#### **F. Staff training**

Lastly, I would like to ask you a couple of questions about the training your staff receives.

37. What kind of training do new intake workers receive? *[Check: is this formal or informal (e.g., “shadowing” a current working for a period)? is the training given by the Region ES office? is a training package given to the local ES office by the Region office?]*

38. Do intake workers have a procedures manual on their desk that they can refer to? If not, what do they do when they have a complex situation and are not sure what to do? *[A procedures manual describes the program, gives all the rules governing who can participate in which programs, and gives guidance on cases that are not typical.]*

39. How do staff learn about changes in the program and procedures that are mandated by the region or the national ministry? Is the new guidance provided in written form? Does the region organize trainings when such changes are introduced?

That concludes the interview. Thank you very much indeed!

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for Head of Regional Employment office**

Person interviewed:

Date:

Title, address, phone number, etc.:

Interviewer:

*Thank you very much for agreeing to meet with me. I hope you saw the letter that was sent ahead that explained the purpose of the meeting. In short, we are conducting research for the World Bank at the request on the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection that has as one objective improving the coordination between the local Employment Service offices and the social assistance offices.*

*I am going to ask a number of questions about the responsibilities and operations of your office so that we have a full context for understanding the answers to the questions specifically on the coordination topic.*

### **A. Labor Market Conditions**

1. How would you classify the conditions now in the Region's labor market? Are there plenty of jobs or a shortage of jobs?
2. Are there some types of skills that are in short supply, I mean that firms cannot find enough qualified staff?
3. In the past 12-18 months has the unemployment situation improved? What about latent unemployment in rural areas?
4. What information sources do you rely on for tracking what is happening in the labor market?

*[Ask if there she receives a report (either from another office or her own staff) on a regular basis with this kind of information; if yes, ask if you could have a copy.]*

5. What about the number of unemployed people registering at the ES offices for unemployment payments—has that been rising or falling in the past 6 months? In the region and by municipalities
6. Last month in the Region about how many people were registered and receiving benefits? In the region and by municipalities
7. How does that compare to six months ago? In the region and by municipalities

*[Ask if there she receives a report (either from another office or her own staff) on a regular basis with this kind of information; if yes, ask if you could have a copy.]*

8. Does your office provide information on jobs in great demand to the vocational schools and universities so that they can adjust their programs to meet the need?

*[If yes, ask whether there is a formal process for this—for example, a committee of educators and officials (and perhaps representatives of big firms) that meet to discuss this.]*

9. Does your office use information on jobs-in-demand to adjust the topics of the training programs being sponsored by the ES offices for those who have registered with the ES?

In general, who decides on the courses that a local ES office will offer—the Region or the local office?

10. How you cooperate with employers? Who is your main vacancy supplier: large firms or small and medium enterprises?

### **B. Activities of the Regional Labor office**

11. Can you give me an overview of the kinds of programs your office now offers to your clients in the region to help them find work? I mean all of the training programs, short-term work for the city (public work jobs), job clubs, etc. *[Try to get a full listing, and ask how many participants were in each last month.]*

<b>Program</b>	<b>participants</b>
Receiving unemployment benefits	
Training #1:	

*[Note: questions 12-15 may not be applicable to the entire region if there are substantial variations by localities; clarify]*

12. Do you have any active programs focused to unemployed able-bodied social assistance beneficiaries?

13. Do you have any active programs focused to particular group of people (e.g. young people, disabled but able to work etc.)?

14. What share of registered unemployed who participate in active labor programs are placed in permanent jobs in the region?

15. Do you have any internal barriers (organizational or financial problems) to implementing different active programs? What kind of barriers? *[Probe because you are*

*likely to get a statement that there is not sufficient funds. So you may have to say something like: “Assume you had sufficient funds, would there still be problems?”]*

### **C. Relations between the Region administration and the local ES offices**

The next broad area to discuss is: how decisions about the activities of the local ES offices are made.

16. What guidance does the Region give on the mix of services a local ES offers, i.e., on the mix of resources devoted to job search assistance, training, direct work experience, seed capital for new businesses, and other areas? [*List any others mentioned*] Perhaps you could start by describing the overall process by which such decision are made.

17. How does the Region judge the effectiveness of the various services of the ES offices, in terms of participants placed in permanent jobs, the length of time it takes participants to find a job, and cost effectiveness (cost of person obtaining a job)?

18. What performance indicators are used generally to track how local offices are operating in terms of putting workers registered with the ES to work? Who decided on the content of these indicators?

19. What types of reports do the municipal ES offices send you on regular basis? How often are they submitted? What kind of reports do the municipal ES offices send you about implication of active programs? [*Get a copy of each*]

20. Is information on the performance of the local ES offices shared with the offices, i.e., is there a report that compares the performance of all the local ES offices that is sent to all the offices?

21. In offering training and other services that are not available to everyone, what is the guidance given by the Region on giving some groups priority, e.g., those with no one working in the household, the handicapped, those out of work for more than a year, those referred by the local SA office? Is this policy written down? [*If so, ask for a copy.*] Do you think local offices follow it? How do you know?

22. How is the budget for training, job counseling, and other activities for each of the field offices determined each year? [*Is there a formula related to the number of registered unemployed in each ES office, is it negotiated, or what?*]

### **D. Co-ordination with the Regional social assistance office**

23. Do you now coordinate actively with the Regional social assistance office? For example, do you refer clients to each other and give each other information about how certain clients are progressing? Please describe what you do. How often you do it? What data are exchanged? If you do not do it, please, describe the possibilities for information exchange. [*Note: ask also about local variations in possible and actual coordination*]

24. Do you have a technical possibility to make a monitoring of unemployed persons from poor households in cooperation with social assistance office?

25. Do clients of the SA offices get any priority for the training and other programs of your office? If yes, is this a formal policy? Is it written down? *[Get a copy.]*

26. One idea to improve the effectiveness of SA and ES programs is to locate them in the same place, i.e., to create a so-called “One Stop Shop.” What do you think about this idea? *[Press if necessary to find out the reason for his opinion.]*

### **E. Incentives to get people back to work**

As you know, there is a lot of interest in trying to reduce the time workers are unemployed. In this regard, various ideas are being advocated. I would like to get your responses to some of these.

27. *What requirements does the ES now have for registered unemployed who are receiving benefit payments to search for a new job?*

28. How accessible are unemployment benefits for different groups of people (rural inhabitants, young people etc.)?

29. How are unemployment benefits recipients controlled?

30. What is the average amount of unemployment benefit per month? Is it enough for the person to escape poverty? *[We are asking about the individual rather than his or her family because if we asked about the family the answer would depend on the worker’s family size. The subsistence minimum income is defined on a per capita basis.]*

31. What is the share of registered unemployed benefit recipients placed in permanent job?

32. Some advocate giving those registered with the ES some special incentives to stimulate them to find jobs quickly. For example, that a worker who found a job in two months could keep receiving unemployment benefits or some other payment until the end of a standard six month benefit period. What do you think about this kind of approach? *I understand that this may not be possible under current legal provisions. But what if it were possible?*

33. There are several other ideas that have been advanced. Please give me your thoughts about each of these and tell me if your Region has tried some of these. *[Where the Region does have experience, find out as much as you can about the details of the program and the results.]*

34. Conditionalities for able-bodied beneficiaries; for example, that they must bring evidence each week of having visited employers in trying to find work or that they are regularly participating in a training program.

35. Graduation or welfare-to-work activities. Do the local ES offices provide assistance to those who are not registered as unemployed, for example the long-term unemployed, who are referred to them by the local social assistance office?

36. Case management. Do some of the local ES offices have staff that work directly with staff from the social assistance agencies to develop a comprehensive plan for addressing the various problems that an unemployed worker and his family may have with goal of getting him permanently back to work? *[So it could be a combination of social services, training, and job search assistance, for example.]*

37. Related to the case management approach is the idea of the ES and/or the social assistance office entering into a mutually-agreed contract with a participant under which each side commits to doing certain things that will likely lead to a permanent job. What do you think of such an approach? *[For example, the ES might commit to the monthly unemployment payments and giving the client information on the maximum number of job openings that are a realistic match with his skills, and the client would commit to searching intensely for work, i.e., visiting the employers for interviews.]*

38. What is the average wage in the new job for clients of the ES who succeed in getting one? Is it enough for the person to escape poverty?

#### **F. Staff training**

39. What training for municipal ES staff is provided at the regional level? What is the list of courses or workshops? How often are they offered? Is there an annual plan? *[Ask for a copy.]*

40. What training is provided at the local offices? Let's take a specific example. When a new staff member is hired to be an in-take worker, what kind of formal training is this person supposed to receive? Is there a Regional training manual for this purpose? *[If so, get a copy.]*

41. Is there anything else you would like to tell me about the way the ES operates or could operate that you think would be helpful for us to know?

*That concludes the interview. Thank you very much indeed!*

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for in-take worker at the local Employment Service center**

Person interviewed:

Date:

Title, address, phone number, etc.:

Interviewer:

Thank you very much for agreeing to meet with me. I hope you saw the letter that was sent ahead that explained the purpose of the meeting. In short, we are conducting research for the World Bank at the request on the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection that has as one objective of improving the coordination between the local Employment Service offices and the social assistance offices.

I would like to watch you interview someone who is applying for unemployment benefits. After that I will ask a few questions about your job.

### **A. Intake Interview**

[1. Observing the interview before asking questions is very important because the worker may change the content of the interview with the client after hearing the questions.

2. Below is a check list of items to listen for during the interview. Never interrupt the interview. You should also be very careful if you ask the intake worker any questions about the interview not to put them on the defensive, i.e., in any way to suggest that they did not do a good job. If you do this, the answers to other questions will likely be negatively influenced. If possible do not ask clarifying questions about the interview.]

[Record answers to this list after you have left the office.]

1. How thorough was the battery of questions about
  - work history,
  - why the person has lost jobs in the past 2-3 years,
  - skills the person possesses,
  - Any special circumstances that affect the person's inability to work, e.g., a chronically sick child.
2. Was there any discussion of the applicant's needs for social services or social assistance?
3. Was a general plan made—the kind of plan that is consistent with a “case management approach” to working with the client? Or was the process started, i.e., the intake worker said that ES and SA staff should work with the client to make a plan of help?
4. How carefully did the intake worker explain the resources available in the office for identifying job openings?
5. How carefully were the ES's expectations about the applicant's required effort in looking for a job explained? *[For example, what are the requirements for a participant to report job*

*search effort to the ES?]* Were penalties for not searching with sufficient effort detailed? Was there any explicit discussion about incentives for finding a job quickly?

6. What did the intake worker say about other options available through the ES, e.g., seed capital and training to start one's own business, training courses, etc? Were the requirements and suitability of the various options seriously discussed with the applicant? Was information provided in writing?

Observation: *Does the worker have a procedures manual or something similar on her table to refer to?*

## **B. Questions for the intake worker after she finishes the interview**

Thank you for letting me observe the interview, it was really very informative for me.

7. [If the intake interview did not include any discussion of social service or social assistance that might be available to the client, ask:]

In the course of doing interviews like this one, do you ever refer people to the social assistance office? Under what conditions?

8. Do you have sufficient information about the programs that the social assistance and social services office offers that you can even know whether it makes sense to refer them to the that agency? Do you have some written materials?

9. [If the answer is yes, ask:

Does the ES office have specific requirements for referring someone to the SA? If so, what is their basis, i.e., did the office decide these by itself or in coordination to the SA?

[Probe to learn how knowledge does the intake worker appear to be about these programs. Record how the degree of information the worker appears to command:]

10. What requirements does the ES now have for registered unemployed who are receiving benefit payments to search for a new job? How does it monitor whether participants are doing this?

11. Does this office impose penalties on clients who do not search for a new job with sufficient effort?

12. In offering training and other services that are not available to everyone, are some groups given priority, e.g., persons referred for help by the social assistance office, those with no one working in the household, the handicapped, those out of work for more than a year? Is this policy written down?

13. What kind of training programs are the most popular among the clients of ES? Why?

I would now like to ask you a couple of questions about what happened when you came to work in this office.

12. When did you begin working in this office? *[Month/year]*

13. What kind of training did you get when you started? *[Probe: was there a formal instruction part to it (rather than just “shadowing” an experienced worker? If so who taught it, someone on the staff?]*

14. Is it the same today for new workers in your position? Do you think more training is needed?

15. How do you learn about program changes that affect your work? Do you usually receive written information about the program?

## Methodology of labor market assessment

The research methodology includes two main directions of analysis: condition of the labor market and interaction of the labor market policy with social programs for the poor.

**1. Condition of the labor market.** Its assessment would be performed by two methods of data collection: in-depth (focused) interviews with experts and analysis of statistical information. These are complementary methods; however, for the assessment of the condition of the labor market, quantitative statistical evaluations are more useful, whereas interviews play a more important role in the assessment of the policy. This is determined not only by the lack of reliable and complete statistical information, but also by the advantages of qualitative methods for discovering the peculiarities of the existing policy.

The following statistical information is to be collected at the regional level (region in general) for 2000–2005.

*Trends in economic growth* (on the basis of the information on the dynamics of economic development):

- level and dynamics of the GRP;
- income dynamics of the population;
- GRP, industrial and agricultural production indexes;
- consumer price index;

*Condition of the labor market* (by the data of labor market surveys conducted by Rosstat):

- level of economic activity and dynamics of the number of economically active population;
- structure of employment by economic sectors (private, state, municipal);
- dynamics of the number of the employed by industries;
- structure of the employed by industries and its changes;
- number of those employed in small entrepreneurship, their share in the payroll number of those employed in industry;
- average wages in the region and by industries, its dynamics;
- level of wage differentiation;
- scale and timing of wage arrears;
- amount of subsistence wage in the region;
- level of unemployment as measured according to the ILO methodology, structure of the unemployed by sex, age, place of residence (urban/rural), period of unemployment;
- level, dynamics and structure of registered unemployment (by sex, age, education, professional groups, share of youth under 30 years old, place of residence);
- Availability of vacancies and tension in the labor market (the number of registered unemployed per one vacancy).

*Mobility of the population* (migration situation in the region) as a factor influencing the condition of the labor market.

**In-depth interviews.** The technique of in-depth interviews with experts to assess the condition of the labor market does not have informational limitations and specific features by regional and municipal levels, and therefore can have a general character. The key questions are formulated to specify the assessment of the condition of the labor market and main employment trends:

- differences in employment problems by municipalities and their causes (interviews with the head of the regional employment agency and the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- influence of the major regional/municipal enterprises on local labor markets (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- prospects of the development of small and medium business in the region (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- years (within the transition period) of the most significant (noticeable) structural changes in employment (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- agricultural employment (hidden unemployment at agricultural enterprises) (interviews with the head of the regional employment agency and the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- the existing practice of getting the status of the unemployed, barriers for the urban and rural population (interview with the head of the regional/municipal employment agency);
- Problems of job-placement of the youth (interviews with the head of the regional employment agency and the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy).
- influence of labor migration on the situation in municipal labor markets (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- Assessments of pendulum labor migration (to the regional center, Moscow, Moscow region) (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy).

## **2. Employment policy of the regional authorities and its integration with social programs for the poor**

Statistical analysis in this area can be but very limited because of the lack of information; therefore a wider use of interviews with the same group of experts is to be performed. Two key directions are singled out: analysis of employment programs (both passive and active) and analysis of their interaction with the targeted programs for the poor.

**Employment programs** are to be analyzed using the following scheme:

- Analysis of the reports of employment agencies about the implementation of active programs (the reports are requested during interviews with the head of regional employment agency);
- In-depth interviews with the head of regional/municipal employment agency to:
  - a) Identify most popular forms of the realization of active programs (re-training, public works, etc.);
  - b) identify specialized active programs, if any (for beneficiaries of target allowances; other groups: youth, disabled capable of working);
  - c) evaluation of the efficiency of these programs by executive bodies, their influence on the situation in the labor market and growth of employment;
  - d) identify external (economic and demographic factors) and internal (organizational and financial problems) barriers for using various forms of active policy;
- Analysis of reports on registered unemployment (passive programs) (requested during the interview with the head of regional employment agency);
- Assessment of the efficiency of the work of employment agencies with the unemployed (interview with the head of regional employment agency).

**Integration with social programs** can be assessed only qualitatively. In-depth interviews with experts include the following clusters of questions:

a) Regional policy (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy):

- qualitative evaluations of the most problem areas: municipalities with the highest level of unemployment and the lowest living standards;
- implementation of an intra-regional policy aimed at local development and creation of new jobs, its efficiency;

b) Participation of big business in employment policy (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy):

- which social programs in the labor market are financed by the big business of the region;

c) Policy towards business (interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy):

- measures aimed to legalize wages and reduce the share of hidden wages, especially towards small business;

d) **Coordination policy of the accounting of the needy and payments** (interview with the head of the regional/municipal employment agency and with the head of the Department of social protection of the population):

- assessment of the coordination between employment agencies and social protection agencies in the process of identification of those who need assistance (including interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- assessment of the possibilities of information exchange between employment agencies and the Department of social protection of the population;
- assessment of the accessibility of unemployment benefits for different groups of the population (urban and rural population, youth, etc.), identification of the most disadvantaged territorial and social-demographic groups;
- assessment of the possibilities of the creation of a databank of socially disadvantaged households and, in this group, monitoring of the families with unemployed members (“the input of unemployment in poverty”);

e) Efficiency of active and passive policies in the labor market for the reduction of poverty (interview with the head of the regional/municipal employment agency and with the head of the Department of social protection of the population):

- influence of the existing job-placement practices (the level of wages in the new job) on the possibility of withdrawing the households of thus placed unemployed from poverty (including interview with the head of the Department of economy and industrial policy);
- the role of the active policy of job-placement of the marginal groups of the population (public works, home employment) in the reduction of the number of targeted assistance beneficiaries;
- Whether unemployment benefits can reduce the number of poor households and in what kind of municipalities (depressive, rural, peripheral, etc.).

A complex analysis by different directions and territorial levels with the use of varied methodology would allow assessing the influence of labor market policy on the dynamics of the number of beneficiaries of targeted social assistance.

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for Head of Regional Labor Department and Department of Economy**

Person interviewed:

Date:

Title, address, phone number, etc.:

Interviewer:

Thank you very much for agreeing to meet with me. I hope you saw the letter that was sent ahead that explained the purpose of the meeting. In short, we are conducting research for the World Bank at the request on the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection that has as one objective improving the coordination between the local Employment Service offices and the social assistance offices.

I am going to ask a number of questions about the responsibilities and operations of your office so that we have a full context for understanding the answers to the questions specifically on the coordination topic.

### **A. Assessment of labor market conditions and main tendencies in the sphere of unemployment.**

1. Does the Department conduct monitoring of the labor market, unemployment problems, poverty elimination and social protection?
2. What are the peculiarities of the local labor markets? What are the differences of the unemployment problems in municipalities and the reasons of these differences?
3. What are the possible ways to increase the number of jobs and, correspondingly, to reduce unemployment, in the relatively successful municipalities as well as in the weakest?
4. How do large enterprises of the region/municipality influence unemployment rate and local labor markets? What is their role in employment support and increase in the region/municipality?
5. What are the prospects of small- and medium-scale business development in the region in your opinion? What policy does the Department conduct in the field of small- and medium-scale business development? Is there a program of small-scale business support?
6. Does the large-scale business take part in social policy? (Social programs that are financed by them)

### **B. Co-ordination with the social assistance programs**

#### *Regional policy*

7. Would you please evaluate the most problem areas: municipalities with the highest unemployment rate and the lowest quality of life?

8. Would you please tell me are there programs of economic development for municipalities? If a program of new jobs creation exists, how efficient is it?

*The participation of the large-scale business in the employment policy*

9. Which programs in the labor market are financed by large companies?

10. Are any measures taken to legalize wages and to reduce the share of gray or concealed wages, especially for the small-scale business (including fiscal measures)?

*The policy of record keeping of the needy and compensations*

11. Are the existing social service programs for the needy families support effective? What could increase their efficiency?

12. Is there a co-ordination of activity of the Department, Employment Services and Social Assistance when the categories of people who need benefits are determined? If yes than how? (United database, mutual consultations of specialists, etc).

13. What information on poverty, on social assistance programs, unemployment, labor market conditions, migration, social expenditures, - is important for the department? Is this information sufficient for estimation of the situation, how is it used?

*The efficiency of active and passive policy on the labor market for poverty reduction*

14. What are the most critical problems of poverty in the region? What is the significance of the problem of poverty of the able-bodied citizens?

15. How does the fixed practice of employment of people who do not have job (the level of wages on the new job) influence the possibilities of elimination poverty of households that contain able-bodied citizens?

16. What are your recommendations for the regional economic policy, labor market policy and social assistance for poverty reduction?

In conclusion I will ask you several specific questions

17. When (in what years during transition) the most powerful (noticeable) structural changes in unemployment took place?

18. How large is the concealed unemployment in agricultural companies? Do you have any specific data on this problem?

19. Is there a problem of unemployment among youth in the region? Are there any special programs?

20. Could you please evaluate the scale of labor migration in the region? Is it reasonable to talk about its influence on the local labor markets?

21. How large is pendulum labor migration (for the pilot region – ask about migration to the regional center, to Moscow or Moscow Region, to Saint-Petersburg and Leningrad Oblast)?

*That concludes the interview. Thank you very much indeed!*

**Observation checklist for independent observer in a social assistance in-take office**

Name of organization	code (1 child allowance department, 2 housing allowance department, 3 department of targeted programs or social assistance)
Settlement	
Date of observation	
Beginning of observation, time	
End of observation, time	

**1. Reception hours**

	private persons	juridical persons
Document reception		
Document delivery		
Consultation		

**Accessibility**

**2. In what part of the settlement the organization is situated?**

1. Administrative (business) center of the settlement
2. Residential area, bedroom community
3. Outskirts
4. Other \_\_\_\_\_

**3. Transport connection**

1. It takes not more than 15 minutes to get to the nearest municipal transport station
2. It takes 15-30 minutes to get to the nearest municipal transport station
3. There is no municipal transport in the place where the organization is situated or it takes more than 30 minutes to get to the nearest municipal transport station

**4. Accessibility barriers on the way to the organization:**

	Yes	No
1. Blurred road (mud and other)	1	0
2. Pavement, footpath are missing (or compelled by cars);	1	0
3. Car park is missing;	1	0

4. Ramps are missing	1	0
5. Other	1	

**5. Availability of signboards, information sheets on the way to the organization**

1. Yes
2. No

**6. Does signboard on the building (front door) contain ...?**

	Yes	No
1. ...organization name	1	0
2. ... operating schedule / reception hours	1	0
3. ... telephone number for consultation	1	0
4. ...list of services and their costs	1	0
5. ...Other (such as?)	1	

**7. On which floor visitors are received?**

On \_\_\_\_\_ floor.

**8. Number of visitors, waiting in lines on the beginning of observation:**

\_\_\_\_\_ Visitors

**9. There are \_\_\_\_\_ seats for visitors**

**10. What conveniences for visitors are there in the interior of organization?**

1. stairs are supplied with railing
2. stairs are supplied with ramps
3. lavatory is working for visitors
4. elevator is available for visitors
5. there is a place equipped for document completion
6. there are enough free forms in places for document completion
7. there are separate rooms/windows for recipients of different services
8. cloakroom for visitors is working
9. wall clock is working
10. there is sound player or TV-set
11. there is queue management system
12. Xerox is working
13. food and drink are sold in the interior of organization or building next door
14. vending machine is working

**11. What sources of visual information about services available for visitors? What are accessibility barriers for each sources of visual information?**

	missing	accessibility barriers						
		no barriers	visual information is	blind copy	bad light	difficult to access because of crowd or in	other	
1. Samples of completion of documents	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	
2. Information stand	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	
3. Signboard with reception hours	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	
4. indexes on doors	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	
5. indexes of location of offices	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	
6. Electronic information table	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	

If answer «6. Other» is chosen, describe what are accessibility barriers for each sources of visual information: \_\_\_\_\_

**12. What visual information is available to visitors?**

1. Notices about innovations and changes in legislation, program rules and document reception
2. Description of application process by steps
3. Full list of documents needed to enter the programs
4. Information about procedure of appellation of benefit payment denial
5. Information about responsibility for service quality and standards compliance (for example, maximum time of waiting in line)
6. Information about address, telephone number, operating schedule, service costs of organizations that provide documents needed for program application.
7. Information about situation and work hours of the nearest Xerox, Bank and others
8. Official announcements that specify or change the official rules and service procedure
9. Other (such as) \_\_\_\_\_

**13. The web-site and e-mail of the organization available from visual sources:**

**ARRANGEMENT OF SPACE**

**14. How large is the floor space, where the clients are waiting for reception?**

About \_\_\_\_\_ square meters.

**15. Is the room where the clients are waiting for reception is lit enough?**

1. Yes, the room is lit well.
2. No, the room is not lit well enough (dimly, erratically).
3. No, it is dark in the room

**16. Is the temperature comfortable in the room where the clients are waiting for reception?**

1. Yes, it is comfortable there.
2. No, it is stuffy.
3. No, it is sufficiently cold there

**17. Is the room where the clients are waiting for reception clean and neat?**

1. Yes, it is very clean and neat.
2. No, it is not clean and neat enough.
3. No, it is very dirty and untidy.

**SERVICE**

**18. The quantity of the specialists, who simultaneously are receiving client of targeted programs during the observation:**

\_\_\_\_\_ Specialists

**19. The of clients of the targeted programs are being received:**

1. in a private office	1. Yes	2. No
2. through a window, counter etc.	1. Yes	2. No
3. (explain) _____		Other

**20. Count, how long did it take one specialist to serve 5 clients from the queue**

From the moment the first client entered to the moment the fifth client exited passed \_\_\_\_\_ minutes.

How many clients were served out of turn during this time, (to take a form, second reception after a copy had been made etc.) \_\_\_\_\_

**21. Do specialists provide additional help to visitors?**

1. They help to fill in forms (dictate)
2. They fill in forms themselves for clients
3. They do copies of documents at the instance of some clients
4. They give additional explanation
5. Other \_\_\_\_\_

**22. What of the listed below is more suitable for description of specialists' attitude in general:**

1. Good will
2. Calmness, patience
3. aggression
4. Other \_\_\_\_\_

**SELF- ORGANIZATION**

**23. What kind of self-organization forms of visitors were noticed during of observation?**

1. Visitors are making a list of people in the queue
2. Visitors are regulating the access of the each other into the room where the documents are received
3. Visitors exchange oral and (or) written information on the documents submission rules (for instance, form samples, addresses of organizations, that it is necessary to visit, etc)
4. Other \_\_\_\_\_
5. Nothing of the above

**24. Did conflict situations (quarrels, squabbles, rudeness, and scuffles) arise during the observation?**

	Among clients	Among clients and specialists
They happened constantly	1	1
They happened several times	2	2
There was a single case	3	3
There were no conflicts	4	4

**25. The quantity of the visitors waiting in a queue(s) at the end of observation:**

\_\_\_\_\_ Visitors

**26. How is it possible to characterize in general the situation, atmosphere in the room(s) where the visitors are waiting for reception?**

- |                 |                          |
|-----------------|--------------------------|
| 1. tension      | 10. attentiveness        |
| 2. confusion    | 11. benevolence          |
| 3. detached     | 12. complaisance         |
| 4. nervousness  | 13. good organization    |
| 5. perplexity   | 14. comfort              |
| 6. overcrowded  | 15. sensitivity          |
| 7. fuss         | 16. conciliation         |
| 8. weariness    | 17. cosines              |
| 9. noise        |                          |
| 18. Other _____ | 19. Nothing of the above |

**OBSERVATION IN A PRIVATE OFFICE**

(Spend no less than 20 minuets in an office or service time of no less of two clients)

**27. How many people are in the office:**

\_\_\_\_\_ Specialists receiving clients  
 \_\_\_\_\_ Specialists not receiving clients  
 \_\_\_\_\_ visitors (with the exception of the observer)

**28. How much time (approximately) it takes to serve one client:**

\_\_\_\_\_ minuets took to serve a client, who visited the office:

1. To submit an application and documents on an allowance
2. To consult a specialist (about the benefits he (she) can claim to, about documents needed, etc.)

2. To re-register
  3. To change the information in the documents and for re-calculation
  4. To receive explanation about rejection or to impugn a rejection
  5. Other (list other reasons, on account of which the client visited the office)
- 

**29. Mark ALL of the listed below that characterize activities and conduct of the specialists:**

	Yes	No
1. Availability of all the documents needed is checked from memory	1	2
2. The package is compared with a list	1	2
3. The accuracy of documents is checked from memory	1	2
4. The accuracy of documents is compared with the reference book, rules and other written sources	1	2
5. A specialist told a visitor that he has no right to a benefit advancing an arguments that are not mentioned in actual legislation (for instance, because, it is known about extra income of the visitor, or about his (her) asocial behavior etc.)	1	2
6. A specialist patiently and calmly explained everything, answered all questions	1	2
7. A specialist was tactless, aggressive	1	2
8. Other (explain)	1	2

### Check list and instructions for case file assessment for targeted social assistance files

Region _____	Municipality _____
Who _____ conducts the evaluation	Case record number _____
Date of carrying out of the evaluation _____	

1. A kind of the assistance:

1. To needy families and needy single living citizens which have mean per capita income below the minimal subsistence level established in the \_\_\_\_\_ region;
2. To nonworking pensioners, which have mean per capita income below the minimal subsistence level established in the \_\_\_\_\_ region for given social-demographic group of the population?

2. Is the case record in a folder? Are documents stitched up?

yes \_\_\_\_\_ no \_\_\_\_\_

3. Does the case record contain the following documents?

Documents	yes	no
The application for granting of the state social assistance	1	2
The information about applicant family structure	1	2
The information about place of residence (stay)	1	2
Information (documents) about living conditions	1	2
Information (documents) about subsidiary plot ownership	1	2
Information (documents) about property beneficially owned that has comparatively high degree of market liquidity (the car, garage, an apartment, the house, etc.)	1	2

4. for the applicant and each member of family included in the structure of his family<sup>2</sup>, mark with X all the documents contained in the case record. In case of inapplicability, put a dash.

---

<sup>2</sup> Persons that are considered as the members of the family: spouses that live together and leading a joint housekeeping, their children and parents, adoptive fathers and adopted, brothers and sisters, stepsons and stepdaughters. Persons that are not considered as the members of the family: conscripts that are severed as sergeants, foremen, the soldier or sailors, the military men who study in military educational establishments of vocational training and have not concluded the contract on passage of military service; the persons who are enduring the punishment in the form of imprisonment, the misdemeanant prisoners, the persons who are being on compulsory treatment under the decision of court; the persons who are being on full state maintenance.

Documents	Number of the member of the family						
	1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.
Documents certifying citizenship							
Documents certifying relationships with the applicant							
Documents confirming a place of residence (stay)							
Documents on assistance provided							
Documents on a state of work capacity							
Copy of the pension certificate							
Documents confirming status of conscript or training in military educational establishment							

5. Is the structure of applicant's family defined correctly?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no.

6. Check up conformity of the application form and confirming documents. Does the application form contain the information which is not confirmed by the documents provided? \_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no.

Do documents contain information which is not present in the application form? \_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no.

7. The information about incomes of the members of the family. For each member of the family included in the application form, note how the information about the incomes is presented.

Number of the member of the family	The types of incomes are present in the case record (write the numbers of the income types following the Table 1 below)	The total sum of incomes without breakdown is present in the case record (1. yes, 2. no)	Incomes are confirmed completely by the documents (1. yes, 2. no)	The types of incomes that are present in the case record but not confirmed by the documents (write the numbers of the income types following the Table 1 below)
1.				
2.				
3.				
4.				
5.				
6.				
7.				

Table 1

<b>Types of income</b>	
1	All payments, taken into account when calculating the median wages;
2	The median wages, paid in all cases, stipulated by the Labor code of the RF;
3	Compensation, provided by a state organ or a public organization for the period of performing state or public duties;
4	Retirement compensations, discharge payments, redundancy wages etc.
5	Pensions, compensation payments (except for compensations to the caretakers of the disabled) and additional monthly benefits, paid to the retired;
6	Monthly life allowance of retired judges ;
7	Grants paid to students of primary, secondary and higher institutions, as well as to postgraduates, students of seminaries, and compensations, paid to these categories on sick-leave;
8	Unemployment benefits and other types of assistance, rendered to the unemployed seeking a new employment or doing educational courses, as well as payments to the temporarily occupied unemployed, the most deprived categories of the unemployed and temporarily occupied children of 14 to 18;
9	Sick-leave allowance, maternity leave , as well as lump benefit paid to pregnant women leaving work earlier than stipulated by the law;
10	Monthly childcare benefit;
11	Monthly allowance paid to child-rearing persons during the first 1.5 years of after a child is born, as well as monthly compensations, paid to persons on their child-rearing leave during the first 3 years after a child is born;
12	Monthly allowance paid to spouses of the military, serving under a contract, if the spouses are not able to find work and have the status of the unemployed; or if the spouses have to leave their jobs to care for under age sick children whose sickness is caused by the service conditions;
13	Monthly compensation paid to spouses of the officers of the Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service and penitentiary institutions of the Russian Federation, when they are not able to find a job in distant regions;
14	Monthly social insurance payment (accidents at work, occupational hazards);
15	Additional payments to all types of pay, covered by the present item, and other social benefits, stipulated by state organs, local administration and other organizations of the RF;
16	Income from leasing real estate, cars and other facilities, owned by the family or family members;
17	Income from selling the products of personal part-time plots and small-scale farming;
18	Money allowances, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, penitentiary institutions, customs, as well as additional payment and food supply, provided on the permanent basis and stipulated by the laws of the Russian Federation;
19	Retirement lump benefit, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs service of the Russian Federation ;
20	Payment under contracts, drawn according to the Civil code of the RF;
21	Financial assistance, rendered by employers to retired employees;
22	Royalties, as stipulated by the laws of the RF on copyright;
23	Income from private businesses (including farms) existing both as natural and artificial persons;
24	Income from stocks, shares (dividends);

25	Alimony, received by children under 18;
26	Interest payment on bank deposits;
27	Money, inherited and received as a gift;
28	Social benefits, provided by the state, local administration and other organizations, in their money equivalent.
29	benefits
30	Income from personal part-time plots and small-scale farming

**Correctness of the assistance assignment and calculation of the income:**

8. Does the period of calculation of incomes correspond to the date of application for the state social assistance (the income of family is defined for last 3 calendar months previous before the application month)?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes \_\_\_\_\_no

9. Is calculation of total and mean per capita incomes presented in the case record?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes \_\_\_\_\_no

10. Does the case record contain information about incomes of the members of the family for all months of the period under review (3 months before the month of the application)?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes \_\_\_\_\_no (the comment\_\_\_\_\_)

11. Are there confirming documents on each type of the incomes specified in the application form?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes \_\_\_\_\_no (the comment\_\_\_\_\_)

12. Are the total and mean per capita incomes of the family defined correctly? (Calculate them according to the [Annex 2](#))

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes \_\_\_\_\_no

13. Define the size of the assistance which should be received by the applicant in accordance with belonging to the certain category (see the Annex 2). Is the size of the assistance defined correctly?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes

\_\_\_\_\_no (specify the correct size of the assistance \_\_\_\_\_).

\_\_\_\_\_in the case record there is not enough information (the comment\_\_\_\_\_).

**Decisions on payment, suspension, re-registration, etc.**

14. Fill in the table about the Decisions presented in the case record:

Date of the Decision	Type of the Decision (1. Decision about reassignment, 2. Decision about suspension, 3. Decision about prolongation 4. other (specify) )	Grounds (1. Act about beneficiary income information verification, 2. Act about verification of material-domestic conditions of beneficiary, 3. Application form about	Verification results / what was changed



\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_inapplicable

17.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about suspension of the payment?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

18. Was the stoppage of payment made in-time? (See the Annex 3)

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_inapplicable

18.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about stoppage of the payment?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

19. Was prolongation of the payment's term made in-time?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_inapplicable

19.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about the prolongation of the payment's term?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

20. Was the size of payment changed in-time?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_inapplicable

20.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about change of the size of payment?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

## **Case record review guide – state social assistance**

### **Formation of sample of recipients' case records**

The given plan is developed for quality inspection of keeping case records of state social assistance recipients. Inspection will be carried out in each of municipalities of the project. Ten case records of recipients in each municipal formation will be selected. It is supposed, that case records of recipients are ordered alphabetically. Case records of recipients are selected on the basis of the following algorithm:

- Calculation of the total number of available case records of recipients is made.
- All available case records are ordered alphabetically.
- The step of selection is calculated as the total number of available case records divided by ten.
- Process of case record selection proceeds until 10 case records will not be selected. If a supervisor go on to the last case record in the set of case records and the number of selected case records is less that ten, then he should continue the selection process continuously from the beginning of the set.

The analysis of one case record should take from about 15 minutes.

### **Recipients that are eligible for state social assistance**

The state social assistance is provided to needy families and needy single living citizens, which have mean per capita income is below the minimal subsistence level established in the \_\_\_\_ region; and to nonworking pensioners, which mean per capita income is below the minimal subsistence level established in the \_\_\_\_ region for given social-demographic group of the population.

### **Recipients that are not eligible for state social assistance**

The state social assistance is not provided:

- to the persons who are on full state maintenance;
- if the applicant, has given incomplete and (or) doubtful data on structure of the family, incomes and property belongs to him (his family) on the basis of the property rights (thus if the applicant for the objective reasons cannot present necessary documents (for example, the person without the certain residence, the immigrant, the refugee, the person who has suffered from act of nature or a fire, etc.), they can be replaced by certificates of institutions of local government, bodies on affairs of a civil defense and the extreme situations, made on the basis of conversation, interrogation, survey of a place of events, with the conclusion about necessity of assistance).

### **The information for the supervisor: inspection of the case record sample for the errors**

To study the process of assignment and granting of the targeted state social assistance, a sample of recipients' case records will be surveyed for the revelation of possible errors. The possible errors will be divided into 2 kinds taking into consideration the functions of the authorized organizers of the targeted social assistance provision that include:

- Formation of case records that include documents, necessary for decision-making;
- Determination of completeness and reliability of the documents presented by the applicants;
- Establishment of the right of the citizen (applicant) and the members of his family for the targeted state social assistance according to conditions of the assistance granting;
- Determination of the structure of the targeted state social assistance recipient's family;
- Calculation of the total income of family and single living citizen, mean per capita family income;
- Calculation of minimal subsistence level of the family;
- Calculation of the size of targeted state social assistance;
- Decision-making on assistance provision to the citizen (applicant) or refusal in provision and notification of the citizen about the decision made.

On the basis of the above-stated functions it can be assumed that possible kinds and types of errors of keeping recipients' case records include:

**Table 1.**

**Kinds and types of possible errors which can arise in case records of the targeted state social assistance recipients.**

<b>Kinds of errors</b>
<b>1. Errors of formation of a case record and an application form</b>
1.1. Case record is not contained in folders or not stitched up
1.2. In a line of the application form instead of the answer "no" or "-" there is a gap
1.3. In the application form there is no information which is available in documents provided
<b>2. The errors connected with calculation and assignment of the state social assistance</b>
2.1. There are no required documents in the case record;
2.2. The assistance is given wrongfully;
2.3. There is a discrepancy between the information in the application form and data from documents provided by the applicant;
2.4. The structure of targeted social assistance recipient's family is defined incorrectly;
2.5. The total income of family and single living citizen is calculated incorrectly;
2.6. The minimal subsistence level of family is calculated incorrectly;
2.7. The size of the assistance is calculated incorrectly;
2.8. Absence of the formal record of the assistance size calculation;
2.9. Discrepancy between the application date and the period on the basis of which income is calculated;
2.10. Redefinition of the size of the assistance due to the change of information given by the applicant is made untimely.

Thus, possible errors in case records of the targeted state social assistance can be divided into two kinds. The first kind of errors includes the errors of formation which do not influence the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the assistance. The second kind of errors consists of the errors connected with calculation and assignment of the assistance. The errors belonging to the first kind include the following: there are no folders, documents are not stitched up; in a line of the application form instead of the answer "no" or

"-" there is a gap; the application form does not contain the information that is available in confirming documents. The specified errors do not influence the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the assistance. However it should be noted, that absence of appropriate formation leads to mess, confusion and quite often hides essential discrepancies in keeping case recodes.

Ten types of the errors belonging to the second kind of errors are recognized significant, because their presence tells the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the assistance. For example, such error as discrepancy between the application date and the period on the basis of which incomes are calculated, testifies that there is a probable error of calculation of assistance size, because, a rule, incomes of families are characterized by significant dynamics. Discrepancy between the information in the application form and in documents provided by the applicant can affect accuracy of assignment and payment of the assistance.

Absence of necessary documents can also testify that there may be an error in the assistance payment, because the facts of presence or absence of some members of the family or their incomes can not be taking into account completely. Absence of formal record of calculation and determination of the assistance size in the case record complicates essentially the control of the case record keeping and actually does not give an opportunity to track correctness of assignment and payment of the assistance.

If the case record contains such errors as a miscalculation of the income, the assistance size and minimal subsistence level, incorrect determination of the family structure, untimely recalculation of the assistance size then we can conclude that this case record contains appreciable errors.

During the further analysis it is planned to construct the following indicators describing the quality of keeping case records of the targeted state social assistance recipients:

Table 2.

The indicators describing the quality of keeping case records of the targeted state social assistance recipients

1. Quantity and a share of case records that have no any error.
2. Quantity and a share of case records that have no errors of the second kind.
3. Types of errors by the degree of prevalence.
4. Quantity of errors counting upon one checked up case.
5. Quantity of errors of the second kind counting upon one checked up case.

### Check list and instructions for case file assessment for housing allowance recipient

*(Evaluation list of a case record of housing allowance recipient)*

Region _____	Municipality _____
Who _____ conducts the evaluation	Case record number _____
Date of carrying out of the evaluation _____	

1. Is the case record in a folder? Are documents stitched up?

yes \_\_\_\_\_ no \_\_\_\_\_

1. Date of application \_\_\_\_\_

2. Is the following information contained in the case record (note all):

- Application form for the housing allowance provision
- Documents (or copies) certifying Russian Federation citizenship of the applicant
- Information about the place of residence (stay)
- Information about the members of applicant's family, registered together with him in place of permanent residence
- Documents (or copies) confirming legal grounds of possession or use of accommodation
- Documents (or copies) confirming the applicant's right for privileges or compensation for housing and communal service payment
- Documents (or copies) containing data on the sums of payments for housing and municipal services. Note (last) month, when documents were provided \_\_\_\_\_.
- Documents (or copies) testifying the presence or absence of the outstanding debts on housing and communal service payment. If the family has a debts, note, for what period it was formed:

\_\_\_\_\_ Less than 3 month's \_\_\_\_\_ more than 3 months

Note also, whether the case record contains a written obligation for liquidation of a debts or its partial repayment:

yes \_\_\_\_\_ no \_\_\_\_\_

4. for the applicant and each member of his family<sup>3</sup>, mark with X all the documents contained in the case record. In case of inapplicability, put a dash.

Documents	Number of the member of the family						
	1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.
Documents certifying citizenship							

<sup>3</sup> Persons that are considered as the members of the family: spouses that live together, their children (including adopted) and parents (adoptive parents); other relatives and disabled dependents if they live together with the applicant and lead a joint housekeeping. It should be noted that married parents (adoptive parents), the single living parent (adoptive parent) and their minor children are considered as a family irrespective of way they live (separately or together).

Documents certifying relationships with the applicant							
Documents confirming a place of residence (stay)							
Documents confirming the rights for the privileges or compensations for housing and communal services							
Documents on a state of work capacity (see Annex 3)							
Documents confirming status of conscript							

5. Is the structure of applicant's family defined correctly?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_ no.

6. Check the conformity of the application form and the confirming documents. Does the application form contain the information which is not confirmed by the documents provided? \_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_ no.      Do documents contain information which is not present in the application form? \_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_ no.

7. The information about incomes of the members of the family. For each member of the family included in the application form, note how the information about the incomes is presented.

Number of the member of the family	The types of incomes are present in the case record (write the numbers of the income types following the Table 1 below)	The total sum of incomes without breakdown is present in the case record (1. yes, 2. no)	Incomes are confirmed completely by the documents (1. yes, 2. no)	The types of incomes that are present in the case record but not confirmed by the documents (write the numbers of the income types following the Table 1 below)
1.				
2.				
3.				
4.				
5.				
6.				
7.				

Table 1

<b>Types of income</b>	
1	All types of pay;
2	The median wages, paid in all cases, stipulated by the Labor code of the RF;
3	Compensation, provided by a state organ or a public organization for the period of performing state or public duties;
4	Retirement compensations, discharge payments, redundancy wages etc.
5	Social benefits, paid from budgets and other sources
6	Pensions, compensation payments (except for compensations to the caretakers of the disabled) and additional monthly benefits, paid to the retired;
7	Monthly life allowance of retired judges ;
8	Grants paid to students of primary, secondary and higher institutions, as well as to postgraduates, students of seminaries, and compensations, paid to these categories on sick-leave;
9	Unemployment benefits and other types of assistance, rendered to the unemployed seeking a new employment or doing educational courses, as well as payments to the temporarily occupied unemployed, to the most deprived categories of the unemployed and temporarily occupied children of 14 to 18;
10	Sick-leave allowance, maternity leave , as well as lump benefit paid to pregnant women leaving work earlier than stipulated by the law;
11	Monthly childcare benefit;
12	Monthly allowance paid to child-rearing persons during the first 1.5 years after a child is born, as well as monthly compensations, paid to persons on their child-rearing leave during the first 3 years after a child is born;
13	Monthly allowance paid to spouses of the military, serving under a contract, if the spouses are not able to find work and have the status of the unemployed; or if the spouses have to leave their jobs to care for under age sick children whose sickness is caused by the service conditions;
14	Monthly compensation paid to spouses of the officers of the Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service and penitentiary institutions of the Russian Federation, when they are not able to find a job in distant regions;
15	Monthly social insurance payment (accidents at work, occupational hazards);
16	Additional payments to all types of pay, covered by the present item, and other social benefits, stipulated by state organs, local administration and other organizations of the RF;
17	Income received from the property, owned by a family or a single person
18	Income from leasing real estate, cars and other facilities, owned by the family or family members;
19	Income from selling the products of personal part-time plots and small-scale farming;
20	Money allowances, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, penitentiary institutions, customs, as well as additional payment and food supply, provided on the permanent basis and stipulated by the laws of the Russian Federation;
21	Retirement lump benefit, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs service of the Russian Federation ;
22	Payment under contracts, drawn according to the Civil code of the RF;
23	Financial assistance, rendered by employers to retired employees;
24	Royalties, as stipulated by the laws of the RF on copyright;

25	Income from private businesses (including farms) existing both as natural and artificial persons;
26	Income from stocks, shares (dividends);
27	Alimony, received by children under 18;
28	Interest payment on bank deposits;
29	Money, inherited and received as a gift;
30	Income and profit of individual businesses, including bonds and property rights;
31	Social benefits, provided by the state, local administration and other organizations, in their money equivalent.
32	Rent compensations
33	Allowance, paid to the guardian for providing the care of the guarded
34	benefits
35	Income from personal part-time plots and small-scale farming

**Correctness of the allowance assignment and calculation of the income:**

8. Does the period of income calculation correspond to the date of the application for the housing allowance (the family income is defined for the last 6 calendar months before the application month)?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

9. Is calculation of total and mean per capita incomes presented in the case record?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

10. Does the case record contain information about incomes of the members of the family for all months of the period under review (6 months before the month of the application)?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no (the comment\_\_\_\_\_)

11. Are there confirming documents on each type of the incomes specified in the application form? \_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no (the comment\_\_\_\_\_)

12. Are the total and mean per capita incomes of the family defined correctly? (Calculate them according to the instruction given separately (Annex 2) \_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

**Decisions on payment, suspension, re-registration, etc.**

13. Note the date of last reassignment of the housing allowance \_\_\_\_\_. If it is not specified, put X. If the date of the first assignment is specified only, write it.

14. Does the case record contain a copy of the notice about the assignment of the housing allowance?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

**Further questions will be applied with specification of corresponding rules**

15. Fill in the table about the Decisions presented in the case record:

Date of the Decision	Type of the Decision (1. Decision about reassignment, 2. Decision about suspension, 3. Decision about prolongation 4. other (specify) )	Grounds (1. Act about beneficiary income information verification, 2. Act about verification of material-domestic conditions of beneficiary, 3. Application form about conditions that lead to change in allowance size, 4. Application form about suspension of the payment, 5. Official recertification, 6. other (specify) )	Verification results / what was changed

16 Was suspension of the payment made in-time? (See Annex 1)?  
 \_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_\_\_inapplicable

16.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about suspension of the payment?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

17. Was the stoppage of payment made in-time? (See the Annex 1)

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_\_inapplicable

17.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about stoppage of the payment?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

18. Was the prolongation of the payment's term made in-time?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_\_inapplicable

18.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about the prolongation of the payment's term?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

19. Was the size of the payment changed in-time?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_\_inapplicable

19.1. Does the case contain a copy of the notice about the change of the size of the payment?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

## **Case record review guide - housing allowance**

### **Formation of sample of recipients' case records**

The given plan is developed for quality inspection of keeping case records of housing allowance recipients. Inspection will be carried out in each of municipalities of the project. Ten case records of housing allowance recipients in each municipality will be selected. It is supposed, that case records of recipients are ordered alphabetically. Case records of recipients are selected on the basis of the following algorithm:

1. Calculation of the total number of available case records of recipients is made.
2. All available case records are ordered alphabetically.
3. The step of selection is calculated as the number of available case records divided by ten.
4. Process of case record selection proceeds until 10 case records will not be selected. If an evaluator go on to the last case record in the set of case records and the number of selected case records is less that ten, then he should proceeds the selection process continuously from the beginning of the set.

The analysis of one case record should take from 20 till 30 minutes.

### **Recipients that are ineligible for housing allowance**

- a) The citizens living in accommodation as a result of the lease concluded with proprietors of accommodations (physical and legal persons) private housing facilities stock, or contract of sublease concluded with leaseholder of accommodations in housing facilities stock regardless of form of ownership;
- b) borrowers under the contract for uncompensated use of property;
- c) legatee in force of fulfillment of bequest by devisees;
- d) Rent recipients under the contract of perpetual maintenance.

Moreover, if an applicant cannot provide the information about incomes of all able-bodied members of his family then the family ceases to be entitled the housing allowance. The exception is made for mothers (or other relatives) who take care of the child under 3 years old; mothers with many children who bring up 3 and more children under 14 years old; citizens under 23 years old educated in educational establishments under full-time course of study on a budgetary basis; the persons who take permanent care of under of the sick members of family; not working wives of military men (except for conscripts) living in districts with no employment opportunities; the citizens having the status of the unemployed after the suspension of payments of unemployment benefits; the persons who are on long-term care.

### **Family structure**

Persons that are considered as the members of the family: spouses that live together, their children (including adopted) and parents (adoptive parents); other relatives and disabled dependents if they live together with the applicant and lead a joint housekeeping.

It should be noted that married parents (adoptive parents); the single living parent (adoptive parent) and their minor children are considered as a family irrespective of way they live (separately or together).

Persons that are not considered as the members of the family: conscripts, the persons who are enduring the punishment in the form of imprisonment, children that are in care of government institutions, missing persons.

The share of adult able-bodied citizens that are not working of 6 and more months and are not registered in employment service is excluded from the allowance. The exception is made for mothers (or other relatives) who take care of the child under 3 years old; mothers with many children who bring up 3 and more children under 14 years old; citizens under 23 years old educated in educational establishments under full-time course of study on a budgetary basis; the persons who take permanent care of under of the sick members of family; not working wives of military men (except for conscripts) living in districts with no employment opportunities; the citizens having the status of the unemployed after the suspension of payments of unemployment benefits; the persons who are on long-term care.

- Rules of suspension, re-registration and prolongation of the payments can be found in the Annex 1.
- Rules of calculation of mean per capita income and minimal subsistence level for social-demographic groups can be found in the Annex 2. The types of income accounted in the process of eligibility checking can be found in the Annex 2.
- Rules of limited work capacity determination can be found in the Annex 3.

### *The information for supervisor: inspection of the case record sample for the errors*

To study the process of assignment and granting of the housing allowance, a sample of recipients` case records will be surveyed for the revelation of possible errors. The possible errors will be divided into 2 kinds taking into consideration the functions of the authorized organizers of housing allowance provision that include:

1. Determination of completeness and reliability of the documents presented by the applicants;
2. Establishment of the right of the citizen (applicant) and the members of his family for the housing allowance according to conditions of the allowance granting;
3. Determination of the structure of the housing allowance recipient`s family;
4. Calculation of the total and mean per capita incomes of the family and single living citizen
5. Calculation of minimal subsistence level of the family;
6. Calculation of the allowance size;
7. Decision-making on the housing allowance provision to the citizen (applicant) or refusal in provision and notification of the citizen about the decision made.

On the basis of the above-stated functions it can be assumed that the possible kinds and types of the errors of conducting of the recipients` case records include:

Table 1.

Kinds and types of the possible errors which can arise in the case records of the housing allowance recipients.

<b>Kinds of errors</b>
<b>1. Errors of formation of a case record and an application form</b>
1.1. Case record is not contained in folder or not stitched up
1.2. In a line of the application form instead of the answer "no" or "-" there is a gap
1.3. In the application form there is no information which is available in documents provided
<b>2. The errors connected with calculation and assignment of the housing allowance</b>
2.1. There are no required documents in the case record;
2.2. The allowance is provided wrongfully;
2.3. There is a discrepancy between the information in the application form and the data from the documents provided by the applicant;
2.4. The structure of the housing allowance recipient's family is defined incorrectly;
2.5. The total income of the family and single living citizen is calculated incorrectly;
2.6. The minimal substance level of the family is calculated incorrectly;
2.7. Absence of the formal record of the housing allowance size calculation;
2.8. Discrepancy between the application date and the period on the basis of which income is calculated;
2.9. Re-determination of the size of the housing allowance due to the change of information given by the applicant is made untimely.

Thus, the possible errors in the case records of housing allowances can be divided into two kinds. The first kind of the errors includes the errors of formation which do not influence the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the allowances. The second kind of the errors consists of the errors connected with calculation and assignment of the housing allowance. The errors belonging to the first kind include the following: there are no folders, documents are not stitched up; in a line of the application form instead of the answer "no" or "-" there is a gap; the application form does not contain the information that is available in confirming documents. The specified errors do not influence the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the housing allowances. However it should be noted, that absence of appropriate formation leads to mess, confusion and quite often hides essential discrepancies in keeping case recodes.

Nine types of the errors belonging to the second kind of the errors are recognized significant, because their presence tells the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the allowances. For example, such error as discrepancy between the application date and the period on the basis of which income is calculated, testifies that there is a probable error of calculation of allowance size, because both income and cost of housing and municipal services are characterized by significant dynamics. Discrepancy between the information in the application form and the documents provided by the applicant can affect accuracy of assignment and payment of the housing allowance.

The absence of necessary documents can also testify that there may be an error in the allowance payment, because some household characteristics as the presence or absence of the family members, their incomes, the characteristics of living conditions, and the size of the payment for housing and municipal services may be unaccounted. The absence of formal record of calculation of the housing allowance size in the case record complicates essentially the control of the case record keeping and actually does not give an opportunity to track correctness of assignment and payment of the housing allowance.

If the case record contains such errors as a miscalculation of the income, the housing allowance size and minimal subsistence level, incorrect determination of the family

structure, untimely recalculation of the housing allowance size then we can conclude that this case record contains appreciable errors.

During further analysis it is planned to construct the following indicators describing the quality of keeping case records of the housing allowance recipients:

Table 2.

The indicators describing the quality of keeping case records of the housing allowance recipients

1. Quantity and a share of the case records that have no any error.
2. Quantity and a share of the case records the have no errors of the second kind.
3. Types of errors by the degree of prevalence.
4. Quantity of errors counting upon one checked up case.
5. Quantity of errors of the second kind counting upon one checked up case.

### Check list and instructions for case file assessment on child allowance

Region _____	Municipality _____
Who _____ conducts	the Case record number _____
evaluation _____	
Date of carrying out of the evaluation _____	

1. Is the case record in a folder? Are the documents stitched up?  
yes \_\_\_\_\_ no \_\_\_\_\_
2. The date of the first submission of the documents by the applicant is \_\_\_\_\_
3. Does the case contain the following information (mark all)?
  - a. Application for granting of the child allowance
  - b. Ratings of the applicant or any other identity card
  - c. Information on a place of residence (or stay)
  - d. Information on the right to reception of the allowance of increased amount (see Annex 2)
4. The marital status of the applicant  
\_\_\_\_\_ Married, live together with the spouse  
\_\_\_\_\_ Married, live separately  
\_\_\_\_\_ divorced  
\_\_\_\_\_ Single  
\_\_\_\_\_ widower/widow  
\_\_\_\_\_ there is no information
  - a. For married. Does the information on a spouse contain in the case?  
yes \_\_\_\_\_ no \_\_\_\_\_
  - b. For divorced or living separately. Does the document confirming, that the (former) spouse does not receive child allowance (a reference from the social protection body of the territory where the other parent is living confirming that he/she does not receive the child allowance) contain in case  
yes \_\_\_\_\_ no \_\_\_\_\_
5. The number of children included in the family \_\_\_\_\_
6. Information on the age of the children (or dates of birth) at the moment of submission of the application (mark for each child)

The child	Age at the moment of submission of the application (full years). If it is not specified, mark with X	The child	Age at the moment of submission of the application (full years). If it is not specified, mark with X
1.		5.	
2.		6.	
3.		7.	
4.		8.	

7. Based on the table in question 6 define if all the children have right to the allowance at the moment of the case record inspection. Children older than 16 (and students older than 18) have no right to the allowance. Indicate the number of children who have no right to the allowance:

\_\_\_\_\_ Older than 18

\_\_\_\_\_ Older than 16 and there is no document confirming the fact that the child is a student in high school or institutions of higher education

8. For each child included in the application form, note all the documents contained in the case record. If additional documents not applied, put a dash.

The child	The basic documents		Additional documents on the child who is under trusteeship (guardianship)	
	A copy of the birth certificate	The certificate about schooling in general educational establishment (for children of six years and more)	An extract from the Decision of local government on the child trusteeship (guardianship) placement	The information from education regulatory bodies about non receipt of the monetary maintenance for the child
1.				
2.				
3.				
4.				
5.				
6.				
7.				

9. Check up conformity of the application form and confirming documents. Does the application form contain the information which is not confirmed by documents provided?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes \_\_\_\_\_no.

Do documents contain the information which is not present in the application form?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes \_\_\_\_\_no.

10. The information about income of the family members. For each member of the family included in the application form, note how the information about the income is presented.

Number of the member of the family	The types of incomes are present in the case record (write the numbers of the income types following the Table 1 below)	The total sum of incomes without breakdown is present in the case record (1. yes, 2. no)	Incomes are confirmed completely by the documents (1. yes, 2. no)	The types of incomes that are present in the case record but not confirmed by the documents (write the numbers of the income types following the Table 1 below)
1.				
2.				
3.				
4.				
5.				
6.				
7.				

Table 1

<b>Types of income</b>	
1	All types of earnings (fees, allowances) and additional pay at all jobs;
2	Payment according to the tariffs, job descriptions, contracts, or based on the revenues;
3	All types of additional payment, rise in wages for: hard work, work in harmful or severe climatic conditions, night work, a degree or long work experience, performing other than defined by one's job description duties etc. );
4	Bonuses and premiums;
5	Payment for overwork and work on holidays and weekends;
6	Wages paid during the vacations, compensation for a period of a skipped vacation;
7	Median wages, paid during the period of performing state and public duties and in other cases stipulated by the labor code;
8	Discharge pay, or retirement compensation;
9	Wages paid after closing the company or redundancy discharge, and to persons seeking a new job;
10	Additional payment provided by the employer, added to the payment guaranteed by the laws of the Russian Federation.
11	Money allowances, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs, as well as additional payment and food supply, provided on the permanent basis and stipulated by the laws of the Russian Federation;
12	Retirement lump benefit, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs service of the Russian Federation.
13	All types of retirement allowances (except for additional pay, provided to caretakers of the retired), compensations and monthly additional payments;
14	Monthly life allowance of retired judges;
15	Grants paid to students of primary, secondary and higher institutions, as well as to

	postgraduates, students of seminaries, and compensations, paid to these categories on sick-leave;
16	Unemployment benefits and grants paid to the unemployed while getting a profession or a second education;
17	Sick-leave allowance, maternity leave , as well as lump benefit paid to pregnant women leaving work earlier than stipulated by the law;
18	Monthly allowance paid to child-rearing persons during the first 1.5 years of after a child is born, as well as monthly compensations, paid to persons on their child-rearing leave during the first 3 years after a child is born;
19	Monthly allowance paid to spouses of the military, serving under a contract, if the spouses are not able to find work and have the status of the unemployed; or if the spouses have to leave their jobs to care for sick children whose sickness is caused by the service conditions;
20	Monthly compensation paid to spouses of the officers of the Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service and penitentiary institutions of the Russian Federation, when they are not able to find a job in distant regions;
21	Monthly compensation paid as health damages inflicted on the employees while performing their duties, except for the additional expenditures on medical, social and professional rehabilitation procedures, as prescribed by the medical and social expert board;
22	Payment covering the cost of food, except for special diet, provided (paid for) according to the laws of RF;
23	Commission paid to insurance agents and staff brokers;
24	Payment under contracts, drawn according to the Civil code of the RF;
25	Author's fees, paid to staff writers of newspapers, magazines and other mass media;
26	Payment, received by the temporary members of election commissions ;
27	Payment, received by natural persons from election commissions, election funds of candidates and election unions for the work performed during election campaigns;
28	Income of natural persons from gold-digging;
29	Income from private businesses (including farms) existing both as natural and artificial persons;
30	Income from stocks, shares (dividends);
31	Income from leasing real estate owned by the family or family members;
32	Alimony, received by children under 18;
33	Interest payment on bank deposits.
34	Social benefits in their money equivalent
35	Income from personal part-time plots.

**Correctness of the child allowance assignment and calculation of the income:**

11. Does the period of income calculation correspond to the date of the application for the child allowance (the family income is defined for the last 3 calendar months before the application month)?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

12. Is calculation of total and mean per capita incomes presented in the case record?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

13. Does the case record contain information about incomes of the members of the family for all months of the period under review (6 months before the month of the application)?  
 \_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no (the comment \_\_\_\_\_)

14. Are the total and mean per capita incomes of the family defined correctly? (Calculate them according to Annex 1)      \_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

15. Define the size of the child allowance which should be received by the applicant (see the Annex 2). Is the size of the child allowance defined correctly?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes  
 \_\_\_\_\_no (specify the correct size of the allowance \_\_\_\_\_).  
 \_\_\_\_\_ there is not enough information in the case record (the comment \_\_\_\_\_).

**Decisions on payment, suspension, re-registration, etc.**

16. Fill in the table about the Decisions presented in the case record:

Date of the Decision	Type of the Decision (1. Decision about reassignment, 2. Decision about suspension, 3. Decision about prolongation 4. other (specify) )	Background evidence (1. Act about beneficiary income information verification, 2. Act about verification of material-domestic conditions of beneficiary, 3. Application form about conditions that lead to change in allowance size, 4. Application form about suspension of the payment, 5. Official recertification, 6. other (specify) )	Verification results / what was changed

17. Note the date of last assignment or reassignment of the allowance \_\_\_\_\_. If it is not specified, put X.

18. Does the case record contain the copy of the notice about the assignment of the allowance?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

Further questions will be applied, only if there are corresponding rules in regions

19 Was the suspension of the payment made in-time? (See the Annex 3)

\_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_in applicable

19.1. Does the case contain the copy of the notice about the suspension of the payment?

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

20. Was the prolongation of the payment's term made in-time?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_in applicable

20.1. Does the case contain the copy of the notice about the prolongation of the payment's term? (See the Annex 3)

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

21. Was the size of the payment changed in-time?

\_\_\_\_\_ yes      \_\_\_\_\_no      \_\_\_in applicable

21.1. Does the case contain the copy of the notice about the change of the size of the payment? (See the Annex 3)

\_\_\_\_\_ Yes      \_\_\_\_\_no

## Case record review - child allowance

### Formation of sample of recipients' case records

This plan is developed for quality inspection of keeping case records of child allowance recipients. Inspection will be carried out in each of municipal formations of the project. Ten case records of recipients in each municipal formation will be selected. It is supposed, that case records of recipients are ordered alphabetically. Case records of recipients are selected on the basis of the following algorithm:

1. Calculation of the total number of available case records is made.
2. All available case records are ordered alphabetically.
3. The step of selection is calculated as the total of available case records divided by ten.
4. The process of case record selection proceeds until 10 case records will not be selected. If an evaluator go on to the last case record in the set of case records and the number of selected case records is less that ten, then he should precede to the selection process from the beginning of the set.

The analysis of one case record should take from 10 to 15 minutes.

### Definitions

The child allowance is given to the families that have children under sixteen (under eighteen on condition that the child is a student in a general educational establishment), provided that mean per capita family income do not exceed regional minimal subsistence level. Income of the base family - the income of parent (parents) and number of children under 16 (18) years is considered\_only. Adoptive fathers, official trustees or guardians can be regarded as parents. The total family income is divided on the number of family members, i.e. parents and under age children. The size of the child allowance depends on a category of the family.

### Recipients that are eligible for child allowance

Child allowance is appointed and paid to one of the parents (adoptive fathers, trustees, guardians), that *have their permanent residence in \_\_\_\_ oblast*, on each child born, adopted accepted under trusteeship (guardianship) *until the child has turned sixteen (on the student in high school or institutions of higher education - until the end of training, but not after the child has turned eighteen)* in the families with mean per capita income, not exceeding the size of minimal subsistence level, established in the \_\_\_\_ oblast.

### Recipients that are not eligible for child allowance

Child allowance is not provided:

- A) if the child is on full state maintenance;
- b) If the child is under trusteeship (guardianship) and the trustees (guardians) receive money on the maintenance of the child;
- c) On the child of parents if they are deprived of their parental rights on this particular child;
- d) if the child under 18 is declared according to the legislation of the Russian Federation.

The minimum subsistence level in the \_\_\_\_\_ oblast in I quarter 2006: 2719,68 rbl.,  
Able-bodied population - 3008,57 rbl.  
Pensioners - 2099,36 rbl.  
Children - 2703,49 rbl.

### **Distinctions in the amount of child allowance**

The amount of the child allowance in the \_\_\_\_\_ oblast:

1. Standard size of the child allowance - 105 rbl.;
  2. For children of single mothers (fathers) - 210 rbl.;
  3. On children whose parents evade from payment of the alimony, or in other cases stipulated by current legislation when collecting of the alimony is impossible- 210 rbl.
  4. On children of military men serving on a draft - 210 rbl.
  5. On children whose parents are students in high school or institutions of higher education - 210 rbl.
- Rules of family structure definition and the types of income accounted in the process of eligibility checking can be found in the Annex 1.
  - Rules of definition of a family category can be found in the Annex 2.
  - Rules of suspension, re-registration and prolongation of the payments can be found in the Annex 3.

### *Instruction for a reviewer: inspection of the case record sample for the errors*

To study the process of assignment and granting of the child allowance, a sample of recipients` case records will be surveyed for the revelation of possible errors. The possible errors will be divided into 2 kinds taking into consideration the functions of the authorized organizers of the child allowance provision that include:

1. For studying process of case records that include documents, necessary for decision-making;
2. Determination of completeness and reliability of the documents presented by citizens;
3. Establishment of the right of the citizen (applicant) and members his family for the child allowance according to conditions of the allowance granting;
4. Determination of the structure of the child allowance recipient`s family;
5. Calculation of the total income of the family and mean per capita family income;
6. Calculation of the size of the child allowance;
7. Decision-making on child allowance provision to the citizen (applicant) or refusal in provision and notification of the citizen about the decision made.

On the basis of the above-stated functions it can be assumed that possible kinds and types of errors of keeping recipients` case records include:

Table 1.  
 Kinds and types of possible errors which can arise in case records of the child allowance recipients.

<b>Kinds of errors</b>
<b>1. Errors of formation of a case record and an application form</b>
a. Case record is not contained in folders or not stitched up
b. In a line of the application form instead of the answer "no" or "-" there is a gap
c. In the application form there is no information which is available in documents provided
<b>2. The errors connected with calculation and assignment of the child allowance</b>
a. There are no required documents in the case record;
b. The allowance is given wrongfully;
c. There is a discrepancy between the information in the application form and the data from documents provided by the applicant;
d. The structure of the child assistance recipient's family is defined incorrectly;
e. The total income of the family and mean per capita income are calculated incorrectly;
f. Absence of the formal record of the allowance size calculation;
g. Discrepancy between the application date and the period on the basis of which income is calculated;
h. Redefinition of the size of the allowance due to the change of information given by the applicant is made untimely.

Thus, possible errors in case records of the child allowance can be divided into two kinds. The first kind of errors includes the errors of formation which do not influence the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the allowance. The second kind of errors consists of the errors connected with calculation and assignment of the allowance. The errors belonging to the first kind include the following: there are no folders, documents are not stitched up; in a line of the application form instead of the answer "no" or "-" there is a gap; the application form does not contain the information that is available in confirming documents. The specified errors do not influence the probability of wrong calculation or wrongful granting of the allowance. However it should be noted, that absence of appropriate formation leads to mess, confusion and quite often hides essential discrepancies in keeping case recodes.

Eight types of the errors belonging to the second kind of errors are recognized significant, because their presence tells the probability of wrong calculations or wrongful granting of the allowance. For example, such error as discrepancy between the information in the application form and the documents given by the applicant can affect accuracy of definition and purpose of the allowance. Absence of necessary documents can also testify that there may be an error in the allowance payment, because the facts of presence or absence of some members of the family or their incomes can not be taking into account completely. Absence of formal record of calculation and determination of the allowance size in the case record complicates essentially the control of the case record keeping and actually does not give an opportunity to track correctness of assignment and payment of the child allowance.

If the case record contains such errors as a miscalculation of the income, the child allowance size and minimal subsistence level, incorrect determination of the family

structure, untimely recalculation of the allowance size then we can conclude that this case record contains appreciable errors.

During the further analysis it is planned to construct the following indicators describing the quality of keeping case records of the child allowance recipients:

Table 2.

The indicators describing the quality of keeping case records of the child allowance recipients

Quantity and a share of the case records that have no any error.
Quantity and a share of the case records the have no errors of the second kind.
Types of errors by the degree of prevalence.
Quantity of errors counting upon one checked up case.
Quantity of errors of the second kind counting upon one checked up case.

### **Administrative cost assessment methodology.**

**Total costs of a program** = direct program expenditures + direct administrative costs + indirect administrative costs

### **BASIC DEFINITIONS**

*Direct expenditures for the social assistance benefit program (non-administrative)* – the amount of payments to recipients

*Direct administrative personnel (DAP)* – employees who receive applications, determine amounts and types of payments, otherwise work with applicants and beneficiaries of the program.

*Indirect administrative personnel (IAP)* – employees not involved directly in the implementation of social assistance programs. Including: heads of social offices, heads of social protection committees, clerical employees, accountants and technical staff involved in premises maintenance, drivers etc.

*Overhead expenditures* – office maintenance, phone bills, purchases of paper and other office accessories etc.

\*\*\*

Administrative costs are usually associated with implementation of a set of programs. In order to determine the share of total administrative expenditures for one single program, cost allocation is required.

To define administrative costs for a single program we will analyze two key positions:

1. what share of in-take worker's wages can be attributed to the program (in case the worker receives application and otherwise works with several programs' clients);
2. the share of indirect expenditures (for example, expenditures for each program should include a certain part of the committee head's salary and a certain part of overhead expenditures).

### **Allocation of direct administrative costs**

#### **100% cost allocation**

Some direct administrative costs, for example, cost of toys and other material endowment items bought for child care institutions, can be entirely allocated to one program. In that case these expenditures should be treated as 100% direct administrative costs on this program. Such expenditures will most likely not appear in our case of studying social assistance benefit programs, unless we find a case of computer equipment purchase for one single benefit program only.

#### **Determining a share of social assistance specialist's wage as part of administrative costs for a given program.**

*Determination of a share of wages according to the estimated work time spent.* It would be best to analyze work time allocation during 2-4 weeks. Employees are in most cases capable to record or otherwise determine themselves how much time they spent working on a certain program. Such information can then be used as given, provided social agency managers trust it. Since the project does not provide time and resources for time

measurement, detailed estimates made by employees and recorded by the team interviewers will be used.

SINCE WE CALCULATE ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS FOR 3 PROGRAMS ONLY (NOT FOR ALL ALLOWANCES AND SERVICES PROVIDED BY SOCIAL PROTECTION DEPARTMENT), OVERHEAD EXPENDITURES AND EXPENDITURES ON INDIRECT ADMINISTRATIVE PERSONNEL PER 1 EMPLOYEE (per 1 full-time employment unit) SHOULD BE CALCULATED MANUALLY! See methodology for that below.

### **Calculation of indirect administrative costs**

First of all, indirect administrative costs that are not wages (i.e. overhead expenditures) should be allocated equally between ALL employees (i.e. between all full-time staff positions) of the office, including administrative personnel working on all programs. Obviously, some part of staff will bring about relatively larger portions of overhead expenditures. For instance, the office head may occupy a larger office than the rest of the staff. But we expect that the effort to collect such information will be too high compared to the scale of distortions it will remove, therefore we will distribute indirect expenditures equally between all employees. That will provide a proxy to account for such expenditures as a part of total administrative costs on a certain program.

Then one should determine the total amount of all indirect expenditures of a social office that are not wages (and other personnel-related benefits and payments). Assume that a social assistance office incurs costs for building maintenance, phone bills, purchases of paper and other office supplies. By adding up all these costs, we obtain a total sum of overhead expenditures of that social assistance office. This sum should then be divided by the number of full-time staff positions of the office. If, for example, the staff consists of 3 employees responsible for granting monetary allowances, 4 specialists engaged in other programs, 1 head and 1 secretary, the total sum of overhead expenditures should be divided by 9 (number of employees of the facility). If one of the employees works half-time, the divisor should be 8,5. We thus obtain the **share of overhead expenditures per 1 full-time staff position**.

Then comes the phase of distribution of expenditures associated with indirect administrative personnel. These include the wages of such employees, and their share of overhead expenditures. We divide total sum of expenditures for indirect personnel by the number of full-time employment units of the rest of the staff (engaged both in the programs we are interested in and elsewhere). In the above example (with 9 employees) it would be dividing expenditures for 2 indirect administrative employees ((head's salary + share of overheads) + (wages of a secretary + share of overheads)) by 7. We thus obtain the **share of expenditures for indirect personnel per 1 program full-time employee (or per 1 program staff position, to be precise)**.

Consider more complicated examples:

1. 1 program employee works half-time. In this case we divide ((head's salary + share of overheads) + (wages of a secretary + share of overheads)) by 6,5.

2. The secretary works half-time. The algorithm for the calculations is as follows:  
 ((head's salary + share of overheads) + (wages of a secretary (half-time) + 0,5 of the share of overheads)) divided by 7.

The next stage would be adding up the obtained numbers (overheads share + indirect personnel expenditures share) and the wages of the direct administrative employees (of the 3 programs that we consider). If an employee works half-time, only half of corresponding overheads share and indirect personnel expenditures share is added.

**Information to be collected for the  
 Calculator of administrative costs:**

1. Name of the facility (also the territory where it is situated)  
*Example: Social protection Department of Petrovsky rayon of Ivanovskaya oblast* \_\_\_\_\_
2. List of allowances granted by this facility, and expenditures on them (without costs of the personnel):

Name of allowance	State total sum of granted allowances (DURING 1 YEAR), without personnel expenditures for each program
1. <i>Child allowance</i>	1,000,000 - <i>example</i>
2. <i>Housing allowance</i>	2,000,000 – <i>example</i>
3. <i>Targeted monthly benefits for low-income citizens</i>	300,000 – <i>example</i>
4.	

A matter to be specified in regions: housing allowances financing from budgets of different level (regional, municipal).

- What percentage is paid from the local budget?
- What percentage is paid from the regional budget?
- What percentage is paid from the federal budget?

3. Direct administrative costs for the personnel (employees, whose wages are considered to be direct administrative costs are usually those who are receiving applications and granting allowances to successful applicants). NOTE: each employee's percentage sum should be equal to 100% if s/he devotes all work time to specified programs and less than 100% if she is partly engaged in other programs not regarded for administrative costs calculation.

**Work time percentage will be entered in the table as an estimate made by employees!**

Employee position	Annual wages, including integrated social tax (with all bonuses and compensations)	Programs (allowances or services), that the employee is engaged in				
		Child allowances	Housing allowances	Allowances to families with many children		
		% of time	% of time	% of time	% of time	% of time
Full time spec. 1	40000 – example	30	30	40		
Full time spec. 2 (engaged in other programs not relevant at the moment)	40000 – example	20	50			
Full time spec. 3	60000 – example	50		50		
Full time Leading spec. 1(engaged in other programs not relevant at the moment)	90000 – example	10	10	10		
Full time Leading spec. 2(engaged in other programs not relevant at the moment)	80000 – example	20		20		
Half-time spec. 4	20000 – example	40	60			

TOTAL direct administrative personnel full-time employment units- \_\_\_\_\_

	Child Allowance		Housing Allowance		Target social assistance	
	personnel full-time employment units	% of time	personnel full-time employment units	% of time	personnel full-time employment units	% of time
1. planning, management and design of the program						
2. consultations upon a first meeting						
3. determining eligibility (cross-checking of the information needed for the means test and other eligibility criteria)						

4. Calculation of the benefit to which and applicant family is entitled						
5. maintaining a database of beneficiaries						
6. home visits						
7. Preparation of monthly reports for the County Departments for Labor, Social Solidarity and Family						
8. Audiences for beneficiaries / applicants (complaints etc.)						
9. Answering complaints						
10. control (inspections), monitoring and evaluation						
11. Please, insert below any other activities which were not included above						

4. Direct administrative costs (EXCEPT PERSONNEL EXPENDITURES):

This table lists all expenditures except personnel expenditures, which are direct administrative costs, i.e. 100% of the costs allocated to a single program.

Expenditure item	Program (allowance or service), to which these expenditures are appropriated	Yearly expenditures
<i>Possibly nonexistent, but check!</i>		

5. Indirect administrative costs: *List yearly amount for each type of indirect administrative costs.*

*Note – it depends on whether it is possible to account for every expenditure item in a Social Security Department separately?*

Expenditure item:	Yearly expenditures
<b>Rent and public utility services:</b>	
<b>Premises maintenance:</b>	
<b>Stationery:</b>	
<b>Computer services:</b>	
<b>Phone:</b>	

<b>Other (list every item in a separate line):</b>	

6. Indirect administrative personnel expenditures: *List employment regime (full-/half-time) and positions of all employees, whose wages are considered indirect administrative costs, and their annual wages, including integrated social tax.*

<b>Name / position</b>	<b>Annual wages, including integrated social tax (with all bonuses and compensations)</b>
<i>1 Secretary 1</i>	
<i>0,5 Secretary 2</i>	
<i>1 Head</i>	
<i>1 Child allowances department head</i>	
<i>1 Housing allowances department head</i>	
<i>1 Driver</i>	
<i>1 Accountant 1</i>	
<i>0,5 Accountant 2</i>	
...	
...	

Total indirect administrative personnel full-time employment units - \_\_\_\_\_

7. ALL OTHER EMPLOYEES, not listed in tables above, i.e. engaged in different programs (allowance granting or services provision)

<b>Name / position</b>
<i>Spec.1</i>
<i>Spec.2</i>
<i>Spec.3</i>
...
<i>Spec.10</i>
<i>Leading Spec.1</i>
...
<i>Leading Spec. 10</i>
...
...
<i>Dep. Head 1</i>
...
<i>Dep. Head 10</i>

**TOTAL: Number of full-time employment units of all other employees - \_\_\_\_\_**  
*(can be each position separately or aggregate number, only aggregate number matters)*

Number of allowance recipients

Program	Number of clients
1. <i>Child allowances</i>	<i>30,000 households – example</i>
2. <i>Housing allowances</i>	<i>50,000 households – example</i>
3. <i>Allowances to families with many children</i>	<i>10,000 households – example</i>

## INTERVIEW GUIDE for specialist working in child allowance office

(semi-formal in-depth interview with social assistance officers responsible for decision-making in qualifying child-rearing citizens for monthly childcare benefits)

### General information

1. Position \_\_\_\_\_
2. Sex
  - 1) Male
  - 2) Female
3. Age \_\_\_\_\_ years
4. Total work experience \_\_\_\_\_ years
5. Work experience as social assistance officer \_\_\_\_\_ years
6. Work experience in the present position \_\_\_\_\_ years

### Receiving and processing applications:

7. What ways of drawing applicants are used in the region and in the municipality? (citizens apply for the benefit themselves only; are potential beneficiaries located via social workers, teachers, neighbors etc.?; how often and why? In what way?)
8. Who and where are the applications submitted to? (Social security offices, or local administration, applicant's home? Other places? Are there special employees dealing with childcare benefits? Or is there a so-called system of "one counter" with one employee dealing with all clients? Other forms?).
9. If there is *one special social assistance officer* for each family, does he/she handle all the stages or are the duties distributed among different employees? (reception, checking the data, decision making, adding the data to the database, preparing the payment)
  - Describe in detail the typical procedure of processing the application, beginning with *the first meeting with the applicant* until drawing the necessary papers for the benefit (number of social assistance officers – in what fields; approximate time estimate for each stage of the processing). *Decision making takes place right after submitting the papers, or the decision is made later or other variants..*
10. Does an applicant for the childcare benefit need to submit any papers issued by your social security office? Does the applicant have to collect them on his own or is it done by the social assistance officer, receiving the papers? On a second application is the procedure shortened in any way?
11. How is the benefit funded and what does the form of payment depend on? (options: it is paid in cash at a social security office, or at a post office; paid to a branch of a bank).

### Who qualifies for childcare benefits?

12. What population groups qualify for monthly childcare benefits? How often, in your opinion, the benefit is granted to those not belonging to low-income categories? What

should be changed in the legislation or in the procedure of granting the benefit to avoid this?

13. Can migrants, refugees, homeless persons or other people with no residence registration receive the childcare benefit?
14. Who among those qualifying for the social assistance is not able to receive it? Why?
15. Is the monthly childcare benefit granted to anti-social families, or to the unemployed? Do you consider it reasonable to help them this way? What assistance should be rendered to them?
16. What is your attitude to targeted social assistance programs? Is there a demand for them? What kind of programs should we implement and who should they target?
17. Is the benefit form easy to complete both for social assistance officers and applicants? (*it is preferable to have the blank handy!*). What items present difficulty most often?
18. Do you memorize the “must have” list of submitted documents or do you have it handy?
19. What papers must be submitted by every applicant? What additional documents must be submitted in some cases? (*the list is not shown!*) (Table 1 is to be filled after the interview: Supplement 1).
20. What documents are to be filed in a personal dossier (originals, copies)? What information is to be added to the database?
21. What types of income are taken into account when computing total family income? How many months are covered? Will you fill in the table, please? (Table 2, Supplement 1).
22. Does the applicant have to submit the information on all types of income, stipulated by the law, or does he give the only the information he considers relevant?
23. If the applicant claims that he does not have some types of income (e.g. savings interest, rent), is he asked to confirm it with the relevant documents?
24. Is the income from private enterprises, part-time plots and their products taken into account when the decision about granting the benefit is made? What method is used to compute it? (It is preferable to get the access to the method)
25. What term is set for the childcare benefit each time it is granted? If during this term the subsistence level changes, is the right for the benefit maintained or is it refused?
26. Should the beneficiaries inform the security office about changes in their families or about changes of their income? How often do they make such statements?
27. How often should the family submit the documents to confirm their right to receive the monthly childcare benefit? What documents must be submitted? (The same documents as initially or only part of the information? What kind of information)?
28. If the family does not inform timely of the changes that lead to losing the benefit (composition, income), or the benefit was granted to the wrong family, what is the procedure of getting back the paid benefits? What penalties are imposed on such families?

Ways of checking the submitted information and ensuring the right decision on granting the benefit.

29. In your opinion, how objective is the information about the applicant's income, submitted by the applicants? If any doubt about the submitted information arises, what is done? How often does it happen?
30. What is the current procedure of checking the data? How often are they checked and in what way? (checking at the applicant's workplace or at the workplaces of other family members; checking at the pension fund, tax inspection, judicial organs) Who performs the check? (the same employees receiving the applicants or special staff?)
31. Do social assistance officers perform the inspection of living conditions on the premises to estimate real living standard? How often do they do it? Can the inspection influence the decision to grant or to refuse the benefit and in what cases in particular? What are the criteria of the estimate? (expensive property, a different composition of the family, other criteria) Who performs the inspection? (the same employees receiving the applicants or special staff? local administration?)
32. At what stages can the inspections be conducted and when do they take place in reality? (before decision-making, or after the first payment; how often? Selected households or all households? Percentage of inspected households?)
33. What methods of ensuring correct calculations of the total income of the household are applied? What is the percentage of mistakes?
34. Is there a program of controlling the decision making process? Who checks the decisions to grant the benefit? (is it done by a local social security office or by a regional office?) Who can see the results? How often are these inspections performed?
35. What are the most common reasons for miscalculations? How does it show? What can be the consequences of a revealed mistake or abuse?

Refused applications for the monthly childcare benefit

36. How often do you have to refuse the application for the benefit? (last month, year? In your opinion, why does it happen? What can be regarded as grounds for the refusal?
37. What is the procedure of appealing the refusal? Percentage of appeals (last year)? What are the decisions?
38. Where can a family get information on their rights to appeal and the procedure of appellation? (at social security offices? At local administration? At judicial organs? Other places?)

Institutional profile

39. What defines your duties? (Contract, job description? General instruction of the branch, oral instruction of the boss, nothing)
40. Do you make use of formal instruction on a daily basis? What are they? (*it is preferable to have one*) Do you make use of informal rules, what are they?
41. How often do you have to work under time pressure? (practically always, most of the time, very often,... almost never )

42. What is your daily amount of work? (number of received people, processed cases, files)? Maximum? Minimum? What does it depend on?

Qualifications of social assistance officers

43. How often are continued education programs held? Who conducts them? Who takes part in these programs?

44. What curriculums are studied?: (it is preferable to get access to a current curriculum)

Time saving,  
Organizational skills,  
Procedure of granting the benefit/allowance,  
Working with different categories of applicants,  
Legislature  
Other matters.

45. Are these skills and knowledge of any practical use? Or do they just “broaden the scope”?

46. In your opinion, what programs can help maximize the effectiveness of your work?

Software used by social assistance officers dealing the childcare benefit issues

47. Who is in charge of the database in your regional division? (a special department? How many people?)

48. Is the current software user-friendly? (adding the data, calculating per capita income and decision making, report blanks on payments and categories of beneficiaries What information from the database is used to make a decision about granting the benefit? (data on the allowances and incomes, received by the applicant?)

49. What databases of other organizations can be referred to when checking the information given by the applicant? Whose duty is it? Is the exchange between databases regular? Who is authorized to use the database? (Can he/she use the whole database or only his/her part?) Is there any affinity between different databases on social benefits?

50. Do the officers receiving the applicants use the database to check on other benefits and allowances, received by the applicants? What information is available to them? What organs can the exchange data with? What information in particular? How often?

Social reforms

51. What is your attitude to transferring social security system from the municipal to the regional authority? Why?

52. The management of monthly child’s benefit has been recently transferred from the federal to regional level? What has changed in your work due to this transfer?

In conclusion we would like you to share your ideas on maximizing the effectiveness of the work of local social assistance officers?

*Annex 1*

Questions 22 and 23 (to be completed after the interview)

Table 1.

Documents	Mandatory	Additional
1. income statements	1	2
2. childcare benefit application;	1	2
3. copy of a child's (children's) birth certificate: from senior to junior child;	1	2
4. copies of the documents, confirming the right of the beneficiary to receive an increased benefit according to the existing laws;	1	2
5. extracts (or copies) from the passport or identification card;	1	2
6. statement by a local social security office about the other parent not receiving the benefit from a different social security office;	1	2
7. instruction about the extension change of the amount of the benefit;	1	2
8. additional documents for a child in a guardian's care	1	2
9. copy of the decision by the local administration about placing a child under the guardian's care	1	2
10. statement by the local department of education about a child not receiving any money allowances	1	2

Question 24

Table 2.

Types of income	Mandatory	To be learned from the documents or from the application	Occur in practice	The absence of these should be confirmed
	Yes No	documents application	Yes No	Yes No
All types of earnings (fees, allowances) and additional pay at all jobs;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Payment according to the tariffs, job descriptions, contracts, or based on the revenues;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
All types of additional payment, rise in wages for: hard work, work in harmful	1	1	1	1

or severe climatic conditions, night work, a degree or long work experience, performing other than defined by one's job description duties etc. );	2	2	2	2
Bonuses and premiums;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Payment for overwork and work on holidays and weekends;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Wages paid during the vacations, compensation for a period of a skipped vacation;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Median wages, paid during the period of performing state and public duties and in other cases stipulated by the labor code;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Discharge pay, or retirement compensation;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Wages paid after closing the company or redundancy discharge, and to persons seeking a new job;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Additional payment provided by the employer, added to the payment guaranteed by the laws of the Russian Federation.	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Money allowances, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs, as well as additional payment and food supply, provided on the permanent basis and stipulated by the laws of the Russian Federation;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Retirement lump benefit, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs service of the Russian Federation.	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
All types of retirement allowances		1	1	1

(except for additional pay, provided to caretakers of the retired), compensations and monthly additional payments;	1 2	2	2	2
Monthly life allowance of retired judges;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Grants paid to students of primary, secondary and higher institutions, as well as to postgraduates, students of seminaries, and compensations, paid to these categories on sick-leave;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Unemployment benefits and grants paid to the unemployed while getting a profession or a second education;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Sick-leave allowance, maternity leave, as well as lump benefit paid to pregnant women leaving work earlier than stipulated by the law;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Monthly allowance paid to child-rearing persons during the first 1.5 years of after a child is born, as well as monthly compensations, paid to persons on their child-rearing leave during the first 3 years after a child is born;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Monthly allowance paid to spouses of the military, serving under a contract, if the spouses are not able to find work and have the status of the unemployed; or if the spouses have to leave their jobs to care for sick children whose sickness is caused by the service conditions;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Monthly compensation paid to spouses of the officers of the Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service and penitentiary institutions of the Russian Federation, when they are not able to find a job in distant regions;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Monthly compensation paid as health damages inflicted on the employees while performing their duties, except for the additional expenditures on medical, social and professional rehabilitation procedures, as prescribed by the medical and social expert board;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Payment covering the cost of food, except for special diet, provided (paid	1	1	1	

for) according to the laws of RF;	2	2	2	
Commission paid to insurance agents and staff brokers;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Payment under contracts, drawn according to the Civil code of the RF;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Author's fees, paid to staff writers of newspapers, magazines and other mass media;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Payment, received by the temporary members of election commissions ;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Payment, received by natural persons from election commissions, election funds of candidates and election unions for the work performed during election campaigns;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income of natural persons from gold-digging;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from private businesses (including farms) existing both as natural and artificial persons;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from stocks, shares (dividends);	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from leasing real estate owned by the family or family members;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Alimony, received by children under 18;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Interest payment on bank deposits.		1	1	1

	1	2	2	2
	2			
<b>Other types of income</b>				
Social benefits in their money equivalent	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from personal part-time plots.	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for specialist working in housing allowance office**

(semi-formal in-depth interview with social assistance officers responsible for decision-making in qualifying citizens for housing allowance)

### **General information**

**Position** \_\_\_\_\_

**Sex**

Male

Female

**Age** \_\_\_\_\_ years

**Total work experience** \_\_\_\_\_ years

**Work experience in the service**

**dealing with housing benefits** \_\_\_\_\_ years

**Work experience in the present position** \_\_\_\_\_ years

### Receiving and processing applications:

1. What ways of drawing applicants are used in the region and in the municipality? (citizens apply for the benefit themselves only; are potential beneficiaries located via social workers, teachers, neighbors etc.?; how often and why? In what way?)
2. Who and where are the applications submitted to? (Social security offices, or local administration, applicant's home? Other places? Are there special employees dealing with housing benefits? Or is there a so-called system of "one counter" with one employee dealing with all clients? Other forms?). If there is *one special social assistance officer* for each family, does he/she handle all the stages or are the duties distributed among different employees? (reception, checking the data, decision making, adding the data to the database, preparing the payment)

- Describe in detail the typical procedure of processing the application, beginning with *the first meeting with the applicant* until drawing the necessary papers for the benefit (number of social workers – in what fields; approximate time estimate for each stage of the processing). *Decision making takes place right after submitting the papers, or the decision is made later or other variants*

3. Does an applicant for the housing benefit need to submit any papers issued by your social security office? Does the applicant have to collect them on his own or is it done by the social worker, receiving the papers? On a second application is the procedure shortened in any way?
4. In what form is the benefit granted and what does the form depend on?

### Who qualifies for the housing benefit?

5. What is your opinion of the criteria, used in estimating the composition of a family to qualify it for the housing benefit? Are they efficient in terms of rendering the

assistance to low-income people? Do you consider the federal decree (#761, 2005), setting new rules for estimating the family composition, valid?

6. What population groups qualify for monthly low-income benefits?
7. How often, in your opinion, the benefit is granted to those not belonging to low-income categories? What should be changed in the legislation or in the procedure of granting the benefit to avoid this?
8. Who among those qualifying for the benefit is not able to receive it? Why? Can it be explained by the fact that housing benefits are not granted to people with debts in maintenance and utilities payment? What should be done in such cases?
9. Is the housing benefit granted to anti-social families, or to the unemployed? Do you consider it reasonable to help them this way? What assistance should be rendered to such people?
10. Is the benefit form easy to complete both for social workers and applicants? (*it is preferable to have the blank handy!*). What items present difficulty most often?
11. Do you memorize the “must have” list of submitted documents or do you have it handy?
12. What papers must be submitted by every applicant? What additional documents must be submitted in some cases? (*the list is not shown!*) (Table 1 is to be filled after the interview: Supplement 1).
13. What documents are to be filed in a personal dossier (originals, copies)? What information is to be added to the database?
14. What types of income are taken into account when computing total family income? How many months are covered? Will you fill in the table, please? (Table 2, Supplement 1).
15. If the applicant claims that he does not have some types of income (e.g. savings interest, rent), is he asked to confirm it with the relevant documents?
16. Is the income from private enterprises, part-time plots and their products taken into account when the decision about granting the benefit is made? What method is used to compute it? (It is preferable to get the access to the method)
17. What term is set for the housing benefit each time it is granted? If during this term the subsistence level changes, is the right for the benefit maintained or is it refused?
18. Should the beneficiaries inform the security office about changes in their families or about changes of their income? How often do they make such statements?
19. How often should the family submit the documents to confirm their right to receive the housing benefit? What documents must be submitted? (The same documents as initially or only part of the information? What kind of information)?
20. If the family does not inform timely of the changes that lead to losing the benefit (composition, income), or the benefit was granted to the wrong family, what is the procedure of getting back the paid benefits? What penalties are imposed on such families?

Ways of checking the submitted information and ensuring the correct decision on granting the benefit.

21. In your opinion, how objective is the information about the applicant's income, submitted by the applicants? If any doubt about the submitted information arises, what is done? How often does it happen?
22. What is the current procedure of checking the data? How often are they checked and in what way? (checking at the applicant's workplace or at the workplaces of other family members; checking at the pension fund, tax inspection, judicial organs) Who performs the check? (the same employees receiving the applicants or special staff?)
23. Do social assistance officers perform the inspection of living conditions on the premises to estimate real living standard? How often do they do it? Can the inspection influence the decision to grant or to refuse the benefit and in what cases in particular? What are the criteria of the estimate? (expensive property, a different composition of the family, other criteria) Who performs the inspection? (the same employees receiving the applicants or special staff? local administration?)
24. At what stages can the inspections be conducted and when do they take place in reality? (before decision-making, or after the first payment; how often? Selected households or all households? Percentage of inspected households?)
25. What methods of ensuring correct calculations of the total income of the household and the amount of the allowance are applied? What is the percentage of mistakes? (estimate) Is there a program of controlling the decision making process? Who checks the decisions to grant the benefit? (is it done by a local social security office or by a regional office?) Who can see the results? How often are these inspections performed?
26. What are the most common reasons for miscalculations? How does it show? What can be the consequences of a revealed mistake or abuse?

#### Refused applications for the monthly low-income benefit

27. How often do you have to refuse the application for the benefit? (last month, year? In your opinion, why does it happen? What can be regarded as grounds for the refusal?
28. What is the procedure of appealing the refusal? Percentage of appeals (last year)? What are the decisions? Where can a family get information on their rights to appeal and the procedure of appellation? (at social security offices? At local administration? At judicial organs? Other places?)

#### Institutional profile

29. What defines your duties? (Contract, job description? General instruction of the branch, oral instruction of the boss, nothing)
30. Do you make use of formal instructions on a daily basis? What are they? (*it is preferable to have one*) Do you make use of informal rules, what are they?
31. How often do you have to work under time pressure? (practically always, most of the time, very often,... almost never )
32. What is your daily amount of work? (number of received people, processed cases, files)? Maximum? Minimum? What does it depend on?

#### Qualifications of social security workers

- 33.** How often are continued education programs held? Who conducts them? Who takes part in these programs?
- 34.** What curriculums are studied?: (it is preferable to get access to a current curriculum)
- Time saving,
  - Organizational skills,
  - Procedure of granting the benefit/allowance,
  - Working with different categories of applicants,
  - Legislature
  - Other matters.
- 35.** Are these skills and knowledge of any practical use? Or do they just “broaden the scope”?
- 36.** In your opinion, what programs can help maximize the effectiveness of your work?

Software used by social security workers dealing the low-income benefit issues

- 37.** Who is in charge of the database in your regional division? (a special department? How many people?)
- 38.** Is the current software user-friendly? (adding the data, calculating per capita income and decision making, report blanks on payments and categories of beneficiaries What information from the database is used to make a decision about granting the benefit? (data on the allowances and incomes, received by the applicant?)
- 39.** What databases of other organizations can be referred to when checking the information given by the applicant? Whose duty is it? Is the exchange between databases regular? Who is authorized to use the database? (Can he/she use the whole database or only his/her part?) Is there any affinity between different databases on social benefits?
- 40.** Does the software you use in your work supply information on all types of assistance or is there special software for each type? Is there any affinity between different databases on social benefits? Can you get information on all types of social assistance, received by one family?
- 41.** What can help maximize the effectiveness of the municipal social workers’ performance? Should the procedure of collecting the information be simplified? Should the procedure of checking the information be simplified? Should you eliminate redundant stages of work? Should the software or other resources be improved?

Social reforms

- 42.** What is your attitude to transferring social security system from the municipal to the regional authority? Why?
- 43.** Do you think it right to calculate the housing benefit using the regional standards? Do you agree with the following statements?
1. It will simplify and maximize the effectiveness of social housing service
  2. It will bring the amount of the benefit closer to the optimum
  3. It will allow to target the benefit at the poor

**44. What is your attitude to the transfer of housing benefits service under the authority of social security organs? What are your reasons?**

*Supplement*

Question 18 (the interviewer only, not to be shown to the interviewed!)

Table 1

DOCUMENTS	mandatory	additional
Application for the benefit	1	2
documents, stating the composition of the applicant's family	1	2
Income statements from the applicant and all members of the family, taken into account when making the decision about the allowance	1	2
Information on rent and facilities payments, covering the month prior to the application date, as well as on overdue rent and facilities payment	1	2
Documents or their copies, confirming the property or tenancy rights of the owner or the tenant	1	2
Documents or their copies, confirming the right of the applicant or members of the family, residing with the applicant, to housing social benefits or rent compensations	1	2
Nationality (Russian Federation) identification documents (or copies) of the applicant and members of the family	1	2
Written promise to pay the overdue rent and facilities payment, either completely or partially – to be submitted to the housing benefits department (for persons having over 3 months' debt)	1	2

To complete (question 20)

Table 2.

Types of income	Mandatory	To be learned from the documents or from the application	Occur in practice	The absence of these should be confirmed
	1. yes 2. no	1. documents 2. application	1. yes 2. no	1. yes 2. no
All types of pay;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
The median wages, paid in all cases, stipulated by the Labor code of the RF;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2

Compensation, provided by a state organ or a public organization for the period of performing state or public duties;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Retirement compensations, discharge payments, redundancy wages etc.	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Social benefits, paid from budgets and other sources	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Pensions, compensation payments (except for compensations to the caretakers of the disabled) and additional monthly benefits, paid to the retired;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly life allowance of retired judges ;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Grants paid to students of primary, secondary and higher institutions, as well as to postgraduates, students of seminaries, and compensations, paid to these categories on sick-leave;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Unemployment benefits and other types of assistance, rendered to the unemployed seeking a new employment or doing educational courses, as well as payments to the temporarily occupied unemployed, to the most deprived categories of the unemployed and temporarily occupied children of 14 to 18;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Sick-leave allowance, maternity leave as well as lump benefit paid to pregnant women leaving work earlier than stipulated by the law;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly childcare benefit;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly allowance paid to child-rearing persons during the first 1.5 years after a child is born, as well as monthly compensations, paid to persons on their child-rearing leave during the first 3 years	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2

after a child is born;				
Monthly allowance paid to spouses of the military, serving under a contract, if the spouses are not able to find work and have the status of the unemployed; or if the spouses have to leave their jobs to care for under age sick children whose sickness is caused by the service conditions;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly compensation paid to spouses of the officers of the Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service and penitentiary institutions of the Russian Federation, when they are not able to find a job in distant regions;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly social insurance payment (accidents at work, occupational hazards);	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Additional payments to all types of pay, covered by the present item, and other social benefits, stipulated by state organs, local administration and other organizations of the RF;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income received from the property, owned by a family or a single person	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from leasing real estate, cars and other facilities, owned by the family or family members;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from selling the products of personal part-time plots and small-scale farming;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Money allowances, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, penitentiary institutions, customs, as well as additional payment and food supply, provided on the permanent basis and stipulated by the laws of the Russian Federation;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Retirement lump benefit, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs service of the Russian Federation ;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Payment under contracts, drawn according to the Civil code of the RF;	1	1	1	1
		2	2	2

	2			
Financial assistance, rendered by employers to retired employees;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Royalties, as stipulated by the laws of the RF on copyright;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from private businesses (including farms) existing both as natural and artificial persons;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from stocks, shares (dividends);	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Alimony, received by children under 18;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Interest payment on bank deposits;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Money, inherited and received as a gift;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income and profit of individual businesses, including bonds and property rights;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Social benefits, provided by the state, local administration and other organizations, in their money equivalent.	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Rent compensations	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Allowance, paid to the guardian for providing the care of the guarded	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Other types of income	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2

benefits	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Income from personal part-time plots and small-scale farming	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for specialist working in other social assistance office**

(semi-formal in-depth interview with social assistance officers responsible for decision-making in qualifying low-income citizens for targeted monthly benefits)

### **General information**

**Position** \_\_\_\_\_

#### **Sex**

Male

Female

#### **Age**

\_\_\_\_|\_\_\_\_| years

#### **Total work experience**

\_\_\_\_|\_\_\_\_| years

#### **Work experience as social assistance officer**

\_\_\_\_|\_\_\_\_| years

#### **Work experience in the present position**

\_\_\_\_|\_\_\_\_| years

### Receiving and processing applications:

1. What ways of drawing applicants are used in the region and in the municipality? (citizens apply for the benefit themselves only; are potential beneficiaries located via social assistance officers, teachers, neighbors etc.?; how often and why? In what way?)
2. Who and where are the applications submitted to? (Social security offices, or local administration, applicant's home? Other places? Are there special employees dealing with benefits, targeting low-income persons? Or is there a so-called system of "one counter" with one employee dealing with all clients? Other forms?).
3. If there is *one special social assistance officer* for each family, does he/she handle all the stages or are the duties distributed among different employees? (reception, checking the data, decision making, adding the data to the database, preparing the payment)

- Describe in detail the typical procedure of processing the application, beginning with *the first meeting with the applicant* until drawing the necessary papers for the benefit (number of social assistance officers – in what fields; approximate time estimate for each stage of the processing). *Decision making takes place right after submitting the papers, or the decision is made later or other variants*

4. Does an applicant for the low-income benefit need to submit any papers issued by your social security office? Does the applicant have to collect them on his own or is it done by the social assistance officer, receiving the papers? On a second application is the procedure shortened in any way?
5. In what form is the benefit granted and what does the form depend on? (options: cash, bank, a post office; money or food and clothes).

### Who qualifies for the benefits, targeting low-income population?

6. . What population groups qualify for monthly low-income benefits?

7. How often, in your opinion, the benefit is granted to those not belonging to low-income categories? What should be changed in the legislation or in the procedure of granting the benefit to avoid this?
8. Can migrants, refugees, homeless persons or other people with no residence registration receive the benefit, targeting low-income population?
9. Who among those qualifying for the benefit is not able to receive it? Why?
10. Is the monthly low-income benefit granted to anti-social families, or to the unemployed? Do you consider it reasonable to help them this way? What assistance should be rendered to them?
11. Is the benefit form easy to complete both for social assistance officers and applicants? (*it is preferable to have the blank handy!*). What items present difficulty most often?
12. Do you memorize the “must have” list of submitted documents or do you have it handy? What papers must be submitted by every applicant? What additional documents must be submitted in some cases? (*the list is not shown!*) (Table 1 is to be filled after the interview: Supplement 1).
13. What documents are to be filed in a personal dossier (originals, copies)? What information is to be added to the database?
14. What types of income are taken into account when computing total family income? How many months are covered? Will you fill in the table, please? (Table 2, Supplement 1).
15. If the applicant claims that he does not have some types of income (e.g. savings interest, rent), is he asked to confirm it with the relevant documents?
16. Is the income from private enterprises, part-time plots and their products taken into account when the decision about granting the benefit is made? What method is used to compute it? (It is preferable to get the access to the method)
17. What term is set for the low-income benefit each time it is granted? If during this term the subsistence level changes, is the right for the benefit maintained or is it refused?
18. Should the beneficiaries inform the security office about changes in their families or about changes of their income? How often do they make such statements?
19. How often should the family submit the documents to confirm their right to receive the monthly low-income benefit? What documents must be submitted? (The same documents as initially or only part of the information? What kind of information?)
20. If the family does not inform timely of the changes that lead to losing the benefit (composition, income), or the benefit was granted to the wrong family, what is the procedure of getting back the paid benefits? What penalties are imposed on such families?
21. In terms of social assistance is the amount of the paid benefit sufficient? Does it really help the poor?

Ways of checking the submitted information and ensuring the correct decision on granting the benefit.

22. In your opinion, how objective is the information about the applicant's income, submitted by the applicants? If any doubt about the submitted information arises, what is done? How often does it happen?
23. What is the current procedure of checking the data? How often are they checked and in what way? (checking at the applicant's workplace or at the workplaces of other family members; checking at the pension fund, tax inspection, judicial organs) Who performs the check? (the same employees receiving the applicants or special staff?)
24. Do social assistance officers perform the inspection of living conditions on the premises to estimate real living standard? How often do they do it? Can the inspection influence the decision to grant or to refuse the benefit and in what cases in particular? What are the criteria of the estimate? (expensive property, a different composition of the family, other criteria) Who performs the inspection? (the same employees receiving the applicants or special staff? local administration?)
25. At what stages can the inspections be conducted and when do they take place in reality? (before decision-making, or after the first payment; how often? Selected households or all households? Percentage of inspected households?)
26. What methods of ensuring correct calculations of the total income of the household and the amount of the allowance are applied? What is the percentage of mistakes? (estimate)
27. Is there a program of controlling the decision making process? Who checks the decisions to grant the benefit? (is it done by a local social security office or by a regional office?) Who can see the results? How often are these inspections performed?
28. What are the most common reasons for miscalculations? How does it show? What can be the consequences of a revealed mistake or abuse?

#### Refused applications for the monthly low-income benefit

29. How often do you have to refuse the application for the benefit? (last month, year? In your opinion, why does it happen? What can be regarded as grounds for the refusal?
30. What is the procedure of appealing the refusal? Percentage of appeals (last year)? What are the decisions?
31. Where can a family get information on their rights to appeal and the procedure of appellation? (at social security offices? At local administration? At judicial organs? Other places?)
32. If the appeal is granted, who takes the responsibility for the mistake? A particular social assistance officer or the manager?

#### Institutional profile

33. What defines your duties? (Contract, job description? General instruction of the branch, oral instruction of the boss, nothing)
34. Do you make use of formal instruction on a daily basis? What are they? (*it is preferable to have one*) Do you make use of informal rules, what are they?

35. How often do you have to work under time pressure? (practically always, most of the time, very often,... almost never )
36. What is your daily amount of work? (number of received people, processed cases, files)? Maximum? Minimum? What does it depend on?

#### Qualifications of social security assistance officers

37. How often are continued education programs held? Who conducts them? Who takes part in these programs?
38. What curriculums are studied?: (it is preferable to get access to a current curriculum)
- Time saving,
  - Organizational skills,
  - Procedure of granting the benefit/allowance,
  - Working with different categories of applicants,
  - Legislature
  - Other matters.
39. Are these skills and knowledge of any practical use? Or do they just “broaden the scope”?
40. In your opinion, what programs can help maximize the effectiveness of your work?

#### Software used by social assistance officers dealing the low-income benefit issues

41. Who is in charge of the database in your regional division? (a special department? How many people?)
42. Is the current software user-friendly? (adding the data, calculating per capita income and decision making, report blanks on payments and categories of beneficiaries What information from the database is used to make a decision about granting the benefit? (data on the allowances and incomes, received by the applicant?)
43. What databases of other organizations can be referred to when checking the information given by the applicant? Whose duty is it? Is the exchange between databases regular? Who is authorized to use the database? (Can he/she use the whole database or only his/her part?) Is there any affinity between different databases on social benefits?
44. Does the software you use in your work supply information on all types of assistance or is there special software for each type? Is there any affinity between different databases on social benefits? Can you get information on all types of social assistance, received by one family?

#### Social reforms

45. What is your attitude to transferring social security system from the municipal to the regional authority? Why?
46. What is your attitude to targeted social assistance programs? Is there a demand for them? What kind of programs should we implement and who should they target?

In conclusion we would like you to share your ideas on maximizing the effectiveness of the work of local assistance officers? *Supplement 1*

Questions 18 (for the interviewer only, not to be shown to the interviewed)  
 Table 1.

Documents	Mandatory	Additional
1. documents, stating the composition of the applicant's family	1	2
2. application for the low-income benefit		
3. residence (registration) documents	1	2
4. living conditions statements	1	2
5. documents on the property status of personal part-time plots	1	2
6. health certificates, ability to work certificates	1	2
7. documents, confirming the owner's status of sellable property (car, garage, flat, house etc.)	1	2
8. documents, confirming monthly payments and allowances	1	2
9. wages and other income records, covering 3 full months before the application, from each family member (given by state and private companies, educational institutions, employment organs etc.)	1	2

To be completed together with the interviewed (question 20)

Table 2.

Types of income	Mandatory	To be learned from the documents or from the application	Occur in practice	The absence of these should be confirmed
	3. yes 4. no	3. documents 4. application	3. yes 4. no	1. yes 2. no
All payments, taken into account when calculating the median wages;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
The median wages, paid in all cases, stipulated by the Labor code of the RF;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Compensation, provided by a state organ or a public organization for the period of performing state or public duties;	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
Retirement compensations, discharge payments, redundancy wages etc.	1	1 2	1 2	1 2

	2			
Social benefits, paid from budgets and other sources	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Pensions, compensation payments (except for compensations to the caretakers of the disabled) and additional monthly benefits, paid to the retired;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly life allowance of retired judges	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Grants paid to students of primary, secondary and higher institutions, as well as to postgraduates, students of seminaries, and compensations, paid to these categories on sick-leave;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Unemployment benefits and other types of assistance, rendered to the unemployed seeking a new employment or doing educational courses, as well as payments to the temporarily occupied unemployed, the most deprived categories of the unemployed and temporarily occupied children of 14 to 18;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Sick-leave allowance, maternity leave as well as lump benefit paid to pregnant women leaving work earlier than stipulated by the law;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly childcare benefit;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly allowance paid to child-rearing persons during the first 1.5 years of after a child is born, as well as monthly compensations, paid to persons on their child-rearing leave during the first 3 years after a child is born;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly allowance paid to spouses of the military, serving under a contract, if the spouses are not able to find work and have the status of the unemployed; or if the spouses have to leave their jobs to care for under age sick children whose sickness is caused by the service conditions;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2

Monthly compensation paid to spouses of the officers of the Interior Ministry, State anti-fire service and penitentiary institutions of the Russian Federation, when they are not able to find a job in distant regions;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Monthly social insurance payment (accidents at work, occupational hazards);	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Additional payments to all types of pay, covered by the present item, and other social benefits, stipulated by state organs, local administration and other organizations of the RF;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income received from the property, owned by a family or a single person	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from leasing real estate, cars and other facilities, owned by the family or family members;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from selling the products of personal part-time plots and small-scale farming;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Other types of income	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Money allowances, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, penitentiary institutions, customs, as well as additional payment and food supply, provided on the permanent basis and stipulated by the laws of the Russian Federation;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Retirement lump benefit, paid to the military, officers of Interior Ministry, State fire service, penitentiary institutions, customs service of the Russian Federation ;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Payment under contracts, drawn according to the Civil code of the RF;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Financial assistance, rendered by employers to retired employees;	1	1	1	1

	2	2	2	2
Royalties, as stipulated by the laws of the RF on copyright;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from private businesses (including farms) existing both as natural and artificial persons;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from stocks, shares (dividends);	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Alimony, received by children under 18;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Interest payment on bank deposits;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Money, inherited and received as a gift;	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Social benefits, provided by the state, local administration and other organizations, in their money equivalent.	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Other types of income	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
benefits	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
Income from personal part-time plots and small-scale farming	1	1	1	1
	2	2	2	2
		1	1	1

	1 2	2	2	2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2
	1 2	1 2	1 2	1 2

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for Head of local social protection department**

(in-depth interview with representatives of territorial bodies of social protection)

Within this interview, three types of targeted assistance are to be considered as programs of targeted social support of the population:

- 1) monthly state allowance for people with children;
- 2) housing and utility allowance;
- 3) targeted social assistance for the poor (besides those listed in 1 and 2, granted and paid according to the Federal Law “On state social assistance” from July 17, 1999.

### General information

Sex

male

female

Age

|\_|\_| years

Total length of service

|\_|\_| years

Length of service in the system of social protection

|\_|\_| years

Length of service in the current position

|\_|\_| years

Number of subordinate's

|\_|\_| people

### **Social sphere reform**

1. Your opinion of the transition of the system of social protection from the municipal level to the regional one. Why do you think so?
2. The management of the housing allowances program was shifted to the regional level from the municipal ones. What do you think of it? Is it more efficient?
3. Is it right to calculate the amount of allowances on the basis of regional standards? To what extent do you agree with the following sentences:
  1. It simplifies and rise the work efficiency of specialists
  2. It brings the size of allowances to the optimal one
  3. It allows to give allowances the neediest families
4. Is it right to transfer the management for housing allowances into the system of social protection? Why do you think so?
5. The management of child allowance program was shifted from the federal level to the regional one. What do you think of it?
6. Your opinion of the reform of the system of natural benefits (monetization) undertaken last year? Was it necessary? What problems did you faced during realization of the reform? Who benefit and lose from the reform?

### **Management of the targeted social assistance programs**

7. Are these programs efficient in supporting the neediest members of society? (describe by type)

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

8. How perfect is the procedure of selection of beneficiaries from point of view of prevention from provision assistance to ineligible? (By program.) How often recipients occur to be ineligible? Why does it happen? What is to be changed in the legislation or granting procedure to avoid it?

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

9. Are there ways to improve means testing procedures? How costly would be more detailed means testing? (By program)
10. In terms of the program goals (social support of the needy), is the amount of the allowance adequate? (By program). Which of them need to be enlarged and which allowances can be abolished?

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

11. Is it necessary to develop a universal definition of family for all types of allowances (housing allowances, child allowances, targeted social assistance)? Who would be the loser then?
12. Can homeless and migrants the do not have all papers needed receive the targeted social assistance?
13. Is social assistance granted to asocial individuals? Should it be done? What could be efficient in these cases?
14. Have there been cases of wrong granting? How the allowance was paid back? What sanctions were applied to such recipients?

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

15. Is there any interaction between targeted social programs and other social protection programs implemented by social protection offices (for example, social service programs)?
16. Does your office have working contacts with organizations from other departments (say, job-placement programs)
17. Are your databases compatible with databases of other organizations of social support of population (for example, employment services)? Do you exchange data? How regularly?
18. How do you monitor the results and efficiency of the programs? How often?

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

19. Is there a post-monitoring correction of the program?

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

20. What accounts do you usually provide? (to whom, how often) Do you need to broaden the list of indicators?

21. Is the work at the local office audited? If yes, who does that, how often, and what is checked?

22. Do you report the results of your work to the citizens or associations that receive the allowances you provided or receive your other services?

**Development prospects**

23. Problems of personnel for social protection offices (lack of staff, low qualification, low motivation, mobility, etc.).

24. Who develops the plan of re-training of staff? (the leaders of your organizations or on the regional level) On which basis?

25. Are pilot projects necessary before a reform is set out? Would your office participate in a pilot project? In what sphere?

26. Your general attitude to targeted social assistance as part of the social protection system. What place do they take in the social protection system?

27. How often do you disagree with the policy that is conducted by your organization as territorial representative office of social protection?

28. The rules of appointment and provision of child allowances are defined by Decree #11-па 21.01.05, which does not contain the requirement for applicant to provide the document that confirms his/her income and income of his/her family. Nevertheless, Decree #245-па 15.12.04 contains information that case records of child allowance beneficiaries should include such documents. In what form actually do the applicants provide the information about the incomes? How can you comment the appeared discrepancy? Should the amendment to act be introduced?

29. In conclusion we ask you to comment the perspectives of your work, where there are possibility and necessity of more efficient work of your organization?

## **INTERVIEW GUIDE for Head of regional social protection ministry/department**

(in-depth interview with a representative of the Ministry of labor and social protection of the population)

Within this interview, three types of targeted assistance are to be considered as programs of targeted social support of the population:

- 4) monthly state allowance for people with children;
- 5) housing and utility allowance;
- 6) targeted social assistance for the poor (besides those listed in 1 and 2, granted and paid according to the Federal Law “On state social assistance” from July 17, 1999.

### **General information**

Gender

male

female

Age

|\_|\_| years

Total length of service

|\_|\_| years

Length of service in the system of social protection

|\_|\_| years

Length of service in the current position

|\_|\_| years

Number of subordinates

|\_|\_| people

### **Social sphere reform**

Your opinion of the transition of the system of social protection from the municipal level to the regional one. Why do you think so?

The management of the housing allowances program was shifted to the regional level from the municipal ones. What do you think of it? Is it more efficient?

Is it right to calculate the amount of allowance on the basis of regional standards? Do you agree with the following statements:

- 1) It would rise the efficiency of staff
- 2) It would move the amount of benefits towards optimal
- 3) It would help to give benefits to the most needy families

Is it right to transfer the management for housing allowances into the system of social protection?

The program of child allowances was shifted from the federal level to the regional one? What do you think of it? Is it more efficient?

Your opinion of the reform of the system of natural benefits (monetization) undertaken last year? Was it necessary? Who are the winners and the losers?

### **Management of the targeted social assistance programs**

Are these programs (housing allowances, child allowances, other regional targeted programs) efficient in supporting the neediest members of society?

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

What are the main problems of the implementation of these programs? (describe by type)

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

How efficient is the procedure of excluding families with high income from participation in the programs? (describe by type)

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

What needs to be changed to avoid such situations? (federal laws, regional laws, the procedure, the implementation control)

Are the amounts of the allowances adequate for helping the needy? Are there any plans to change the amounts or shift some funds to other programs?

Is it necessary to develop a universal definition of family for all types of allowances? (housing allowances, child allowances, targeted social assistance) Who would be the loser then?

Can homeless, refugees, migrants and other categories of citizens who do not have all papers needed receive the targeted social assistance (child allowances, targeted social assistance)?

Is social assistance granted to asocial individuals, marginal men, long-time unemployed? Should it be done? What could be efficient in these cases?

Is there any interaction between targeted social programs and other social protection programs implemented by social protection offices (for example, with the social service programs)? What is the nature of the interaction?

Does your office have working contacts with organizations from other departments (say, job-placement programs)

Are there any differences in implementation of the programs between different municipalities in the region? What is the nature of the differences?

Do you monitor the results and efficiency of the programs? Please, give examples. Is it enough information, is it regularly collected?

*Housing allowances*

*Child allowances*

*Other regional targeted programs*

How are results used? Are there any examples of post-monitoring correction of the programs?

Is there an access on regional level to all local data bases? In what way (on-line)?

### **Development prospects**

How serious are the problems of personnel for social protection offices?

1. the problem of the personnel is very serious
2. some problems with the personnel exist, but they do not influence significantly the performance of social protection offices
3. there is no problem with the personnel
4. other (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

What are the main problems of personnel for social protection offices (lack of staff, low qualification, low motivation, mobility, etc.)?

1. shortage of the personnel
2. turnover of the personnel
3. low qualification of the personnel
4. low motivation of the personnel
5. other (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

The effect of the last year reforms on personnel?

1. during reform the personnel quality is worsened essentially
2. the personnel quality is not changed
3. the personnel quality is improved
4. other (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

Who develops the plan of re-training of staff? On which basis?

Are pilot projects necessary before a reform is set out?

1. yes, it is very important
2. yes, pilot projects are necessary, but not always
3. I do not think that pilot project implementation affects essentially the success/failure of reforms.
4. other (specify) \_\_\_\_\_

What is your attitude towards participation of your region in pilot projects? In what sphere?

Do you report the results of you work to the citizens or associations that receive the allowances you provided or receive your other services?

The rules of appointment and provision of child allowances are defined by Decree #11-па 21.01.05, which does not contain the requirement for applicant to provide the document that confirm his/her income and income of his/her family. Nevertheless, Decree #245-па 15.12.04 contains information that case record of child allowance beneficiaries should include such documents. In what form actually the applicants should provide the information about the incomes? How can you comment the appeared discrepancy? Should the amendment to act be introduced?

Your general attitude to targeted social assistance as part of the social protection system. What place they take in social protection system?

In conclusion we would like to ask you to give your opinion concerning the perspectives of the development of social protection system and necessary measures that should be taken to increase of its efficiency.

## Focus-group guides and meetings performance technique

### **Within the framework of the project, *Improved Targeting of Social Assistance Programs in the Russian Federation***

**The project objective** is to design a set of regional social assistance strategies focused on monetary assistance programs envisaging the verification of income data, and also the development of guidelines on how to improve targeting of social assistance programs, which include the estimation of income of a beneficiary, on the basis of common elements of relevant strategies.

The project is implemented by a consortium made up of three organizations: Institute for Urban Economics (IUE), Independent Institute of Social Policy, and The Urban Institute.

Among the project participants there are six regions of the Russian Federation: *Tverskaya Oblast* (pilot region), Bryanskaya Oblast, the Republic of Buryatiya, Orlovskaya Oblast, the Republic of Kabardino-Balkariya, and Sverdlovskaya Oblast.

The guider includes the recommendations on how to organize and hold three focus-group meetings to be attended by social assistance recipients from each of municipalities selected for the purposes of the project implementation. The project involves three types of target social assistance. Therefore, the recipients of every type of social assistance will form a focus-group arranged in every selected municipality (one focus-group for every type of social assistance):

- Monthly child allowances;
- Housing allowances;
- Other decentralized programs of social assistance initiated on the basis of federal law # 178-FZ, On State Social Assistance, as of July 17, 1999.

The focus-groups will be arranged in the form of a meeting (three meetings to be organized in every selected municipality) with a moderate number of recipients (15-20 persons) held in a suitable premise, that is, a separate room where the participants may be placed. Every focus-group must be held in a premise which is comfortable for clients. The premise should be isolated, and be furnished with a table around which all the participants could have been placed as for a “round-table” session.

The employees of the consortium implementing the project will moderate the focus-group meetings. The focus-group meetings should be arranged in the following manner:

1. Duration of every focus-group meeting is 1,5-2 hours. We should hold them in compliance with the program of a visit of the project experts to every pilot municipality as agreed with Social Assistance Department of each region under study.
2. In order to ensure that a focus-group includes 15-20 clients, we recommend that at least 25 persons should be invited. Among the invitees could only be the recipients of mentioned above types of benefits.
3. The invitees should not be acquainted with one another. The same person cannot take part in 2 and more focus-group meetings.

4. The recipients of investigated types of social assistance (see above), who belong to different socio-demographic groups, should be invited as focus-group participants. The details are provided in ii 3 and 4 below.

**Focus-group 1. Recipients of Monthly Child Allowances:**

The representatives of various social cohorts should be randomly selected from the municipal data base of recipients of the given type of benefit: large families with many children, single mothers (fathers), families with disabled children, families with unemployed members, families with disabled parent (-s), families with children whose parent (-s) evade child support payment (or recovery of child support payment), and also, if possible, families of conscript and contract servicemen with children; families of students of military educational institutions; families of higher or specialized secondary educational schools with children, who were registered by municipal social assistance agencies.

**Focus-group 2. Recipients of Housing Allowances:**

The representatives of various types of families should be randomly selected from the list of housing allowance recipients: families with underage children, including broken families and large families with many children, families of pensioners, single elderly people, and representatives of beneficiary categories of population: families with disabled members families with unemployed members, and families registered as low-income households by municipal social assistance agencies.

**Focus-group 3. Recipients of target assistance in accordance with the regional social assistance program (in case of the pilot region – the law of Tverskaya Oblast designed on the basis of the federal law # 178-FZ, On State Social Assistance, as of July 17, 1999).**

The representatives of low-income households registered by social assistance agencies, including families with disabled members, families with non-working disabled members, large families with many children, and families with unemployed or non-working able-bodied members should be selected at random from the list of recipients of target social assistance.

1. One expert will moderate a focus-group meeting, while another one will keep the records of the meeting. Local officials, representatives of regional social assistance department and social assistance agencies will not be allowed to attend the focus-group meetings<sup>4</sup> to make the clients feel free and at ease.
2. Only adult family members should be invited to take part in focus-group meetings.

The moderator's address, the project presentation and the introduction to the goals of focus-group meetings will open the discussion, for example:

---

<sup>4</sup> Additionally, during the meetings, in line with generally accepted standards of a social research, we plan to take measures for keeping the information confidential. Every participant of the focus-group will be notified that any personal information – received during the focus-group meeting – may be revealed without indicating names, surnames, patronymics, and other personal data as regards the persons who provided the information.

Good Afternoon,

The meeting is held as part of the international project, *Improved Targeting of Social Assistance Programs in the Russian Federation*. The consortium of three organizations: Institute for Urban Economics (IUE), Independent Institute of Social Policy, and The Urban Institute will execute the project.

The project's objective is to design regional development strategies and improved target social assistance programs for \_\_\_\_\_ Oblast.

We appreciate your participation in the meeting. Your opinion will help to measure the performance of social services, and take measures in order to achieve efficiency and improve targeting of social benefit programs.

We assure you that your personal data will be kept confidential. In future your answers will be used only in an impersonal form along with answers provided by other participants.

- With the assistance of local administrations or social assistance agencies a kind of a tea party, during which the participants will be able to ask attending experts any question of interest, may be arranged in order to slightly encourage the participants. It is advisable that related information should be included into the invitation form.
- The clients who are welcome participants of the focus-group meetings should receive the invitations (by letter, phone, or personally) from Social Assistance Department of \_\_\_\_\_ Oblast or its territorial branch located in a municipality at least 3-4 days before the meeting day.
- At the same time we find it extremely unacceptable if the clients, invited to take part in the meeting, are under any pressure. To this end, the invitation form should contain this information:
  - participation in a focus-group in absolutely voluntary;
  - every requirement concerning the confidentiality of the information provided by focus-group participants will be strictly complied with.
- The invitation form should include this information:
  - 1) time and location of the meeting;
  - 2) name of an adult family member who is invited to take part in the meeting, and name of another adult family member who may participate instead of the first one;
  - 3) the meeting's objective – find out the citizens' opinion of social benefits and housing allowances they are entitled to, and of whether they are satisfied with social assistance application procedures;
  - 4) voluntary participation in the meeting;
  - 5) assured confidentiality of the information provided; the participants should be informed of the fact that departmental officials and representatives of municipal social services will not attend the meeting;
  - 6) tea-part with refreshments;
  - 7) any other information which you believe should be necessarily included into the invitation form.

With due account for mentioned above we find the following invitation form to be most agreeable:

Dear \_\_\_\_\_ (*indicate the invitee's name, patronymic and surname*)!

Within the framework the international project, *Improved Targeting of Social Assistance Programs in the Russian Federation*, Social Assistance Department of \_\_\_\_\_ Oblast in association with \_\_\_\_\_ (*specify the name of the municipal social assistance agency*) conducts the survey of residents of \_\_\_\_\_ (*provide the name of the municipality*) to know their opinion of types of received social benefits and housing allowances, and also of whether they are satisfied with social assistance application procedures.

We invite you to take part in the meeting to be held in \_\_\_\_\_ (*specify the location*) at \_\_\_\_:\_\_\_\_ (*indicate the time*) to discuss your practice of applying to social assistance agencies. It is very important to us to know your opinion about the procedure and rules of application to various types of social assistance, remoteness of social assistance agencies from the place of residence; what agencies and for what types of social benefits you generally apply to, and what problems you encounter in that connection, and also what you would like to improve in terms of the agencies' performance

The group of think tanks including Institute for Urban Economics and Independent Institute of Social Policy (Moscow) will hold the meeting.

The participation in the meeting is absolutely voluntary. Your refusal to take part in the meeting in no way will result in cessation of social benefits. Additionally, all the information received from you will be kept strictly confidential, municipal official and representatives of Social Assistance Department of \_\_\_\_\_ Oblast will not among the meeting attendees. The information received during the discussion will not include names, patronymics and other personal data provided by residents who appeared to be willing to tell the project experts about their practice and give related recommendations.

Tea with refreshments will be arranged for the invitees in the end of discussion.

Please, specify the name, patronymic and surname of another family member who may take part in the meeting instead of the invited one if the invitee has no opportunity to be the participant.

\_\_\_\_\_  
(*indicate the name of sponsoring organization*).

#### 10. Main agenda items to be addressed at the focus-group meeting:

Receipt of information about social assistance (how the participants learnt about social benefits, indicate, if possible, whether that has been long ago, and how long the participants have been the recipients of social benefits)

Location of a proximate social assistance agency, how the participants get to the agency, and how often do they need to visit the agency.

Why do the participants apply for social benefit or housing allowance?

Do the participants know the eligibility procedure (who is entitled to social benefit (housing allowance), on what grounds is the benefit granted)? Do the participants find the procedure agreeable?

Benefits application practice. Whether it was easy to collect the documents? What problems they faced in connection with the work schedule, attitude of social workers, or because it was impossible to confirm the income, and so on.

Expenses incurred due to the collection of documents.

Reliability of information provided at the stage of application for benefits, and data verification reliability.

Do the participants know the persons (families), who, in their opinion, are entitled to social benefits (housing allowances), but do not receive it / do not apply for benefits? Why do the participants think it happens? Do they know a contrary example, when the families receive benefits, but, in the opinion of the participants, are not entitled to benefits? What is the reason? What of two problems is most important?

Have there been occasions when the participants were not entitled to benefit? Why did it happen? Have the participants been provided with clear reasons as to why they were not entitled to benefit? Have they filed an appeal? What result they achieved?

Time for handling the applications (how much time passed from filing the collected documents for application for benefit (allowance) till payment of benefit (allowance)?)

In what form do the participants receive benefits (in-kind benefits or cash benefits; paid in cash, transferred to an account, or sent by mail)? What form is preferable? Why?

*For housing allowance and target social assistance.* Do the participants think that repeated application for benefit (allowance), after the expiry of previous validity period, easier or not? *For monthly child allowance.* Had they to produce papers or provide other information to social assistance department to confirm that they have been entitled to monthly child allowance? How often have they to do that?

Importance of social benefits to the participants. What benefits do they receive? What benefits are most important?

To what extent are the participants satisfied with selected aspects of the performance carried out by *social assistance department / housing allowance department*: prompt receipt of application documents, documents receipt and issuance procedure, work schedule, and competence of social workers?

The outcomes of the focus-group meetings will be incorporated into the report intended for Social Assistance Department of \_\_\_\_\_ oblast.

- If you have questions on how to sample the invitees to focus-groups, please, contact:
1. \_\_\_\_\_ (name and contact information of the responsible person from the project team)
  2. \_\_\_\_\_ (name and contact information of the responsible person from the regional social assistance department)