DISABILITY AND DEVELOPMENT
IN THE WORLD BANK, 2002–07

Jeanine Braithwaite, Richard Carroll, Daniel Mont, and Karen Peffley

INTRODUCTION
People with disabilities compose a significant portion of the population. Estimates show that there are at least 600 million people with disabilities in the world, of which at least 400 million live in developing countries and are disproportionately represented among the poor. In most countries, people with disabilities have historically been stigmatized and denied the opportunities that have benefited other poor people. Governments have ignored this population and have failed to enforce their own laws where such laws exist. People with disabilities living in poverty, therefore, benefit least from the expanding opportunities that economic development brings, are least likely to achieve empowerment even when other poor groups do, and are most likely to remain vulnerable to economic shocks and other sources of insecurity.

Since about 1996, awareness in the World Bank about the two-way causality between poverty and disability has increased. The World Bank has made efforts to direct part of its lending to projects targeted specifically at people with disabilities (disability-specific projects). In addition, the Bank is working on increasing the degree to which concerns about disability issues are reflected in all of its development activities, including strategies, policies, programs, and projects in light of the economic and social benefits of ensuring the participation of people with disabilities in the development process and providing opportunities for those people.

Disability issues extend across many sectors of the Bank’s work. The Disability & Development (D&D) team was created in 2002 by the Social Protection and Labor Unit of the Human Development Network (HDN) to help ensure that disability issues are appropriately addressed in the World Bank’s mainstream poverty alleviation efforts. A key function of the team is to coordinate and seek synergies (a) among the various areas of social protection (social insurance, social funds, social safety nets, and labor markets); (b) within HDN more broadly (education, health, nutrition, and population); and (c) across the Bank (poverty reduction, gender, social development, postconflict recovery, transportation and communications, and so forth).

Objectives
This chapter’s objectives are (a) to present the record of the World Bank’s involvement in disability as part of its overall development strategy; (b) to share with development partners some of the good practices the Bank has discovered and fostered; and (c) to stimulate new ways to address the issues facing people with disabilities through partnerships, better

Jeanine Braithwaite is senior economist at the World Bank and is head of the Disability & Development team of the Social Protection and Labor Department. Daniel Mont, Senior Economist, and Karen Peffley, Program Assistant, are on this team. Richard Carroll is a consultant at the World Bank.
practices, and the further mainstreaming of disability into the work of the Bank.

How the Theme Fits in the Social Risk Management Framework and How Bank Thinking on Disability Has Evolved

As both a cause and a consequence of poverty, disability is an issue central to the mission of the Bank as well as to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). For example, as many as one-third of all primary schoolchildren not attending school have a disability, and lack of maternal health care is a major cause of disability in developing countries (World Bank 2003b). A paper commissioned by the Bank estimates that gross domestic product lost as the result of labor costs alone is in the range of 5 to 7 percent worldwide (Metts 2004). This loss results both from the inadequate access to the labor market and from the lack of services for people with disabilities, which compels other household members to withdraw from the labor market.

Disability is not a rare event but is rather a normal part of the life cycle and something that all people are likely to experience. The World Bank estimates that roughly 10 to 12 percent of the world’s population has a disability, and as many as one-fourth of all households have a member with a disability (Mont 2007). People with disabilities face major barriers that prevent them from working, attending school, building families, or even participating in civic activities.

Disability was a neglected topic in the World Bank before 2001. Without a formal sector or structure, regional vice presidential units had taken up disability on an ad hoc basis, as a component in a few projects or as a reference in a poverty report or other research. In 2001, in Social Protection Sector Strategy: From Safety Net to Spring Board (World Bank 2001), the Bank introduced a new social risk management approach that helped focus the World Bank’s work on fighting poverty of the more vulnerable groups in society, including people with disabilities. In pursuing this new focus, the Bank has become aware that people with disabilities are disproportionately represented among the world’s poor and that the poverty of people with disabilities is both deeper and more difficult to overcome.

In response to this challenge, a small Disability & Development team was created at the Human Development Network, Social Protection (HDNSP), and an adviser on Disability and Development was appointed in 2002. Regional vice presidential units began to designate regional disability coordinators for regional working groups on disability, and all regions now have disability coordinators. Initially, the team focused its efforts on raising awareness and organizing training events to sensitize the World Bank staff to the issue. Success was mixed. Training events were attended by few task team leaders, and unrealistic expectations were raised among nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) and disabled persons’ organizations (DPOs) by two high-profile international conferences (in 2002 and 2004). Nevertheless, the World Bank was able to advocate for disability as an issue, which raised awareness internally and also among other development agencies. In addition, the Bank helped NGOs better make their case to address disability from an economic development framework.

The World Bank began to move into specialized areas that were necessary to develop the evidence base for the case to include disability in World Bank operations: data and disability prevalence, inclusive education, accessibility, legal issues and safeguards, health, conflict management, and natural and human-made disasters. A list of papers, notes, toolkits, and training events undertaken is available on the HDNSP D&D Web site (http://www.worldbank.org/disability) and excerpts are provided in annex 7.A. As a result, the World Bank has been able to raise awareness that disability is a key issue for development, given the vicious circular nature of poverty and disability. Poverty causes many disabilities that are prevented in more developed countries, and households with members who have disabilities are often poorer than average.

In 2004, HDN management realized that D&D work at the World Bank needed to be reoriented toward mainstreaming by incorporating disability concerns and inclusive policies in World Bank lending and economic and sector work, thus making D&D work more operationally relevant. The first measure was to produce operational toolkits. In 2005, activities shifted more toward improving the evidence base and results framework for interventions in disability-inclusive policies. These efforts are focused in several key areas: monitoring disability in World Bank operations, data, and prevalence and developing disability indicators; evaluating the relationship between disability and poverty; promoting inclusive education; using health and rehabilitation to reduce disability; ameliorating disability in countries affected by conflict; increasing accessibility; supporting social protection (disability pensions, disability grants, and labor market protection); developing operational tools and guidelines; and fostering partnerships.

In 2005, the first loan dedicated to disability, the Iraq Emergency Disabilities Project, was established to promote the delivery of rehabilitation services and orthotic and prosthetic services that improve physical functioning.
Types of Interventions and Activities

The World Bank’s comparative advantage in supporting disability interventions lies in its capacity to address complex, multisectoral issues in a consistent, coordinated, fiscally responsible, and operational manner. The World Bank’s strengths lie in the following areas: (a) helping countries understand the economic reasons and advantages for pursuing inclusive development; (b) providing the analytical work to develop policies, programs, and targeted safety nets; and (c) ensuring that Bank programs and projects help with incremental implementation of the United Nations (UN) Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, which entered into force on May 3, 2008.

The World Bank has undertaken a three-pronged approach to pursue the D&D objectives. This approach includes continuing its efforts of the past several years to mainstream disability into existing programs and research; improving the evidence base through data measurement, collection, and program and policy analysis; and continuing outreach and awareness building of disability as a development issue that is crucial for achieving sustainable reduction of poverty as well as reaching some key MDGs. The specific areas of D&D that the Bank will address are described later in this chapter.

METHODOLOGY

Because disability is not a World Bank sector or thematic code, D&D activities cannot be quantified and analyzed in the same way as other social protection and labor (SP&L) activities. A baseline of World Bank activity in disability was undertaken in 2006 and 2007. In the case of D&D, a simple criterion was adopted to estimate the D&D portfolio: if the lending documentation or report mentioned disability in any way, the activity was counted.

D&D PORTFOLIO ACTIVITIES AT THE WORLD BANK, 2002–07

During fiscal years 2002 to 2007, 6.7 percent of World Bank projects by number and 6.65 percent of new lending commitments mentioned disability, although a precise amount dedicated to specific disability aspects could not be determined. The total volume of these new lending commitments was US$4.8 billion. Disability was mentioned in 6 percent of economic and sector work during fiscal years 2002 to 2006. Another indicator of progress is that many World Bank country offices and public information centers now provide both physical and communications access. Figure 7.1 and table 7.1 show the increasing importance of D&D activities in Bank lending operations.

Types of D&D Activities

The history of D&D activities at the World Bank is not as long, nor is the volume of associated lending as high, as that of other areas of SP&L. Furthermore, lending volume is not a good measure of the importance of D&D activities in the Bank’s work, partly because providing access to persons with disabilities can be low cost, particularly for new construction. For example, for an additional cost of 1 to 2 percent of school construction, a building can be accessible to all (World Bank 2003a). The Bank’s D&D activities are growing. Major disability activities include the following:

- Developing disability indicators, statistics, and measurement capacity
- Supporting inclusive education
Table 7.1: Projects that Refer to Disability by Region, Number, and Lending Amount, Fiscal Years 2002–07

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Number of projects mentioning disability</th>
<th>Lending commitments for projects mentioning disability (US$ millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>0 4 0 2 0 20 26</td>
<td>0.0 240.5 0.0 85.0 0.0 1,058.6 1,384.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asia and the Pacific</td>
<td>1 1 0 3 2 4 11</td>
<td>0.0 138.8 0.0 79.0 104.0 579.4 901.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe and Central Asia</td>
<td>4 1 1 4 2 11 23</td>
<td>44.2 300.0 100.0 197.0 147.3 532.8 1,321.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America and the Caribbean</td>
<td>3 2 3 4 5 7 24</td>
<td>347.0 72.0 218.7 702.5 194.8 730.0 2,265.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East and North Africa</td>
<td>0 4 0 4 1 3 12</td>
<td>0.0 388.5 0.0 178.1 10.0 120.0 696.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td>0 0 4 3 1 7 15</td>
<td>0.0 0.0 765.7 357.0 120.0 605.0 1,847.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8 12 8 20 11 52 111</td>
<td>391.2 1,139.8 1,084.4 1,598.6 576.1 3,625.8 8,415.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ calculations, based on the Business Warehouse data and World Bank documents.
Note: Because of rounding, totals may deviate slightly from the sum of the parts.
Promoting health and rehabilitation
- Ameliorating disability caused by conflict and natural disasters
- Increasing accessibility for persons with disabilities to community life and to economic empowerment
- Pursuing disability activities within the three core areas of SP&L
- Developing operational tools and guidelines
- Creating regional initiatives
- Forging partnerships.

Developing Disability Diagnostics, Statistics, and Measurement Capacity. A working group on improved disability measurement and statistics was begun by the UN Statistical Commission and supported by the World Bank through a US$235,000 development grant facility (DGF) and also through donated staff time. Known as the Washington City Group, it is working actively to improve the measurement of disability and statistical systems. More than 50 countries have participated in these activities.

The World Bank aims to assist countries in providing reliable data for making more inclusive policies and in implementing, monitoring, and evaluating those policies. Definitions, measurements, and prevalence of disabilities vary substantially across countries. Many developing countries significantly underestimate the prevalence of disability. Often families hide children or other family members with disabilities because of associated social stigma. Where people with disabilities are not visible in society, prevalence is even more difficult to assess. Recent studies in selected developing countries indicate a disability prevalence of 10 to 12 percent of the population, with about 2 to 3 percent of the entire population having severe impairments (Mont 2007). The World Bank promotes a modern, functional approach to disability, which is a better platform for designing inclusive policies than the previously predominant medical approach. Additional details of the World Bank’s work in this area are provided in annex 7.B.

The Disability & Development team has produced a survey paper about disability and poverty, which is based on a review of all 154 poverty assessments undertaken by the World Bank (Braithwaite and Mont 2008). This survey found that a surprisingly high percentage of poverty assessments (80.5 percent) had some mention of disability, but fewer than 10 percent (11 by count) had information detailed enough to assess the relative poverty rate among households with and without members with disabilities, and all of those assessments were in only one World Bank region—the Europe and Central Asia Region. The team is also working on an empirical analysis of poverty and disability—work that can now be done because new data are now available.

Supporting Inclusive Education. Universal primary education by 2015 is one of the MDGs. Universal primary education cannot be obtained unless all children are in school, including those with disabilities. Inclusive education is the education framework for including all hard-to-reach children, including those with disabilities; it was originally based on a principle stating that all should have the opportunity to learn together. The team produced a series of Education Notes on inclusive education and the cost of making schools accessible both in terms of physical layout and for information and communications technology. Furthermore, a project to include disability indicators in the Education Management Information Systems of four East Asian countries was recently completed and will be expanded to three more countries in the region. In addition, the World Bank has actively been engaged in the policy dialogue on inclusive education in Cambodia, Indonesia, and Vietnam.

Promoting Health and Rehabilitation. The World Bank has a strong commitment to achieve good health, nutrition, and population outcomes. The MDGs and the adoption of the Poverty Reduction Strategy Framework underscore the importance of inclusive health policies. Supporting more inclusive public health policies involves collecting evidence, developing such policies, and ensuring access to health services, especially for rehabilitation. The Disability & Development team has provided technical support to operations and studies on disability and health in some of these areas. Knowledge gained is available on the World Bank’s intranet and Internet sites. Since 2006, the World Bank has been partnering with the World Health Organization (WHO) on the first World Report on Disability and Rehabilitation, coauthoring several chapters as well as working on the report’s editorial and advisory committees. This joint report is expected to be launched in 2009.

Ameliorating Disability Caused by Conflict and Natural Disasters. Conflict and disaster are two important causes of disabilities. The emphasis on disability in these settings is often on the emergency phase, with a focus on reintegration of former combatants and medical rehabilitation of physical injuries. Much data on disability in these situations has been limited to the specific case of land mines and amputations. The problem, however, is much more complex and greatly influences the affected countries’ opportunity for sustainable
and equitable growth. The World Bank has unique comparative advantages to address this issue at all phases—from emergency to reconstruction, and from fragile states to sustainable development. The Disability & Development team has also worked on mental health and conflict.

Several operational tools and publications are available in this area, and the team has revised a draft toolkit on disability in conflict-affected countries. With support from the Trust Fund for Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development and from other trust funds, the Disability & Development team and operational teams in the regions are presently working in this area, especially in Sub-Saharan Africa. In the South Asia Region, the World Bank was very active in addressing disability aspects of natural disasters (such as the Pakistan earthquake and the Southeast Asia tsunami).

**Increasing Accessibility for Persons with Disabilities to Community Life and to Economic Empowerment.** Accessibility is a very important part of the inclusion of people with disabilities. An accessible environment is essential to the enjoyment of the rights of people with disabilities to participate in community life. Community participation includes access to transportation, water supply and sanitation, technology, civil and political participation, appropriate sources of communication and media to obtain information, and accessible infrastructure. Increasingly, World Bank country offices and public information centers are accessible to people with disabilities.

The International Finance Corporation and European Bank for Reconstruction and Development are adopting policies and guidelines on the accessibility of new construction. The cost of new construction is only 1 to 3 percent (World Bank 2003a). In the World Bank, a joint guidance note on disability-inclusive social analysis between D&D and the Social Development Department was completed, and dissemination is taking place. The International Finance Corporation and European Bank for Reconstruction and Development are adopting policies and guidelines on the accessibility of new construction. The Disability & Development team is collaborating with other units—namely, the Legal Network, Operations Policy and Country Services, and the Sustainable Development Network—to develop an action plan for increasing accessibility by phasing universal design into all World Bank-financed construction. Universal design is “the design of products and environments to be usable by all people, to the greatest extent possible, without the need for adaptation or specialized design” (Center for Universal Design 1997). Additionally, HDNSP partnered with the Social Development Department to produce Social Analysis and Disability: A Guidance Note (Social Development Department and Human Development Network 2007).

The World Bank has done extensive work on bus, rapid transit, and other forms of accessible transportation, including guidelines for accessible transportation done by the Social Development Department with support from the Disability & Development team.

**Pursuing Disability Activities within the Three Core Areas of SP&L.** The Disability & Development team has also undertaken some initial work in the three core areas of social protection:

- **Expanding opportunities.** Helping create good jobs through better labor market regulations, active and passive labor market policies, and wage-setting processes
- **Providing security.** Assisting people with disabilities in better managing their risks to reduce their vulnerability, helping them secure an asset base, and enabling them to engage in higher-risk but higher-return activities
- **Enhancing equity.** Providing minimum levels of subsistence and helping correct market-based distributive outcomes.

In the area of “providing security,” the team supported work on disability systems in Latin America and India, in addition to earlier work on Poland on disability insurance in general and on social safety nets. It also looked at employment practices in the countries of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) in the context of “expanding opportunities.”

**Developing Operational Tools and Guidelines.** The Disability & Development team focused on providing operational tools, such as a toolkit for including disability in operations. The toolkit includes a database of international and national legislation. At present, the toolkit is available only internally to World Bank staff members, but the team is working to make it available publicly. Many short notes on operationally relevant topics are already publicly available on the external Web site (http://www.worldbank.org/disability). Additionally, the team collaborated on the aforementioned Social Analysis and Disability: A Guidance Note.

**Regional Initiatives and D&D-Specific Projects**

Regional and country initiatives in disability have been gaining momentum. The World Bank’s regions are particularly active and developed regional strategies or working
groups: the Europe and Central Asia (ECA) Region, the East Asia and Pacific (EAP) Region, the Africa (AFR) Region, the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) Region, the Latin American and Caribbean (LCR) Region, and the South Asia Region (SAR). Each region has a disability focal-point person, who works across sectors and helps link sector colleagues with the Disability & Development team’s expertise. Primary areas of work in lending and nonlending activities include the following:

■ Supporting national disability strategies or policies and their related action plans for implementation
■ Providing technical assistance for collecting baseline data, developing management information systems, and mapping disability prevalence
■ Carrying out analytical and advisory activities assessing technical aspects of programs, conducting economic analysis and projections, and examining disability in relation to conflict situations
■ Sponsoring high-level, high-visibility conferences on disability
■ Committing a country-based development marketplace to disability and creating small-grants programs to support DPOs
■ Mainstreaming disability into education, community-based rehabilitation, transportation, microfinancing, community-driven development, and other projects and social funds
■ Developing a few stand-alone disability projects in disaster and postconflict situations
■ Generating knowledge and guidelines on HIV/AIDS and disability.

Partnerships

The World Bank has provided and continues to provide significant support to the Global Partnership for Disability and Development (GPDD), “a dynamic new initiative to accelerate inclusion of people with disabilities and their families into development policies and practices” according to the GPDD Web site (http://www.worldbank.org/disability/GPDD) hosted by HDNSP:

➔ The GPDD was formed to increase collaboration among development agencies and organizations to reduce the extreme poverty and exclusion of a substantial number of children, women, and men with disabilities living in poor countries. This population includes those born with disabilities and people who become disabled through wars and other violence, traffic or work injuries, diseases, disasters, and other causes.

The World Bank has supported the GPDD through a DGF. Initially obtained for one year to finance activities on better disability data, the DGF was recently extended for two additional years (US$700,000) to assist the GPDD in its interim operations until a permanent secretariat can be formally established.

Other important partnerships include continuation of and new financial commitments from donors such as Denmark, Finland, Italy, Japan, Norway, the Bank-Netherlands Partnership Program (BNPP), and the Bank’s Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD) Network through the Social Development Department (ESSD disability window, ESSD general call, and secondees). These funds support the work of the regions on disability projects such as country studies and analytical work.

Summary of Results of D&D Activities

The Bank has had some notable achievements. Through the Disability & Development team, the Bank has contributed significantly to the improvement of disability data collection through surveys, censuses, and administrative data and has provided knowledge management and operational tools designed to help task team leaders make their projects more inclusive (see annex 7.C). Currently, the Disability & Development team is collaborating with WHO on the first World Report on Disability and Rehabilitation.

In the regions, a growing number of activities are emerging, such as the following:

■ The Multi-country Demobilization and Reintegration Program in Africa targets an estimated 450,000 former combatants in seven countries. Services include the provision of physical rehabilitation assistance (prostheses and orthotics), counseling, vocational training, and support for microenterprise activities.
■ The Primary Education for Disadvantaged Children Project in Vietnam has combined project funds of US$243 million for technical support to improve administration, enhance delivery of acceptable quality education, and develop a policy on inclusive education and accessible schools.
■ The Disability and Child Protection Project in Bangladesh will establish a US$30 million social fund to finance NGOs and private provision of services, training, and empowerment for people with disabilities.
■ Data collection in the Latin America and Caribbean (LAC) Region—including a pilot of disability questionnaires in the household surveys of Bolivia and Ecuador—and awareness and outreach through a video demonstrate the importance and complexity of data on disability.
The Arab Republic of Egypt’s Social Protection Initiative Project contains a disability component to develop and test integrated programs for children with disabilities and at-risk youth through a range of providers and to use the experience of the programs to develop a new strategy for improving services.

An ECA Region disability study, which comprises work in four countries (including a disability survey piloted in Uzbekistan), is analyzing the economic costs of disability. Results will be published in book form.

Other projects include development of microfinance initiatives, social funds, national disability policies, classroom tools promoting inclusive education, and support for development marketplaces that are entirely focused on DPOs. Interest expressed by the Bank’s client countries is growing daily, spurred in part by the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities but also by a strong and growing movement within civil society. Boxes 7.1 to 7.6 provide additional examples of D&D activities by region.

**Box 7.1**

**AFRICA REGION D&D ACTIVITIES**

- Three country surveys are under way—in Uganda, South Africa, and Zambia—on disability and HIV/AIDS.
- Three country studies have been conducted on the economic and social status of people with disabilities in Angola, Burundi, and Sierra Leone.
- A policy note has been written on people with disabilities in Sierra Leone.
- A pilot was done with the OECD on disability prevalence, with referrals for children with disabilities in and out of school in Ethiopia.
- The Multicountry Demobilization and Reintegration Program supports the demobilization and reintegration of former combatants in the greater Great Lakes region of Central Africa. The largest program of its kind in the world, the work currently targets an estimated 450,000 former combatants in seven countries. Support will also be extended to two additional countries if and when appropriate. Services typically include the provision of physical rehabilitation assistance (prostheses and orthotics), counseling, vocational training, and support for microenterprise activities.

*Source: Information provided by the World Bank Africa regional disability coordinator.*

**Box 7.2**

**EAST ASIA AND PACIFIC REGION D&D ACTIVITIES**

**Regionwide**

- All public information centers in the region are ensuring information is accessible. They supported the translation of the UN Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization toolkit on embracing diversity into at least three languages in the region. Accessible public information centers resulted in increased use of the centers by people with disabilities in the Philippines.
- A transportation project addresses disability from the perspective of prevention and road safety.

**Cambodia**

- Socially inclusive materials in Cambodia, including books and television and radio slots, have been developed.
- A workshop on inclusive education was held in Cambodia in May 2007.

**Cambodia, Indonesia, Mongolia, and Vietnam**

- Administrative capacity has been built, and an inclusive educational management information system has been developed.

**Indonesia**

- BNPP trust funds were provided for baseline data collection on children with disabilities in the education sector. Some policy directives supporting inclusive education are envisioned as a result of this study.

**Philippines**

- The Social Expenditure Management Project included a component of social assistance for disadvantaged groups (US$25 million).
- Development marketplace support was provided for access to justice for the deaf. Several other development market competitions distributed grants to various stakeholders working on independent living.
- A DGF was awarded for children with disabilities in the Philippines.
Thailand

- The Japan Social Development Fund funded post-tsunami reconstruction work.

Vietnam

- The Primary Education for Disadvantaged Children Project combined project funds of US$243 million for technical support to improve administrative planning and management, to enhance delivery of acceptable quality education, to provide links to communities, and to produce a national-level child development report and policy on inclusive education and accessible schools.
- Disability questions have been introduced on the national census.
- An HIV/AIDS project run by young people with disabilities received support from the Bank. This project is a fully mainstreamed project through which young people with disabilities raise awareness.

Source: Information provided by the World Bank EAP regional disability coordinator.

Box 7.3

Europe and Central Asia Region D&D Activities

Armenia


Lithuania

- A Lithuania education improvement project is making 62 schools accessible to children with disabilities and is fully renovating the Vilnius School for the Deaf, as well as providing teacher training (US$25.29 million).

Romania

- A component of the Social Sector Development Project supports the rehabilitation of people with disabilities by strengthening the capacity of the National Institute for Medical Expertise and Work Capacity Recovery. It also bolsters the local medical expertise offices of the National House of Pensions and Other Social Insurance Rights (US$50 million, US$6.32 million of which targets people with disabilities).

Turkey

- Under a social inclusion project, assistance is given to existing or emerging programs that address the needs of the vulnerable, including people with disabilities, through four components:
  - Priority interventions program
  - Inclusive early childhood education of Roma
  - Social assistance programs
  - Capacity building for Roma social inclusion

- A program has provided training to 6,678 special education teachers, who themselves reach 150,000 students, 35,000 of whom are students with disabilities.
- Visually and hearing impaired primary schoolchildren are receiving specialized equipment through phase 2 of a basic education project. The project is building 70 special education primary schools and installing 770 computers. Special educational materials and teacher training will cover 1,340 preschool classrooms.

Uzbekistan

- A regional disability study is in print. It includes four country studies, including a disability survey piloted in Uzbekistan.

Source: Information provided by the World Bank ECA regional disability coordinator.

Box 7.4

Latin America and the Caribbean Region D&D Activities

Principle

- Mainstreaming disability measurement to promote effective policy making for social inclusion

Main Outputs

- Pilot of disability questionnaires in the household surveys of Bolivia and Ecuador
- Support for the inclusion of statistical data on disability in the national strategies for the development of statistics in Central America
- Awareness and outreach through video to demonstrate the importance and complexity of data on disability

Source: Information provided by the World Bank LAC regional disability coordinator.
Developing a Results Framework

The overall strategic objective of the Bank's D&D work is to support the creation of more inclusive societies in client countries. Such societies will improve opportunities, security, and equity for people with disabilities and their families. This strategic, higher-level objective needs to be measured in a way that is attributable to the Bank's activities. Because barriers to labor-market participation keep persons with disabilities from participation, an indicator for opportunity would be a decrease in the difference between the employment, access to basic health and education services, and poverty rates of people with disabilities and others. An indicator for security could be

---

**BOX 7.5**

**MIDDLE EAST AND NORTH AFRICA REGION D&D ACTIVITIES**

**Arab Republic of Egypt Social Protection Initiative Project Disability Component**

Project objective: Develop and test integrated programs for children with disabilities and at-risk youth through a range of providers, and use the experience of these programs to develop a new strategy for improving services.

**Main results:**
- Exposure to new inclusive approaches
- Awareness of issues for policy formulation

**Main outputs:**
- A total of 36 subprojects were developed with an average cost of approximately US$100,000 per subproject.
- 1,028 facilities were rehabilitated to adapt the infrastructure to the needs of children with disabilities.
- Numerous resource materials were developed to support future interventions.

**Institutional development:**
- Effect on Ministry of Insurance and Social Affairs
- Effect on the service providers and the communities
- Effect on future international collaborations

Source: Information provided by the World Bank MENA regional disability coordinator.

**BOX 7.6**

**SOUTH ASIA REGION D&D ACTIVITIES**

**Principles**
- Use mainstreaming in inclusive development.
- Have a two-country focus (India and Pakistan), with others on demand.
- Build on existing momentum.

**Strategy**
- Mainstreaming through prevention and inclusion
- Improving data and information
- Emphasizing awareness and outreach

India
- The Andhra Pradesh Rural Poverty Reduction Program targeted 560 disadvantaged *mandals* in 16 districts on the basis of levels of human, economic, and infrastructural development indicators. People with disabilities were then specifically selected, and the targeting was facilitated by NGOs and DPOs, as well as by self-help groups of people with disabilities.
- Interventions included providing surgical corrections and assistive devices, family support programs, and training to paraprofessionals in community-based rehabilitation; reviving defunct rehabilitation centers and establishing bridge residential schools for children with disabilities; and providing microcredit loans, small enterprise development, and vocational training.
- A draft document, “People with Disabilities in India: From Commitments to Outcomes,” was produced in June 2006.

Pakistan
- For the Earthquake Disability Project, a US$5 million grant from International Bank for Reconstruction and Development surplus supported community-based rehabilitation through contracting NGOs.
- Two Japan Social Development Fund grants provided US$1.6 million for Handicap International and Milestone (a national DPO) to establish resource and information centers for community-based rehabilitation and independent living.

Source: Information provided by the World Bank South Asia regional disability coordinator.

---

**FUTURE ACTIVITIES AND STRATEGIES**

**Developing a Results Framework**

The overall strategic objective of the Bank's D&D work is to support the creation of more inclusive societies in client countries. Such societies will improve opportunities, security, and equity for people with disabilities and their families. This strategic, higher-level objective needs to be measured in a way that is attributable to the Bank's activities. Because barriers to labor-market participation keep persons with disabilities from participation, an indicator for opportunity would be a decrease in the difference between the employment, access to basic health and education services, and poverty rates of people with disabilities and others. An indicator for security could be
the establishment of disability pensions and caregiver allowances in middle-income countries. An intermediate outcome indicator for equity could be the percentage of public buildings with physical and communications access as an important step toward a higher-level and longer-term objective: full inclusion and no difference in poverty incidence among people with or without disabilities. These indicators are important to gauge progress toward inclusion at global and national levels. Collecting comparable data for these indicators would require serious efforts because currently they are still not routinely monitored in borrowing countries.

Key outcome and process indicators include the following:

- Strategy and plan approved by the Bank’s Board and resources allocated
- Increased number of people trained and an increased number of Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers, national development plans, and Country Assistance Strategies (CASs) that include disability as an issue.
- Global networks, universities, and training institutions that include disability in their work
- Knowledge easily accessible at all levels, Web page use, and use of other formats
- Adoption of a policy on infrastructure by the Bank with support to the field
- Strengthened international collaboration and increased appreciation from other donors, banks, and civil society regarding the Bank’s role in such collaboration as a result of the GPDD progress and process
- All infrastructure and new construction supported by Bank funding to be accessible by people with disabilities
- Increased percentage of people with disabilities employed by the Bank and other development partners, as well as an increased percentage of people with disabilities in national governments, universities, and community-based organizations.

Emerging Opportunities for D&D

A number of business opportunities could be exploited on the basis of past efforts and if adequate resources are made available:

- Implementing the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
- Building the interest of governments, international organizations, and the private sector in creating business and partnership opportunities
- Strengthening cooperation with civil society
- Strengthening multisectoral collaboration within and outside the Bank—for example, strengthening the collaboration between the Health, Education, and SP&L Sector Boards; strengthening collaboration between HDN, ESSD, the Development Economics Vice Presidency, the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Vice Presidency, and others within the Bank; and increasing collaboration with UN agencies such as the United Nations Children’s Fund, the UN Development Programme, the International Labour Organization (ILO), and WHO
- Addressing the large needs for dealing with mental, physical, sensory, and psychosocial disabilities in countries in conflict and postdisaster situations
- Strengthening international cooperation at global, regional, and national levels in addressing disability in development—thus enhancing equity in development
- Involving people with disabilities in development
- Ensuring that all new construction and rehabilitation of existing construction is inclusive and accessible
- Strengthening knowledge management, including accessibility for people with disabilities
- Strengthening human rights, equity, and poverty alleviation in international aid
- Increasing the understanding and use of inclusive development within international development.

As part of these activities, the Disability & Development team aims to raise the presence of disability considerations and activities in the World Bank portfolio and to provide task team leaders with the evidence base and operational tools they need to make compelling arguments to borrowing governments for incorporating disability into World Bank operations and to assist governments to measure whether these results are achieved. There are many more opportunities for D&D than the team could address. Following is only a selected subset.

Global Partnership for Disability and Development. As noted in the retrospective, the Bank played a key role in establishing the GPDD and is a very active member in this coalition of NGOs, DPOs, multi- and bilateral development agencies, governments, the private sector, and civil society. The Disability & Development team will continue to support the GPDD by providing fiduciary oversight for the multidonor trust fund that supports the GPDD; implementing the DGF, which HDN recently obtained for the GPDD; helping the task force of the GPDD to navigate Bank procedures; and participating regularly in GPDD meetings and telephone conferences.
United Nations. The Bank will continue to partner with the UN agencies, particularly the UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA), ILO, WHO, and the UN Washington City Group.

Implementation of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. As noted in the Implications of the UN Convention Note (Guernsey, Nicoli, and Ninio 2007) countries that sign and ratify the convention will look to the Bank and other international organizations for guidance and assistance in its implementation. The Bank’s primary contribution could be to assist countries in understanding how to implement the ambitious goals of the convention incrementally, given the resource constraints they face. A demand-driven response to country needs is an obvious basis for future Bank strategy. This response could be supported by cross-support and other services by the Disability & Development team. In addition, the Bank could provide a global monitoring service, similar to its Global Monitoring Report for the implementation of the MDGs. Monitoring and evaluation is a very important part of the convention, which creates governance for monitoring but leaves open the technical and institutional questions of how to do it. UNDESA, one of the agencies supporting the implementation of the convention, has already indicated its interest in cooperating with the Bank in constructing a results framework. The Disability & Development team at HDNSP is capable of providing low-cost assistance to the construction of this framework. It would, however, need to work more extensively with other Bank sectors and networks to develop a set of monitorable indicators for countries that ratify the convention and to strengthen national statistics to collect better data on disability, should the Bank decide to engage in this activity.

ANNEX 7A: DISABILITY PUBLICATIONS AND TRAINING EVENTS, 2003–07

Disability Publications

The publications listed in this annex are available at http://go.worldbank.org/L7EYWC6G40 or as otherwise noted.

2008


2007


2006


2005


Training Events

2007

November 8–9, 2007: “Disability and Disaster,” Milan, Italy
Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

October 29–November 2, 2007: Inclusive Research (Global Health Research and Disability) Global Forum for Health Research, China
Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

October 2007: “Measuring Disability,” presentation to various stakeholders in New Delhi
Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

Speaker: Jennifer Madans, United Nations Washington Group on Disability Statistics

Speaker: Jennifer Madans, United Nations Washington Group on Disability Statistics

2006

December 2006: “The International Classification of Functioning, Disability, and Health,” UN Special Programme for the Economies of Central Asia Conference on Disability Measurement, Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan
Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

December 2006: “Measuring Disability,” presentation to Pakistani Census Bureau
Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

November 9, 2006: “Measuring Disability on Censuses and Surveys”
Speakers: Jennifer Madans, United Nations Washington Group on Disability Statistics; Daniel Mont, World Bank

October 2006: “Disability and Employment Policy,” course on the Labour Market Integration of Disabled Persons for Professionals from Latin America and the Caribbean, Turin, Italy
Speaker: Daniel Mont

October 11, 2006: “Mental Health” at Harvard University, Cambridge, MA
Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

July 11, 2006: “Inclusive Development: Tools for Operationalization (East Asia)”
Speakers: Christopher J. Thomas, sector manager, East Asia and Pacific Region Human Development Sector; Charlotte McClain-Nhlapo, East Asia and the Pacific disability adviser; Alberto Ninio, lead counsel, World Bank Legal Department; Jean-Roger Mercier, Environmental Assessment, Quality Assurance, and Compliance Unit; Marco Nicoli, Human Development Network, Social Protection; Katherine Guernsey, consultant

July 5–6, 2006: “Disability and Development,” the Danish Association of Disability Organizations and Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

June 14, 2006: “Inclusive Development and the Law: Challenges and Opportunities for the World Bank” (staff only event)
Speakers: Gerard Quinn, professor of Law, National University of Ireland, Galway; Michael Stein, visiting
professor, Harvard Law School; John Wodatch, chief, Disability Rights Section, Civil Rights Division, U.S. Department of Justice; Alberto Ninio, lead counsel, Environmental and International Law Unit, World Bank; Charlotte McClain-Nhlapo, coordinator for SAR and EAP, Disability Working Group, World Bank; Jeanine Braithwaite, senior social protection economist, World Bank; Katherine Guernsey, international lawyer and consultant

Speakers: Jeeva Perumalpillai-Essex, Disability Focal Point, AFR; Emmanuel Akpa, sector manager, Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Sector, AFR; Charles Di Leva, chief counsel, World Bank Legal Department; Johannes Hoogeveen, Human Development Network, Social Protection, Dar es Salaam; Jean-Roger Mercier, Environmental Assessment, Quality Assurance, and Compliance Unit; Marco Nicoli, knowledge officer, Human Development Network, Social Protection; Katherine Guernsey, consultant

Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

May 4, 2006: “Rio de Janeiro: Experiences on CBR and Deinstitutionalization”
Speaker: Leda de Azevedo, president, FUNLAR

Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

April 4, 2006: “Microfinance and Disability”
Speakers: Roy Mersland, consultant, Leonard Cheshire International; Enzo Martinelli, resource development manager, Leonard Cheshire International; Mike Goldberg, senior microfinance specialist, World Bank; Christopher Magarian, director, Finance Group, Japonica Intersect

March 2006: “Measuring Disability Prevalence,” Meeting of Central American National Statistical Offices, Panama City
Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

Speaker: Ian Kaplan, research associate, University of Manchester

February 28, 2006: “The Disability Adviser in Kosovo: Key Lessons and Limitations”
Speaker: Mary F. Hayden, president, LBH Institute

Speakers: Michael Collins, director, Hilton/Perkins Program; Aubrey Webson, regional consultant for Africa and the Caribbean; Steven M. Rothstein, president, Perkins School for the Blind

February 2, 2006: “Introducing the Employers’ Forum on Disability”
Speaker: Susan Scott-Parker, founder and chief executive, Employers’ Forum on Disability

2005

December 20, 2005: “Technology International: The CITTI Project”
Speaker: Bridgett Perry, project director, Colorado Institute for Technology Transfer and Implementation

Speakers: Susan Hirshberg, senior education specialist, World Bank; Charlotte McClain-Nhlapo, coordinator for South Asia and East Asia and the Pacific, Regional Disability Working Group, World Bank

Roundtable discussion for the International Day of Disabled Persons

Speakers: K. P. Perkins, Bunmi Aina, and Respicius Batamula, Gallaudet University

Speakers: Enzo Martinelli, resource development manager, Leonard Cheshire International; Désirée Roman Stadthagen, Latin American and Caribbean regional program manager, Leonard Cheshire International
October 25, 2005: “Disability in Emergency Response: An Analysis of Early Tsunami Relief Efforts”
Speakers: Maria Veronica Reina, president, Center for International Rehabilitation; Katherine J. Dorsey, director of publications, Center for International Rehabilitation; Anne Hayes, international coordinator, Center for International Rehabilitation

Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

Speaker: Pia Rockhold, World Bank

July 2005: “Measuring Disability,” Interministerial Meeting on Disability, Hanoi
Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

Speaker: Betty Dion, chair, International Commission on Technology and Accessibility, Rehabilitation International

June 29, 2005: “Disability and Sports”
Speaker: Elise C. Roy, cofounder and director, Ready-Set-Go

Speaker: Daniel Mont, World Bank

June 14, 2005: “Sharing of Experiences: USAID’s Efforts to Accelerate the Inclusion of People with Disabilities”
Speakers: Lloyd Feinberg and Rob Horvath, U.S. Agency for International Development

May 26, 2005: “Psychosocial and Mental Health after Disaster: The Aid Program for Tsunami Affected Countries by JSPN”

April 21, 2005: “ADA Fifteen Years Later: Lessons for Legal Frameworks in Developing Countries”
Speaker: John Wodatch, chief, Disability Rights Section, Civil Rights Division, U.S. Department of Justice

April 20, 2005: “Equity in Education: Students with Disabilities, Learning Difficulties and Disadvantages”
Speaker: Dr. Peter Evans, senior specialist, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development Centre for Educational Research and Innovation

March 30, 2005: “A National Commitment to Inclusive Education”
Speaker: Manuel Campos, director, National Secretariat for the Social Inclusion of Persons with a Disability

March 14, 2005: “Disability and Social Safety Nets”
Speaker: Sophie Mitra, assistant professor, Fordham University

February 24, 2005: “Post-Polio Syndrome”
Speaker: Lauro Halstead, director, Post-Polio Program, National Rehabilitation Hospital

February 15, 2005: “Inclusion of People with Disabilities and Sustainable Development: Mobility International USA”
Speaker: Karen Heinicke-Motsch, program manager, Mobility International USA

2004

November 10, 2004: “Independent Living Movement in Asia” and “Activities of Self-Help Groups in Asia”
Speakers: Yukiko Nakanishi, president, Asia Disability Institute; Shoji Nakanishi, chair, Disabled People International Asia-Pacific Regional Council
November 4, 2004: “Improving Postsecondary Education for Deaf Men and Women around the World” Speakers: T. Alan Hurwitz, vice president, dean, and chief executive officer, National Technical Institute for the Deaf, Rochester Institute of Technology; James J. DeCaro, professor and director, Postsecondary Education Network—International, E. William Clymer, coordinator, Postsecondary Education Network—International

October 26, 2004: “What Constitutes Disabilities: Comparisons between the Global North and the Global South” Speaker: Karen Saba, vulnerable population specialist

October 13, 2004: “Is Community-Based Rehabilitation a Sound Strategy for Disabled Persons in Developing Countries? Lessons Learned from CBR Experiences in Ghana and Benin” Speaker: Olivier Jadin, rehabilitation specialist

June 10, 2004: “Vietnam through a Disability Lens: Finding a Prescription for Greater Clarity and Action” Speakers: Yen Vo and Glen W. White, University of Kansas


May 6, 2004: “HIV/AIDS and Disability: Experience from Handicap International” Speaker: Florence Thune, Handicap International

April 22, 2004: “Preparing Teachers to Educate Children with Disabilities in Inclusive Settings in LAC and ECA: A Presentation of ‘Teacher Centered’ Training Modules Developed by the Joseph P. Kennedy, Jr. Foundation” Speakers: Maggie J. McLaughlin, University of Maryland; Alfredo Artiles, Vanderbilt University

April 14, 2004: “Training and Employment of People with Disabilities: Perspectives from Asia and the Pacific Region” Speaker: Debra A. Perry, International Labour Organization

March 10, 2004: “Action for Ability, Development, and Inclusion: Experience from India” Speaker: Syamala Gidugu, Action for Ability, Development, and Inclusion


January 22, 2004: Integrating Disability Messages into the Mainstream Media Speaker: Barbara Duncan, Rehabilitation International


ANNEX 7.B: KEY EXAMPLES OF ROLES FOR THE BANK AT DIFFERENT LEVELS


- Develop “good practice” case studies on successful interventions in disability across sectors from developing countries that explain how countries made progress in the area. This work could include strategy development, training programs, financing mechanisms, and other required technical support.
- Provide support for designing and implementing pilots.
- Continue support for data collection and for monitoring and evaluation.
- Help generate resources to support the regions in disability research (including financing Disability & Development team members’ participation in regional efforts).

Regions: Regional Management Teams

- Encourage identification of country and sector point persons to engage with the disability teams in their regions and at the center.
- Specific policy decisions to ensure mainstreaming disability in the Bank’s work:
  — Financing only infrastructure that is accessible (transport, roads, public buildings, technology)
—Ensuring reform programs include the needs of people with disabilities
—Ensuring in the review process of analytical and advisory activities (AAA) and projects that disability issues have been considered and evaluated (much like gender, environment, or social issues).

Countries
■ Ensure a strategy for disability is included in the CAS with a few key actionable and measurable targets.
■ Provide support to national disability policy development and action plans and law reform.
■ Ensure disability issues have been addressed in AAA and projects during the review process.
■ Allow for flexible budgeting to ensure cross-sectoral input and support for disability.

Sectors and Cross-Sectoral Programs
■ Develop a checklist in each sector for projects, programs, and AAA that covers aspects of disability that should be mainstreamed.
■ Approach disability in cross-sectoral ways—for example, transportation projects that include education and health components on road safety and emergency road services or education programs that include accessible infrastructure and school health components.
■ Ensure accessibility to all infrastructure, services, and technology as well as economic and social participation.
■ Conduct more economic analysis on disability and poverty, as well as on the cost of providing disability-friendly services and infrastructure.

ANNEX 7.C: DISABILITY DATA AND MEASUREMENT

The Disability & Development team has been very active in improving the quality and quantity of data on people with disabilities living in developing countries. These efforts have taken place in every region and involve quantitative, qualitative, and administrative data. Accomplishments include the following:

■ The team secured a DGF for the UN Washington Group on Disability Statistics to support its efforts to develop and test internationally comparable census questions on disability. The team has been an active member of that group, including chairing its analytical working group and being involved in regional training sessions in Africa and Latin America to develop countries’ capacity.

■ The team has assisted in the development of quantitative data on disability collected by the World Bank in Ecuador, India, Pakistan, Panama, Uzbekistan, and Vietnam.

■ The team oversaw the development of a qualitative data instrument that was then used in Georgia, Kenya, and the Republic of Yemen. The results of the Kenya data will inform the development of the country’s national disability survey. In the other two countries, the results are feeding into government workshops aimed at developing a national disability policy. Earlier, the team also had a combined qualitative-quantitative study in Indonesia that assessed service delivery for people with disabilities in that country.

■ Using BNPP funds, the team developed a methodological paper that used poverty-mapping techniques to develop a technique to estimate poverty rates for small populations using matched census and survey data. This technique was used in Mozambique, Tanzania, and Uganda. The team also helped the Development Economics Vice Presidency secure some funds to test the applicability of the Living Standards Measurement Study for data collection on disability.

■ Using BNPP funds, the team is currently helping to integrate disability into the educational management information systems (EMIS) in Cambodia, Indonesia, Mongolia, and Vietnam. In conjunction with this project, the team has also advised on the Child Development Record component of Vietnam’s Primary Education for Disadvantaged Children project. Education Program Development Fund support has been secured to extend the EMIS project to the Lao People’s Democratic Republic, Timor-Leste, and Tonga.

■ The team has supported efforts by the HDN Education Department and the OECD to adapt a technique for measuring disability in children to developing countries. The technique has been successfully pilot tested in Cambodia and Ethiopia. In Cambodia, the early identification and assessment of children with disabilities has been mainstreamed under the Education for All Fast-Track Initiative and funded by the Catalytic Funds. Plans are under way to implement data collection in many countries.

■ The team is involved in many capacity-building activities, such as training in Central Asia (Armenia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan) and South Asia (Bangladesh, India, and Pakistan); individual meetings with census bureaus in Pakistan and Vietnam; production of a video on disability data collection with the LAC Region; and individual consultations with numerous
countries, including (in addition to those mentioned above) The Bahamas, Guyana, Paraguay, and Peru.

■ The team has published Social Protection Discussion Papers on measuring disability prevalence and on designing disability indicators for evaluating public health interventions, as well as a piece in *The Lancet* on issues involved with using disability-adjusted life years to assess the impact of public health interventions on disability. A paper on disability prevalence in Zambia has been published by *ALTER: The European Journal on Disability* (2007). The team also spoke on developing disability data for policy purposes at the 2007 American Public Health Association meetings and the 2008 American Statistical Association meeting. Another paper coauthored with members of the Washington City Group on cognitive testing protocols was presented at the 2008 International Conference on Survey Methods in Multicultural, Multinational, and Multiregional Contexts in Berlin.

REFERENCES


